ASPECTS OF THE KOREAN TRADITIONAL VOCAL GENRE,

*KAGOK*:

FEMALE *KAGOK* AND THE CALL FOR A NEW INTEGRATIVE

*KAGOK* NOTATION

PART ONE (OF THREE PARTS)

A thesis

submitted in fulfillment

of the requirements for the Degree

of

Doctor of Philosophy in Music

in the

University of Canterbury

by In-suk Lee

University of Canterbury

2007
INTRODUCTION

1. Defining kagok  
2. The current status of kagok  
3. The current state of research into kagok  
4. Structure  
5. Methodology  
6. Sources  
   a) Primary sources  
   b) Secondary sources

PART I

CHAPTER 1

Aesthetics of Kagok: The Integration of Music and Korean Culture

Introduction  
1.1. Philosophy of kagok (Yeak sasang) and kagok ensemble  
1.2. Vocal quality (Ŭmjil) and Confucianism
1.3. Aesthetics of Musical form
  1.3.1. The musical structure
  1.3.2. The principle of word setting
  1.3.3. Cadences
1.4. Sikimsae
  1.4.1. The definition of sikimsae
  1.4.2. Frequency of sikimsae patterns
  1.4.3. The beauty of sikimsae
1.5. Vocalization (Palsŏng)
1.6. The performance position (Chase)
1.7. Kagok text (Noraetmal)
1.8. The performance order (Yŏnju sunsŏ)
Conclusion

CHAPTER 2

Marginalization of Female Kagok: Female Kagok Singers and Kagok's History

Introduction

2.1. Kagok singers ‘kisaeng’
  2.1.1. Kisaeng system
  2.1.2. Kagok kisaeng
  2.1.3. Kisaeng during Japanese colonization (1910 - 1945)
2.2. Survival of kisaeng
  2.2.1. Kagok singers in the late twentieth century
2.3. Today’s repertoire of kagok
2.4. Kagok history: manuscripts and anthologies
  2.4.1. Development of kagok: old manuscripts of kagok’s accompanying instrument ‘kŏmun’go’
  2.4.2. The flourishing era of kagok: professional kagok singers (kagaek) and anthologies
  2.4.3. The earliest evidence of female kagok
  2.4.4. The decline of kagok
2.4.5. The need of co-operative research between music and literature

Conclusion

CHAPTER 3

Kagok Education

Introduction 158
3.1. The oral/aural tradition of kagok 160
   3.1.1. Traditional kagok class 160
   3.1.2. Recollection of Cho Soon-ja’s kagok learning 168
3.2. Kisaeng schools and curriculum 170
3.3. Today’s kagok education 177
3.4. Kagok notation of chŏngganbo 183
3.5. Problems of terminology 184
3.6. Trials of new methodology 187
3.7. Understanding chŏngganbo notation 192
   3.7.1. Musical backgrounds and personal views about the kagok class 195
   3.7.2. The length of time taken to learn kagok with chŏngganbo notation 197
   3.7.3. Disadvantages and advantages of chŏngganbo notation 200
   3.7.4. Five practical tests for chŏngganbo notation 202
Conclusion 203

CHAPTER 4

Sondongjak (hand signs) in Kagok Education

Introduction 207
4.1. Types of sondongjak 214
   4.1.1. Tapping the rhythmic cycle 215
4.1.2. *Sikimsae sondongjak* 220
4.1.3. *Ch’ikinún yŏsŏng* (upward-gliding) 221
4.1.4. *T’oesŏng* (downward-gliding) 225
4.1.5. *Ch’usŏng* (a pitch bend) 229
4.1.6. *Hyuji* (rest) 232
4.1.7. Dynamics 233
4.2. The principles behind *sondongjak* 234
  4.2.1. *Sondongjak* for the visualization of *sikimsae* 234
  4.2.2. Equating *sondongjak* and *sikimsae*’s spectrogram 236
  4.2.3. *Sondongjak* for conducting oneself 240
  4.2.4. *Sondongjak* for meditation 241
  4.2.5. *Sondongjak* for memorization and as a rhythmic and melodic pattern indicator 242
  4.2.6. *Sondongjak*, from movement to cognition and sound 243
  4.2.7. *Sondongjak* as an achievement indicator 247
4.3. Comparison of four singers’ *sondongjak* and sound 250
  4.3.1. The shape of *sondongjak* 251
  4.3.2. Direction in *sondongjak* 253
  4.3.3. Comparison with *sikimsae* spectrogram 255
4.4. *Sondongjak* and notation 264
Conclusion 266

**PART II**

**CHAPTER 5**

*Kagok* and Western Staff Notation

Introduction 268

5.1. The first generation of transcriptions 280
  5.1.1. Pitch 284
  5.1.2. Time signature and bar-lines 285
5.1.3.  Complicated triplets  
5.1.4  Duration  
5.2.  Ch’angjak kagok (Newly-composed kagok)  
5.2.1.  Sangil  
5.2.2.  Ŭjebam Kkumgilesŏ  
5.3.  Transcriptions for analysis  
5.4.  Transcription for kagok education  
5.5.  The transcription by a non Korean  
Conclusion  

CHAPTER  6  
New Integrative Kagok Notation  

Introduction  
6.1.  Kabo (old notations for kagok singing)  
6.1.1.  Supahyŏng notation (the water wave style notation)  
6.1.2.  Sŏnyulsŏn kagok notation  
6.1.3.  Yŏnŭmp’yo (neumatic notation)  
6.2.  Timeline of the New Integrative Kagok Notation (NIKN)  
6.3.  The first draft of the new integrative kagok notation  
6.3.1.  Pitch  
6.3.2.  Rhythm  
6.3.3.  Rhythmic cycle  
6.3.4.  Timbre change  
6.3.5.  Sikimse signs  
6.3.6.  Bar division  
6.3.7.  New signs  
6.3.8.  Sondongjak (Hand signs)  
6.4.  The second draft of the NIKN  
6.4.1.  Pitch  
6.4.2.  Rhythm
CHAPTER 7

New Integrative Kagok Notation: A Case Study

Introduction 365

7.1. Summer course at the Korean National University of Education, 2001 367
   7.1.1. Observation 369
7.1.2. Analysis

7.2. Studies in Asian Music and Music Education courses at the University of Canterbury, 2002
   7.2.1. Observation
   7.2.2. Analysis

7.3. Testing the final version of the NIKN at the University of Canterbury, 2004
   7.3.1. Observation
   7.3.2. *Chŏngganbo* translation test
   7.3.3. Questionnaire
   7.3.4. Singing test with *sondongjak*

7.4. Testing the final version of the NIKN at the University of Canterbury, 2006
   7.4.1. Review of the five sessions
   7.4.2. Questionnaire
   7.4.3. Singing test with *sondongjak*

Conclusion

CONCLUSION

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Discography

Filmography

Appendix I. Catalogue of Fieldwork Research Materials

Appendix II. Questionnaires

   2001 Surveys of Understanding of *Chŏngganbo* in Korea
   2001 NIKN Test in Korea
PART III

The New Integrative Kagok Notation Score of the first suite (hanbat’ang) of female kagok

Contents
Translation of kagok texts
Directions
Score
### List of Figures

| Figure 1    | Copy from Rockwell’s analysis                          | 24 |
| Figure 1-1  | The transcription of the fifth section of *T’aep’yōngga* by Sŏ Han-bŏm | 37 |
| Figure 1-2  | Transcription of *p’yōngjo Isudaeyŏp*, *Pŏdûrûn* by Kim Ki-su | 49 |
| Figure 1-3  | *Chŏngganbo* transcription of *p’yōngjo Isudaeyŏp*, ‘Pŏdûrûn’ by Kim Ki-su | 50 |
| Figure 1-4  | Authentic *kagok* songs in *p’yōngjo* mode             | 55 |
| Figure 1-5  | The first cadential phrase of the first four songs in a *kagok* suite | 59 |
| Figure 1-6  | The cadential phrase of each section in the two modes  | 60 |
| Figure 1-7  | The frequency of *sikimsae* patterns in *kagok*        | 72 |
| Figure 1-8  | *T’oesông* sign                                        | 75 |
| Figure 1-9  | *Kagok* notation of *Pyŏngnong* by Hong Wŏn-gi         | 76 |
| Figure 1-10 | A schematic view of velum and pre-palatal              | 82 |
| Figure 1-11 | The first song of *female* *kagok* suite               | 90 |
| Figure 1-12 | The first song of *male* *kagok* suite                 | 90 |
| Figure 1-13 | The fourteenth song of the female *kagok han pat’ang*  | 94 |
| Figure 1-14 | The twenty-fifth song of the male *kagok han pat’ang*  | 94 |
| Figure 2-1  | Genealogy of the present *kagok* tradition             | 99 |
| Figure 2-2  | The development of *kagok*                             | 149|
| Figure 2-3  | *Samjûk kûnbo*, 1841                                  | 151|
| Figure 3-1  | No.41 in *Kim Ki-su’s 108·66 Short Songs* and its transcription | 190|
| Figure 3-2  | Disadvantages of *chŏngganbo* notation                 | 202|
| Figure 3-3  | Advantages of *chŏngganbo* notation                    | 202|
| Figure 4-1  | Finger counts of *kriya*                               | 208|
| Figure 4-2  | Five different types of the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycles | 217|
| Figure 4-3  | Comparison of the use of rhythmic cycle icons          | 218|
| Figure 4-4  | The sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle and ten-beat rhythmic cycle | 219|
| Figure 4-5  | Upward-gliding movement in *p’yōngjo* mode             | 221|
| Figure 4-6  | Upward-gliding movement in *kyemyŏnjo* mode            | 222|
| Figure 4-7  | Right hand upward-gliding and its *sondongjak* description | 223|
| Figure 4-8  | Left hand upward-gliding and its *sondongjak* description | 224|
| Figure 4-9  | Both hands upward-gliding and its *sondongjak* description | 224|
| Figure 4-10 | Downward-gliding transcription in Western notation      | 225|
| Figure 4-11 | Right hand downward-gliding *sikimsae* and its *sondongjak* description | 227|
| Figure 4-12 | Left hand downward-gliding *sikimsae* and its *sondongjak* description | 228|
| Figure 4-13 | Image of downward-gliding *sikimsae*, *chŏngganbo*, both hands description | 228|
| Figure 4-14 | Right hand *ch’usŏng* and *sondongjak* description     | 231|
| Figure 4-15 | Left hand *ch’usŏng* and *sondongjak* description      | 231|
List of Tables

Table 1-1 Comparison between the two vocal genres: kagok and sijo 47
Table 1-2 Number of syllables and beats in each section of authentic kagok form 53
Table 1-3 The number of syllables in sijo poem and kagok structure 56
Table 1-4 The number of different syllables in every beat of the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle 58
Table 1-5 Frequency of the Upward-gliding (yang) pattern in p'yŏngjo kagok 69
Table 1-6 Frequency of the Upward-gliding pattern in kyemyŏnjo 69
Table 1-7 Frequency of the Downward-gliding (ŭm) in P'yŏngjo 70
Table 1-8 Frequency of the Downward-gliding (ŭm) in Kyemyŏnjo kagok 70
Table 1-9 Frequency of the chung-nam-im pattern in P'yŏngjo kagok 70
Table 1-10 The analysis of the subjects of female kagok 88
Table 1-11 The analysis of the subjects of male kagok 88
Table 1-12 Order of female kagok han pat'ang 92
Table 2-1 The repertoire of six kwŏnbŏn in the radio programs in 1920 113
Table 2-2 The number of performers in the radio programs in each kwŏnbŏn in 1920 115
Table 2-3 The number of kagok repertoire today 140
Table 2-4 The list of existing kagok repertoire today 141
Table 2-5 Notation of Mandaeyŏp, Chungdaeeyŏp and Sakdaqeyŏp in old manuscripts 144
Table 3-1 The numbers of kisaeng in sixteen Kisaeng Unions in 1918 172
Table 3-2 Types of vocal classes and the number of students in Hansŏng Kwŏnbŏn in 1918 174
Table 3-3 Timetable of the P'yŏngyang kisaeng school during the Japanese colonization 175
Table 3-4  The number of students in traditional music and Western music at Seoul National University 178
Table 3-5  Performance order of today's kagok 182
Table 3-6  The symbols of three main sikimsae by four different kagok singers 186
Table 3-7  Musical background of the students in the survey 195
Table 3-8  The degree of making sondongjak with confidence in kagok class 196
Table 3-9  Duration of familiarity of chŏngganbo notation 198
Table 3-10  The degree of convenience of the vertical reading style of chŏngganbo 198
Table 3-11  Main resource of kagok learning during the class 199
Table 3-12  The degree of understanding of chŏngganbo notation in the survey 203
Table 4-1  The hand gesture for Ādi tāla 208
Table 4-2  The symbols of the rhythmic cycle 216
Table 5-1  Comparison of melody structure of five kagok songs in ujo mode 301
Table 7-1  NIKN tests for effectiveness 366
Table 7-2  The procedure of the 3rd draft of the NIKN test at the KNUE 369
Table 7-3  The series of five weeks tests for the NIKN in the MUSI 251 377
Table 7-4  Comparison of the results of seven practical questions 381
Table 7-5  Satisfaction with the notation in terms of its effectiveness 382
Table 7-6  The results of the seven practical questions in the test 393
Table 7-7  Satisfaction with the NIKN in terms of its effectiveness 394

List of Plates

Plate 1-1  Huwŏn yuyŏn (After Garden Party) in the eighteenth century : female kagok singing accompanied by kŏmun'go 35
Plate 1-2  Cho Soon-ja and Yi Chu-hwan at Kungnip Kugakwŏn in 1965 35
Plate 1-3  Kim Wol-ha and Kim Kyŏng-bae with full kagok ensemble 36
Plate 1-4  Miindo (the beautiful woman) in 1798 by Sin Yun-bok 41
Plate 1-5  Chosŏn yŏinŭ siksa (Women's supper in the late Chosŏn dynasty) painted in 1902 by De Lanetgierre 45
Plate 1-6  Orchid painting 74
Plate 1-7  Salp'uri dance 77
Plate 1-8  Yi Chu-hwan and Cho Soon-ja at a recital in Japan in 1964 84
Plate 1-9  Woman with changot in 1990s 85
Plate 1-10  Cho Soon-ja and Kim Kyŏng-bae at a recital in 1984 86
| Plate 2-1 | *Pumyŏnnyu yŏnhoedo* in the eighteenth century | 106 |
| Plate 2-2 | Little *kisaeng* with *kŏmun’go* | 117 |
| Plate 2-3 | *Kisaeng* wearing *Ch’unaengjŏn* costume in 1929 | 117 |
| Plate 2-4 | The first visit of Korean traditional music performers to Japan in 1964 | 132 |
| Plate 2-5 | *Kagok* performance with Hong Wŏn-gi in 1983 | 133 |
| Plate 2-6 | Historical *Kagok* Myŏngin’s Records | 138 |
| Plate 3-1 | *Sŏdanger* (Village classroom) by Kim Hong-do in the eighteenth century | 161 |
| Plate 3-2 | *Kisaeng*’s music class with *changgo* and *kŏmun’go* from *Kisandoch’ŏp* – a collection of paintings by Kim Chun-gŭn | 163 |
| Plate 3-3 | The two young *kisaeng* and a Japanese general in 1910s | 173 |
| Plate 3-4 | Korean Traditional Music Orchestra and female chorus in 1973 | 180 |
| Plate 3-5 | *Kagok* performance of Kim Wŏl-ha and her students in 1983 | 180 |
| Plate 3-6 | Beginner *kagok* students singing with *Taemaru* | 187 |
| Plate 4-1 | Aku Tongmi singing the Bhutanese National Anthem with hand gestures | 209 |
| Plate 4-2 | The author’s first *kagok* lesson in 1996 | 210 |
| Plate 4-3 | *Kagok* Students making *songdongjak* at the KNUE | 211 |
| Plate 4-4 | *Kagok* singer’s singing without & with *sondongjak* | 213 |
| Plate 4-5 | A short rest sign | 233 |
| Plate 4-6 | A phrase end sign | 233 |
| Plate 4-7 | Kim Yŏng-gi’s preparation of the rest beat | 239 |
| Plate 4-8 | Different shapes of *sondongjak* between Cho Soon-ja and Kim Yŏng-gi | 251 |
| Plate 4-9 | The same hand shapes of Kim Chŏng-ja and Choe Su-ok | 253 |
ABSTRACT

Aspects of the Korean traditional vocal genre, ‘kagok’: female kagok and the call for a New Integrative Kagok Notation.

Kagok is a genre of highly refined, traditional, Korean, vocal music, which is now endangered and marginalized in contemporary Korean culture. Female kagok singers (kisaeng) have also been ignored in Korean music society. The aim of this study is to preserve and revitalize kagok, in order to conserve its true nature in a contemporary context, and for the future. This thesis is twofold. The first part shows how the aesthetics of the Chosŏn dynasty are fundamental to kagok’s history, and female kagok singers’ education. Furthermore, existing kagok scores, written in traditional chŏngganbo notation or in Western staff notation, are examined in this part, and they reveal the need for the creation of a new kagok notation. The second part of the thesis concerns the creation and testing of the New Integrative Kagok Notation (NIKN), which combines the essentials of chŏngganbo and Western staff notation, and provides a more effective vehicle for the transmission, transcription and recording of this art form, particularly for inexperienced, contemporary students.
Acknowledgements

During my Ph.D study I was supported by many different grants, most notably a University of Canterbury Doctoral Scholarship, an ASIA 2000 Foundation grant to carry out fieldwork in Korea, a Prize given by the National Center for Korean Traditional Performing Arts, one of six presenter’s travel grants of the International Conference on Korean Musicology in Commemoration of the 60th Anniversary of National Independence, and University of Canterbury School of Music funds for conference travel. I am most grateful for these. I have also been stimulated by generations of students and by teachers, and encouraged by my family, who participated in all stages of the research.

I would firstly, and especially, like to thank Cho Soon-ja, with whom I spent many valuable hours learning to sing kagok and absorbing knowledge about it. She offered me invaluable resources and advice for both my scholarly and creative work, and so promptly replied to my many requests for information. I was very privileged to meet and interview Kim Chŏng-ja, Muk Kye-wŏl, Kwŏn Il-ji, Kim Ch’ŏn-hŭng, Yi Yang-gyo and Kim Ho-sŏng. I thank them for sharing their long and valuable careers with me. I would also like to thank other kagok musicians who helped me in this study by performing for me: Choe Su-ok, Kim Yŏng-gi, and Lee Jun-a.

I would like to thank my supervisor, Elaine Dobson, who read drafts of this dissertation and made invaluable suggestions. She also showed me how to make my English prose clearer. Elaine Dobson, Park Mi-kyung, Chun Inpyong and Song Bang-song and one anonymous reviewers also offered insightful criticism.
The delight of this research has been sharing it and views, with colleagues. I am most grateful to the students of the School of Music at the University of Canterbury and the Korean National University of Education for their willingness to participate in the testing of the effectiveness of the various notations.

This dissertation has grown out of years of research, thought and conversation with friends and my family. Both my friends Chu Chi-ung my computer programmer and Terence who has always, cheerfully encouraged me.

To my family, especially my husband Jason, my children Susie and James, my mother and my father I give you my warmest thanks for always being there for me and encouraging me.
Note on Orthography

This study follows the rules of the McCune-Reischauer system of Romanization of the Korean language. This system is described as follows.

McCune-Reischauer Romanization System for Korean Language

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vowels</th>
<th>Roman</th>
<th>Consonant</th>
<th>Initial</th>
<th>Medial</th>
<th>Final</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ᵁ</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>r</td>
<td>k</td>
<td>k, g (between vowels and after m, n, ng, l), ng (before m, n, l)</td>
<td>k</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ᵁ</td>
<td>ya</td>
<td>l</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>n, l (when preceded or followed by l)</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ᵁ</td>
<td>o</td>
<td>t</td>
<td>t</td>
<td>t, d (between vowels and after m, n, ng)</td>
<td>t</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ᵁ</td>
<td>yŏ</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>r (between vowels), l (before all other consonants and after n, l), n (after other consonants)</td>
<td>l</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ᵁ</td>
<td>o</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>m</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ᵁ</td>
<td>yo</td>
<td>t</td>
<td>p</td>
<td>b (between vowels and after m, n, ng, l), m (before m, n, l), p (before and after all other consonants)</td>
<td>p</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ᵁ</td>
<td>u</td>
<td>s, sh (before wi)</td>
<td>s, sh (before wi), t</td>
<td>t</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

1 n.a. “McCune-Reischauer system of Romanization of the Korean language.”
In Korea, it is stipulated that the ‘new’ romanization system, which was introduced by the Korean government in 2001, must be adopted in all publications. However, most scholars of Korean Studies, regardless of discipline, refuse to use this system and are still using the McCune-Reischauer system. It was also decided, at the Fourth Conference of Korean Studies Association of Australasia, by Korean studies librarians, to keep the McCune-Reischauer system. Therefore, in this thesis the McCune-Reischauer system is adhered to.

---

Using the McCune-Reischauer system, Korean names are presented with the family name first. Korean given names are usually made up of two syllables, presented with hyphenation between the two, and the first syllable is given with a capital letter and the second syllable in lower case. Names of Korean scholars are not always written in McCune-Reischauer system. Some people prefer their names to be written according to how they are spelt, because this is a more effective way of sourcing their works e.g., in a library. Consequently, throughout this thesis the following people will not have their names written according to the McCune-Reischauer system: Chae Hyun-kyung, Chun Inpyong, Cho Soon-ja, Hwang Byung-ki, Lee Hye-ku, Lee Jun-a, Park Mi-kyung and Song Bang-song.

For Chinese terms, the Pinyin Romanization system is used in this study. The Korean script is not used except in the glossary for reference.

The Chinese script for Korean words has not been used except for the words kagok, yeak sasang and Mannyŏn changhwanjigok in the first chapter, because the origin of these words is discussed at that point.
Introduction

*Kagok* is a highly regarded vocal genre of Korean traditional music. Its performance has been enjoyed for over four hundred years in Korea and it is still performed today. However, it is endangered and marginalized in contemporary Korean music culture and it has not been fully introduced to the English-speaking world, except through Coralie Rockwell’s research, which contains many inaccuracies and omissions.\(^1\) Although research into *kagok* exists in the Korean language, it is largely historical and emphasises male *kagok* while ignoring the female *kagok* singers (*kisaeng*). *Kisaeng* was the only female group who were allowed to be involved in musical and artistic pursuits during the Chosŏn dynasty (1392-1910).

Until Ha Kyu-il created his mensural notation, known as *chŏngganbo*, for *kagok* singers in the early twentieth century, *kagok* was taught by rote. *Chŏngganbo* notation is still used today but it is unfamiliar and has many disadvantages for Koreans and non-Koreans alike. As a consequence, it is very common for musicologists to transcribe Korean traditional music, including *kagok*, into Western staff notation, but this, too, has disadvantages. These transcriptions give a distorted view of Korean music and especially the aesthetics of *kagok*.

---

In order to address these shortcomings and to preserve the true nature of kagok in a contemporary context, and for the future, this thesis aims to show how the aesthetics of the Chosŏn dynasty are fundamental to kagok, and to create a new kagok notation which combines the essentials of the two different notations: chŏngganbo and Western staff notation.

1. Defining kagok.

In contemporary Korea, there are two quite different types of vocal genres and both have the same Sino-Korean name of kagok (歌曲). The first kagok genre is a type of traditional song cycle accompanied by a chamber ensemble, in which the poems (sijo), are related melodically but not textually.\(^2\) This kagok used to be called Mannyŏn changhwanjigok (萬年長歡之曲) which can be translated ‘Songs of ten-thousand-years of joy.’ Kagok was sung by kisaeng and the male literati (sŏnbî) at private parties (p’ungnyubang) in the Chosŏn dynasty (1340-1910). During the parties, literati composed poems (sijo) on kagok’s texts. They sometimes sang them, otherwise, professional kagok singers (kagaek) and professional male musical instrumentalists (yulgaek) were invited and gave performances.

The second kagok genre encompasses songs written since Pongsŏnhwa (Balsam Flower). Most Koreans recognize these latter, diatonic style songs as kagok. Robert Provine describes these songs as follows.

The first work of this genre [Western style lyric song] is thought to be Pongsonhwa (‘Balsam Flower’) by Hong Nanp’a (1900-40), and many hundreds of such songs have been written since then, becoming a staple of radio and television. The style of this lyric kagok is entirely Western, employing orchestra and a purely diatonic, conservative harmony, combined with Korean words; many Koreans feel, however, that kagok expresses deeply Korean sentiments and that this is a very Korean form of music.4

2. The Current Status of Kagok

Western style, diatonic kagok, is a popular Korean vocal form while traditional kagok songs are currently disappearing from Korean culture, to the extent that they are now preserved as one of Korea’s national treasures. Even the opportunity to learn traditional kagok is very limited, although other traditional folk genres and instrumental music have become popularized.

---

A good example occurred when the author visited the *kagok* classes at the Seoul Traditional Arts High School in Seoul, Korea. Most *kagok* students had not learnt *kagok* before, but they had already learnt Korean operatic form (*p’ansori*) or other traditional instruments, especially a twelve string zither (*kayagŭm*). The main reason for choosing *kagok* as their major, was that *kagok* was not such a competitive genre for entry into universities, although the maximum number of new *kagok* students is one or two a year in any university which offers traditional music. Consequently, *kagok* courses are also marginalized at tertiary level. Hence, in Korea, there are only two full-time *kagok* lecturers (one of them is Kim Kyŏng-bae, the male Human Cultural Property of *Kagok*), among over one hundred, full time lecturers in the Korean traditional music departments at universities in Korea. Coralie Rockwell as early as 1974, described the vulnerability of *kagok*.

Unfortunately, as I have already shown, it is becoming more difficult every decade in Korea to find traditional performers and teachers of the highest calibre. With the death of the famous *kagok* singer and compiler of *sijo* and *kagok* notation books, Mr. Yi Chu-hwan [Lee Chu-hwan], a great gap has occurred both in the study and performance of the *kagok* repertoire. . . . Although the Music College of Seoul National University includes *kagok* in its curriculum, it is only studied for four hours each week (two hours for vocal instruction and two hours for instrumental ensemble) in the final year of the undergraduate degree course. There is no
provision for kagok, sijo, kasa, or kayagŭm-pyŏngch’ang or p’ansori to be studied as a major subject for the degree.⁵

The above shows how the global industrial culture has produced major changes in the world of music through the introduction of Western music and musical thought since the nineteenth century. From the perspective of the traditional classical performing arts, the decline of kagok has been the result of Westernization and modernization of society and culture.

3. The Current State of Research into Kagok

Despite diminishing kagok performances, kagok is a popular research subject among Korean musical society. It is not hard to find articles about kagok in Korean music journals. The main reason is that kagok more than any other musical genre in Korea, is found in many historical sources including manuscripts and anthologies. However, the author addresses two main problems in the current research on kagok:

a) Narrow research topics focusing on an historical approach using old manuscripts.

b) Unreadable transcriptions of kagok into Western staff notation.

a) Narrow research topics focusing on an historical approach using old manuscripts.

Keith Howard pointed out the current research trends in Korean traditional music:

“In the West, and following Thomas Kuhn, history is little more than an interpretation of the past for the present. Koreans, in contrast, and in so far as I as an outsider can see, feel intimately connected to their ancestors. Reflecting this, the dominant approach to musical scholarship emphasizes a historical and literary tradition.”

*Kagok* is typical of this trend. A great deal of writing on *kagok* by Koreans, written in Korean language, has been about historical aspects of *kagok* such as the interpretation and comparison of old manuscripts and interrelationship between pieces. These trends have been analyzed by Park Hyŏn-ji: “In my research approximately one hundred-thirty works have studied *kagok* research . . . . Approximately seventy percent of theses on *kagok* consist of analysis of old manuscripts of the accompanying instrument, *kŏmun’go* related to *kagok*’s history. The other thirty percent are related to categorizing vocal techniques and professional *kagok* singers (*kagaek*).”

Only three articles are found about a case study of *kagok* for beginners.

---


------. “Kungmin Hakkyo Esŏt’i Chŏnt’ong Kagok Kach’ang Chido” [Case study of kagok teaching in primary
This kind of historical research does not directly help to encourage Koreans to enjoy *kagok*. Korean ethnomusicologist, Park Mi-kyung has criticized the current trends of *kagok* research and also insists on more practical ways of researching *kagok*: “Do not interpret *kagok* any more with complicated and unreadable Western transcriptions from the old manuscripts. It does not reflect *sikimsae* and ornamentation, properly, which are considered the most characteristic aspects of Korean traditional music. . . The current research is not helpful for revitalizing *kagok* today. In order to popularize *kagok* today, contextual studies, more practical research and creative research methodologies are urgently demanded.”

It is extremely difficult to find articles about the creation of new teaching methods for *kagok*, new systems of *kagok* notation or previous or present day *kagok* singing styles. It is, therefore, an unavoidable and essential task that research topics and methods in *kagok* studies should be extended to include more practical and productive ways of preserving and revitalizing *kagok*.

b) **Unreadable transcriptions of *kagok* into Western staff notation.**

---


9 Park Mi-kyung. “*Kagok: Hyŏndaeh Norae changriroso Chaeinsikŭl Wihan Siron*” [The opinions on popularization of *kagok* as a today’s song]. *Han’guk ŭimaksa hakpo* 22 (1999b) : 19-42.
Many Korean traditional music scholars transcribed *kagok*, from that written in *chŏngganbo* notation, into Western staff notation in order to explain *kagok* to Koreans and foreigners alike. However, most *kagok* staff notation did not reflect *kagok* sound properly. For example, Robert Provine pointed out: “the Korean teacher and student are able to ignore many presumptions inherent in the Western use of staff notation, and the notation can be an effective means of teaching and learning. The problem arises when a Westerner tries, via notation, to understand something about Korean music, or vice versa, since the sets of presumptions come into conflict.”

The problem of using Western staff notation for *kagok* affects not only a Westerner but also today’s Korean students who were taught music in the modern musical curriculum. When Korean students try to learn *kagok* with either *chŏngganbo* notation or Western staff notation, both notations appear difficult to read and are non-effective. This notational problem exacerbates *kagok*’s vulnerable situation today.

4. Structure

There are three parts to this thesis. Part I (Chapters 1 - 4) shows how the aesthetics of the Chosŏn dynasty are fundamental to *kagok*’s history, and female *kagok*.

---

singers’ education. Furthermore, existing kagok scores, written in traditional chŏgganbo notation or in Western staff notation, are examined in this part, and they reveal the need for the creation of a new kagok notation. Part II (Chapters 5 - 7) of the thesis concerns the creation and testing of the New Integrative Kagok Notation (NIKN), which combines the essentials of chŏngganbo and Western staff notation, and provides a more effective vehicle for the transmission, transcription and recording of this art form, particularly for inexperienced, contemporary students.

Part III is the final result of the NIKN presented as a score of the first suite (han pat’ang) and is intended for practical use.

In order to describe this long-lasting vocal form, associated with its social and cultural context, a chronological approach is necessary and three areas are defined a) Kagok as tradition, b) Kagok as a contemporary vocal form and c) Kagok as a future legacy. Part I encompasses a) and most of b). Part II is concerned mainly with c) because of its relevance to the creation of a new notation.

a) **Kagok as tradition**

One questions why many scholars value kagok so much, why kagok song was created in certain structures, timbres, and style, why kagok performances have a
particular order and manner and why kagok singers sing about themes of longing and sadness. These questions arise when kagok is analyzed in the social context of the Chosŏn dynasty. An analysis of kagok sound itself does not reveal the answers clearly.

Chapter 1 answers the above questions by revealing kagok’s aesthetics and values, its inherent musical form and its relationship to the ideology of the Chosŏn dynasty. Chapter 2 focuses on kagok as the expression of the singer’s thought and belief. It reveals who sang kagok, why kagok was sung and when it was created. Here, it is necessary to introduce female kagok singers, composers and audiences. There is limited research on kisaeng, so a kisaeng’s life and social system will be also illustrated. In addition, the history of female kagok will be examined through a study of interdisciplinary works musical resources and Korean, traditional, literature scholars’ work.

b) Kagok as a contemporary vocal form

While the first two chapters (chapter 1 and 2) illustrate the Chosŏn dynasty’s society and culture of kagok, the following three chapters, describe kagok as a contemporary vocal genre and a rapidly changing one. These chapters examine why kagok today is performed in different ways from the past, why kagok is marginalized
from contemporary Korean society and why *kagok* is taught and translated in certain ways.

Chapter 3 explains *kagok’s* unique traditional teaching styles, mainly within *kisaeng* schools and in an oral and aural tradition. In addition the situation of the contemporary *kagok* education system is observed and problems that have arisen in *kagok* education are seen to reflect the need to create the new notational system.

Chapter 4 is focused on *kagok’s* unique teaching method, hand gestures (*sondongjak*), which is disappearing in *kagok* classes today. Revealing the value of these unique hand signs will help prevent them from disappearing.

In part II, chapter 5 aims to show the extent to which *kagok* is distorted in Western staff notation that is commonly used in teaching, analysis and composition. In order to do this, six *kagok* transcriptions in Western staff notation will be assessed in terms of notational mistakes and the degree to which the notation reflects the true *kagok* sound.

c) **Kagok as a future legacy**

In order to make *kagok* a future legacy two principle questions arise: “which is the more effective method of learning *kagok*?” “How effectively *kagok* will be taught?” The answers to these questions resulted in the creation of the NIKN (New Integrative
Kagok Notation) by the author. Chapter 6 aims, firstly, to recognize the degree to which the traditional notation, chŏngganbo, is understood in classes today and secondly, to examine the merits and demerits of chŏngganbo notation. Thirdly, the process of the NIKN’s creation, from the first draft to the final draft, is presented. In the final chapter, the NIKN’s case studies are described, showing their effectiveness for teaching today’s students.

5. Methodology

In recent years, one of the new trends of ethnomusicology is the study of change, by revisiting or following up field work and creating a record of change. For example, Helen Rees’ *Echoes of History: Naxi Music in Modern China* (2000), Brita R. Neimark’s *Balinese discourses on music and modernization* (2003) and Anthony Seeger’s *Why Suyá Sing* (2004) illustrate this.11 This trend has influenced Korean traditional music research: *Samulnori* by Keith Howard (1998) and Nathan Hesselink

---

In this thesis the changes which have taken place in kagok will be described according to the author’s personal interactive process of kagok making, including fieldwork undertaken in 2001 and 2005. There have been considerable changes to kagok during the ten years since the author first learnt kagok (1996) to the creation of the NIKN (2006). The changes occurred not only to kagok music itself but also to the social circumstances surrounding it. These changes will be analyzed according to John Blacking’s premise “it is a discipline that holds out hope for a deeper understanding of all music. If some music can be analyzed and understood as tonal expressions of human experience in the context of different kinds of social and cultural organization, I see no reason why all music should not be analyzed in the same way.” Because there has been considerable emphasis on the historical aspect of kagok and comparative research

Hesselink, N. “Samul nori as Traditional Preservation and Innovation in a South Korean Contemporary Percussion Genre.” Ethnomusicology 48. 3 (2004 b) : 405-444.

between old manuscripts, this thesis will concentrate on *kagok* in the twentieth and twenty-first centuries.

This ethnographical approach to *kagok* requires more practical and experimental research than a theoretical, historical or scientific one. It also follows the new perspective of ethnomusicology; “The shift in ethnomusicological method from a modern-era science paradigm toward more experimental forms of fieldwork is in part a response to changing world orders that challenge the superiority of Western worldviews.”

To understand the reality of *kagok*’s status in Korea today, and *kisaeng*, the four most renowned *kagok* singers were asked to participate in this study and five Korean scholars were interviewed. To collect tangible information about *kisaeng*, considerable time was spent by visiting museums, libraries and research foundations. The outcome was not very satisfactory because of the paucity of material on them. Then a Korean folklorist, Yi Po-hyŏng, introduced two old ladies, reputed to be *kisaeng*, to the author, for this study. The *kisaeng* denied being such and recommended that the author visit further people, who in turn introduced more contacts. The outcome of these interviews

---

was much more productive.\textsuperscript{15} It is obvious that observation and recording of \textit{kagok} classes and interviewing many different levels of \textit{kagok} students are keys to examining the difficult aspects of \textit{kagok} learning. Therefore, all levels of \textit{kagok} lessons, at a high school of traditional music and universities, were observed and sixty-one students were surveyed. Also sixty students in New Zealand and Korea were involved in five different classes for testing the efficiency of the NIKN. In order to get the more accurate result of the efficiency of the NIKN, the NIKN should be tested as many times as possible. The author believes that the musical backgrounds of New Zealand students and Korean students are similar to each other. Both of them are all Westernized and have not had the chance to sing songs with \textit{chŏngganbo} notation. During these tests, pedagogical method, constant self-assessment and feedback were required, both at the time of the classes and in each test session.

6. Sources

a) Primary Resources

There are four different types of primary resource material used: audio materials, video materials, manuscripts and published scores, which were collected during the

\textsuperscript{15} As is the expected tradition in Korea, the author always had to prepare a small gift (because I had come from New Zealand this was a New Zealand calendar or a bottle of honey) for an interviewee for their information.
author’s fieldwork in 1996, 2001 and 2005. Among these the most valuable resources are twenty audio tapes of the author’s kagok lessons with Cho Soon-ja, which reflect not only Cho’s forty years experience of kagok but also contain the discourse among Park Mi-kyung, Cho Soon-ja and the author. The video records of four different kagok singers (Cho Soon-ja, Kim Yŏng-gi, Choe Su-ok and Lee Jun-a) singing with hand signs, are extremely valuable evidence of how kagok was transmitted in different ways. These singers learnt kagok from three different teachers and provide a good comparison of singing style.

To research female kagok singers, ‘kisaeng’ and traditional kagok education, interviews with kagok singers, and people related to Korean traditional music were essential. The demography (Korean name and sex/age in 2001/ and their title) of these people follows:

1. Cho Soon-ja (f / 57 / the Human Cultural Property of Kagok)
2. Ch’oe Su-ok (f / 57 / Kagok lecturer at Seoul National University)
3. Kim Ch’ŏn-hŭng (m / 92 / the oldest traditional musician and dancer as the Human Cultural Property of Chŏngjaemu [classical court dance])
4. Kim Chŏng-ja (f / 58 / Professor of Seoul National University )
5. Kim Yŏng-gi (f / 43 / the Human Cultural Property of Kagok)
6. Lee Jun-a (f / 38 / Principal female singer in the National Centre for Korean Traditional Performing Arts)
7. Yi Yang-gyo (m / 74 / the Human Cultural Property of Kasa)
8. Yi Tong-gyu ( m / 57 / Principal male singer in the National Centre for Korean

---

16 See the Appendix 1, 449.
Traditional Performing Arts)

9. Muk Kye-wŏl (f / 82 / Human Cultural Property of Folk Song of Kyŏnggi province)

Needless to say, Cho Soon-ja’s kagok experiences, while learning from Yi Chu-hwan, Hong Wŏn-gi (1910-1992) and Yi Nan-hyang (1913-1986), were very informative. Similarly Kim Chŏng-ja’s kagok experiences, while learning from Kim Wŏl-ha and Kim Chin-hyang (1917-1993), and Kim Yŏng-gi’s experience while learning from Kim Wŏl-ha, were focused on in their interviews, in order to describe the traditional ways of kagok teaching.

The extant, available kagok manuscripts for singing can be divided into two different types: a) manuscripts in chŏngganbo and b) transcriptions into Western staff notation. All kagok scores in chŏngganbo are edited from Ha Kyu-il’s manuscripts. On the cover of the scores a small-size, Chinese character, ‘編’, or a Korean character, ‘엮음’, denotes an ‘edited book.’ As editors, professional kagok singers easily published their own kagok scores in their hand writing. Yi Chu-hwan (1959), Kim Ki-su (1980), Hong Wŏn-gi (1981), Kim Chŏng-ja and Ch’oe Su-ok (1993), and Cho Soon-ja (2004) published edited, kagok scores. The difference and similarities between the notations in these scores will be examined in the Chapter 3.
The translated *kagok* songs in Western staff notation were published by Chang Sa-hun for the first time in the 1930s, and Kim Ki-su’s contributions in transcription are considerable, such as *Eighty-eight Female Kagok Pieces* (*Yŏch’angkagok yŏdŭnyŏdŏllip*) and *Korean Music: Kagok* (*Han’guk Ŭmak: Kagok*). In addition, Kim Ki-su published a *kagok* work book, *Taemaru 108·66 (Kim Ki-su’s 108 and 66 Short Songs)* that was designed for beginners to adjust to the *chŏngganbo* system. Regardless of whether the score is in *chŏngganbo* or staff notation, these collections show why it is essential for a new notation to be created in this study. *Chŏngganbo* and staff notation are not effective for today’s students. Chapter 6 and 7 show the creation and testing of the new notation which addresses these problems.

b) Secondary Resources

Howard’s significant number of publications on ethnographic works and Korean music are valuable resources for this study. His excellent scholarship and deeper insight on Korean music guided the author to explore methodologies and principles of Korean music. The two volumes of his recent publication, *Preserving* 

---

19 The list of his works on Korean music can be seen on the website of [http://mercury.soas.ac.uk/users/kh/publications.htm](http://mercury.soas.ac.uk/users/kh/publications.htm).
Korean Music: Intangible Cultural Properties as Icons of Identity, and Creating Korean Music: Tradition, Innovation and the Discourse of Identity are monumental works of excellent scholarship. The two volumes account for the preservation of Korean music by observing its past, contemporary and future, from an ethnomusicologist’s point of view and one who has shown a continuing enthusiasm for Korean music. Many primary sources are used to full advantage and amass a wealth of data. Howard then integrates all, giving a comprehensive picture of the environment in which Koreans lived and performed their music. His *Samul nori* research, in chapter 1, 2 and 3 of volume 2, gives further weight to his scholarship and understanding. This research is based on over twenty-five years of work in the area, and each volume includes a CD of representative examples of Korean music. These are invaluable guides for the exploration of Korean music from court to folk.

Any ethnographic study of *kagok* requires interdisciplinary work to explain various aspects of *kagok* and its links with culture and society. Korean literature scholars’ works are necessary for the deeper understanding of the texts of *kagok* and *sijo*.

---


Music education, music history, the science of singing, Korean history and traditional dance, women’s studies and even computer theory (for the new notation) are necessary adjuncts to support this study. Because kagok’s unique hand gestures, called sondongjak or hand signs, have roles similar to those of Western conducting, reference to conducting and psychology is important. In order to explain how these gestures affect kagok learning, a psychological and music educational approach is adopted. Furthermore, Western vocal techniques and sound production are also valuable in the analysis of kagok singing styles.

Various types of notation such as Japanese koto notation, Indonesian gamelan notations and African Time Unit Box System have to be considered when creating the NIKN. The history of koto notation is particularly helpful, because the traditional oral/aural teaching method requires many different types of notations, to be used by today’s students. The Koto: A Traditional Instrument in Contemporary Japan\textsuperscript{21} contains not only a wide variety of information on the koto itself, but also the various aspects of koto performance traditions based on Johnson’s experiences of learning koto with several different teachers in Japan. Particularly relevant is chapter 5 on the development of new koto notation. Over ten different notations were created on the basis of students’

musical levels and backgrounds. These ten notations show interconnectedness between notation, the performer and the music and as the musical background and educational circumstances of koto students or performers changed, a new notation was created or modified to fit the changes.

Anthony Seeger’s publication, Why Suyá sing? is also a suitable, ethnographical role model for this author’s study. As Seeger stated: “the ways the questions [in this book] are answered will suggest a methodology for ethnomusical study.” Seeger has researched the verbal arts of Suyá Indians of Mato Grosso in Brazil based on twenty-four months of field research. He explained the relationship of music and the broad social and cultural contexts of its performance with concrete examples of music. His logical organization of material, sufficiently disciplined thought processes, especially in the analysis, were catalysts for the explanation of the relationship of kagok sound and the Chosŏn dynasty’s social and cultural context. In addition, Seeger’s skill in documenting his fieldwork materials and recordings, through figures, tables and an accompanying CD, acted as an example for the arrangement of fieldwork outputs for this dissertation.

Korean scholars’ works by Song Bang-song, Kwŏn O-sŏng, Chun Inpyong, and Kwŏn To-hûi, on Chosŏn dynasty’s social and cultural context related to musical
changes, were valuable in observing kagok’s history and its singers’ lives. A young Korean scholar, Kwŏn To-hūi’s works, on folk musicians in the Chosŏn dynasty, were very informative and simulative for tracing out kagok’s history. Her Ph.D dissertation thoroughly introduced Chosŏn dynasty’s professional male and female singers and their accompanists’ musical activities.22

As has been mentioned, the only publication in English, dealing solely with the musical aspects of kagok itself, is Kagok: a traditional Korean vocal form (1972) by Coralie Rockwell. Although it is the reproduction of her Master of Arts thesis, it contains the history of kagok and an analysis of kagok’s musical structure within seven chapters. Most valuable parts are the kagok transcriptions into western staff notation from chŏngganbo by Yi Chu-hwan in the appendix. These will be examined in Chapter 5. To date this book has been the major reference in English for scholars studying kagok. However, in spite of the significant effort made to cover kagok in depth, the book has many shortcomings. Much of Rockwell’s text is correct, but the errors mean that we must exercise caution. Willem Adriaansz strongly criticized this work: “The present reviewer is firmly convinced that the author would have been better served if this book

---

had not been published, at least not in its present, unfinished, form. The responsibility for this misadventure is not only the author’s; the editor of the series in which this book appeared should have recognized the obvious shortcoming of the work, the publication of which should not have been allowed without through revision.”

The first critical mistake of this book is that the analysis of kagok’s musical structure was not related to sikimsae at all, but its modal structure was analyzed according to the diatonic chords I-IV-V progression. Sikimsae was described as simple, Western ornamentation by Rockwell.

The second mistake Rockwell made was in her vague explanation of tables and figures. In one example Rockwell, in order to visually present the singer’s dynamic and vibrato range, made a melogram, from a cassette tape, of Chi Hwa-ja’s kagok singing [Figure 17].

No pitch, partials, or duration reference points are shown, nor is the exact place, from which the examples are taken in the songs, indicated.

---

Rockwell analyzed the male and female voices from these incomplete melograms as follows:

A striking difference between the spectral graphs of the male and female voice was observed. While the male voice showed a more even
distribution of harmonic partials throughout the spectral range, emphasis on the lower partials was evident (see Figures 15 and 16). The female voice showed very prominent middle and upper partials that could be clearly distinguished from the lower band (see Figures 17 and 18). . . . The conclusion can be made that the male voice emphasizes lower partials and the female voice middle and upper partials.\textsuperscript{25}

The conclusion Rockwell came to is not supported by these melograms. Her conclusion relies on a generalization, that the pitch range of male \textit{Ch’osudaeyŏp} is much lower than that of female \textit{Isudaeyŏp} and the male voice is naturally one octave lower than the female voice. These two melograms are confusing because she omitted to indicate which parts of \textit{Isudaeyŏp} and \textit{Ch’osudaeyŏp} were tested and presented in the above melograms. Furthermore, a comparison between male \textit{Ch’osudaeyŏp} and female \textit{Isudaeyŏp} cannot give objective results. The melodic line of these two songs is quite different from each other. If a comparison was to have been made, the same song sung by a male and a female should have been analyzed. Then her object would have been achieved.

Thirdly, there are many mistakes in her hand written Chinese and Korean characters, which are unreadable and incorrect. This aspect was also criticized by Song

\textsuperscript{25} Rockwell. 1972: 43 and 48.
Bang-song. As can be seen in the following extracts for the book the Korean word for 중여음 is shown as 중여은 (p. 93) and kiho is shown killho (p. 32).

These mistakes were obviously caused by her limited experience of kagok; Rockwell did not undertake fieldwork in Korea for this book. Two, non-professional, Korean musicians, who lived in Los Angeles, were her main advisors and teachers for her study. In addition, the recordings of kagok songs which were analyzed in the melogram, had been given to Rockwell by Dr. Robert Garfias in 1966. These formed the extent of her primary source material for the book. It was only after the publication of this book that Rockwell carried out her fieldwork in Korea and produced a few articles in books and journals.

Published articles and books are critically important in providing information on kagok’s past and present. However, references or research about Ha Kyu-il (a compiler of today’s kagok repertoire) were extremely limited before Sŏn’ga Ha Kyu-il Sŏnsaeng Yakchŏn was published. There is no doubt that Ha Kyu-il is the compiler of today’s

29 Kim Chin-hyang. Ed. Sŏn’ga Ha Kyu-il Sŏnsaeng Yakchŏn [Memories of Kagok Singer, Sŏn’ga Ha Kyu-il].
*kagok* repertoire. His adopted daughter, Kim Chin-hyang edited seven different scholars’ works for the book. This book describes not only Ha Kyu-il’s life as a *kagok* singer and teacher but also his *kagok* lesson notes (vocalization, breathing and teaching plans), and lists of his recordings. In addition, the introduction of other female *kagok* singers, and his *kagok* manuscripts and transcriptions of Kim Chin-hyang’s *kagok* singing, are also presented.

Considering the lack of resources on *kisaeng*, *Malhanŭn Kkot Kisaeng* surprisingly contains much information on their history from their origin to the *kisaeng* schools of the 1910s, and even today’s prostitutes. In addition, the explanations of *kisaeng* schools, including their timetable and school rules, are extremely valuable. However, the author Kawamura considered *kisaeng* to be mostly a prostitute group, rather than a group of cultural producers such as musicians, artists and literati. For example, the title of his preface is ‘*A show window in Wanwoldong*’, which depicts a modern prostitute’s house in a notorious street for prostitutes in Pusan. Even photos of street girls are shown at the end, and old pornographic paintings are introduced. He also mentions Japanese sex tourism during the Japanese colonialism (1910-1945). However, *kisaeng*’s contribution for the preservation of Korean traditional performing arts is not

---

appreciated at all. Yi Mun-yŏl, a journalist of Korean literature, criticized Kawamura’s distorted views on *kisaeng* in the review of the book in the beginning of the Korean edition. “Kawamura explained *kisaeng* together with today’s prostitutes, in the same line, and his observation, which shows a very narrow viewpoint, was that their roles have not changed since the origin of the *kisaeng* system in the Koryŏ dynasty. This distorted viewpoint was caused by the author’s limited background as Japanese and having been under Japanese colonialism.” The misconception of *kisaeng* has increased because of Japanese sex tourism, of the 1960s, the Japanese colonial rule and the Japanese ‘comfort women’ system of the Second World War. In spite of his distorted view, this book provided useful references for the research of *kisaeng*.

In spite of the brevity (five short pages), the article “A Few Thoughts on Western Music Notation in Korea”\(^{31}\) considers Western music notation in Korea. Provine explains how Western music notation in Korea is understood by Westerners and Koreans in different ways. One of his examples, Kim Ki-su’s *kagok* transcription, is a wake up call to Korean music scholars to recognize the notational problems of Korean traditional music. It is very rare to point out this problem by foreign scholars. Furthermore, it also encourages the Korean musicologist to reconsider how Korean

traditional music, including *kagok*, should be explained to a Westerner and today’s Korean.
CHAPTER 1

Aesthetics of Kagok:
The Integration of Music and Korean Culture

Introduction

Hearing female kagok ‘Pŏdürūn’ (the first song of the first suite of female kagok) for the first time is an experience not easily forgotten. One female singer sits with her right knee bent up in front of the chest and the left leg folded under the right. The hands are folded over each other on the raised knee. She sings in a soft lyric voice like the spring breeze, at times in tones extremely slow, sustained and melismatic, for approximately twelve minutes. The singer manipulates the vibration of her throat with long breath control, to explore the many possible variations of sound. However, her downcast eyes and head seldom move except for gradual, changing, lip movements throughout the song. The texts, twenty-four syllables of the short poem, are full of sadness, longing and waiting for her lover. In spite of her deep sadness, there are no moaning, shouting, piercing or rushing sounds. The overall flow of rhythm, dynamics and melody does not have dramatic or sudden changes but
is carefully balanced.

This traditional vocal genre, *kagok*, was considered the ‘apex of vocal literature’. Students learning *kagok* in the twentieth century are still taught that it has the ‘best sound’ and is superior to the other great vocal forms, *sijo* and *kasa*.\(^1\) In order to achieve a more complete understanding of the whole of *kagok*, an approach which integrates music with social attitudes, customs, and philosophy (ideology) in the Chosŏn dynasty is essential as Bruno Nettl pointed out it is “an understanding of music as a product of mankind.”\(^2\) If the social and cultural aspects of *kagok*-making are ignored and the study of *kagok* is limited to the sounds themselves, an illusion is created that *kagok* is an entity in itself and the essential, principal aesthetics of *kagok* can be overlooked.

The purpose of this chapter is to illustrate how musical aspects of *kagok* were integrated with social and cultural aspects of the Chosŏn dynasty. In addition, the aesthetics of *kagok* will be explained on the basis of neo-Confucianism (Confucianism), which was the national ideology of the Chosŏn dynasty.\(^3\) The following musical aspects

---
\(^1\) Rockwell. 1972: 42.
\(^3\) Neo-Confucianism is a reassertion and metaphysical transformation of Confucianism that developed in the Song-dynasty (960-1279) China. Orthodox Neo-Confucianism is represented by the teaching of Zhu Xi (1130-1200). However, neo-Confucianism also recognized the Confucian canon by giving priority to the Four Books over the Five Classics. Michael C. Kalton. “Neo-Confucianism.” *Encyclopedia of Asian History*. London: Collier Macmillan,
will be examined to meet this purpose: the ideology of the Chosŏn dynasty, kagok’s philosophy, vocal quality, vocalization, sikimsae, the performance position, texts and performance order.

1. 1. Philosophy of kagok: Yeak sasang (禮樂思想) and kagok ensemble

In Sejong sillok (Annals of King Sejong) [1418-50], the purpose of music for the literati in the Chosŏn dynasty was based on Confucianism: it was to cultivate human nature to the loftiness of sainthood by blending the spirit and men into one, to create a universe where heaven and earth are in one accord and a cosmos in which yang [representing the sun, male, right and day aspects] and yin [representing the moon, female, left and night aspects] exist in perfect balance. This musical belief was called ‘Ideology of rituals and music’ (Yeak sasang). It originated in China and was adopted by the Chosŏn dynasty to control the people. Ye is described well in the following two Confucian classic texts written in the Han dynasty (206 B.C -220 A.D):

1) Yegi [Record of Music Yuyeji (禮記) in Chinese]
2) Zhongyong [Doctrine of the Mean, Zhongyong (中庸) in Chinese]

---

These two texts explain the roles and value of music. The *Yegi* states:⁵

When the early rulers formed the Li [rituals] and Yue [music], their purpose was not to satisfy the mouth, stomach, ear, and eye, but rather to teach the people to moderate their likes and hates, and bring them back to the correct direction in life.” (*Yuyeji* 1934 ed: ch.1)

Music [Yue] is the highest expression of virtue (*Yuyeji* 1934 ed: ch.15)

The achievement of virtue [De] is the superior goal, the achievement of art [Yi], inferior. (*Yuyeji* 1934 ed: ch.11)

When moderate and easy-going music prevails, people tend to become healthy and contented. When rough, vigorous, exciting, and overwhelming music prevails, people tend to become militant and inflexible. (*Yuyeji* 1934 ed: ch.11, Dai trans.1962:20)

The concept of ‘perfect balance’ in *Sejong sillok* was also adopted from one of the Confucian classic texts ‘Zhongyong.’ It literally means “middle-common.”

The ultimate! These songs are straightforward, but not overbearing. They wind about but do not bend over. When pressing near, they do not crowd; when moving afar, they do not drift away. They move, but within bounds; they repeat but do not bring boredom. They make one be attentive but do not make one worrisome. They are enjoyable, but not in an uncontrolled fashion. They are useful, but not consuming; they are vast, but not shouting; giving but not wasting. They are taking without

---

hoarding, managing without smothering, forthcoming, but not dissipating.\textsuperscript{6}

As it was stated, the main function of early music was to promote moderate behaviour and contribute to a smooth functioning of the state. In addition, music was treated not as a sounding art but a broad ethical concept, which is called \textit{p’ungnyu ŭmak}. Hence, \textit{kagok’s} musical aspects fully adopted Confucianism, because \textit{kagok} was appreciated by the literati and \textit{kisaeng}. In order to achieve the goal of music’s ‘perfect balance,’ \textit{kagok} has been performed with an authentic musical ensemble. The accompanying instruments are as follows:

\begin{itemize}
  \item \textit{Kŏmun ‘go} (six-string plucked zither)
  \item \textit{Haegŭm} (two-stringed bowed lute)
  \item \textit{Taegŭm} (large transverse flute)
  \item \textit{Sep’iri (P’iri)} (double-reed oboe)
  \item \textit{Changgo} (double-headed hourglass-shaped drum)
  \item \textit{kayagŭm} (twelve-string zither)
\end{itemize}

\textit{Yanggŭm} (dulcimer) and \textit{tanso} (small vertical flute) can be added to the full ensemble.

Nowadays, it is hard to find a good \textit{kagok} accompanist, because opportunities for the performance and learning \textit{chŏngak} music are very limited. In contrast, it is popular to learn the folk genre ‘\textit{sanjo}’.\textsuperscript{7} In Korea, the importance of folksongs stemmed from the


\textsuperscript{7} Cho Soon-ja. personal interview. Masan, 29 May. 2001. Folk music can be defined as the “musical repertory and
notion of a shared oral heritage.\textsuperscript{8}

\textbf{[Plate 1-1: Huwŏn yuyŏn (After Garden Party) in the eighteenth century. female kagok singing accompanied by kŏmun’go ]}\textsuperscript{9}

\textbf{[Plate 1-2: Cho Soon-ja and Yi Chu-hwan at Kungnip Kugakwŏn in 1965. Left to right, kŏmun’go, haegŭm, taegŭm, sep’iri and changgo]}\textsuperscript{10}

\textsuperscript{8} Howard, Keith. 2006a: 81.


\textsuperscript{10} \url{www.chosoonja.org}. access. 4 Nov. 2006.
The most important instrument in the kagok ensemble is the kŏmun’go which provides the fundamental pitches for the singers. In tradition, the kŏmun’go was often used as an accompanying instrument rather than the ensemble in p’ungnyubang. Most male and female kagok singers were required to learn the kŏmun’go first. It is evident that the kŏmun’go is often seen in the old paintings of the Chosŏn dynasty. In [Plate 1-1] one female singer is singing in the authentic kagok posture and one literati is accompanying her with kŏmun’go.

The only percussion instrument in the kagok ensemble, changgo, plays the rhythmic cycles to maintain the rhythmic structure. Originally, it was the kagok singer who led the whole music performance, but the changgo players later became the leaders

---


of the ensemble controlling the beats. In a *kagok* class, *changgo* is the only instrument to accompany singers, otherwise, there is no instrument used. It is the *sep’iri, taegûm* and *haegûm*’s role to produce *sikimsae* or decorate the melody especially with upward gliding and downward gliding sounds. Similarly, the *sep’iri* play the vocal melody with *sikimsae*. However, the accompanying sound heterophonic, which creates the characteristic harmonic texture in Korean traditional music.

This heterophony can be seen in the following example. Here, the initial sixteen-beat phrase of the fifth section of *T’aep’yŏngga* (The last song of the *kagok* suite) shows the beauty of heterophony as it occurs in a *kagok* ensemble.

![Figure 1-1: The transcription of the fifth chang of T’aep’yŏngga by Sŏ Han-bŏm.](image)

---

13 Sŏ Han-bŏm. “Chŏnt’ong Kaake Nat’anan Han’gukinŭi Miûsik” [Aesthetics of Korean Traditional Songs].
As shown in the above transcription, the initial note is the same $b^\flat$ and then heterophony occurs between the voice and $taegüm$. While the $taegüm$ maintains a constant tone $b^\flat$, the $taegüm$ deviates to create musical tension by ornamenting the vocal line with pitches of shorter duration. Before all the sound of the instruments and the voice reach $e^\flat$ on the sixteenth beat as a temporal release, the accompanying instruments alternatively modify the voice melody according to different degrees of consonance and dissonance. The $p’iri$ and the voice are quite in unison except for a few beats. The $haegüm$ simultaneously reinforces the vocal line by ornamented and unornamented forms of the melody.

This heterophonic, accompanying ensemble creates a satisfactory resolution from the feeling of dissonance. Therefore, the phrase expresses well the aesthetic musical principle of variety within unity. Lee Kang-sook described this harmonic texture: “to understand harmonic texture in Korean music one should not think in a chordal sense, but in the literal sense.”14

---

1. 2. Vocal quality (Ŭmjil) and Confucianism

The Korean word ŭmjil (ŭm-sound jil-quality) refers to a singer’s timbre, dynamics and volume, which can be translated as vocal quality in English. The ŭmjil of female kagok is so clear, light and soft that the sound is peaceful, lyrical and thin in texture. It does not produce a soubrette or dramatic coloratura sound. These sounds are produced more orally than nasally. Hong Wŏn-gi, for example, did not allow either male or female kagok singers to make nasal sounds.¹⁵

In female kagok, timbre change appears very often between the chest sound and falsetto. The falsetto technique is used in only female kagok songs, which have the softer, lighter and brighter tone. The falsetto sound is produced above middle F in the vocal range; on higher notes, the head sound ensures singers sing more softly. Otherwise, the notes below middle F are produced by the chest.

The ‘flow’ of kagok singing was often described as being like a spring breeze, a green willow tree or the sleeves of a robe.¹⁶ All of these images express not artificial beauty but natural beauty and harmony. Consequently, female kagok requires neither the higher pitches of the soprano, nor a very low sound. The vocal range of kagok is not wide, around two octaves, which is a comfortable sound for kagok singers and

---

¹⁵ Hong Wŏn-gi. Nam yŏch’ang Kagok [Kagok Notation Book For Male and Female]. Seoul: Hongin, 1981. 23.
¹⁶ Sŏ Han-bŏm. 1985: 82.
audiences. The vocal range of female *kagok* is from *t'ae* (F) to *hwang* (e♭).

Within the above vocal range *kagok* is sung in two different modes: *Ujo-p'yŏngjo* and *ujo-kyemyŏnjo*. *Ujo-p'yŏngjo* is often called ‘*ujo*’ or ‘*p'yŏngjo*’ and *ujo-kyemyŏnjo* is often called ‘*kyemyŏnjo*’.¹⁷ Both modes are pentatonic scales in *kagok* although there are various types of three and four notes of *kyemyŏnjo* in folk music. The modal description of both types of modes depends on which notes are commonly used and which have the heaviest vibrato and cadence notes.¹⁸

1) *P’yŏngjo*

2) *Kyemyŏnjo*. ( ) means ‘rarely appeared note’

---

¹⁷ Chang Sa-hun. *Kugak Ch’ongnon*. Seoul: Segwang ūmak ch’ulp’ansa, 1985: 78. In this study *p’yŏngjo* and *kyemyŏnjo* are used.

In kyemyŏnjo, hwang e♭ very often appears with a wide vibrato sikimsae which rarely appears in p’yŏngjo. In addition, the range of the vibrato of kyemyŏnjo is much wider than p’yŏngjo. Consequently the timbre of kyemyŏnjo is slightly more coloratura than that of p’yŏngjo. The overall image of the kagok sound can be compared to the following painting.

[Plate 1-4: Miindo -The Beautiful Woman - in 1798 by Sin Yun-bok]¹⁹

Magnification of her face

¹⁹ Sin Yun-bok. (1758-unkown) was one of the most outstanding painters in the Chosŏn dynasty. Miindo is the most popular painting of his works.
The above painting *Miindo* exemplifies the ideal woman of the Chosŏn dynasty. During the Chosŏn dynasty, the overall image of the woman was ‘natural,’ ‘soft’ and ‘light.’ The ideal, beautiful, Korean woman had very thin, light eyebrows, a small mouth and slim and narrow shoulders. As can be seen, during the Chosŏn dynasty, the beautiful woman was neither active nor smiling. In the picture, her face is bent slightly down and her eyes are also downcast. This appearance corresponds to a *kagok* singer on the stage whose eyes are downcast with the head slightly bowed.

The image of the female *kagok* singer in the painting ‘*Miindo*’ is relevant to the vocal techniques of *kagok*, which are intended to produce soft and light sounds like ‘a spring breeze.’ In order to achieve the ideal *kagok* sound, *kagok* teachers often explain detailed methods. Cho Soon-ja often reveals that the singer’s mouth is never opened wide, and her lips always cover the teeth during *kagok* singing. The singer’s mouth gradually changes shape during her singing. This movement is able to prevent to produce the sound from the hard palate, because it requires the mouth to be wide open. Hong Won-gi also explains this technique in his female *kagok*...

---

20 Kim Chŏng-ja, professor at Seoul National University, agreed with the author’s opinion.
notation book. The strong sound of syllables such as ‘kka’, ‘ppa’ and ‘jja’ from the hard palate should be sung on the soft palate, sounding like ‘ga’, ‘pa’ and ‘ja’.

The gradual change of singer’s mouth technique affects the pronunciation of the diphthongs and double vowels in the text. They are sung by gradually separating the two vowels. For example, the word ‘toego’ should be sung as ‘to-i-go’ in the first section of the first song of the kagok han pat’ang and t’aep’yŏng is sung as t’a-ū-i-p’yŏ-ū-ŏ-ŏng in the first two syllables of t’aep’yŏngga.

The reason that the female sound is especially not strong and coloratura but soft and light, is again related to Zhongyong, ‘perfect balance.’ Confucian governments, as in the Chosŏn dynasty, emphatically inhibited extremes of behaviour. Women in the Chosŏn dynasty were meant to be passive and avoid behavioural extremes: they were not allowed to shout or make eye contact with older people and men. They were required to be calm. Even women’s footsteps should be silent. The following extract shows how Confucianism was firmly entrenched in women’s lives during that time.

According to Confucian morals, women could not stroll in their garden or venture out during the daytime except under certain conditions. Two of the conditions were receptions for royal visitors

22 Hong Wŏn-gi, 1981: 23.
or Chinese envoys, and welcomes or farewells for family members on trips. To see off and greet members of her family was an expression of affection and therefore could not be prevented. As a rule, women were allowed in the streets only at night, after the men were restricted to their homes by a 9 P.M. till 2 A.M. curfew. When she went outside the house, a woman had to veil her face. She was not to be seen by men who were not close relatives . . .

Considering such social conditions, it was not surprising that women’s social life in the Yi [Chosŏn] dynasty was limited to special groups and occasions. Most involved gatherings of neighbour women or relatives on special occasions such as the New Year festival, the Full Moon festival, and birthdays.  

In contrast, males in the Chosŏn dynasty were strongly encouraged not to be weak, light and passive but strong, brave and active. Hence, they never used falsetto techniques in singing but the chest sound was always used. Using the chest sound makes the singers sing with a louder voice, especially at a higher pitch. A strong and powerful sound can be produced from the chest resonance. The roles of men and women show a rigid distinction in the Chosŏn dynasty. A good example is the rule that males and females do not sit together, after they reached the age of seven. (Namyŏ ch’ilse pudongsŏk) This aimed to prevent personal contact between men and women outside marriage. In addition, family members even husband and wife did not have a meal together in the upper and middle classes; males had meals in

---


their room, each with portable dining tables, which were always served by female servants or wife. Females had meals together with only females.

[Plate1-5: Chosŏn yŏinŭ siksa (Women’s supper in the late Chosŏn dynasty) painted in 1902 by De Lanetgierre] 25

The above painting was painted by a foreigner in the late Chosŏn dynasty. The totally different dining custom from a Western country, probably looked strange for the foreign painter. It is natural that differing gender roles also affected the vocal style of music-making, in accordance with society’s expectation at that time.

As has been explained, the influence of Confucianism in Korea, especially during the Chosŏn dynasty, was similar to that of Christianity on Western countries. Confucianism was introduced in the fourth century, but it was not a major influential

25 De Lannetgierre. (French painter), from his collection of paintings Images from the Far East Asia 1903.
religion before the Chosŏn dynasty: “although Confucianism had not been central in earlier Korean society, during the Yi dynasty [the Chosŏn dynasty] Korea developed into what was undoubtedly the most Confucian (Neo-Confucian) society in East Asia.” 26 Even in Korea today, Confucianism still affects a Korean’s thoughts, behaviour and lifestyle. The Confucian ceremony of honoring teachers, ancestors and nature is held only in Korea and these rites have entirely vanished in China. Every second and eighth month of the lunar calendar, the rites, called Sŏkch’ŏnje, are still held as they have been for six hundred years, in memory of Confucius, at the University of Sŏnggyun’gwan in Seoul. During the ceremony, a dance ritual is performed by people dressed as court officials who offer wine and food to the altar of Confucius and are accompanied by traditional music ‘Munmyo Cheryeak.’

1. 3. Aesthetics of musical form

_Kagok’s_ well structured musical form is often acclaimed by Korean musicologists. Sŏng Kyŏng-nin stated that “No other vocal genre of classical song can be compared with _kagok_ in beauty of form, standardization of accompanying instrument, and wide

---

range of expressiveness.\textsuperscript{27} The text of kagok is the traditional, literary poetic genre ‘sijo.’ Confusingly, sijo has two different meanings today: 1) traditional, literary poetic genre ‘sijo’ 2) traditional short, lyric song. This poetic genre sijo is used in two traditional musical vocal genres, kagok and sijo, but both these genres are quite different from each other as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Text</th>
<th>Origin</th>
<th>Structure</th>
<th>Rhythmic Cycle</th>
<th>Accompaniment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Kagok</strong></td>
<td>sijo</td>
<td>16\textsuperscript{th} century</td>
<td>5 sections &amp; instrumental sections. (Intro. Interlude &amp; Concl.)</td>
<td>16 beats</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sijo</strong></td>
<td>sijo</td>
<td>18\textsuperscript{th} century</td>
<td>3 sections only</td>
<td>5 or 8 beats</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 1-1: Comparison between the two vocal genres: kagok and sijo]

Overall, kagok is more stylish and well structured than sijo although sijo is more widely popular than kagok among the older generations. Especially, kagok’s authentic

---


form is often appreciated by Korean traditional music scholars as ‘the most refined vocal genre amongst the classical songs’.²⁹

1.3.1. The musical structure

*Kagok* is highly stylized in terms of both its composition and its musical structure. The formal structure of one female *kagok* suite (*han pat’ang: han - one, pat’ang - suite*) comprises fifteen songs. Each song comprises five sections, called *chang*, with the addition of a possible instrumental introduction, interlude and conclusion. It is interesting that the conclusion also functions as the introduction to the next song. *Kagok*’s rhythmic structure can be described as cyclic and tiered. It is based on an overall rhythmic cycle tier, called *changdan*. The *changdan* is built up from rhythmic units called *taegang*, which are, in turn, built up from beats, called *pak*.

Section 1

[Figure 1-2: Transcription of p’yøngjo Isudaeyøp, Pødurün, by Kim Ki-su]³⁰

[Figure 1-3: Chŏngganbo transcription of p’yŏngjo Isudaeyŏp, Pŏdŭrn, by Kim Ki-su]

---

31 Kim Ki-su. 1980: 1. (forward)
Two different rhythmic cycles are found in kagok: the full rhythmic cycle (sixteen-beat changdan) and abbreviated rhythmic cycle (ten-beat changdan). Only p’yŏnsu taeyŏp (the fourteenth song of kagok han pat’ang) uses the abbreviated ten-beat rhythmic cycle.32

The rhythmic cycle is repeated within each section as is shown in Table 1-2. Note that the eleven beats shown in sections II, IV and the Conclusion are incomplete rhythmic cycles, which are completed by the five beats in the next section, i.e., section III, V and Introduction (to the next song) respectively. It is important to note that the end of the eleven beats in section II and IV includes four beats of rest, which help define the division between the sections.

The form of kagok is divided into two types according to textual setting and the length of musical sections. Ten out of fifteen songs in female han pat’ang are considered as authentic kagok songs (Isudaeyŏp, Chunggŏ, P’yŏnggŏ, Tugŏ in both modes, and Panyŏp and T’aep’yŏngga in a single each). The remaining five songs are

---
called modified *kagok* songs, because they have a special term in their title such as *nong, rak* or *p’yôn*. (*P’yŏngnong, Urak, Hwan’gyerak, Kyerak*, and *P’yŏnsudaeyŏp*).

The authentic form of *kagok* has a regular *sijo* (*p’yŏng sijo*) as a text and is sung in a slow tempo from one beat = 20 to one beat = 45 except for the transitional song from *p’yŏngjo* mode to *kyemyŏnjo* mode, *Panyŏp* (one beat = 80) with the predetermined, five sections plus three interludes, musical form. Each syllable of the *sijo* text is mostly assigned to the pre-determined beats in the five sections as it has been shown in [Figure 1-2] and [Figure 1-3]. The modified form was developed after the authentic form of *kagok*, in sections. The songs are sung in faster tempo from one beat = 50 to one beat = 75. The structure is the same as the authentic form but the third section is extended because of the extended number of syllables.

Compared with the authentic *kagok*, the modified *kagok* has more syllables, up to seventy-three (the multiple syllable *sijo* is called *sasŏl sijo*), but the structure and beats are the same as the authentic *kagok* except for the third section, which is usually extended to fifty-three beats [Table 1-2]. As more syllables are combined with the same beats of the authentic form in the faster tempo, the elaborated *sikimsae* such as upward-gliding or downward-gliding are rare. Consequently, the melodies of modified *kagok* are syllabic rather than melismetic.
The ten-beat rhythmic-patterned song, P’yŏnsudaeyŏp, has the longest texts (ninety-three syllables) in two-hundred and twenty beats as a modified kagok song. In addition, the tempo of the song is the fastest in kagok han pat’ang (seventy-five beats a minute) and the theme is about ‘flowers.’ Therefore, the song is the most rhythmic, melodic and cheerful in the whole suite. It can be considered the climax of the han pat’ang. The next song, T’aep’yŏngga, is in the authentic form, sung in a suddenly slower tempo, forty-five beats in a minute.

The following table shows the number of syllables (ŭmjŏl) and beats in each section of authentic kagok form and its modified form.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Musical Sections (Chang)</th>
<th>Number of syllables</th>
<th>Number of beats</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>authentic</td>
<td>modified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Introduction</strong>&lt;br&gt;(instrumental)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>I section</strong></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8 – 16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>II section</strong></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8 – 16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>III section</strong>&lt;br&gt;(Pre-climax)</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Interlude</strong>&lt;br&gt;(instrumental)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>IV section</strong>&lt;br&gt;(Climax)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>V section</strong></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Conclusion</strong>&lt;br&gt;(Instrumental)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>44</td>
<td>46 – 73</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 1-2: Number of syllables and beats in each section (chang) of authentic and modified kagok form]
As it can be seen, the length of each section change differs from sixteen beats to fifty-three, but this principle structure (the number of beats and syllables) is always the same, within the authentic kagok form. The first section of kagok consists of thirty-two beats (16+16) with seven syllables, starting on the first beat of the rhythmic cycle. The second section can be considered as the response to the first section with seven syllables within twenty-seven beats (16+11). The third section is longer than the other sections lasting thirty-seven (5+16+16) beats with fourteen syllables. From this section, the climax of the song is expected as higher notes, with ornamentation appear frequently. The cadence of the third section adds to the expectation of the climax, because it finishes with an ascending phrase.

After the third section, the interlude is played by accompanying instruments within the sixteen beats. The fourth section is considered as the climax of the song with twenty-seven beats (16+11). The first phrase of it consists of high pitches (c’ and e♭) and the longest phrase (ten beats) with join in only one breath. This fourth section is exactly the same, except for the tempo, in the four songs in the same mode [Figure 1-4]. The last section is the longest section comprising forty-eight beats (5+16+16+11). It releases the tension with a lower melodic line and after that, the conclusion follows.
The manuscripts are from the Yi Chu-hwan's Kagokpo. 1959. The coloured patterns are explained in p.55-58 and p.64-67.
1.3.2. The principle of word setting

Both authentic and modified forms of the *sijo* poem have three lines, but the numbers of syllables within them are different. The authentic form comprises forty-three to forty-five syllables and the modified *sijo* form has more syllables within each line (approximately seventy syllables to ninety-six syllables). The following shows the syllable numbers of the authentic *sijo* verse form and how the authentic *sijo* verse form is connected to the five sections of authentic *kagok* structure. (Each number denotes the number of syllables).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th><em>Sijo</em></th>
<th><em>Kagok</em></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Introduction</strong></td>
<td><strong>I section</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stanza one</td>
<td>3, 4</td>
<td>3, 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 or 4 4</td>
<td>II section</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stanza two</td>
<td>3, 4, 3 or 4 4</td>
<td>III section</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Interlude</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stanza three</td>
<td>3, 4, 3, 5</td>
<td>IV section</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>V section</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 1-3: Interrelationship of syllables in *sijo* poem and *kagok* structure]

The syllables in each section of *kagok* are linked with the rhythmic cycle and *taegang* (six groups of beats) structure. The *taegang* structure is strongly related to word setting. In *kagok’s* melismatic melodic structure, the words were also arranged according to this fixed *taegang* structure.
A new syllable is given mainly on the first beat (pak) of each rhythmic unit (taegang) i.e., the first, fourth, seventh, ninth, twelfth and fourteenth beat of the rhythmic cycle (changdan). These beats are accented. The figure 1-2 and 1-3 transcription is an example from p’yôngjo Isudaeyôp which shows how the syllables (úmjôl) and changdan, taegang and pak structure relate. The third, eighth, tenth and eleventh beats are not given any syllables throughout authentic kagok songs. The syllable’s sound, here, is sustained or there is a rest.

This phenomenon of word setting corresponds to the accent rule of the Korean language, which accents the first syllable of every word. In standard Korean language, there is no accent on the second or last syllable of words. Therefore, the first beat of each taegang is the strongest. The following figure shows the numbers of syllables related to this taegang structure in the authentic eight kagok songs.
(P : P’yŏngjo, K: Kyemyŏnjo)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>14</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>16</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table1-4: The number of different syllables on every beat of the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle]

1. 3. 3. Cadences

It is interesting that every cadence in each ending section of a kagok suite is the same. It equates with the rhyme of the poem. Thirteen chŏnggan [literally, square] occupy the cadential ending in the first section. It means that 40.7% (thirteen out of thirty-two) of the pitches and durations in each first section within one suite are the same. Only the tempo is different among them (note: in Tugŏ, the two notes in the eighth chŏnggan are omitted because of the faster tempo).
The above are the first cadential sections of the first four songs (Section I) of a kagok suite, notated in chŏngganbo (Korean mensural notation). This shows, perfectly, how the same phrase occurs at the cadences, which end each song in the p’yŏngjo mode. The repetition of the cadential phrase in the same mode can be compared with rhyming patterns (apun) of Western and Korean traditional poems (hansi), and originated from Chinese poems. The climax of each song (Section IV) is entirely the same in a few songs of one suite, although the texts are different. These all give stronger unity to a
The following shows the fixed cadential phrase of each section within one suite. These are repeated in the same position throughout one suite.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>I</th>
<th>II</th>
<th>III</th>
<th>V</th>
<th>I</th>
<th>II</th>
<th>III</th>
<th>V</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

[Figure 1-6: The cadential phrase of each section in the two modes]

---

These repeated cadential phrases often cause listeners recognition difficulty of distinguishing songs among one suite. In addition, as certain sikimsae patterns are also repeated many times through one song and between others. Interestingly, the climax of the song, the fourth section is the exactly identical in the same mode of the authentic kagok songs. The manuscripts in [Figure 1-4] and [Figure 1-7] show how similar they (the first song (Isudaeyŏp), the second song (P’yŏnggŏ), the third song (Chunggŏ) and the fourth song (Tugŏ) are in one suite.

1. 4. Sikimsae

Yi Sŏng-ch’ŏn pointed to sikimsae as the essence of traditional music. Yi Po-hyŏng also stated that research into sikimsae was a priority and urgent for Korean traditional music but research into sikimsae at the time was only beginning.

The meaning of sikimsae used today is more extensive and broad. When the characteristics of Korean traditional music were considered in the 1960s, ‘nonghyŏn’ was the most important aspect. The term ‘nonghyŏn’ originated from kŏmun’go technique, which means vibrating the strings of the kŏmun’go. However, the term sikimsae replaced it to cover all vibrato techniques of wind

instruments, vocal instruments and stringed instruments. Therefore, today the meaning of sikimsae is vague and broad.\textsuperscript{36}

1. 4. 1. Definition of sikimsae

The definition of sikimsae is still controversial today in spite of its common use. The term sikimsae is a compound word sikim and sae. Sikim literally means ‘fermentation,’ sae is ‘style.’ Sikim originated from ‘komsakta (fermented for a long time)’ or ‘sakida (ferment),’ which describes the fermenting of food to be made for different tastes.\textsuperscript{37} In this respect, sikimsae denotes a performer’s individual musical technique which depends on their musical experiences and ability. Before the 1960s, the term nonghyŏn was used for sikimsae. Even by 1970, Korean dictionaries and Korean music dictionaries did not contain the term ‘sikimsae.’ Definitions of sikimsae vary. The following quotations are from renowned musical scholars in Korean traditional music:


\textbf{Yi Sŏng-ch’ŏn:}

“Sikimsae is the domain of pitch movements after the first pitch is sung. The first pitch is the principal note and the rest of the movements within vibratos are the secondary notes. The literal


\textsuperscript{37} Cho Soon-ja. 1996: 5.
meaning of *sikimsae* is ‘digest then spit (vomit, dissolve)’. In other words, the first note lasts for a while, to be digested then the rest of the short notes with vibratos ‘nonghyŏn’, are produced. This whole process can be called *sikimsae*.”

**Lee Kang-sook:**

“Why do Koreans accept, for example, several tones in a *nonghyŏn* technique as a single tone while Westerners might consider them as several tones? The answer is rather simple: Koreans have learned to appreciate and hear the several tones in *nonghyon* [nonghyŏn] as an entity of one tone. *Nonghyon* refers to the method of depressing and releasing a string on a *kayagŭm* or *kŏmun’go*. . . thereby producing many subtle nuances that color and enrich the melody. Of course, a similar sound phenomenon exists in Korean singing too. It is often said to be a vibrato.”

**Lee Byong-won:**

“Relatively simple melodic lines are aesthetically enriched by subtle dynamic changes. It is the varying combination of these two elements, directional vibrato and dynamic variation, that establishes the authenticity of the music and reflects different personal or regional styles.”

In the above definitions, only Yi Sŏng-ch’ŏn used the term ‘*sikimsae*’. This is because the definition of *sikimsae* has not been clearly established yet. Overall, it is evident that *sikimsae* contains subtle dynamic and pitch changes with vibrato, which are quite different from Western ornamentation or grace notes. However, *sikimsae* has often

40 Lee Byong-won. 1980: 204.
been translated into ‘ornamentation’ in English, although this English musical term does not fully cover the meaning and function of sikimsae.

In order to figure out the differences between Western ornamentation and sikimsae, ‘The Symposium of The Comparison between Western ornamentation and sikimsae’ was held by Korean traditional music scholars and Western musicologists in 1999. Four papers were presented at the Symposium. Two were presented about Korean sikimsae and the other two were about Baroque ornamentation. Korean musicologists, Yi Po-hyŏng and Yi Sang-gyu provided the outcome of sikimsae research to date: five researchers of sikimsae in folk music and eight researchers of sikimsae in classical music.

42 Research of Sikimae in Folk Music

Research of Sikimae in Classical music:
i) Kim Kŏn-sŏp. “Hyŏnhaeng yŏmilleke nat’an P’iri sikimsae yŏn’gu” [Research of P’iri sikimsae in Hyŏnhaeng
The other Korean musicologist, Yi Sang-gyu, categorized sikimsae into two parts based on the theory of sikimsae by Sŏ Han-bŏm: “Sikimsae can be divided into two parts: one is micro sikimsae, which has an ornamental function. Sikimsae can ornament before or after notes. The other is metro sikimsae, which is for decorating passages to make them more melismatic and dynamic.” Yi Sang-gyu also compared the number of sikimsae signs between today’s notation of p’iri and taegŭm instruments and the 1930s’ notation of them. 43 The conclusion was that sikimsae as ornamentation was extended from nine to twenty-one types and sikimsae as decoration grew from three to eleven types.

---

Throughout the symposium, the comparison between sikimsae and Western ornamentation was not addressed clearly. This is because no scholars dealt with both together, sikimsae itself was only explained by Korean traditional music scholars, and only Baroque ornamentations were discussed by Western music scholars. None satisfactorily defines sikimsae. However, it is obvious that sikimsae is quite different from Western ornamentation or grace notes. The most distinctive aspect is that sikimsae is strongly related to its mode, rhythmic cycles and melodic progress. It does not appear individually on any note like Western ornamentation or grace notes. Sikimsae can be defined as a pivotal bridge which links one note to the other, while exploring different vocal techniques, rhythmic flexibility and timbre changes. For example, if chung (仲 a ⁰) or t'ae (太 f ) notes move to nam (c) in p'yŏngjo mode, one specific pivotal bridge, called ch'usŏng sikimsae (a surging ornamentation), has to be used. If a longer duration (at least two thirds of one chŏnggan) of hwang (黄 e ⁰) moves to chung (仲 a ⁰) in kyemyŏn mode, the pivotal bridge, upward-gliding sikimsae (ch'ikinŭn yosŏng), always accompanies it in order to link hwang and chung.⁴⁴

---
⁴⁴ See p. 221 and 222.
1.4.2. Frequency of sikimsae patterns

In kagok singing, the most frequent melodic pattern is related to two distinctive sikimsae: upward-gliding (朝鲜 ч’ик’инун yosŏng) and downward-gliding (朝鲜 t’oesŏng).45 The upward-gliding sikimsae is the sound of pushing-forward-forces and downward-gliding is the sound of pulling-reducing-force. These sikimsae are often explained in the relation to the yin/yang cosmic principles, which originated in Chinese philosophy. Yin (Kor: ŭm) is traditionally interpreted as woman, negative, dark or moon, Yang is man, positive, light or sun.

The yin/yang cosmic principle is often applied to Korean music regardless of traditional or contemporary music. Keith Howard explains the balance between opposing yin and yang forces in samul nori.

Small gongs have traditionally been considered male when producing a high thin pitch or female when lower in pitch and thicker in timber, but at a primary level SamulNori superimposes playing techniques, an open sound being interpreted as yin and a closed or damped sound as yang. . . . An open sound on the hourglass drum is where the stick rebounds, while a closed sound requires the stick to remain in contact with the drumhead; for the thin whip-like yŏl ch’ae stick these are represented within verbal notation as tta or t tôk for open sounds and ttak, tta, ta or ki for closed sounds.46

---

45 See 4.1.3 and 4.1.4 in this dissertation for musical transcription.
46 Howard, Keith. 2006b: 29.
Cho Chae-sŏn described the translation of the *yin/yang* cosmic principle into musical sound as follows: “The stressing sound is considered to be the sound of yang and releasing sound is the sound of yin. The yin sound bears a fundamental difference from the yang sound in its tone quality. The subtle beauty of the tone comes from the yin sound and the sound of pulling-reducing-force, so that the melody could not be formed without the interaction of these changing qualities of the tones.”

Contemporary Korean composers often adopted the cosmic principle in their work to show the Korean philosophical point of view. Yun Isang explored the conflict between opposing yin and yang forces by mixing yang’s continuous lines with yin’s broken line and transitory quality rather than a static state in his work, *Konzert für Flöte und kleines Orchester* (1977). Paek Pyŏng-dong’s piece, *Drei Bagatellen* (1973), was also based on the cosmic complementary nature of yin and yang.

This idea of the contrasting ying and yang sounds is relevant to the kagok’s opposing two sikimsae, upward-gliding and downward-gliding. Yang sound, upward-gliding sikimsae is a glissando upwards which includes accelerando and repeated undulation of pitch. Yin sound, downward-gliding is the opposite of upward-gliding.

---


48 Howard, Keith. 2006b. 150-151.

49 Howard, Keith. 2006b. 159.
The balance of the frequency in which the two sikimsae patterns occur is seen in the following table.

1) **Yang’s appearance in each piece of kagok han pat’ang**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Isudaeyŏp</th>
<th>Chunggŏ</th>
<th>P’yonnggŏ</th>
<th>Tugŏ</th>
<th>Panyŏp</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I Section</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II Section</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III Section</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV Section</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V Section</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 1-5: Frequency of the upward-gliding (yang) pattern in p’yŏngjo kagok]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Isudaeyŏp</th>
<th>Chunggŏ</th>
<th>P’yonnggŏ</th>
<th>Tugŏ</th>
<th>Panyŏb</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I Section</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II Section</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III Section</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV Section</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V Section</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 1-6: Frequency of the upward-gliding (yang) pattern in kyemyŏnjo]
2) Yin’s appearance in each piece of kagok han pat’ang.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Isudaeyŏp</th>
<th>Chunggŏ</th>
<th>P’yŏnggŏ</th>
<th>Tugŏ</th>
<th>Panyŏp</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I Section</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II Section</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III Section</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV Section</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V Section</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 1-7: Frequency of the downward-gliding (ŭm) in p’yŏngjo]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Isudaeyŏp</th>
<th>Chunggŏ</th>
<th>P’yŏnggŏ</th>
<th>Tugŏ</th>
<th>Panyŏp</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I Section</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II Section</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III Section</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV Section</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V Section</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 1-8: Frequency of the downward-gliding (ŭm) in kyemyŏnjo kagok]

Except for the above two sikimsae, the a♭仲–c♭ – B♭ pattern is outstanding.

The frequency is as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Isudaeyŏp</th>
<th>Chunggŏ</th>
<th>P’yŏnggŏ</th>
<th>Tugŏ</th>
<th>Panyŏp</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I Section</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II Section</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III Section</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV Section</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V Section</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 1-9 Frequency of the a♭仲–c♭ – B♭ pattern in P’yŏngjo kagok]

If students are able to sing the above repeated sikimsae patterns and cadential
phrase properly they have already mastered one third of *kagok* technique. The proportion of these patterns in *kagok* is more than 30%. Paek Tae-ung pointed out *kagok’s* repeated patterns as *nogaba* style (changing texts only within a routine melody and form), although many scholars and singers do not agree with his viewpoint.\(^{50}\)

---

[Figure: 1-7: The frequency of sikimsae patterns in kagok]
1. 4. 3. The beauty of sikimsae 시김새

Lee Hye-ku described sikimsae aesthetics by comparing them to the wind blowing and pine trees.

Blowing in the pine groves in my head, the wind rushed by in a crescendo, followed by a decrescendo as the wind died away; after straining, the pine needles shook back in a kind of tremolo, giving a very settling sound. The delicate variations in sound made by the pine trees varied with the force of the wind blowing in and passing out. The long, drawn-out sounds of the wind blowing through the pine grove could hardly be said to have melody or rhythm; what gave the sense of beauty could only be the dynamics, that is, the changes in power."

As can be seen, sikimsae descriptions tend towards curving, silky images rather than the straight and strong. Kagok’s sikimsae can be compared to this calligraphic movement because sikimsae usually contains changes of dynamic, pitch and timbre even in a short passage. The following calligraphic painting [Plate 1-6] shows a similar curving image to that of kagok’s sikimsae.

---

The beauty of curving lines of the orchid was done with brush and black ink on paper. To give dynamics to the curving lines of the orchid, painters are required to control their breathing through meditation before painting. Such images can be also seen if the hand movements, associated with sikimsae in kagok practice, are observed. The movements are called ‘sonsikim,’ ‘sonjangdan,’ or ‘sondongjak.’ Sondongjak is an effective way of visually conveying the sikimsae of kagok. These movements trace the shape of signs in kagok chŏngganbo notation.

52 Wŏn Ok-sŏn’s personal collection.
54 See Chapter 4 for detailed description of these.
The ascending and descending hand signs trace this line to indicate the increasing speed of the tremolo and the decreasing volume of the vocal sound. The downward gliding sikimsae (t’oesŏng) is a good example of a curved image. T’oesŏng means a speeding up of the tremolo (A♭-F in the p’yŏngjo mode) in the notation. The clear and soft sound fades slowly repeating A♭ - F.55

The following kagok notation [Figure 1-9] by Hong Wŏn-gi shows the beautiful curving lines of his calligraphic notation, which act as a stimulus for the beauty of the vocal lines being produced. Hong’s calligraphy of sikimsae signs is well-expressed, so that the movement of the sound can be easily imitated. Calligraphy is very dynamic. It is written with a brush. Even one letter involves many different movements to create different tones by the powerful control of the brush strokes. In the same way the different dynamics, speed, range and curve of the hand movements convey the changes of dynamics, pace, accent, pitch and timbre in the voice.

55 See p. 225-259 for details.
Figure 1-9: Kagok notation ‘P’yŏngnong’ by Hong Wŏn-gi

The Korean, beautiful, curving line is again an essential element in Korean traditional female solo dance, salp’uri (dance for releasing misfortune), which is considered the pinnacle of Korean folk dance. \(^{57}\) Salp’uri was designed to exorcise evil spirits. The dancer always makes curving lines with a long white cloth while dancing, which symbolizes a path to drive away evil. Correspondingly, salp’uri also requires long breath control and slow movements to dance with sanjo music.

[Plate 1-7: Salp’uri dance]\(^{58}\)

The salp’uri dance starts in a very slow rhythm, in a mystical quiet manner, which requires extremely slow movements of the long, white cloth. During these

---


movements, a high degree of spiritual, expressive ability is demanded for the dynamics. By waving the white cloth, the dancer purifies her deep sadness and anger. As the tempo gradually increases, the white cloth traces bigger and faster lines.

1.5. Vocalization (*Palsŏng*)

The Korean term ‘*palsŏng*’ means ‘how to make sound through the human body’. It can be translated as ‘vocalization’. This term is also emphasized whenever *kagok* is taught. Although the female *kagok* singer’s voice is not very loud or strong, the sound itself is always clear and conveyed with tension during the long phrases. While singing, it is important not to push the sound out of the mouth, but keep it resonating within the body, usually for thirty seconds, for one breath. In order to do this, long breaths are essential. The longest breath in female *kagok* is around one minute and twenty seconds, through three syllables, in the slowest song, *p’yŏngjo Isudaeyŏp*, of *kagok han pat’ang*. To sing a long phrase within one breath, singers required special training in breath control.

At inspiration, a singer should inhale as much as she can in a second, as air freely enters the respiratory tract and the pressure below the glottis becomes lower than the atmospheric pressure. At the moment of full inspiration, the diaphragm is in its lowest
position. While singing, a singer should exhale as slowly as she can, and the airflow should be controlled. This task is to avoid the sudden collapse of the ribcage, and rapid diaphragmatic mounting.

During the breath management of her singing, a singer should keep a physical equilibrium. “To be skillful, a voice user must learn to maintain equilibrium between the mechanics of airflow regulation and vocal-fold resistance to the air in order to accomplish precise coordination between the two.”59 In kagok singing, this physical equilibrium should accompany the emotional equilibrium, which is one of the important goals of kagok singing. Emotional equilibrium is also the aim of music learning in Confucianism, which is the cultivation of human virtue. Yi Sŏng-ch’ŏn described equilibrium as one of the aesthetics of Korean traditional classical music.

The music that was created by this elite group [in the Chosŏn dynasty] is called Chŏngak or ‘proper’ (correct, right) music. . . . Thus, the reason that music is necessary in a society is to make people proper and to create a society of higher values of ethics. And because Chŏngak is considered to be music that builds life of high character and builds courage towards devotion to the state, the sŏnbi and scholars chose Chŏngak as a way of discipline and pleased themselves in the playing and listening of it.

In the first chapter of the Zhongyong (The Doctrine of the Mean), a Confucian Literature, it is said, “While there are no stirrings of pleasure, anger, sorrow, or joy, the mind may be said to be in the

state of equilibrium. When those feelings have been stirred, and they act in their due degree, there ensues what may be called the state of harmony.” The word equilibrium in this passage, can mean appropriate, not extreme, level, or balanced.60

In the Chosŏn dynasty, women, especially, required enormous patience, which was one of the essential ethics. They had to keep ‘the rules of conduct for women.’ In order to keep these rules and to follow the traditional idea of seven evils ‘Ch’ilgŏjiyak’, women were prohibited from disobeying parents-in-law, bearing no son, committing adultery, jealousy, carrying a hereditary disease or garrulousness, otherwise they would be expelled from the home. They were not allowed remarriage for their life span, although, upper class Korean men maintained several wives, and it was possible for an ordinary man to remarry.61 Women were not allowed to be jealous of their husband’s concubine but should suppress it.

Emotional equilibrium is the result of patience and refinement from anger, sorrow and joy. Kagok’s long breath control requires enormous patience as well, which led to emotional equilibrium. To sustain the tension of sound in long phrases, Cho Soon-ja advised her female students, including the author, to train the middle muscle of the vagina by repeatedly ‘relaxing and tensioning’ it slowly. She believed that when the

throat muscle is controlled, together with the vaginal muscle, the sound is much longer, clearer and more powerful. Her advice pointed to the traditional vocalization of *kagok*, which is often given during *kagok* lessons: “Tense and focus on the lower part of your abdomen, *tanjŏn*, and then vocalize through *twitmok* (back of your head).”

However, this instruction is too vague to follow for people today. Cho Soon-ja interpreted the important area, ‘*tanjŏn*’, as the vaginal area and lower part of the hip joint. In addition, Korean traditional music scholars and *kagok* singers have not confirmed exactly which part of the body is referred to by the word ‘*twitmok*’.

During the interview with Kim Chŏng-ja, professor at the Seoul National University, she said “I suspect that ‘*twitmok*’ would be the soft palate (velum) in the mouth. My teacher, Kim Chin-hyang, did not allow me to make a sound from the hard palate (pre-palatal) in the mouth.”

---


Kim Chŏng-ja ’s opinion is the same as that of Cho Soon-ja and Kwŏn Il-ji. They all treated the sound from the hard palate in the mouth as non-tense sound called ‘pŏlkŏk chabarajin sori’. As stated before, the sound from the hard palate was also prohibited because it requires the singer’s teeth to be seen. Surprisingly this vocalization is again strongly related to women’s demeanour in the Chosŏn dynasty. Women in the Chosŏn dynasty were never allowed to open their mouth widely. Even when smiling they were not allowed to show their teeth. They were educated to be quiet. “After the marriage ceremony . . . It was the beginning of the woman’s married life, a life of

64 Miller, Richard. 2000: 34.
patience and self-restraint. The bride had to remain as speechless as a statue and could not speak even if she were asked questions by the groom. She was also forbidden to make the least movement on her own.”

1. 6. The performance position (Chase)

The performance position, *chase*, is considered to be an important aspect in *kagok* singing. Hong Wŏn-gi emphasized: “To be skillful in singing, *kagok* singers should sit on a floor with the right posture and peaceful face, tightening the lower abdomen area. Even if a singer is very talented and has a good voice, he/she cannot make a good sound without *kagok*’s authentic posture.” The performance position of *kagok* follows the Korean traditional living style, that is, to sit on the floor without a chair. The actual sitting position between male and female singers is again different. Male singers traditionally sit in a fixed cross-legged position with hands on their thighs. Female singers sit with their right knee bent up in front of the chest and the left leg folded under the right. The hands are folded over each other on the raised knee. This was the typical sitting position for women even in everyday life in the Chosŏn dynasty, and it is sometimes carried through to the present day. The following photo of Cho Soon-ja and

her teacher Yi Chu-hwan at a recital in Japan, in 1964, shows this performing position.


The above woman’s posture seems tense, introverted and passive, but the male’s position seems more relaxed and positive than the woman’s one. Passive social customs of women in the Chosŏn dynasty affected every manner of women’s lives including their clothes and sitting postures. In public, women from high and middle classes were expected to hide their faces, except for their eyes, with special clothing ‘changot.’ 68

Today, however, Cho Soon-ja rejects the traditional woman’s performance position for two reasons. \(^70\) Firstly, the women’s performance position makes singers’

\(^{69}\) De Lannetgierre. 1902.

\(^{70}\) Cho Soon-ja. personal interview. 13 June. 1996.
breath control difficult because the body shape is too tight to breathe. Secondly, today there is no reason for women to have such passive manners. The human rights situation between men and women in today’s Korea is one of equality.

[Plate 1-10: Cho Soon-ja and Kim Kyŏng-bae at a recital in 1984]71

1. 7. *Kagok* text: *Noraetmal*

Vocal music can more closely express social attitudes and the cultural and individual experiences of its creators, than instrumental music because of the texts (*noraetmal*). *Kagok* also reflects the social attitudes and customs of the Chosŏn dynasty through its texts. Today, *kagok’s* texts have been researched under the

Korean traditional poetic genre ‘sijo.’ Ethnomusicologists such as Alan Merriam, Bruno Nettl and John Blacking emphasized the importance of studying the text of songs. “One of the most obvious sources for the understanding of human behaviour in connection with music is the song text. Texts, of course, are language behaviour rather than music sound, but they are an integral part of music and there is clear-cut evidence that the language used in connection with music differs from that of ordinary discourse.”

The illustrations of the literati and kagok singers’ main interests and the attitudes of the Chosŏn dynasty in the text are obvious. Through the texts, kagok became especially the vehicle of female emotional expression, because other ways of emotional expression were very limited under Confucian society. Outside the palace, the literati and kisaeng both enjoyed not only the beauty of nature but also extra liberties. These arts were regarded as the literati’s p‘ungnyu which symbolized nature and freedom. The following table shows an analysis of such typical subjects in one suite for both male and female kagok songs in Kagokpo (The kagok notation book) by Yi Chu-hwan.


Sadness of waiting | Enjoyment of life | Chinese tale | Appreciation of nature | Prosperity
---|---|---|---|---
8 songs (53.3 %) | 3 songs (20 %) | 2 songs (13.3 %) | 1 song (6.6%) | 1 song (6.6%)

[Table 1-10: The analysis of the subjects of female kagok]

| Patriotism | Bravery | Enjoyment of life | Chinese tale | Appreciation of nature | Prosperity | Diligence |
---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
8 songs (30.7 %) | 3 songs (11.5%) | 9 songs (34.6%) | 2 songs (7.6%) | 2 songs (7.6%) | 1 song (3.8%) | 1 song (3.8%)

[Table 1-11: The analysis of the subjects of male kagok]

The table above shows that the themes of texts are strongly related to their personal emotions, full of intimate feelings (usually in relation to love, to nature, to self-pity) rather than social or political propaganda. The most popular subject of female kagok songs was ‘the sadness of waiting for their lovers.’ This subject occupies eight of the fifteen songs (53%). This fact reflects kisaeng’s miserable life style. They longed for their lovers, who visited them only occasionally and then left without warning. This circumstance were often observed in Korean poetry in classical Chinese (Han’guk hansi) and kagok anthologies. One Korean literature scholar thoroughly analyzed kisaeng’s identity and receptive femininity through the
Korean poetry in classical Chinese, which were written by *kisaeng* and their lovers. Composing poems and singing *kagok* were the vehicles of expression of their insight and concerns. In *Kogŭm kagok*, their sorrows of separation were dealt with three different levels.

In contrast, male *kagok* songs convey ‘enjoyment of life’ (34.6%), ‘patriotism’ (30.7%) and ‘bravery’ (11.5%) instead of ‘sadness of waiting’. Patriotism towards the King was the first priority of a male’s life, but the expression of their love towards females, as elegant literati, was almost forbidden in the Chosŏn dynasty.

The reason for gender distinctions in *kagok* texts is also clear. Again, these are related to general differences in gender roles during the Chosŏn dynasty. Men, as well as being required to be brave, patriotic and have outgoing personalities, were involved in all sorts of social, political and business interests. Women were expected to be patient, retiring and do household tasks. They were not allowed a social life outside home. *Kisaeng* were no exception. The first songs of both male and female *kagok* suites are good examples of how different messages are set to a similar melody in both male and

---


76 Kawamura, Minato. 2002: 100.
female *kagok*.

A willow tree becomes a ball of thread
An oriole’s singing turns into a spinning wheel.
Weaving my broken heart through the ages for my love.
Who was it that said ‘spring blossom is beautiful!’

[Figure 1-11: The first song of *female* kagok suite]^{77} [Figure 1-12: The first song of *male* kagok suite]^{78}

[Figure 1-11] presents a woman’s broken heart in spring blossom longing for her lover.

However, [Figure 1-12] encourages people to be diligent through its active mood.

Overall, the texts of *kagok* clearly show that a *kisaeng*’s life was still very much dependent on men although *kisaeng* were allowed to sing songs, play instruments and write poems which were usually male dominated areas.\(^79\)

---

77 Lee In-suk. Trans.
1. 8. The performance order (Yŏnju sunsŏ)

*Kagok* songs are collected together in *han pat’ang* and sung in a predetermined order like a ‘suite’. The fifteen female *kagok* songs which make up *kagok han pat’ang* can be divided into three major groups (songs 1-4, 6-9, 10-14) with a bridging song (song 5) and a final song (song 15). The first group of four, the original *kagok* songs, (1.Isudaeyŏp, 2. Chunggŏ, 3. P’yŏnggŏ, 4. Tugŏ) are sung in *p’yŏngjo* mode. The second group of four, also original *kagok* songs, is in *kyemyŏnjo* mode and these have the same titles as songs 1 to 4. The third group consists of more recent songs which have longer texts than the original songs. The tempo is faster than the original songs, except for the final song (song 15). This is in a slow tempo and has a tranquil mood. These fifteen songs are sung without a break.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Tempo</th>
<th>Mode</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Isudaeyŏp</td>
<td>One beat = 20</td>
<td>P’yŏngjo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Chunggŏ</td>
<td>One beat = 25</td>
<td>P’yŏngjo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. P’yŏnggŏ</td>
<td>One beat = 30</td>
<td>P’yŏngjo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Tugŏ</td>
<td>One beat = 45</td>
<td>P’yŏngjo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Panyŏp</td>
<td>One beat = 80</td>
<td>P’yŏngjo + Kyemyŏnjo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Isudaeyŏp</td>
<td>One beat = 20</td>
<td>Kyemyŏnjo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Chunggŏ</td>
<td>One beat = 25</td>
<td>Kyemyŏnjo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. P’yŏnggŏ</td>
<td>One beat = 30</td>
<td>Kyemyŏnjo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Tugŏ</td>
<td>One beat = 45</td>
<td>Kyemyŏnjo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. P’yŏngnong</td>
<td>One beat = 50</td>
<td>Kyemyŏnjo + P’yŏngjo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Urak</td>
<td>One beat = 55</td>
<td>P’yŏngjo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Hwan’gyerak</td>
<td>One beat = 55</td>
<td>P’yŏngjo + Kyemyŏnjo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Kyerak</td>
<td>One beat = 60</td>
<td>Kyemyŏnjo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. P’yŏnsudaeyŏp</td>
<td>One beat = 75</td>
<td>Kyemyŏnjo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. T’aep’yŏngga</td>
<td>One beat = 45</td>
<td>Kyemyŏnjo</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 1-12: Order of female kagok han pat’ang]  

The overall performance order of *kagok* shows that there is a gradual tempo increase from one song to the next, until the last song, which is in a slow tempo. This is achieved by the quickening of tempo within each group of songs. The tempo increase is related to the idea of the Korean literati. They considered that a slow-paced life style was elegant and a faster one was vulgar or frivolous. For example, the literati only

---

walked slowly with their hands folded behind their backs because they considered themselves elegant and intelligent people, different from ordinary people.

The first song, ‘Jsudaeyŏp’ is in the slowest tempo of kagok (twenty beats in a minute), and represents their dignity and grace. Chun Inpyong also described the aesthetical view of music in the Chosŏn dynasty as follows:

If a person is to be a gentleman (Kunja), music and morality always have to be present in his daily life. Music has to be used for personal mind control and as a vehicle of enlightenment for the citizen . . . Music has to be always in a slow tempo and have peaceful melodies. Music in fast tempo and with loud sounds should be treated as lascivious music.”

As the singers become more involved in the kagok performance, they experience more emotional and physical warmth. This results in an increase in tempo and is seen as reflecting the literati’s relaxation of their social and political morals. The tempo of the third group (songs 10-14) is faster than the first and the second group. The fourteenth song can be considered the climax of kagok han pat’ang. It has the fastest tempo except for the bridging song ‘Panyp’ (song 5). The sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle (changdan) used in other songs is condensed into the abbreviated ten-beat, rhythmic cycle by

---

deleting six rests. The second to last of both the female and male songs are no longer about sadness as follows.

The peony is the king of flowers
and the sunflower a noble subject;
The lotus is a gentleman,
the apricot blossom a commoner;
The chrysanthemum a sage in retirement,
the plum blossom a poor scholar;
the gourd flower is an old, old man,
the China pink is a boy;
The mallow is a witch
and the wild rose a harlot;
Among them the pear blossom is a poet,
and are not the red peach, the green peach,
and the peach of three colours,
all of them playboy?

[Figure 1-13: The fourteenth song of the female kagok han pat’ang]^{83}

A small yacht
Made from a pine tree
Is ablaze with music
Flutes, drums, zithers
Liquor and cuisine
A rock hammer chiseled from the Anam Mountain
Made a channel
That brought female entertainers, rice wine, and ‘ladies of the night’ to the beach.
They party in the moonlight
Enjoy the cruise and drunken merriment
And make love as they flow through Kûmyŏng cave and lake Sŏnnu

[Figure 1-14: The twenty-fifth song of the male kagok han pat’ang]^{84}

---

84 Lee In-suk. Trans.
The finale song ‘T’aep’yŏngga’ is sung in a tranquil mood. Its tempo is dramatically reduced. It decreases from seventy-five beats to forty beats per minute. The text is about the prosperity of the nation. The Korean musicologist, Chang Sa-hun depicted p’ungnyubang phenomenon as follows.

*Kagok* was often enjoyed by the literati during a banquet with alcohol. Initially, in spite of starting to sing, the literati’s attitude is still stiff with tension because of their social position. As the appreciation of songs increases, the party atmosphere loosens and there is an increase in warmth and laughter. As they became more involved in *kagok*, they became more drunken and more ‘human’ in nature. They forget their social position and begin talking about humorous tales and sexual innuendoes. They enjoy the feeling of freedom as an everyday human being. However, the literati could not return home without dignity and grace, so they must revert to their slow pace of life. This reflects their dignity and courtly manners.85

Han Myŏng-hŭi also described how Chosŏn literati fully enjoyed *kagok* and how the slowest song, *Isudaeyŏp* were appreciated in a cheerful mood in their *p’ungnyubang.*

He considered the appearance of the female’s slowest song, *kyemoyjo Isudaeyop*, in the middle of party as the most enjoyable time and climax of the party.86

---

Conclusion

Anthony Seeger stated that singing was “part of the social reproduction.”\(^{87}\) Kagok, the classical vocal form, is part of the social reproduction of the Chosŏn dynasty. Kagok sound alone is not the most significant aspect. The philosophy and social context in the Chosŏn dynasty were equally important. More than any other genre, kagok, which was the most loved, contained the aesthetic views of the elite social group (literati and kisaeng) of the Chosŏn dynasty.

In this chapter, kagok’s aesthetics in conjunction with musical sound, accompanying instruments, vocal quality, musical form, vocalization and timbre have been explained. Unique vocal qualities clearly relate to female roles in the Chosŏn dynasty, and female vocalization is similarly related to the social ethics of that period (such as avoiding loud sounds and therefore using falsetto techniques). The most tangible evidence of kagok’s aesthetic lies in the musical form with its related taegang structure of beats and syllables, musical cadential phrase sound and their relationship with the text’s rhyming patterns.

The definition and classification of sikimsae terminology are still controversial and sikimsae should be further defined and clarified as one the essentials of Korean

\(^{87}\) Seeger, Anthony. 2004: 130.
traditional music. This clearer definition and classification of *sikimsae* in Korean traditional music, including *kagok*, will avoid any further distortion in its notation and transcription. Because *sikimsae* is not the same as Western ornamentation, despite its translation from Korean as ‘ornamentation,’ a substantial chang on this subject was necessary.

The different aesthetics of Korean traditional music were often only described through abstract theories from old Confucian references, without showing musical examples. Therefore, in this chapter an analysis of the above features (*sikimsae*, accompanying instruments, vocal quality, musical form, vocalization and timbre) went some way to rectifying this.
CHAPTER 2

Marginalization of Female Kagok:

Female kagok singers and kagok’s history

Introduction

Little research has been done on the origin of female kagok and singers although a lot of research has been done on male kagok and the music itself. However, kagok songs were definitely enjoyed by both the male literati and female entertainers, kisaeng, during the Chosŏn dynasty. Kisaeng were called talented ladies (kinyŏ, ki means talent and yŏ means female), or artistic talents (yegi, ye means arts and gi means talent), before the Japanese colonization. In spite of kisaeng’s great contribution to kagok as singers, composers and audiences, they were marginalized in Korean traditional music history.

In addition, it is extremely hard to find any record of female kagok singers in kagok’s old manuscripts and anthologies. For example, fifty-six names were mentioned as famous kagok singers during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries in a sijo anthology, Haedong kayo, written in 1763, but all of the names seem to be male.⁴ Today, one of the well-known books, An Introduction to Korean Traditional Music (Kugak ch’ŏngnon), written by Chang Sa-hun mentions kagok on forty-four pages, but it mentions twenty-five male kagok singers only, as the significant singers in kagok history.⁵ Although Sŏng Kyŏng-nin made a genealogy of the present kagok tradition, as follows, there is no female name apart from Kim Wŏl-ha.

![Genealogy of the present kagok tradition]

⁴ One of the traditional kagok anthologies written by Kim Su-jang in 1763.
⁵ Chang Sa-hun. 1985: 418 - 462.
These facts are not surprising if the circumstances of the Chosŏn dynasty are considered. The preface to *Women’s culture in the Chosŏn dynasty* (*Chosŏn-yŏsokko*) is a good example which shows the low standard of research into female singers:

There were twenty million people living in the Chosŏn Dynasty and half of them were women. There are quite a lot of stories about female culture including marriage life, methods of home education, traditional manners and so on . . . I read *Ojuyŏsok’t’onggo* written by the American scholar, Im Rak-ji. He explained the women’s culture in the Chosŏn dynasty with only one example: when a mother wants to stop her baby’s crying, the traditional way is to say ‘a tiger is coming for you’. I wondered why he explained only one example among uncountable cases of female culture in the Chosŏn dynasty. It is understandable because the author of the book was non-Korean and his knowledge about Korean culture and society was too limited. In addition, this is our fault because no book or resource has been written about women in the Chosŏn dynasty.7

This chapter aims to show how kagok was enjoyed by kisaeng and literati and how female kagok has been transmitted historically. It also reveals the kisaeng’s social and educational experiences as kagok singers. Today, kisaeng groups no longer exist in Korea. However, a few previous kisaeng and professional kagok singers who try to

contribute to the preservation and introduction of *kagok*, do exist in Korea. These respected singers and teachers will be introduced as present day *kisaeng*.

The historical aspects of *kagok* will be also examined, focusing on how and why the variety of repertoire of *kagok* in the eighteenth century has shrunk into only one suite today: the present. The era of decline, the flourishing era, and the era of development will be considered. In order to research the origin of *kagok*, old manuscripts of *kagok*’s accompanying instrument ‘*kŏmun’go*’ and its anthologies are referred to. These are the main references for *kagok*’s oral transmission from its origins to the beginning of the twentieth century.

### 2. 1. *Kagok* singers, ‘*kisaeng*.’

It is evident that *kisaeng* contributed greatly to all sorts of artistic and musical developments in the Chosŏn dynasty as producers and consumers. Lee Byong-won stated that the contribution of *kisaeng* to Korean music and dance was considerable.\(^8\) However, in spite of the *kisaeng*’s long history few of their contributions, have remained, such as their education systems, training methods and performance records, as Yi Nŭng-hwa, Yi Mun-yŏl and Kawamura have also stated. This is largely because

---

8 Lee Byong-won. 1980: 201.
*kisaeng* were thought too frivolous, and were considered a part of popular culture. Consequently, the need for documenting and researching *kisaeng* was very weak. The Chosŏn dynasty and the Korean government did not encourage people to research *kisaeng*. However, *kisaeng* are popular characters in the Korean traditional literature and tales. This fact reflects that *kisaeng*, regardless of their social status in the past, were still strongly connected to the lives of ordinary people.

*Kisaeng* have been researched by Korean literature scholars through the traditional tales and their literature, rather than by Korean musicologists. Louise McCarthy researched *kisaeng* in the Koryŏ period in her Ph.D dissertation through the analysis of the traditional poetry book, *Tongguk Yi Sanggukchip* by Yi Kyu-bo.⁹ There are few and limited publications in English on the subject. If research focused on *kisaeng* not only on its association with entertainment, even prostitution, but on the fact that many of the women were important musicians, poets and artists, the education of *kisaeng* and their works would become critically valuable. Much of the music written at this time was created, performed and appreciated by those members of *kisaeng* themselves.

---

Today, *kisaeng* have all but vanished from Korea. *Kisaeng* today only means prostitute in Korea, hence, as mentioned above, the roles of women in the upper and middle classes under Confucianism were largely confined to the domestic sphere. Women received only an informal education at home, because women were required to obey the Confucian virtues of diligence, filial piety and chastity.\(^{10}\) The male society needed female groups who could entertain them. Consequently, the *kisaeng* system was formally set up and controlled by the Chosŏn dynasty.

2. 1. 1. The *kisaeng* system

The *kisaeng* system developed during the Koryŏ dynasty (918-1392)\(^ {11}\). *Kisaeng* were trained in dancing and musical performance for national festivals called a female musician (*Yŏak*).\(^ {12}\) However, the *kisaeng* system was strengthened during the Chosŏn dynasty. The male dominated society of Confucianism needed female entertainers for either private parties or governmental occasions. In addition, women in the palace were not treated by male doctors. Consequently, the Chosŏn dynasty needed to train both female entertainers and female doctors, also called talented ladies (*kinyŏ*). They were

---

12 Kim Tong-gyu. “The history of *kisaeng* during the Yi dynasty.” *Asia Yŏsŏng Yŏn’gu [The Research of Females in Asia]*. Seoul: Asia Munje Yŏn’gu Sungmyŏng University. 1966: 75-76.
controlled and trained by the Department of Performing Arts in the Chosŏn dynasty (Changakwŏn).

Female entertainers, kinyŏ, were chosen as young girls from the common people or lower classes. Young and clever kinyŏ apprentices were selected and trained, in mainly Chinese medicine and acupuncture, to be doctors. However, they had to learn dancing and singing to perform at National festivals, official parties and even private parties. They belonged to the Clinic for the Royal Family (Naeŭiwŏn) and Ministry of Health (Hyeminsŏ). In addition, the needlewomen of the Costume Department for the Royal Family (Sangŭiwŏn) were also trained in singing and dancing. The following text by Lee Hye-ku shows evidence of female kagok ‘kisaeng’, who also belonged to other departments.

Apart from the official parties organized by the dynasty, the literati had private parties or banquets for the appreciation of the beauty of the four seasons: Ch’unhwayu [blossom of spring], hajŏngp’ung [green trees and breeze of summer], ch’unmyŏngp’ung kain [the clear and bright moon of autumn], tongjŏnggyŏng [snowy mountains of winter]. These parties were accompanied by kisaeng who are famous for singing. The literati enjoyed kisaengs’ singing and dancing . . . at the famous banquets called sŭngse norŭm and pyŏlgam norŭm at the Pukkijŏng where one hundred literati, musical accompanists and professional kagok singers (kagaek) were sitting. After a while, a medical doctor kisaeng and an embroiderer

---

kisaeng came and sang ujo Isudaeyŏp kagok songs and danced.¹⁴

There were three, different, strictly classified kisaeng grades at the end of the Chosŏn dynasty.¹⁵ Of course, the social levels of kisaeng’s guests were different as well. The highest grade of kisaeng, ilp’ae, was a government position which was especially created to control the kisaeng group. The ilp’ae was expected to learn music, dance and literature, in order to entertain at upper class functions. They were also allowed to have private guests in their home. Female doctors who treated women in a palace also belonged to this highest grade. Some kisaeng were given very high positions by the kings of the Chosŏn dynasty. The second highest kisaeng, ip’ae were concubines, who had retired at the age of thirty from the highest grade, and part-time prostitutes who entertained at private parties with their artistic skills. The third highest kisaeng, Sam-pae, served ordinary men by singing popular songs, but they were forbidden to perform the classical songs and dances of the first grade kisaeng.¹⁶

Regardless of the kisaeng grade, most kisaeng were involved in “entertaining men” with song, dance or sexually explicit behaviour. Kisaeng appeared in almost all paintings of the Chosŏn dynasty’s functions and chronicles. In formal functions by the

---

dynasty and informal parties, *kisaeng*’s involvement was essential. The following painting is a good example of *kisaeng*’s involvement in official events and private parties.

[Plate 2-1: *Pumyŏnnyu yŏnhoedo* in the eighteenth century]^{17}

In order to achieve a higher level of performance, *kisaeng* lived together and trained every day, in the dynasty-provided house, *kyobang*, which was considered as the representative artists group in the Chosŏn dynasty.^{18}

The association of *kisaeng* with entertainment did not necessarily mean these women were always subservient to men. Many *kisaeng* had close friendships with men and enjoyed a level of freedom and autonomy that was denied most of the women of

---

^{17} [http://www.kcds.hs.kr/PAINT/image/p126_2](http://www.kcds.hs.kr/PAINT/image/p126_2), May. 2002.

that period.\textsuperscript{19} Some \textit{kisaeng} are celebrated today, although most names of the \textit{kisaeng} were forgotten. For example, \textit{kisaeng}, Non’gae who is said to have dragged an invading Japanese officer to his death over a cliff in Chinju in 1592, is celebrated through the ‘Non’gae Festival’ every year in Chinju.

\section*{2. 1. 2. Kagok Kisaeng

The \textit{kagok-kisaeng} were treated as the highest group of \textit{ilp’ae}.\textsuperscript{20} Women in this group were accomplished composers and singers of \textit{kagok}. They were highly acclaimed and were the most popular genre of both musicians and literati among the upper class. The \textit{kagok} song and its text (\textit{sijo}) were the most popular media of expression for these literati and the \textit{kisaeng}’s way of thinking.\textsuperscript{21}

In the preface of \textit{Ch’ŏnggu yŏngŏn} (one of the most popular anthologies), \textit{Sigaildo-sasang} (\textit{Si} - poem, \textit{ga} – song, \textit{il} - correspondence, \textit{do} – principle, \textit{sasang} – ideology) is explained.\textsuperscript{22} \textit{Sigaildo-sasang} literally means that a poem and a song are both performed at the same time. In other words, once \textit{sijo} was written it should be presented through a song. This is valuable evidence in the tracing of how \textit{kagok} was

\textsuperscript{20} Kim Chŏng-ja. personal interview. 21 August. 2001.
\textsuperscript{21} Park Min-yŏng. 2003: 232.
\textsuperscript{22} One of the three famous \textit{kagok} anthologies in the Chosŏn dynasty written in 1728.
enjoyed in the Chosŏn dynasty. Kagok was composed from the text of the song. Sigaildo-sasang also reveals the origin of kagok performance that sijo, Korean traditional poetry, was composed to be sung rather than read. After composition of the text, sijo, then kisaeng or the literati spontaneously sang it in the musical form of kagok with an expression of their emotion. These hundreds of songs were compiled in the kagok anthologies. However, the male and female kagok han pat’ang has been sung alternatively from male to female within the fixed repertoire and form since Ha Kyu-il.

Kagok was originally enjoyed in the p’ungnyubang (the literati’s salon or party place), so the texts contain their author’s humor and wit but they remain anonymous.

The following text of the male kagok, soyong, shows one such literati’s wit.

A pot which cooks by itself without wood burning.
A horse which grows everyday without feeding.
A kisaeng who works spinning and catering without complaint.
A kettle which offers wine without stopping.
A cow which gives birth every day without care.
Oh wu oh.........,oh wu oh.....
If I had these five things, I would not envy anybody.24

Under the these cheerful circumstances, literati and kisaeng often fell in love or had strong relationship in spite of their different social status. An affair between the famous literati, Sŏ Kyŏng-dŏk and the most famous kisaeng in Korean history, Hwang

23 Kawamura (2002) shows a picture of kisaeng doing calligraphy with a brush indicating that some kisaeng could read and write.
24 Trans Lee In-suk.
Chini (1506 - 1544), are still popular today and a few her poems are still remembered as a responsorial song (hwadapka) in Korea. Hwang Chini’s works, on the mutability of love, are acclaimed for their depth of feeling, meditative rhythms and rich symbolism.

Her three poems have been passed down as follows.\(^{25}\)

**P’yŏngjo Isudaeyŏp in the third suite of female kagok**

동짓달 기나긴 밤을 한 허리를 들어 내여
춘풍이불아래 서리서리 넣였다가
어른님 오신날 밤이여든
굽이 굽이 퍼리라

I cut in two
A long November night, and
Place half under the coverlet, Sweet-
And When he comes, I shall take it out,
Unroll it inch by inch, to stretch the night.

1. **P’yŏngjo P’yŏnggŏ in the second suite of female kagok**

어저 내일이여 그림중 모르던가
이사라하드며 가랴마는 제구타여
보내고 그리는 향은 나도 몸라 하노라.

Oh! How poor I am!
I couldn’t imagine how much I would miss my lover. I did push him to leave me.
Why am I missing him so much?

2. **Kyemyŏn Kyerak**

청산리 백개수야 수이 감을 자랑마라
일도 창해 하면 다시 오기 어려워라
명월이 만공산하니 쉬여간들 어머리.

Do not boast of your speed,
O blue-green stream running by the hills:
Once you have reached the wide ocean,
You can return no more.
Why not stay here and rest,
When moonlight stuffs the empty hills?

In spite of kisaeng’s low social status, kagok kisaeng was extremely high and they enjoyed much fame. They were also privileged to have an academic life, which was not

---

allowed for ordinary women in those days. The kisaeng’s high power originated from the Koryŏ period. McCarthy depicts kisaeng’s social statues as follows: “While in court dances kisaeng are often portrayed as goddesses with life-prolonging powers, in the annals and biographies in the History of Koryŏ they are typically associated with untoward behavior, be it dissention among officials or unkindly decorum. But the increasing frequency of such accounts as the dynasty progressed suggests that the popularity of kisaeng as concubines increased throughout the latter half of the Koryŏ period.”26 Yi Mae-ch’ang (1573-1610), produced her own anthology Maech’angjip, which is the only anthology written by a female.

The kyemyŏnjo Isudaeyŏp of the female kagok han pat’ang was from the anthology, which is about the most popular theme of female kagok songs about the sadness of a waiting lover. The following description shows how kagok kisaeng were viewed in the Chosŏn dynasty:

The famous kagok kisaeng, Kyesŏm (1766-?) who achieved her own singing style ‘Kyerangjo’, mourned her kagok teacher, Lee Chung-bo. She wanted to visit her teacher’s tomb twice a day to pay her respects but it was during the busiest season of preparing for a national festival. Other kisaeng gathered in a room to practise together. The council considered her emotional state so they offered her horses for her convenience. When she expressed her grief through kagok singing at literatis’ private

---
functions, the literati could not help crying. Soon after her teacher’s
death she left the palace behind her, together with her social position,
fame and wealth and lived in the remote countryside as a Buddhist.27

Kagok kisaeng were, then, different from folk song kisaeng. Kagok kisaeng were
considered to be the best singers and most elegant kisaeng. Therefore, kagok kisaeng
had to follow very strict rules; they were not allowed to learn Korean folk songs. When
a kagok kisaeng went to a folk song class for the first time she was warned by a kagok
teacher, and if she returned to the folk song class a second time she was expelled from
the kagok class. The previous holder of Human Cultural Property of Kyŏnggi province
folk song, An Pi-ch’i (1926-1997), was an example of this. An Pi-ch’i learnt kagok from
Ha Kyu-il for four years.28 However, she was sent to the folk music class because she
breached the rule. The rule was designed to protect the kagok singer’s voice, which
follows a very different vocalization. When students came to learn kagok, a teacher
always tested the students’ singing to find out which genre of music would suit their
voices. Kagok required a silky thin voice; whereas folk songs and p’ansori needed a
husky and coloratura voice.29

Even the classical vocal genres, sijo and kagok had different vocal qualities. If a student learned the sijo technique, which usually has a wide vibrato, the student was not able to make kagok’s tense vibrato, which is produced with in a narrow range. Cho Soon-ja explained this phenomenon: “our throat muscle can be compared to a rubber band, which is very hard to tighten once it has lost its tension after long extension.”

2. 1. 3. Kisaeng during Japanese colonization (1910-1945)

The roles of kisaeng during the Japanese colonization of Korea were critically important as transmitters of traditional music. According to Song Bang-song, kisaeng’s performances on radio did contribute to the increasing popularity of Korean traditional music, although kagok and instrumental musical genres were insignificant in radio programs in 1920. It is appropriate, here, to examine important individual kisaeng and their contributions to the preservation of kagok.

---

i) Performances at Kyŏngsŏng Radio Broadcasting

*Kisaeng’s* performances were often aired through radios during the Japanese colonization and Kyŏngsŏng Radio Broadcasting regularly offered *kisaeng’s* singing including *kagok* and other classical and folk songs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Chosŏn</th>
<th>Hansŏng</th>
<th>Hannam</th>
<th>Taedong</th>
<th>Kyŏnggi</th>
<th>Taejŏng</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Kagok</em></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Kasa</em></td>
<td>19</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Kayagŭm solo</em></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Kayagŭm duo</em></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Kŏngonga kagok</em></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Kyŏngsŏng chapka</em></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Kyesŏng ipch’ang</em></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Kosivŏn’gon</em></td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Namdo Kayo</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Kogŭm yongŏn</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Namdo solo</em></td>
<td>27</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Namdo sori</em></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Namdo tan’ga</em></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Namdo chapka</em></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Tanso solo</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Sŏdo sori</em></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Sedo tan’ga</em></td>
<td>33</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Sŏdo chapka</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Ipch’ang</em></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Chosŏn’ga</em></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Chosŏn kagok</em></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Chosŏn kasa</em></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Chosŏn sori</em></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Chosŏn chapka</em></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Chunggŏ sijo</em></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P’yŏngsŏjŏ</em></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Haejusanyŏmbul</em></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>128</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 2-1: The repertoire of six Kwŏnbŏn in the radio programs in 1920]^{31}

---

^{31} Song Bang-song. 2000a: 95.
The repertoire of kisaeng performers on the radio varied: twenty-seven genres from vocal music to instrumental music were aired. The following [Table 2-1] will show the frequency of the music performances of the six renowned Kwŏnbŏn in the radio programs in 1920. Kagok was performed four times only in three-hundred and twenty performances. This fact reveals that the popularity of kagok in the 1920s was extremely low. On the other hand, folk vocal music such as sŏdo chapka (30.9 %), namdo chapka (18.75 %) were more popular with the public. However, three classical music genres (kagok, kasa and sijo) number only fifty-one out of three-hundred and twenty performances (15.9 %).

The other interesting point of the record is that instrumental music was rarely performed by kisaeng. Song Bang-song pointed out the fact that learning instrumental music required more time to learn than vocal music. Therefore, a short period of kisaeng training during the Japanese colonization made the vocal genres, excluding kagok, popular and the instrumental genres weak.

The following table shows Kwŏnbŏn (kisaeng schools) and the number of kisaeng who appeared on radio programs in 1920.\textsuperscript{32}

\textsuperscript{32} Song Bang-song. 2000a: 93-98.
[Table 2-2: The number of performers in the radio programs in each Kwŏnbŏn in 1920]33

The above six kwŏnbŏn were located in Hansŏng (Seoul), because over eighty percent of kisaeng (470 out of 588 kisaeng) belonged to the Kwŏnbŏn in Seoul [Table 2-1]. After the Chosŏn dynasty, most kisaeng did not come back to their hometown and stayed in Seoul, which meant they were already well trained kisaeng. As can be seen in table 5, Chosŏn Kwŏnbŏn and Hansŏng Kwŏnbŏn performed more actively than other ones. In the two Kwŏnbŏn Ha Kyu-il made an effort to teach kagok to the kisaeng from 1914 to the 1930s. Weakening situation of kagok apparently appeared in the gramophone recording industry during the Japanese colonization. According to the Korean Traditional Music Disc Museum, six-hundred and eighty-five gramophone recordings have been preserved today. However, of these only ten are female kagok sung by Yi Nan-hyang and Sŏ Sanhoju. Therefore, research on kisaeng should be encouraged urgently while some old kisaeng are still alive.

33 Song Bang-song. 2000a: 103.
ii) Ha Kyu-il’s devotion to kisaeng’s survival and his students

After the Chosŏn dynasty was invaded by Japan in 1910, kisaeng groups, including kagok kisaeng, were scattered. However, they could not return to their families as they would bring with them the disgrace of being kisaeng. The pioneer of today’s kagok, Ha Kyu-il looked after them by establishing the Kisaeng Union the Mubugi Chohap (The Kisaeng’s Union for the Husbandless) in 1911. This union was set up to protect kisaeng from being sold by rich men from Yubugi Chohap (The Concubine Kisaeng’s Union). Ha Kyu-il also set up other kisaeng unions and one school (Chŏngak Chŏnsŏpso: 1912 and Taejŏng Kwŏnbŏn: 1914).34 The kisaeng school, Kwŏnbŏn, usually offered kagok, sijo, dance, kŏmun’go, kayagŭm and yanggŭm as subjects.

Ha Kyu-il himself offered to teach kagok to kisaeng at Kwŏnbŏn. As time went by, the school extended its repertoire not only to classical music but also to folk genres such as p’ansori, Japanese music, folk songs and sanjo.35 He also taught them kagok and Korean traditional dance ‘ch’unaengjŏn ’ which had originally been performed in front of the King (Sunjong) of the Chosŏn dynasty. Ch’unaengjŏn is not an active dance and


35 See the Chapter 3. for more details of kisaeng’s education.
has extremely slow, grave movements which are intended to lead to a peaceful and tranquil mood.\textsuperscript{36} The following photo on the cover of a Japanese journal in 1929, shows \textit{kisaeng} wearing \textit{ch’unaengjôn} costumes.

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{plate2-2}
\caption[Plate 2-2: Little kisaeng with k\textit{ömun’go}]{Plate 2-2: Little \textit{kisaeng} with \textit{kömun’go}\textsuperscript{37}}
\end{figure}

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{plate2-3}
\caption[Plate 2-3: Kisaeng wearing Ch’unaengjôn costume in 1929]{Plate 2-3: Kisaeng wearing \textit{Ch’unaengjôn} costume in 1929\textsuperscript{38}}
\end{figure}

Hwang Byung-ki acknowledged the great contribution that Ha Kyu-il made to \textit{kagok}, especially through the development of his teaching method and transcription.

After he resigned from the highly regarded position of ‘mayor’ he concentrated on

\begin{footnotesize}
\textsuperscript{36} Kim Mae-ja. Han’guk\textsuperscript{i} Ch’um (Korean Traditional Dance). Seoul: Taewonsa.1990: 42.
\textsuperscript{37} Kawamura, Minato. 2002: 201.
\textsuperscript{38} Kawamura, Minato. 2002: 298.
\end{footnotesize}
teaching kagok, in the Yiwangjik Aakpu and kisaeng schools, for ten years from 1926.\textsuperscript{39}

The Yiwangjik Aakpu (the Institution for Korean Traditional Classical Music) was one of the official music institutions for male musicians under Japanese Colonization.\textsuperscript{40}

From 1926 to his death in 1936, Ha Kyu-il continued to teach kagok at the Yiwangjik Aakpu. In spite of his tremendous contribution to Korean traditional music, information about him and especially on his teaching methods is very limited and consequently little research has been done on him.\textsuperscript{41}

Ha Kyu-il was also the first person to release a kagok recording by the Japanese gramophone recording company, Ilbon Ilton Ch’ukûmgi Chusikhoesa, in 1925. Unfortunately, any copies have yet to be found and its existence is known only from a newspaper article.\textsuperscript{42} In total, Ha Kyu-il released twenty-three recordings but less than half of them have been found.\textsuperscript{43} There was one duet kagok recording, ‘Hwap’yŏn’, in about 1935, recorded by Columbia (Columbia 4065). It was sung by him and his female student Kim Su-jŏng (1914-1970) in the Taejŏng Kwŏnbŏn.

\textsuperscript{39} Hwang Byung-ki. 2000: 3-7.
\textsuperscript{40} Compact Disc, Yiwangjik Aakpu ŭnak SYNCD-006, was released in 1993 (Rec.1928-1948).
The most influential kagok singers today, from Ha Kyu-il on, are all from the Yiwangjik Aakpu or the unions: they are Yi Chu-hwan (male), Yi Pyŏng-sŏng (male), Kim Chin-hyang (female), Yi Nan-hyang (female), Chu San-wŏl (female), Kim Su-jŏng (female), and Sŏ Sanhoju (female).

iii) Ha Kyu-il’s female students

Kim Chin-hyang (1910-1997): Kim Chin-hyang was adopted by Ha Kyu-il at the age of seven, and then lived with him for three years before going to the kisaeng union. She was good at kagok singing, but concealed her musical talent once the liberation from the Japanese colonization occurred. However, she was found again when she met, by chance, her colleague (a Korean traditional music performer) on a Seoul street in 1987. Kim Chŏng-ja, professor of the Seoul National University, a kayagŭm performer, searched for her after hearing about this meeting. Eventually, Kim Chŏng-ja met Kim Chin-hyang and persuaded Kim Chin-hyang to teach kagok to her and Ch’oe Su-ok. Kim Chŏng-ja wanted to learn kagok as a kagok accompanist.44 She researched Kim Chin-hyang’s kagok experiences and her education under Ha Kyu-il and recounted them in detail in the book Sŏn’ga Ha Kyu-il Sŏnsaeng Yakchŏn.45 One year before her death,
Kim Chin-hyang appeared in the TV documentary and said “We should remember that kagok is obviously the fundamental form of Korean traditional music.”

**Chu San-wŏl (1894-1982):** Chu San-wŏl was born in P’yŏngyang and brought up in a middle class family. She learnt kagok, kasa and sijo from Ha Kyu-il in the Chosŏn Kwŏnbŏn. She was good at not only kagok but also calligraphy and kayagŭm. After she married a patriot, Son Pyŏng-hŭi in 1911, she spent her life supporting him until his death. He was more than twenty years older than her and she had no children. After his death, she often sang kagok, kasa and sijo when she felt lonely, but she almost ceased her official kagok performances.46

**Yi Nan-hyang (1900-1979):** When Yi Nan-hyang was only thirteen years old she was chosen as the representative of a little kisaeng group (tonggi) in P’yŏngyang. Hence, she was sent to perform for a party for the king at the palace (chinyŏn) in Seoul. From there, she entered the Chosŏn Kwŏnbŏn in 1914 and learnt kagok, kasa, sijo and dance, mainly from Ha Kyu-il. Her specialty was channorae (variations of the authentic kagok - Nong, Rak, P’yŏn and P’yŏngnong) and kasa. Her delicate sikimsae technique was especially well known. After her marriage to a press reporter, Mr. Nam, as his second wife she continued to learn kagok from Ha Kyu-il at the Chosŏn Kwŏnbŏn. Eventually

---

46 Kim Chin-hyang. 1991: 139-142.
she released a kagok record in 1935, which was the first recording of female kagok. In total, she released six gramophone recordings during her life.\(^{47}\)

i) Two kagok recordings
[Columbia 40369-A (21257) Kyerak]
[Columbia 40369-B (21258) P’yŏn]

ii) Two kasa recordings
[Columbia 40155-A (21259) Sangsa pyŏlgok]
[Columbia 40155-B (21260) Paekkusa]

iii) One folk song (Tanga)
[Taihei (8210-ACK697) Nokŭmbangcho]

iv) Kayagŭm performance
[Taihei(8210-BCK696) Kayagŭm – pyŏngch’ang]

The above recordings were released after her marriage and it was very unusual for a married kisaeng to learn kagok continuously. Without her husband’s support she could not have kept up her musical life. She was also famous for her filial piety towards her blind mother-in-law and after three years of enthusiastic care, her mother-in-law regained her eyesight.\(^{48}\)

Sŏ Sanhoju (1910-?): Sŏ Sanhoju was born in Seoul. She was an adopted daughter of Ha Kyu–il and learnt kagok and dance from him. She left four gramophone recordings made during the Japanese colonization: i) Polydor 19010-A Kyerak, ii)

---


Polydor 19010-B, Hwap’yŏn iii) Polydor 19010-A, Kasa Ch’unmyŏngok iv) Polydor 19010-B.49

There are only a few gramophone recordings left from this era, because the cost of recordings was very expensive. Any resources of these kisaeng’s lives, including musical performances and recordings, are extremely limited. Luckily, Kim Chin-hyang wrote down brief accounts of their lives in Sŏn’ga Ha Ku-il Sŏnsaeng Yakhŏn based on her memories of them as colleagues.

2. 2. The survival of kisaeng

After independence from Japan, Korea was still unstable, politically and economically. In addition, the Korean War broke out the country during 1950-1953. Since the war, Western culture, including music, has dominated Korea. As the interaction has increased, the musical changes have taken place in Korea. Although the traditional music has increased so that today there are over 400 members of the NCKTPA (National Centre for Korean Traditional Performing Arts), there are around 30 university courses in traditional music and there are more recordings of traditional music than ever before, kisaeng have disappeared and kagok is marginalized.

49 Korean Traditional Music Disc Museum.
If any Kwŏnbŏn kisaeng was alive today she would be at least eighty years old. All kisaeng concealed their connections with kisaeng unions, and are consequently impossible to find. For example, a famous kagok kisaeng, Chi Hwa-ja, married and had sons. However, she did not want to give kagok performances or teach it again when someone offered opportunities for this. The reason was that she did not want to reveal her past which could bring disgrace on her family.\(^{50}\) Today, the word ‘kisaeng’ only exists as an historical term.

When the author visited Korea in 2001 to carry out archival research of kagok and kisaeng schools, it was very difficult to find any former kisaeng or to obtain any information about kisaeng. Just as hope was being lost, rumors were heard about two women thought to be former kisaeng. One Korean musicologist recommended that two elderly singers (Muk Kye-wŏl and Kwŏn Il-ji), believed to be two surviving kisaeng, be interviewed.

\[\text{a) Muk Kye-wŏl (b.1921)}^{51}\]

In the *Garland Encyclopedia of World Music*, Muk Kye-wŏl was considered a well trained musician as well as being a

\(^{50}\) Cho Soon-ja. personal interview. Masan. 5 July. 2001.

\(^{51}\) The photo was taken from [http://kt.blg.yahoo.com/see/0728222](http://kt.blg.yahoo.com/see/0728222). access. 12 May. 2006.
“courtesan.” However, she denied that she used to be *kisaeng*. Muk Kye-wŏl turned out to be the holder of the Human Cultural Property of *minyo* (folk song) in Kyŏnggi province. When I visited her (at eighty-twon years old) in 2001, she lived with her only daughter and granddaughters in a small apartment in Seoul. I interviewed her:

I was not a *kisaeng*. I really enjoyed singing songs in my early childhood, and I was famous as the best singer in the village. The reason I went to Kwŏnbŏn, at the age of ten was to learn Korean folk songs. I was very good at Korean folk song so my adopted mother sent me there to learn from a good teacher. In fact, I wanted to learn *kagok*. After testing my voice, my teacher sent me to a folk song class. My colleagues were also girls around eleven or twelve years-old. Most of them were trained to be *kisaeng*. My class-mates had to learn ‘daily rules for good manners and behaviour for *kisaeng*, such walking style and sitting posture and how to make attractive and sexy facial expressions. I have never ever served men at parties. I just sang folk songs for them. When my singing study did not improve sufficiently, the teacher used to hit my legs with a rod. The rules of the institution and teachers were very strict.  

Muk Kye-wŏl’s strong denial of her past career as a *kisaeng* or courtesan was found in other sources: “She began to sing from a teacher at a courtesan institute when eight years old, although in later life, she denied she ever worked as a courtesan. While

---


53 Muk Kye-wŏl. personal interview. 20 August. 2001.
still a child, she frequently sang on radio, and her career really took off after she won first prize at a contest in Inch’on in 1941.”

b) **Kwŏn Il-ji (b. 1926)**

Cho Soon-ja advised the author to meet Kwŏn Il-ji for the research of *kisaeng*. Kwŏn Il-ji is the holder of the Provincial Human Cultural property of *kagok* and *sijo* in Taegu. When the author visited her, she seemed lonely living by herself in a very small flat. In spite of her age she looked very healthy and elegant. She has not married and has no child, which is extremely unusual, for her age, in Korea. Most former *kisaeng* did not marry during their life time although some *kisaeng* were chosen as the concubines of the upper class literati or rich men. Kwŏn Il-ji did not talk about her life at all but *kagok* singing itself. However, the author tried to build a rapport with her, while learning *kagok*. In the second visit to her, the author asked her about ‘*kisaeng*’ she also denied being a *kisaeng* and emphasized her career as a *kagok* singer. For example, Yi Po-hyŏng, one of the honorable Korean traditional musicologists, recommended she live in Seoul to give frequent *kagok* performances there. In addition, she tried to show her deep

---

54 Howard, Keith. 2006a: 93-94.

55 This date may be inaccurate as Koreans of that age did not have their births registered until a few years afterwards, because of the high infant mortality rate.
relationship with Kim Wŏl-ha (the holder of the Human Cultural Property of \textit{kagok} and \textit{sijo}). Kwon Il-ji called Kim Wŏl-ha as ‘hyŏngnim’ my sister, and met her often in Seoul.

In my last (fourth) visit to her, she did, reluctantly, mention her past. She grew up in a poor family and looked after her sister everyday rather than going to school. While looking after her sister she was attracted by the sound of \textit{kagok} and \textit{sijo} in a village. Old men and women often gathered together and sang \textit{kagok} and \textit{sijo}. In addition, her aunt was a \textit{kisaeng} and the aunt visited Kwon in her house wearing beautiful garments, which also attracted Kwon to be a \textit{kisaeng}. Thereby, Kwon went to the Taegu Kwŏnbŏn (Taegu Kisaeng school) to learn about \textit{kagok}: “I did everything in order to learn more \textit{kagok}. I was so enthusiastic about learning \textit{kagok} that I served and even slept with my teacher, Chŏng Kyŏng-t’ae (b.1917), a renowned male \textit{kagok} and \textit{sijo} singer in those days.”\textsuperscript{56}

Despite the fact that both singers all tried to hide their past as \textit{kisaeng}, they contributed greatly to the preservation of \textit{kisaeng}’s songs and female \textit{kagok}. Even after their retirement, today they are still teaching Korean traditional songs, privately, and give performances. Muk Kye-wŏl, for example, received an honorable prize as a ‘\textit{Kugak insang}’ [The best Korean Traditional Musician] in 2004.

\textsuperscript{56} Kwon Il-ji. personal interview. Taegu. 17 August. 2001.
2. 2. 1. Kagok singers in the late twentieth century

Since Japanese colonization (1910-1945) and a demoralizing civil war in 1950s and 1960s, Korean traditional music has suffered considerably. Numerous tradition-bearers were killed and valuable primary sources and oral transmission were significantly lost. Even Koreans did not recognize the value of their heritage, including traditional music, while anything foreign was treated as valuable. Robert Provine recalled those days:

When I first arrived in South Korea in the late 1960s, it was obvious that most young Koreans, and many older ones as well, felt that anything Western (music, for example) was good and that anything Korean was inferior. . . . In the 1970s, when I was doing research in Korea for my Ph.D. dissertation, my drum teacher wanted me, a foreigner, to preserve his music and spread it around the world, because there was little interest from young Koreans, and he felt that his art would otherwise die forever. 57

The situation was dire enough in 1962 for the South Korean government to promulgate the Cultural Property Preservation Law (Munhwajaе pohobŏp) as an attempt to both investigate Korea’s cultural roots and preserve and promote its heritage. The new system is called ‘the Human Cultural Property System (Muhyŏng munhwajaе

chedo) and was established in 1964.\textsuperscript{58} Also in 1968, the National Centre for Korean Traditional Performing Arts (Kungnip Kugakwŏn) was established to preserve and transmit Korean traditional music and dance. Since 
\textit{Chongmyo Cheryeak} (a Rite for Royal Ancestors) was chosen as a category of the first of the Human Cultural Properties (Muhyŏng munhwaje) in 1964, seventeen musical genres have been selected to receive the award.

\textit{Kagok} was chosen as Property 30 in 1969 and female \textit{kagok} was chosen in 1973. Kim Wŏl-ha was the first recipient of the female \textit{kagok} singer category of the Human Cultural Property of \textit{kagok}. The recipients are given monthly stipends and they also have the responsibility for giving a performance annually and teaching their students during their life time. The payment only began in the mid 1970s.\textsuperscript{59} After being chosen as the recipient, Kim Wŏl-ha had a responsibility to give regular performances and transmit her knowledge of \textit{kagok} singing to her students called ‘Chŏnsuja’ or ‘Chŏnsusaeng’. Their students also receive a scholarship from the Cultural Properties Administration (Munhwaje Ch’ŏng). Masters students might be chosen to succeed as a Human Cultural Property later. After Kim Wŏl-ha’s death, no one replaced her position

\textsuperscript{58} Hesselink, Nathan. “Samul Nori as Traditional Preservation and Innovation in a South Korean Contemporary Percussion Genre.” \textit{Ethnomusicology} 48. 3 (2004b) : 407.

\textsuperscript{59} Howard, Keith. 2006a: 10.
for four years. The reason was that Kim Wŏl-ha’s master student, Kim Yŏng-gi was so young and her musical career was not advanced enough to receive the honorable position. Cho Soon-ja had had no relationship with Kim Wŏl-ha’s school. Eventually, the Cultural Properties Committee (Munhwajae Wiwŏnhoe) chose both of them as Human Cultural Properties of female kagok, in 2000.

i) Kim Wŏl-ha (1918-1996)  

Kim Wŏl-ha was chosen as the first Human Cultural Property of kagok in 1973, and her contribution to Korean traditional classical music was tremendous. She learnt kagok in 1951, by chance, from a sijo club in Pusan. When she went tramping in Mt. Kŭmjŏng, to heal her weakened body, she was attracted to the sound of sijo singing. Learning sijo healed her broken heart (she had lost her husband in the Korean War). She started learning kagok from Yi Chu-hwan in 1953 and he also gave her the pen name, Wŏl-ha. She was very popular for her beautiful voice, which was described by Han Myŏng-hŭi as “… much clearer than the water from the fountain in the beautiful mountain Myohyang, and much clearer than the wind from the

---

Pacific Ocean to the forests. Her timbre sounds like a flute from an angel and her clear sound is similar to the moonlight in autumn.”61

Kim Wŏl-ha was so enthusiastic about teaching kagok that she wished to establish a kagok school. The Wŏl-ha Foundation (Wŏl-ha Munhwa Chaedan) was established after her death in 1991. The foundation was organized by her students to preserve kagok by offering scholarships and supporting conferences. The president of the foundation is Kim Kyŏng-bae who is the Human Cultural Property of male kagok. He is also an adopted son of Kim Wŏl-ha. Hence, she supported his kagok study by teaching him and providing financial aid.

Kim Wŏl-ha left more than eleven recordings of kagok and sijo.62 In spite of her significant contribution to kagok, very little material remains to show how she taught it. She did not even release her own kagok solo recording, most of her kagok recordings are the part of the traditional music series. Eventually, in 2004, her solo CD containing her kagok singing during 1971-1973 was released by her student Sin Un-hŭi.63

63 See the Appendix I
ii) Cho Soon-ja (b. 1944)

Cho Soon-ja formally started learning Korean traditional music at the age of fifteen, in 1959, as a member of the Korean Traditional Music Performers’ Group of the Chungang Broadcasting Commission (Chungang Pangsongguk). She learnt various types of Korean traditional music and dance, including vocal forms and instruments, and then she gave performances to the public and to foreigners at many concerts organized by the Korean government. Three years later, she entered the National Centre for Korean Performing Arts. Since her meeting with her teacher, Yi Chu-hwan, at the National Centre for Korean Performing Arts in 1962, her musical career has been reinforced as a kagok singer. When the Korean government offered the Korean Traditional Classical Music Concert to Japan for the first time in 1964, Cho Soon-ja and Yi Chu-hwan sang the kagok song ‘T’ae p’yōngga’ as a duet and Cho also gave a solo performance. Plate1-2. The following is the photo of the first tour of Korean traditional music performers group in 1964:
After that concert Cho concentrated on learning and performing *kagok* as a professional *kagok* singer, although she has lived in Masan, far away from Seoul, since her marriage. In spite of the long distance from Seoul to Masan, Cho Soon-ja learnt *kagok* from Hong Wŏn-gi and Yi Nan-hyang after her marriage. It was very unusual for Hong Wŏn-gi to travel such a long distance to teach his student, Cho Soon-ja. He probably recognized her talent and musicality.

Forty years of enthusiastic work on *kagok* resulted in more than one hundred *kagok* performances in domestic and international music concerts. Cho often performed *kagok*, not only with Yi Chu-hwan but also with the Human Cultural Property of male

---

64 The first male on the right is Yi Chu-hwan and the second person on the left in the first row is Cho Soon-ja.
www.chosoonja.org.
Kagok, Hong Wŏn-gi (1922-1997), Kim Kyŏng-bae and other outstanding male and female kagok singers.

As has already been stated, the most honorable position for a kagok singer, the Human Cultural Property of Kagok, was awarded to Cho Soon-ja in 2000, and it recognized her social position as the eldest kagok singer who learnt kagok from Yi Chu-hwan and Hong Wŏn-gi after Kim Wŏl-ha. Her teachers, Yi Chu-hwan, Hong Wŏn-gi and Yi Nan-hyang, therefore, probably expected Cho Soon-ja to help prolong kagok’s popularity. Cho did not stop at merely introducing the first and second suite of kagok in her performances. She produced CDs and a notation book of the second and third suite.

of kagok: the release of the second and third suites of kagok on CDs was significant in the history of kagok because no kagok singer had recorded them before.

Furthermore, her publication Yŏch'ang Kagok Mahŭndasŏtnip [The Forty-five Songs of Female Kagok] contains those three suites (forty-five songs) of female kagok in a form of chŏngganbo notation, As she stated in the preface of the book, the goal of the book was to provide a more readable notation than before:

“This notation book was the outcome of my kagok experiences of singing, teaching, thinking and the consideration of previous kagok notation books. I tried to present the original clear pure sound of kagok rather than the decorative and skilful aspects. I also intended to correct the mistakes of the previous notation books which were just copied from other kagok notation books or written by a non-kagok singer.”

Among Cho Soon-ja’s musical performances, the concerts for the revival of the second and third suites, are historical works, because no other gave such performances in the twentieth century.

iii) Kim Yŏng-gi (b. 1958)

Kim Yŏng-gi is considered to be the best student of Kim Wŏl-ha. Kim Yŏng-gi has learnt kagok from Kim Wŏl-ha since her childhood. When the author met her in order to record her singing, the author was surprised at the tone colour of her voice.

which was quite similar to that of her teacher, Kim Wŏl-ha, although Kim Yŏng-gi’s speaking voice was not similar to her teacher’s. The author asked Kim Yŏng-gi if she had a video recording of her *kagok* lessons with Kim Yŏng-gi. Unfortunately, Kim Yŏng-gi did not have a video recording either of her *kagok* lessons or Kim Wŏl-ha’s *kagok* singing with hand movements, although Kim Wŏl-ha died only ten years ago, in 1993.

However, Kim Yŏng-gi’s general musical education was through the modern system, which gave her a different musical background from the other Human Cultural Properties. For example, she graduated from the Korean National High School of Traditional Music and Seoul National University. Her father was on the staff of the National Centre for Korean Traditional Performing Arts, which gave her many opportunities to meet famous Korean traditional musicians and learn from them. She is also a professional *kŏmun’go* player.

**iv) Lee Jun-a (b.1963)**

Lee Jun-a is the representative singer of Korean traditional classical songs at the National Centre of Korean Performing Arts. Her position requires her to sing all classical genres, *kagok*, *kasa* and *sijo* and give performances of traditional classical songs, very often in Korea and overseas, as a representative singer. She learnt *kŏmun’go*
at the National High School of Korean Traditional Music in Seoul and also learnt *kagok* with Kim Yong-gi from Kim Wol-ha. Her specialty is *kasa* rather than *kagok* and she holds the position of successor to the Human Cultural Property of *Kasa*. Two unique singing styles are instantly recognized: frequent oscillation and wider vibrato. Her teacher Yi Yang-gyo pointed out that her unique vocal style is much closer to *kasa* and *sijo* than to *kagok*.

v) **Ch’oe Su-ok (b.1944)**

Ch’oe Su-ok was the colleague of Cho Soon-ja in the *kagok* class of Yi Chu-hwan. In 1987 Ch’oe Su-ok and Kim Chong-ja met Kim Chin-hyang and became her students, thus continuing the lineage from Ha Kyu-il. Eventually Ch’oe Su-ok and Kim Chong-ja published a *kagok* notation book in Kim Chin-hyang’s book ‘*Sŏn’ga Ha Kyu-il Sŏnsaengs*’ in 1993. Actually Ch’oe Su-ok ceased being a performing musician but continued teaching *kagok* at Seoul National University. Her *sondongjak* were unclear and vague when the author recorded her singing. She only used *sondongjak* when correcting students, but her students did not follow her *sondongjak*.

vi) **Other singers and *kagok* recordings**

the position of The Human Cultural Property of *kagok* was vacant for four years. However, this fact stimulated *kagok* singers to be more productive: CDs of female *kagok* were released rapidly. Kim Wŏl-ha’s students such as Han Cha-i (1999), Hwang Suk-kyŏng (2001), Kim Yŏng-gi (2000 & 2002), and Kang Kwŏn-sun (2004), released their solo CDs to enhance their careers. Cho Soon-ja extended her repertory from the first suite to the second and third suites in 1998.

Between 1969 and 2004, twenty *kagok* LPs and CDs have been released. Among the twenty recordings, the following six CDs show how *kagok* has been sung and inherited from Ha Kyu-il to the present day. Ha Kyu-il & Yi Nan-hyang were originally recorded during the Japanese colonization, and two of them (by Yi Chu-hwan and Kim Wŏl-ha) are reproductions of the tape recordings of the 1970s.

---

67 See the Discography
[Ha Kyu-il & Yi Nan-hyang, 1993 (Rec.1930s) SYNCD-058B]

[Ha Kyu-il, 1993 (Rec.1928-1948), SYNCD 006]


[Cho Soon-ja, 1998 (Rec.1986 & 1998)]

[Chi Kŭm-jŏng & Kim Ho-sŏng 1999 (Rec.1970s) NSSRCD]

[Plate 2-6: Historical Kagok singers’ Records]
2. 3. Today’s repertoire of kagok

Kagok has been passed down with its anthologies. They contain not only texts but also the performance style, mode, and other musical information. The three kagok anthologies [Ch’ŏnggu yŏngŏn, Kagok wŏllyu and Haedong kayo] were first introduced as the repertoire of kagok. However, Cho Soon-ja has recently published, Songs and People in the Kagok Anthologies,\(^69\) which introduced nineteen, newly annotated, kagok collections.

It is hard to find evidence for the preset order of performance, like today’s kagok han pat’ang, in the anthologies. Hundreds of pieces in the anthologies were categorized by the theme of the songs, or their mode or forms.\(^70\) Also the number of songs sung varied, depending on the occasion. In Kŭmok ch’ongbu, the eight songs were selected, rather than twenty-four songs, for the princess’s birthday feast. Only three songs were performed for the sixtieth birthday party of Taewŏngun,\(^71\) which corresponds with Chang Sa-hun’s remarks: If a singer started to sing kagok, kagok accompanists had to begin accompanying the singing, without pre-knowledge of what the song would be. If, however, kagok accompanists performed a prelude of any song,


from the *kagok* repertoire, the singer had to quickly pick up the right song from the prelude. Therefore, singers and accompanists need high musicality.\(^72\) Today, a *kagok* piece has a preset form of five vocal sections and instrumental pieces. It also has a preset place within in a suite of fifteen songs (the *han pat’ang*). In total, one hundred and fifty-six *kagok* songs (eighty-five songs for male and seventy-one songs for female) have been transmitted. These were notated by Ha Kyu-il in 1926. The seventy-one female songs are as follows.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of fifteen forms of the suite</th>
<th>Number of existing songs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>P’yŏngjo</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Isudaeyŏp</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Chunggŏ</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. P’yŏnggŏ</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Tugŏ</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>P’yŏngjo</em>Kyemyŏn</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Panyŏp</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Kyemyŏnjo</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Isudaeyŏp</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Chunggŏ</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. P’yŏnggŏ</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Tugŏ</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. P’yŏngnong</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Urak</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Pyŏngjo</em>Kyemyŏn</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Hwan’gyerak</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Kyerak</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. P’yŏnsudaeyŏp</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. T’aep’yŏngga</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 2-3: The number of *kagok* repertoire today]\(^73\)

\(^{72}\) Chang Sa-hun. 1985: 422.

\(^{73}\) Chang Sa-hun. 1985: 430-431.
Among the above collections, most professional *kagok* singers can sing only the first suite (fifteen songs). The second, third and fourth suites became forgotten, in spite of their notational preservation. The titles of the second and third suites are as follows:

(Note: the title of each song is named after the first three syllables of the song):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of fifteen forms of the suite</th>
<th>First suite</th>
<th>Second suite</th>
<th>Third suite</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Pyŏngjo</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Isudaeyŏp</td>
<td>Pŏdŭrŭn</td>
<td>Kanbame</td>
<td>Tongjittal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Chunggŏ</td>
<td>Ch’ŏngjoya</td>
<td>Ch’ŏngkyesan</td>
<td>Kanbame</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. P’yŏnggŏ</td>
<td>Ōjŏ naelin</td>
<td>Kkume daninŭn</td>
<td>Kkume</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Tugŏ</td>
<td>Ilgaki</td>
<td>Hansumŭn</td>
<td>Siktuldan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Panyŏp</td>
<td>Namhayŏ</td>
<td>Tanane</td>
<td>Ōnyaki</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Kyemyŏnjo</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Isudaeyŏp</td>
<td>Ōnyaki</td>
<td>Hwangsok / Ihwau</td>
<td>Turyusan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Chunggŏ</td>
<td>Sanch’one</td>
<td>Ihwae</td>
<td>Sŏsane</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. P’yunggŏ</td>
<td>Ch’o거래nge</td>
<td>Nokch’o</td>
<td>Nugu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Tugŏ</td>
<td>Imsulchi</td>
<td>Twismaee</td>
<td>Ch’ŏnjje</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. P’anngong</td>
<td>Paktu</td>
<td>Hansone</td>
<td>Ch’ŏdang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Urak</td>
<td>Paramŭn</td>
<td>Yujanŭn</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Hwan’gyerak</td>
<td>Apnaena</td>
<td>Sarangŭl</td>
<td>Mularae</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Kyerak</td>
<td>Ch’ŏngsando</td>
<td>Ch’ŏngsalli</td>
<td>Paramdo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. P’yonsudaeyŏp</td>
<td>Moranŭn</td>
<td>Mosirŭl</td>
<td>Wŏlip’yŏn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. T’aep’yŏngga</td>
<td>Irado</td>
<td>Irado</td>
<td>Irado</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 2-4: The list of existing *kagok* repertoire today]\(^{74}\)

---

The above, marginalized, *kagok* songs were recently sung on the stage. Cho Soon-ja preserved these valuable second and third suites through her performances. She also released the second and third suite of *kagok* on CDs in 2000. These CDs are first recordings of the second and third suites in the history of *kagok*. Cho’s active musical works stimulated other singers: Kim Yŏng-gi also rushed to release the second suite of *kagok* in 2002 and a second suite performance in 2003.

It is evident that *kagok* singers’ musical performances and recordings became much more active after Kim Wŏl-ha’s death in 1996 in order to make *kagok* more popular. However, the collection is still very limited. The works were produced by only a few professional singers.

2. 4. *Kagok* history: manuscripts and anthologies

2. 4. 1. Development of *Kagok*: old manuscripts of *kagok*’s accompanying instrument ‘*kŏmun’go*’

Manuscripts of *kagok*, around the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, the earliest period of *kagok* development, were designed not for a singer but for a *kŏmun’go* player. *Kŏmun’go* has been considered as the most noble and rich instrument, so it has been enjoyed by literati as the accompanying instruments. If instruments are shown about

---

75 See the Discography.
literati’s *p’ungnyu kŏmun’go* is always accompanied. The role of the *kŏmun’go* is usually to play the principal notes of the *kagok* melody. It is the most important instrument of the *kagok* ensemble. Therefore, teachers even today, strongly recommend that *kagok* students also learn *kŏmun’go* as the representative accompanying instrument in Korean music.

The earliest manuscripts of the period found were *Kŭmhap chabo* (1572), *Yanggŭm sinbo* (1610) and *Hyŏn’gŭm t’ongmun yugi* (1620). Most titles of the manuscripts have the word ‘*kŭm*’ which means *kŏmun’go*. These valuable manuscripts do not mention female singing at all. This is not surprising, because, the Chosŏn dynasty was a male dominated society and female *kagok* singers (*kisaeng*) were of a very low class. Therefore, it was inappropriate to mention lower class females. In these manuscripts, the slowest songs (*Mandaeyŏp*), the medium tempo songs (*Chungdaeyŏp*) and the faster tempo songs (*Saktaeyŏp*) were considered to be the origin of *kagok* in terms of mode, form and musical style. However, those songs gradually disappeared. The reason for this was explained in the historical book *Sŏngho sasŏl* written by the Korean scholar, Yi Ik (1681-1763), in the eighteenth century:

---

Today, [The seventeenth and eighteenth century in the Chosŏn dynasty] there is one vocal genre called Taeyŏpcho, but these songs do not have rhythmic cycles. Among them, these are three kinds of styles called Cho: Mandaeyŏp, Chungdaeeyŏp and Saktaeyŏp which were originally from Samgigok [Popular song of the Koryŏ dynasty (935-1392)]. However, Mandaeyŏp were too slow to enjoy, hence they disappeared a long time ago. Chungdaeeyŏp was a bit faster than the Mandaeyŏp, but people also disliked it because it was still too slow. Only Saktaeyŏp is still enjoyed. \(^{78}\)

The evidence of the above three Taeyŏpcho’s appearance and disappearance is shown in the old kŏmun’go manuscripts as well. The following table shows it clearly.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Slow Man</th>
<th>Medium Chung</th>
<th>Fast Sak</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Taeak hubo (records music from 1455 to 1468)</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kŭm hapchabo (1572)</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yanggŭm shinbo (1610)</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hyŏn’gŭm t’ongmun yungi (1620)</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chŏngbo kokŭmbo</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paegunam kŭmbo (1610-1636)</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hyŏn’gŭm shinjŭng karyŏng (1680)</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Han’gŭm shinbo (1724)</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ch’ŏnggu yŏngŏn (1728)</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shinjak kŭmbo (1724-1776)</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yuyeji (1776 and 1800)</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kurach’ŏlsa kŭmjabo (1800 and 1834)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uhŏn kŭmbo (early King Kojong)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Samjuk kŭmbo (King Kojong period)</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kagok wŏllyu (1876)</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kŭmhaek chŏryo (late King Kojong period)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hyŏn’gŭm oŭm t’ongnon (1886)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hapk’o kŭmbo (1915?)</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mussang shin’gu chapk chip (1915)</td>
<td>○</td>
<td>○</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 2-5: Notations of Mandaeyŏp, Chungdaeeyŏp and Saktaeyŏp in old manuscripts] \(^{79}\)

---

As *saktaeyŏp* was popular in the beginning of the eighteenth century, *saktaeyŏp* was extended to many modified songs such as *Nong* (rich), *Nak* (joyful) and *P’yŏn* (modified). These modified songs increased *kagok*’s popularity, as they provided a more extended repertoire.

### 2. 4. 2. The flourishing era of *kagok*: professional *kagok* singers (*kagaek*) and anthologies.

The late eighteenth and the beginning of the nineteenth century are considered to be the climax of the history of *kagok*, because of the appearance of professional *kagok* singers (*kagaek*) and creations of *Kagok* anthologies. *Kagaek* organized professional *kagok* clubs (*kadan*) and made its anthologies. For example, a member of the most renowned *kadan* (*Kyŏngjŏngsan kadan*) Kim Sŏng-gi resigned his honorable, governmental position and concentrated on performing *kagok* and learnt other accompanying instruments such as *kŏmun’go, pip’a, kagok* and flutes to be a *kagaek*. He finally made his *kagok* anthologies in 1763.

The social status of *kagaek* was a middle class, called *chungin*. Hahn Man-yŏng distinguished types of music in Korea related by the social classes: “at one end of a continuum is ritual music and music specifically for use at court entertainments and

---

banquets. At the other end is folk music proper, the music of the lower classes or
sangmin. Chŏngak, the music of the chungin, middle class, is of equal importance, for
all three traditions remain alive in the present time."\(^\text{81}\) In the Chosŏn dynasty The
chungin comprised technicians, sons of higher class concubines, officers of the dynasty
or businessmen, who were well educated and rich but did not belong to the higher class.
They pursued yangban’s (highest literati group) life so kagok singing was an ideal for
their entertainment. Cho Kyu-ik, a Korean literature scholar, describes this era as
follows:

One of the most characteristic aspects of kagok in the late Chosŏn
dynasty was the organized professional kagok groups. Social and
political changes in the late Chosŏn dynasty led to the speedy
popularization of art, including music, so professional kagok singers
were naturally in demand. Previously, traditional kagok was sung by the
‘literati’ so there was a limit as to who could perform kagok. As art
became popular from the lower class to the higher class, the middle class
who knew the artistic demands of both classes produced professional
artists, including musicians. Professional kagok singers were from the
middle class who worked . . . Kim Ch’ŏn-t’aek can be considered to be
the first professional kagok singer.\(^\text{82}\)

---

\(^{81}\) Hahn Man-young. 1991: 61.

Professional *kagok* singers including Kim Ch’ŏn-t’aek produced three anthologies and these were at the forefront of developments of *kagok* in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. The three anthologies were:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Editor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Ch’ŏnggu yŏngŏn</em></td>
<td>(1728)</td>
<td>Kim Ch’ŏn-t’aek,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Haedong kayo</em></td>
<td>(1763)</td>
<td>Kim Su-jang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Kagok wŏllyu</em></td>
<td>(1876)</td>
<td>An Min-yŏng</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Park Hyo-gwan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The editors of these anthologies were all eminent male *kagok* singers of the time.

The preface of *Ch’ŏnggu yŏngŏn* (1728), written by Chŏng Yun-gyŏng, shows Kim Ch’ŏn-t’aek’s *kagok* singing:

Kim Ch’ŏn-t’aek was already a famous *kagok* singer and he was good at composing new *kagok* songs. His best friend Kim Sŏng-gi was a good *kŏmun’go* accompanist. When Kim Sŏng-gi played the *kŏmun’go*, Kim Ch’ŏn-t’aek sang *kagok* as a responsorial song. The harmony of those sounds was really beautiful, enough to attract ghosts. Their musical performances were the best in those days. No other *kagok* singers were more famous than them. 83

*Kagaek*’s active performances contributed to *kagok*’s popularization and as a result, different types of variations of *kagok* were created. A Korean traditional music scholar, Chun Inpyong, explained that the reasons for the creation of many variations of *kagok*, rather than new-style songs, were based on *Yegi* written by a Confucian. “Only

‘sŏngja [a holy man] knows the nature of music yeak and could create music: only
‘myŏngja [a wise man] can teach and explain yeak.” Therefore, in terms of Confucian
principles, a musician would not try to create new songs (suribujak), but only vary
them.  

Eventually, the formal order of all pieces in female and male han pat’ang (one
suite) were established in the nineteenth century and these fifteen forms of kagok
correspond to today’s kagok han pat’ang. The following tree illustrates how today’s
kagok han pat’ang was formed.

---

[Figure 2-2: The development of kagok]85

---

In spite of the vigorous activity of *kagok* in the eighteenth and nineteenth century, only male *kagok* singers’ names have been passed down today, like the authors of anthologies. The names of female *kagok* singers before the twentieth-century have still not been found, although their existence is evident.

2. 4. 3. The earliest evidence of female *kagok*

The earliest evidence of female *kagok* lies in ‘*Samjuk kŭmb*’, published in 1841, which was the *kagok* notation book for *kōmun’go* as an accompanying instrument.86 This book contains the Chinese character ‘女’, female, at the front of the text in the three songs: (‘*Ujo Isudaeyŏp*’, ‘*Ujo Chorim*’ and ‘*Kyemyŏn Chorim*’). The following red circle shows the character ‘女’, female, from *Samjuk kŭmbo*.

---

The earliest information about female kagok’s repertoire is in one sijo (poem)


The kŏmun’go sounds improve as its bridges and strings are moved. The tuning sounds of the introduction are long and gloomy, The p’iri lead becomes softer by sucking and sucking. The haegŭm bow becomes cheerful by being spread with rosin. The changgo sounds higher by squeezing its laces. The ensemble sound makes me relaxed and peaceful. After the ensemble, a little kisaeng starts kagok with a face slightly bent down. The tunes are Ujo, Kyemyŏn, Soyong, P’yŏllrak ..... 

87 Song Bang-song. 1984: 984. [Notation no.19]
As can be seen the above sijo Hanyangga clearly describes the kagok ensemble’s preparation for performance. The four kagok’s accompanying instruments kŏmun’go (the seven stringed zither) haegŭm (two stringed-fiddle) and changgo (hourglass shaped drum) describe how they were tuned for a kagok performance. In addition, the last line mentions the female kagok singer (little kisaeng), the modes of kagok (ujo and kyemyŏn) and the repertoire of kagok (Soyong and P’yŏllak). This earliest evidence of a female kagok’s existence was written in the nineteenth century, which is the climax of kagok history. During this era, 1870, Yŏch’ang kayorok (female kagok text book) was written in purely Korean script, called ‘Han’gŭl’ rather than in Chinese characters. The repertoire of the book is kagok wŏllyu’s female sijo.

2. 4. 4. The decline of kagok

It is obvious that the Chosŏn dynasty, with its Confucian ideology, began to change during the nineteenth century, as kaehwa sasang (enlightened thought) spread through Chosŏn society, as the new ideology among the progressive scholars. In addition, Western rationalism and the egalitarianism and humanism of Christianity spread throughout Korea from China in the late Chosŏn dynasty. The infusion of these new ideologies produced new and popular musical genres, which were enjoyed by the

---

89 Trans. Lee In-suk.
middle class and lower class, such as minyo (folk songs) p’ansori (a one-man operatic form) and sanjo (an improvised solo instrumental form). For the celebration of the 40th anniversary of the enthronement of King Kojong, Hyŏmyulsa Theater was launched in 1902. It provided a venue for the systematic activities of professional folk music. Consequently, new ideologies emerged and other musical genres than kagok were extended. This directly influenced the falling away of the popularity of kagok. Cho Kyu-ik, a Korean literature scholar, pointed out that the most renowned kagaek, Park Hyo-gwan, ignored this new ideology (enlightened thought), and strongly advocated Confucianism, with its loyalty, patriotism and filial piety. These themes which had used in order to maintain upper class superiority were no longer popular in the late nineteenth century. Instead of kagok, sijo with its new ideology became popular. However, Kagok wollyu (1876) has been made supported by Taewŏngun, and Kyobang kayo (1872) shows the form of today’s han pat’ang.

In the late nineteenth century, p’ansori was also enjoyed in kagok p’ungnyubang, and was described in the anthologies of kagok, Kŭmbu ch’ongok (1885). In addition, p’ungnyubang kagok musicians, singers and accompanists naturally influenced

---

93 Kwon To-hui. 2003: 42.
musicians of other genres. Song Bang-song explains the circumstance: “Song lovers, singers, and entertainers brought the early form of Yŏngsan hoesang and various kagok to the surface in the late Chosŏn dynasty, which then became the deriving force for the development of folk music in Korea.”\(^\text{94}\) The flourishing of professional kagok singers and clubs began to diminish in the late nineteenth century, while sijo and the p’ansori genres became popular as folk music. The speed of the decline increased rapidly at the beginning of the twentieth century, spurred on by the collapse of the Chosŏn dynasty and thirty years of Japanese colonization. Referring to [Figure 2-2], it can be seen that varied forms of kagok were no longer created and the repertoire of kagok became very limited.

The reasons for kagok’s decline have not been clearly researched by Korean traditional music scholars beyond Kwŏn To-hŭi, who analyzed kagok’s decline and related it to Korean, literature scholars’ similar works. In the late Chosŏn dynasty, the object of music was self-entertainment rather than the cultivation of the human mind. Kim Su-jang (kagaek) regretted this change; “thirty years ago, there were many kagok singing groups of three or five people who gathered together in the forest or nearby waterfall and pine trees, and they sang all day long and thereby achieved a better higher

---

\(^{94}\) Song Bang-song, 2000b: 29.
2.4.5. The need for co-operative research between music and literature.

Paradoxically, the text of kagok, a musical form, has been researched more by Korean literature scholars, as a Korean traditional poetic genre, called sijo. The three valuable, kagok anthologies (Ch’ŏnggu yŏngŏn, Haedong kayo, Kagok wŏllyu) containing hundreds of sijo, have been researched and analyzed in terms of their literary aspects, such as the structure of the poetry and the interpretation of the old Korean words. However, research on sijo, without musical knowledge of kagok, is limited, which is insisted by the Korean literature scholars. Cho Tong-il, insisted that “In order to figure out the origin of sijo, we [Korean literature scholars] need to wait for the Korean music scholars’ work of kagok, because sijo is the text of kagok so the text is strongly related to musical structure.” Cho Soon-ja recognized this need for cooperative research, between scholars of Korean traditional music and Korean literature. Yet still today, little, combined research on kagok has been carried out in

---

order to explain the link between its music and literature. Cho Soon-ja often gives \textit{kagok} group lessons to Korean literature scholars and Korean musicologists, formally and informally, in order to discuss ‘\textit{kagok} as a musical genre’ and ‘\textit{kagok} as a literary genre’. She has been recognized as a valued adviser for this. A Korean literature scholar, Sin Kyŏng-suk acknowledged Cho Soon-ja in her papers.\textsuperscript{98} Korean literature scholars wanted to know \textit{sijo}’s musical aspects and they learnt \textit{kagok} from Cho Soon-ja, for more than one year, and performed with her in 2006. Cho Soon-ja also extended her own understanding of \textit{kagok} through the discussions with the literature scholars and the result was her recent publication, \textit{Songs and People in the Kagok Anthologies}.\textsuperscript{99} These cooperative works not only extend the knowledge about \textit{kagok} but also encourage \textit{kagok} singing.

\section*{Conclusion}

Too little attention has been paid to the documentation of female \textit{kagok} singers (\textit{kisaeng}), and \textit{kagok}’s history. References specifically to \textit{kisaeng}’s \textit{kagok} musical contributions and their education and control are lacking. Consequently, the earliest evidence of female \textit{kagok} was only one old manuscript and one poem, \textit{Hanyangga},


written in the nineteenth century, after the time when \textit{kagok} was at its peak.

In order to rectify this marginalization of female \textit{kagok} in history, \textit{kisaeng}’s great contribution to Korean traditional music, as composer, producer and audience were explained and documented. This exposes the distorted image of \textit{kisaeng} as ‘olden day prostitutes’. In addition, the documentation of \textit{kisaeng}’s writings and activities has been given, based on both music and literature scholars’ works. Interviews with two, elderly, experienced \textit{kisaeng}, although they both denied their past ‘being a \textit{kisaeng},’ has added a further insight into a \textit{kisaeng}’s life.

The study of \textit{kagok}’s history has revealed not only how \textit{kagok} has changed, but how it is in the present and may be in the future. Old manuscripts of \textit{kagok}’s accompanying instrument (\textit{kómun'go}), and historical anthologies confirmed female \textit{kagok}’s existence alongside male \textit{kagok}. In addition, old female \textit{kagok} text books, such as \textit{Kainp’ilhyu} and \textit{Yŏch’ang kayorok}, showed how female singers learnt \textit{kagok} before vocal notation existed. The study also documents how \textit{kagok} should be taught, considering the huge change of social and educational circumstances in Korea. The next chapter will compare \textit{kagok}’s traditional teaching method to the present one in order to find a more effective teaching method for future \textit{kagok}. 
CHAPTER 3

*Kagok* Education

Introduction

There is a Korean proverb which states that a dog who has lived with his poet master for three years, can recite poetry. This reflects the traditional belief of Koreans towards education, including music education, that a pupil could learn best by living with, and closely serving, their teacher. In such apprenticeship, the students not only learnt about music but also adopted their teacher’s attitudes and beliefs. Good examples are the *kisaeng* who learnt *kagok* from Ha Kyu-il for three or four years and who were automatically all a *ch’aemajún kisaeng* (the best *kisaeng* with elegance and nice manners). Students of Ha Kyu-il not only learnt *kagok* but also manners, attitude and elegant behaviour as well. Originally, a *ch’aemajún kisaeng* was called the best *kisaeng* because she had been trained in manners, performing arts, and Chinese art at a *kisaeng* school (*kyobang* or *kwŏnbŏn*) from her early childhood.¹ In contemporary Korea, it is impossible to learn *kagok* in the traditional way as “musical training moved from

---

¹ Kim Chin-hyang. 1993: 146-147.
apprenticeship into mainstream education.”

As the education system changed into Western style, the teaching methods, including those of music, were necessary to adjust to the changed circumstances. Ted Solis insisted “In teaching ensembles [world music ensembles] we subject and re-subject ourselves and our students to such “vicissitude of translation,” combining pedagogy, consultant self assessment, feedback that happens both in the moment and in semester and yearly evaluations, and the constant creative resynthesis of life experience.”

In spite of the huge change in kagok’s circumstances, little has been written about kagok’s pedagogical interface between the traditional way and the contemporary one, although the recognition of the importance of teaching methods in Korean traditional music education has been increased in contemporary Korea. Since 2002, The Kungnip-Kugakwŏn (National Centre for Korean Traditional Performing Arts) has established the annual teaching method competition, called “Korean Traditional Music Teaching Methods Contest” for current music teachers and young scholars. Most of the articles and new teaching methods in the competition were very practical, based on their teaching experience, although they were limited to folk

---

2 Howard, Keith. 1998b: 600.

music such as *samul nori, minyo changdan* and *changgo* performance. Only one teaching method applied to *kagok* and that one is by this author.⁴

This chapter will focus on a comparison of *kagok*’s educational circumstances and pedagogical methods between the past and the present. This is essential for the creation of a more effective and complete pedagogical method for the future of *kagok*. This chapter also attempts to reveal the difficulties of contemporary *kagok* education.

### 3. 1. The oral/aural tradition of *kagok*

#### 3. 1. 1. Traditional *kagok* class

In the traditional *kagok* class the teachers were respected and noble role models and were also expected to be knowledgeable ‘experts.’ For this reason, the teachers were dignified and authoritative, which caused them to be strict and serious in the class. Overall, the teacher’s impact on a student’s life was dramatic. In Confucianism, a teacher should always be respected by his students, as a king or parents were respected, which is described as ‘*Kunsabuilch’e.*’ This attitude towards a teacher still persists in Korean traditional music society although it is weakening in formal education in Korea.

---

The following famous painting of the Chosŏn dynasty shows the atmosphere in the class, especially the relationship between students and teachers. As it has been explained, females, except for *kisaeng*, were not seen in the classroom of the Chosŏn dynasty.

[Plate 3-1: ‘Sŏdang’ (a Village classroom) by Kim Hong-do in the eighteenth century].

In the above painting, the teacher in the class looks strict and is using a rod (beside the table), and a crying boy student seems to have been hit on his lower back leg with a rod by his teacher, which was the typical punishment. Other boy students look rather serious, but humorous as well. On the other hand, this picture also conveys
students’ respect for and obedience towards their teacher and the teacher’s love for his
students. This is because the painter Kim Hong-do painted the complex situation with
wit.

Originally, kagok was taught by the oral/aural tradition. In a typical kagok tutorial,
the only accompanying instrument was changgo and even this was not necessary as
beating the knees could replace the role of changgo. To teach kagok more effectively,
teachers described the movements of sound visually, with changgo sticks or hand
movements, sondongjak.⁵ Although notation books for kagok’s accompanying
instruments have existed since the sixteenth century, this oral tradition was the main
teaching method of kagok in the Chosŏn dynasty. Teachers also concentrated on
cultivating the students’ ears.

Oral training is not uncommon. William Malm recalls his ko tsuzumi and taiko
drums lessons in Japan “Observation is possible since there is no notation to distract the
eye. One sees only the teacher or other student; thus all lessons have the aura of a
performance. In the speaking of the lessons themselves we should note first that one
must develop a patient sense of time. In traditional practice, a music teacher (sensei)
gives lessons on certain days at certain places but not at a specific time for each student.

⁵ The values and important aspects of hand movements are explained in Chapter 4.
To take a lesson one simply goes on the right day to the right place and waits. The waiting period equals approximately twenty minutes times the number of students who have arrived earlier, and is usually spent in the lesson room. Thus, one normally cannot rehearse just before a lesson. Rather, the sound and spirit of other players and other compositions permeate the ear and mind before the lesson.  

[Plate 3-2: Kisaeng’s music class with changgo and kŏmun’go from Kisandoch’ŏp – a collection of paintings by Kim Chun-gŭn] 

Teachers expected the students to listen carefully and follow the teacher’s eyes, mouth and hand movements while singing. Students then copied the teacher’s singing as closely as possible. Such teaching style is known in Korea, as ‘kujŏn simsu’, literally, “transmit through the mouth, understand by the heart.” Teachers of singing or performing were not the same as they are today. In the oral tradition, music would not

---


be performed in a fixed style. In the past, a teacher taught one passage in a certain way and then it was not necessarily sung in exactly the same way the next time.

In particular, the degree of flexibility of pitch progression and dynamics was extremely high in sanjo, kagok and p’ansori, which require improvisation. This flexibility caused tremendous difficulties for the beginners to learn. However, their ability to create similar phrases or imitate, grew naturally as time went by. Eventually, they could improvise by modifying or creating their own phrases.\(^8\) In the kagok tradition, myŏngin (prominent singers) performed over hundreds of kagok pieces automatically, without any prearrangement.\(^9\)

In order to achieve this level, students were required to have a high standard of aural musicality and concentration, otherwise they had to give up their training. According to the Sejong sillok [Annals of King Sejong]: “They [female musicians] were also trained in singing and playing the instruments. Those who were slow in learning were punished by the chejo (music director) or expelled from the organization. Negligent teachers were also punished and those who had no talent were sent home.”\(^{10}\)

\(^8\) Chun Inpyong. 2000b: 391.
\(^9\) Chang Sa-hun. 1985: 422.
\(^{10}\) Sejong sillok [Annals of King Sejong]. Vol.116. April 29th year of King Sejong.
This strict teaching style continued because of the desire to be professional and to be perfect performers, in order to serve a king or government officials during national feasts. Kisaeng did not learn music and dance as their hobbies or for cultivating their mind but for their professional services. The following explains the reasons why the kisaeng system lasted for over five hundred years. “Since the early Yi dynasty there were demands for the abolition of the kisaeng system because it conflicted an effective opposition [sic]. Kisaeng had direct influence on the conduct of the officials themselves. It was often argued, if kisaeng were abolished government officials might steal the wives of commoners. Gradually, kisaeng posed various political, social cultural problems. . . . the kisaeng system continued to exist till the end of the Yi dynasty.”11 In order to maintain the kisaeng system, the kibu system (a sort of husband-manager) was established to ensure the livelihood of medical, music and sewing kisaeng. The kisaeng and kibu provided the services required by the state without engaging in prostitution. Towards the latter part of the Yi dynasty the kibu system was institutionalized. The strict training of the kisaeng then, still had to be continued. This strictness still existed in kwŏnbŏn.

Ha Kyu-il’s student Kim Chin-hyang recalled her *kagok* class with him. “When students were absent without any notification, or lost concentration while studying, Ha Kyu-il punished them with a rod. This was the heaviest punishment. The lighter one was to prick the arms with a needle. The punishment was conducted not by him but by the student’s friend to make it more disgraceful.”  

[Sŏng Kyŏng-nin recalled his *kagok* classes from Ha Kyu-il in the music institution, *Yiwangjik Aakpu*, in 1930.](#)

During the *kagok* lessons, notation was not used at all, although a teacher could use it as teaching material . . . *Kagok* notation was useless while teaching and learning *kagok*. However, students were allowed to notate *kagok* by themselves only after classes. For the transcription of *kagok*, *chŏngganbo* notation was used. In addition, the transcriptions for voice and wind instruments of *kagok* were distributed by the teachers. However, students were still not allowed to use the notation during the classes.

As far as I can remember, from my experiences, transcriptions of ‘*Yŏmillak*, ‘*Yŏngsanhoesang*, ‘*Pohŏja*’ and ‘*Kagok*’ were written by me. These were not copied from my teacher’s. However, the main melodic structure of my transcription never differed from my teacher’s except for a few ornamentation parts.”

As has been described, *kagok* teachers strongly encouraged students to concentrate on only the teacher and his singing. Teachers believed that note-taking and notations disrupted concentration. When Ha Kyu-il taught young girls, aged fifteen

---

12 Kim Chin-hyang. 1993: 47.

13 Kungnip Kugakwŏn Chŏnt’ong Yesul Chinhŭnghyoe ed. 1989a: 6. Trans. Lee In-suk
years, in the Kwŏnbŏn (kisaeng’s house and school), the slowest song in one kagok suite ‘Isudaeyŏp: Pŏdŭrŭn’ was chosen as the first song in the repertoire of the kagok class.\(^\text{14}\)

This was because that song contains the most varied kinds of sikimsae and requires long breath control. Once it was learnt, the rest of the songs comprising similar melodic patterns would be much easier to learn.\(^\text{15}\) Hence, it usually took at least three hours per day, for three or four months, to learn sikimsae. After one year Ha Kyu-il’s students could sing approximately ten songs so that they could learn the faster kagok song, ‘Urak’, and dance.

During the classes of Ha Kyu-il, students were not allowed to use kagok notation books. However, he wrote the kagok textbook ‘Kainp’ilhyu’ for the teaching of kagok. ‘Kainp’ilhyu’ literally means ‘it is essential to keep this with you all the time.’ Hence, students could keep the small book ‘Kainp’ilhyu’.\(^\text{16}\) It has only kagok texts for memory aids. It is evident that Ha Kyu-il was very enthusiastic about teaching kagok efficiently. He distributed kagok scores written in chŏngganbo, which was the origin of Yi Chu-hwan’s Kagokpo. His intention might have been to give his students more

__Endnotes__

\(^\text{14}\) Kim Chin-hyang. 1993: 46.
\(^\text{15}\) See the similarity of melody lines within one suite in Chapter 1.
\(^\text{16}\) It was made in 1926, and is very small sized book. It contains the text of nine kagok songs, nine kasa and seven sijo. Ha’s kisaeng student, Yi Nan-hyang showed it to Cho Soon-ja in the 1970s, which was stated during the kagok lessons in 1996.
comprehensive and complete information and personal memory aids for after-school use. Needless to say, in those days, these could be extremely helpful, especially for beginners to practise by themselves. Today, a recording machine is essential for kagok students to record their lessons.

3. 1. 2. Recollection of Cho Soon-ja’s kagok learning

Cho Soon-ja is the last person to have learnt kagok in the traditional way, that is, without the use of notation (although the notation book existed). She remembers her student era as a time, when a tape recorder was not popular. When a master demonstrated a verse of kagok, without any accompanying instruments, except for the changgo, students had to repeat it over and over until they could perform it. Thus, the only way for students to learn a song was to fully focus their attention on the master’s demonstration and instruction. To do this, the students required incredible musicality and concentration. If they could not reach the required standard they had to change their major study from singing to another subject.17

When a verse of the song or one passage of sikimsae was demonstrated, students tried to copy their master’s singing. They had to simultaneously remember the tune, with sikimsae, without the use of any notation. To achieve the techniques of sikimsae

appropriately, *sondongjak* was adopted which could illustrate the *sikimsae* sound. Students had to utilize the hand system perfectly, or their master would severely reprimand them.\(^\text{18}\) Cho Soon-ja paints an evocative portrait of her first *kagok* lesson from Yi Chu-hwan in the early 1970s.

When my teacher came into the class room, he seemed very serious, with strong and sharp eyes and a closed mouth. At first appearance, he looked stricter than students had heard he would be. He straightaway taught how to beat the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle without any verbal instruction [simply imitation]. After his demonstration of the rhythmic cycle, he started to teach the first song ‘*Isudaeyŏp*’ straight through. After the second beat with an index finger of the left hand, he shook his right hand to describe upward-gliding *sikimsae*. At that moment, we could not stand the funny singing and the hand movement. However, we would bite our lips to stop ourselves laughing. On the other hand, he did not notice us at all and kept on teaching the class seriously.\(^\text{19}\)

As Cho Soon-ja recalled, the traditional way of teaching *kagok* was mainly by watching and repeating the teacher’s demonstration of beating and singing with *sondongjak*. However, questioning the teacher in front of others in the class would not happen often, because students feared showing their ignorance to a teacher and because of their respect for other students. Even if students had a question, they would ask it

\(^{18}\) Cho Soon-ja. personal *kagok* lesson. February. 1996.

only after much thought. It was usual that nobody asked questions of the teacher in the class. Students’ participation or spontaneous questions were not encouraged. Needless to say, disagreements were seen to be rude and disruptive.

Cho Soon-ja often heard from her kagok teachers (Yi Chu-hwan, Hong Wŏn-gi and Yi Nan-hyang), “t’ongūro paewŏra” literally, “Learn as a whole”. This teaching concept is quite different from the Western approach to music. The traditional way did not encourage an analytical method but presented the musical whole without drawing undue attention to the parts of which it was composed. However, if one phrase was not copied appropriately from a teacher, students had to practise the whole of it, over and over without asking questions.20 These attitudes correspond to the Confucian ‘golden rule’ which is not to draw attention to oneself. In the author’s experience, the Confucian golden rule still remains in today’s kagok class even though students are encouraged to ask questions.

3. 2. *Kisaeng* schools and curriculum

When the traditional class system of *kisaeng* collapsed and *kisaeng* could no longer live at the ‘*kyobangwŏn*’ in the palace at the beginning of the twentieth century,
Ha Kyu-il’s private kisaeng school ‘Chŏngak Chŏnsŭpso’ in 1910 helped them survive and his best students become renowned kagok singers. Chŏngak Chŏnsŭpso changed its name to Taejŏng Kwŏnbŏn in 1914, and then Chosŏn Kwŏnbŏn in 1925. This was because the Japanese government commanded kisaeng unions to change their names to Kwŏnbŏn, a name originating from the Japanese geisha system.

The kisaeng school ‘Chŏngak Chŏnsŭpso’ in 1910 was the origin of the kisaeng union. Under colonization, kisaeng established the labor union ‘Tadong Chohap’ in 1911, and ran party houses by themselves. This was possible because the head of the kwŏnbŏn asked the Japanese police to protect the kwŏnbŏn.21

Kisaeng unions also ran kisaeng schools in several cities (P’yŏngyang, Chinju, Seoul and Taegu), which were similar to Western conservatories. In Chyosen miin pogam (1917), eighteen kisaeng schools were run and controlled by the Japanese government and those aged eight to twenty were eligible to attend. The following table clearly shows the kisaeng students’ ages and numbers in sixteen unions in 1918.22

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Hansŏng</th>
<th>Taegŏn</th>
<th>Han Nam</th>
<th>Kyŏng hwa</th>
<th>Su wŏn</th>
<th>Taegu</th>
<th>Tong gnae</th>
<th>Pyŏng yang</th>
<th>Kwa ngju</th>
<th>Yŏn’gi</th>
<th>An sŏng</th>
<th>In ch’ŏn</th>
<th>Kim Ch’ŏn</th>
<th>Kaesŏng</th>
<th>Chinna mpo</th>
<th>Ch’a ngwŏn</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>175</td>
<td>181</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 3-1: the numbers of kisaeng in sixteen Kisaeng Unions in 1918]^{23}

This table shows that approximately sixty-five percent of girls are aged from sixteen to twenty years. Girls in their late twenties are very rare. Hence the kisaeng’s working period is very short, no more than ten years. Among the schools, Hansŏng

---

Kwŏnbŏn (one hundred and seventy-five students) and Taejong Kwŏnbŏn (one hundred and eighty-one students) were the most famous and concentrated on educating ilp’ae kisaeng (the top class kisaeng).

Hansŏng kwŏnbŏn offered ten different types of vocal genres in 1918, which is unusually diversified. Kagok classes were divided into two streams (U-Kyemyŏn and Ujo) in terms of mode. Kagok, kasa and sijo were all very popular classes.

---

As can be seen in the above table, the number of students in the classical vocal genres (*kagok*, *kasa* and *sijo*) is higher than that of the folk genre, *chapka*. However, in the radio programme of *Kyŏngsŏng Radio Broadcasting*, *chapka* was the most popular genre and *kagok* was rarely aired. This fact reflects the low demand for *kagok* from the audiences during the Japanese colonization, in spite of the *kisaeng*’s interest in *kagok*.

In the P’yŏngyang *kisaeng* school, the first regulation concerned compulsory and optional subjects. Compulsory subjects were *sijo*, *kagok*, *kŏmun’go*, *yanggŭm*, *kayagŭm* folk-songs, Chinese letters and poems, calligraphy and Korean traditional painting. Optional subjects were Japanese and painting. Students had to complete the three year course and pass the final exam for the diploma. The institution fees were 1*won* 50 *chŏn* per month for three years and the school rules were quite strict: students who had poor attendance and manners were given three detentions and then expelled. All students had to pass the final exam to get the diploma.

---

To become a *kisaeng* most girls studied full-time for three years. However, it has not been researched if every *kisaeng* school offered a well organized curriculum such as the P’yŏn’gyang *kisaeng* school. The time-table of the school shows that *kisaeng* took eleven subjects in total. In terms of its musical content, four different musical subjects (*kagok*, Japanese song, Korean folk songs and music) were taught. Among these, only one subject ‘*kagok*’ was taught every day. This fact reveals that *kagok* was considered the most essential subject in music education and equal in importance to calligraphy in the overall curriculum. The following time-table shows the curriculum of the P’yŏn’gyang *kisaeng* school for the third year.26

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mon.</th>
<th>Japanese</th>
<th>Calligraphy</th>
<th><em>Kagok</em></th>
<th>Japanese Song</th>
<th>Korean Folk</th>
<th>Singing practice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tues.</td>
<td>Japanese</td>
<td>Calligraphy</td>
<td><em>Kagok</em></td>
<td>Japanese Song</td>
<td>Attitudes</td>
<td>Music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wed</td>
<td>Composition</td>
<td>Calligraphy</td>
<td><em>Kagok</em></td>
<td>Japanese Song</td>
<td>Korean Folk</td>
<td>Singing practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thurs.</td>
<td>Painting</td>
<td>Calligraphy</td>
<td><em>Kagok</em></td>
<td>Japanese Song</td>
<td>Korean Folk</td>
<td>Attitudes &amp; Manners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fri</td>
<td>Poetry</td>
<td>Calligraphy</td>
<td><em>Kagok</em></td>
<td>Japanese Song</td>
<td>Korean Folk</td>
<td>Singing practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sat</td>
<td>Poetry</td>
<td>Calligraphy</td>
<td><em>Kagok</em></td>
<td>Painting</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 3-3 : Timetable of the P’yŏn’gyang *kisaeng* school during the Japanese colonization]

According to the above timetable, Korean traditional music education included learning dance and at least two or three musical instruments at the same time. This was compulsory. For example, the prominent *kagok* singer, Yi Chu-hwan (1909-1972) was not only good at playing *p’iri*, and *kagok*, but also proficient in playing Buddhist dances ‘*sŭngmu*’.\(^{27}\) *Kagok* singers had to learn Korean traditional instruments and dances, even though their major focus was on *kagok*. The reasons are clear:

Firstly, Korean traditional music was originally for either ensembles or orchestral groups rather than for solo performances. Solo performances and *sanjo*, were only developed in the late nineteenth century. To produce a good ensemble performance, it was essential for all players to have knowledge of the techniques used by other instruments in the ensemble. In the *kagok* ensemble, a singer had both the role of singer and conductor. Consequently, *kagok* singers needed a considerable knowledge of all accompanying instruments.

Secondly, Korean traditional classic dance assisted the understanding of *sikimsae*, which is the most distinctive characteristic of Korean traditional instrumental music and vocal music. This is because the beauty of the curve is the principal element in Korean aesthetics, including dance music and fine art. In *kagok*, it was expressed by the sound

---

\(^{27}\) Cho Soon-ja. 1989: 53-68.
of sikimsae. Among the classical dance genres, Ch’unaengjŏn was especially popular, and was Ha Kyu-il’s specialty. It contains very limited movements to express very slow curving lines in a tranquil mood and exaggerated by the dancer’s long sleeves. The costumes are beautifully decorated and the dance was often taken by Japanese to advertise Korean things for Japanese tourists during Japanese visits.

3.3. Today’s kagok education

Today, the central institution for Korean traditional music education is the University. In 1954, the first Korean traditional music department was set up by Chang Sa-hun at the Tŏksŏng Woman’s University but closed in 1956; then Seoul National University was established by Lee Hye-ku in 1959. Twenty-two universities were offering Korean traditional music courses employing more than eighty full-time lecturers in 1999. Among twenty-two universities, only nine universities offer kagok for a degree; Seoul National University, Ch’ukye Yesul University, Yong’in University, Tan’guk University, Chŏnnam University, Chŏnbuk University, Kyŏngbuk University, Tongguk University and Yŏngnam University. Each university needs one or two new students in a year or at least every four years. As a result, there is still no female full

time kagok lecturer, in Korea. Cho Soon-ja teaches kagok at several universities, traveling long distances as a part-time lecturer. She teaches professional singers individually and students in a group.

The circumstances surrounding kagok education are in contrast with those of Western music. For example, in Seoul National University, there are two sections to the Music department with seven-hundred full-time students: 1) the Korean Traditional Music Department, and 2) the Western Classical Music Department. In the Korean Traditional Music Department only three or four students are studying kagok out of one hundred and thirty-two who are studying traditional instruments, composition and theory. The Western Music Department has approximately six hundred students, one hundred of whom are studying Western, classical, vocal music. The following table shows the number of students in each section at Seoul National University in 2002.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Traditional music</th>
<th>Western music</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Vocal</strong></td>
<td>Kagok (4), Folksong (4)</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Composition</strong></td>
<td>12</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Instruments</strong></td>
<td>100</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Theory</strong></td>
<td>12</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>132</td>
<td>568</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 3-4: The number of students in traditional music and Western music at Seoul National University]
Originally, the *kagok* curriculum required students to learn two or three different instruments, Korean traditional dance and *kagok*. Currently, however, students may focus on *kagok* alone. To be a professional musician in Korean traditional music today, it is compulsory to have a university certificate in traditional music. Entrance to a university is dependent on a student’s bursary results, with the examination focusing on a students’ music skill in their major traditional instrument. The university offers tutorials in a student’s major study, but these are only for a half hour or an hour per week in total of sixteen weeks for four years. The total number of hours is a maximum of thirty-two per year, which is extremely small compared with the traditional apprenticeship education. The students are required to perform at an examination twice a year. After graduating from university, a few students may become members of traditional music orchestras as they do in the Western musical system. However, being a *kagok* performer means it is hard to find employment, thus causing a paucity of male *kagok* singers and contributing to the miserable status of *kagok* in contemporary Korea. During the author’s fieldwork male *kagok* students were not been seen in the Korean Traditional Performing Arts High School and Seoul National University.

Korean music, including *kagok*, has been drastically Westernized since Japanese colonization. Korean traditional music orchestras have joined a female choir, a style
which did not exist in Korean musical tradition. Even *kagok* has been sung in unison by a group of female singers. *Kagok* is no longer chamber music and always uses microphones on stage.

[Plate 3-4: Korean Traditional Music Orchestra and female chorus in 1973]^{29}

[Plate 3-5: *Kagok* performance of Kim Wŏl-ha and her students in 1983]^{30}

---


Kagok music itself has also changed owing to the decreasing demand for it in Korean society. There are two most obvious changes:

Firstly, the performance repertoire of kagok has been reduced and fixed, mainly due to a lack of professional kagok singers, even though a total of one-hundred and fifty-six kagok songs (comprising seventy-one female songs and eighty-five male songs), have been passed down to this century. Ha Kyu-il is considered the father of today’s kagok because he was the first to compile a repertoire of kagok songs. Currently, all kagok come directly from Ha Kyu-il’s repertoire, which is still used in learning kagok today. Today, the principal repertoire of kagok consists of only the fifteen, female songs (comprising one suite called female han pat’ang) and the twenty-four male songs (comprising one suite called male han pat’ang). Traditionally these two male and female han pat’ang are sung in alternation within twenty-seven songs. Currently, the most common performance style of kagok is to sing only one or two songs of a faster tempo, as vocal solos and these form a part of Korean traditional music concerts. The female chorus is rarely performed. It takes more than two hours to perform the male and female alternating solo without a break, so it is hardly ever performed today. Instead, in its place, the male and female duet song T’aep’yóngga is often performed at concerts.
The following table shows how the order and repertoire are different among male solo, female solo and combined han pat’ang.

(P: Ujo p’yŏnggio, K: Kyemyŏn)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Male han p’atang</th>
<th>Female han p’atang</th>
<th>Male &amp; Female han p’atang</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. P. Ch’osu taeyŏp</td>
<td>1. M: P Ch’osu taeyŏp</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. P. Chunggŏ</td>
<td>4. F: P Chunggŏ</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. P. Samsudaeyŏp</td>
<td>7. M. P Samsudaeyŏp</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Öllong</td>
<td>19. M. Öllong</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. P’yŏllong</td>
<td>10. P’yŏngnong</td>
<td>20. F. P’yŏngnong</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Öllak</td>
<td>23. M. Öllak</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Urak</td>
<td>24. F. Urak</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. Ölp’yŏn</td>
<td>15. T’aep’yŏngga</td>
<td>27. M&amp;F Duet T’aep’yŏngga</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 3-5: Performance order of today’s kagok]
Secondly, the improvised kagok songs have disappeared and kagok songs are fixed with notation. The power of notation and recordings is very strong and caused kagok to be fixed and its improvisation to disappear. Originally, the kagok han pat’ang was not sung in a predetermined order. In fact, a set order did not exist. Singers listened to each introduction of the kagok ensemble, and recognized which song had to be sung among several hundreds of songs. They could then sing with improvisation within its fixed musical form. Their musicality was exceptional.\textsuperscript{31} Today it is almost too difficult for students to sing even one han pat’ang of kagok from a notation book, in order to graduate from a university.

3. 4. \textit{Kagok notation of chŏngganbo}

Four kagok notation books for the voice have been mainly used since Ha Kyu-il wrote down kagok songs: 1) \textit{Kagokbo} by Yi Chu-hwan in 1958, 2) \textit{The Eighty-eight Kagok Songs for Female} (Yŏch’ang Kagok Yŏdūn Yŏdúllip) in 1980 by Kim Ki-su, 3) \textit{Kagok Scores for Male and Female} (Nam Yŏch’ang Kagok), 1980 by Hong Wŏn-gi, and 4). Cho Soon-ja recently published her own kagok notation book, \textit{The Forty-five}.

\textsuperscript{31} Chang Sa-hun. 1985: 422.
Kagok Songs for Female (Yŏch’ang Kagok Mahŭn Tasŏtnip) in 2003. These notation books were written in the chŏngganbo notational system (meaning square shaped score), which was created about five hundred years ago in the Chosŏn Dynasty. It consists of sixteen squares from the top to the bottom, read from the right to the left. One square represents one beat and can be divided into three parts vertically, and subdivided into two parts horizontally, to denote its rhythm. The pitch is described by five Chinese characters: Hwang (黃 = E♭), T’ae (太 = F), Chung (仲 = A♭), Im (林 = B♭), Nam (南 = C) in the p’yŏngjo mode. The upper octave is indicated by the prefix ‘ミ’ beside the characters, and the lower octave by the prefix ‘人’.

3. 5. Problems of Terminology

Comparing the previous four different notation books reveals some interesting facts. The explanation of sikimsae symbols and their names are different in each. Different kinds of sikimsae, and the terms by which they are known, are not standardized because the definition of sikimsae is controversial. Therefore, every kagok notation book explains the same vocal technique by different terms and symbols created by each notation book’s authors. This problem originates from the first formal kagok notation book written by Yi Chu-hwan in 1959 as he did not explain the twelve symbols
he created. Furthermore, Kim Ki-su created twenty-seven symbols for his *kagok* notation and Hong Wŏn-gi used twelve symbols in his *kagok* notation book.\(^{32}\)

Whenever *kagok* notation books were published by other authors they also made their own *sikimsae* name and symbols. These were all based on the description of the way the sound was produced. In the author’s view, the number of the different terms given for each vocal technique created the biggest obstacle in researching *sikimsae*.

Apart from the presentation of the same vocal technique symbols in various ways, the names of the symbols are totally different from one singer to the other, for example, upward-gliding is called *Ch’ik’innŭn yosŏng* by Cho Soon-ja, *Chol’ump’yo* by Kim Ki-su, *Pajjak k’iŏ Cholla dŭlŏnaenŭn p’yŏ* by Hong Wŏn-gi and *Hanbŏn kulke t’alyŏkŭl chuŏ yosŏnhago itdaeŏ ttok ttok ttolŏjinŭndŭt yosŏng* by Kim Chŏng-ja which are translated in the table below. Despite the different terms the meaning is the same, describing the overall ascending pitch progression with dynamic and melodic undulations. The lack of standardized terminology caused confusion among singers and scholars. The author used Cho’s term during the interviews but many scholars and singers did not understand the term directly. The author had to demonstrate it by singing.

---

For this study, the name of three *sikimsae* will follow Cho Sun-ja’s term because Cho Sun-ja’s terms originated from Yi Chu-hwan’s *kagok* class.\(^{33}\)

In female *kagok*, three, main, distinctive *sikimsae* were used. The following table shows the three different names for *sikimsae* in four popular *kagok* notation books today.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Overall translation in English</th>
<th>Cho Soon-ja</th>
<th>Kim Ki-su</th>
<th>Hong Wŏn-gi</th>
<th>Kim Chŏng-ja &amp; Choi Su-ok</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td><strong>Upward-gliding</strong> glissando upwards which includes accelerando and repeated dips in pitch**</td>
<td>Ch’ik’inŭn yosŏng Rising vibrato</td>
<td>Chol’amp’yo A symbol of squeezing up sound</td>
<td>Pajjak k’iŏ Cholla dulŏnaenŭn p’yo A symbol of very tighten, upward, squeezing –gliding.</td>
<td>Hanbŏn Kullŏ yosŏngchago kurŭ nŭn p’yo. A symbol of a strong rising and then gentle vibrato</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td><strong>Pitch bend upwards</strong> slightly raising the pitch at the end of the note**</td>
<td>Ch’usŏng Surging sound</td>
<td>Minŭn p’yo A symbol of pushing up</td>
<td>Tochung milŏ ollinŭn p’yo A symbol of Push-up in the middle</td>
<td>Chorŭinŭn p’yo A symbol of squeezing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td><strong>Downward-gliding</strong> glissando downwards which includes accelerando and repeated undulations pitch**</td>
<td>T’oesŏng Backward sound</td>
<td>T’oeyosŏng Backward vibrato sound</td>
<td>Haesŏng Releasing sound</td>
<td>Sŏsŏhi p’ulŏ naerinŭn p’yo A symbol of downward-gliding and slowing down</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 3-6: The symbols of three main *sikimsae* by four different *kagok* singers]

---

3. 6. Trials of new methodology

When the author visited the beginners’ kagok class, comprising seven fifteen year-old girls at the Seoul Traditional Arts High School (Seoul Kugak Yego), Seoul in June, 2001, an interesting situation was evident. The students were not singing kagok but several new short songs, in order to prepare for the exam. During the previous four months they had not learnt any kagok songs, because the beginner students, taking kagok as their major in the Seoul Traditional Arts High School and other schools, first had to learn the text book, *Kim Ki-su’s 108·66 Short Songs (Taemaru paek’al yuuk)*$^{34}$ composed by Kim Ki-su, and to read chôngganbo notation properly.

[Plate3-6: Beginner kagok students singing with Taemaru at the Seoul Traditional Arts High School ]

---

$^{34}$ Kim Ki-su. 1978.
Kim Ki-su’s 108·66 Short Songs is still used as the essential text book for the formal (but not authentic) kagok education. The length of each piece is very short, from one column (twelve or sixteen chŏnggan) to three columns. It is divided into two parts. The first part, comprising one hundred and eight pieces, was designed for the recognition of the names of yulmyŏng and the rhythmic divisions of the chŏngganbo system. The beginning twenty-six songs dealt with simple rhythms such as one note in each chŏnggan, after that, the remaining songs were set in two or three notes in each chŏnggan. The second part, comprising sixty-six pieces hence the title of the whole, (108.66) is a more advanced level and extends the length of piece up to ten columns, with changing metre often from four to three beats. However, only the first part is learnt in the curriculum of the school before the kagok piece is learnt.

The students spent three hours per week for one semester singing with this book. The aim of the class is to help the beginners, who have learnt music with Western musical notation, to read and get used to chŏngganbo notation as soon as possible. However, the only required vocal technique in the book was the chest sound, with three- or four-beat, regular, rhythmic patterns in a fast tempo. This resulted in the short songs sounding like Western music instead of Korean traditional music where there is both chest and head sound, and flexible regular rhythmic cycles. It was obvious something
needed to be created to facilitate the teaching of kagok.

The effect of the Kim Ki-su’s 108·66 Short Songs’ sound, as it is known, is an example of Kim Ki-su’s musical character. Chae Hyun-kyung analyzed this. “Although he is currently recognized as pioneer of new music (Hwang Byung-ki 1982; Sin Yong-son 1991), his contribution to the development of Ch’angjak kugak is considered questionable because of his close imitation of Western-style orchestral writing and unusually elevated sound volume in his works”\(^\text{35}\)

Kim Ki-su’s 108·66 Short Songs is quite similar to Western sight-singing textbooks such as Concone,\(^\text{36}\) which has been the essential textbook for Western vocal students in Korea since the 1970s. This is because the composer of the book, Kim Ki-su, always tried to teach kagok in a Western music style. For example, he translated the names of the Korean seven notes into solfege (Do, Re, Mi), American and English style (A, B, C, D), and the German style (A, H, C) at the beginning of the book.\(^\text{37}\) The following is the transcription of No.41 and 45 in the book.

---


\(^{37}\) Kim Ki-su. 1978: 3.
In spite of his work for kagok education, including publishing the above book, Cho Soon-ja does not agree with its use for kagok education. She gave two critical reasons for this. Firstly, it is not an effective book for beginner kagok students to read chŏngganbo properly, because the name of the Korean syllables (hwang, t'ae, chung, im, nam) are not produced in the normal way but converted into the p’iri (Korean oboe)’s onomatopoetic sounds (na, nu, nŏ, no, nŭ) as follows.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Hwang</th>
<th>Na</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(黄=E♭)</td>
<td>T'ae</td>
<td>Nu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(太 F)</td>
<td>Chung</td>
<td>Nŏ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(仲 A♭)</td>
<td>Im</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(林 B♭)</td>
<td>Nam</td>
<td>Nŭ</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The p’iri’s onomatopoetic sounds are much easier to pronounce than the original name of the notes. However, the students have to convert the p’iri’s note name into the original name before chŏngganbo notation can be read.

Secondly, the one hundred-eight short songs do not contain sikimsae and timbre changes. Only the chest sound is required and even the higher notes above t’ae (太, f’) are usually sung with the chest sound. Therefore, the resulting sound does not closely represent the true nature of kagok sound. It is more close to the sound of the newly-composed, traditional, children’s songs (kugak tongyo), which are composed in a pentatonic scale and the short rhythmic cycles, in regular beats, of traditional folk songs.

Thirdly, as can be seen in Figure 3-2, the most popular note is e♭’, which is extremely high to sing without falsetto. This high note from chest sound is very harmful for female singers when their voices change during puberty where the break occurs. Kim Ki-su’s book ignored not only sikimsae but also female kagok techniques.

With the disadvantages, Kim Ki-su’s 108·66 Short Songs has been still used as the essential text book for the formal kagok education. This fact reveals that chŏngganbo notation is difficult or not effective to learn within a limited time for contemporary students who are exposed to Western music. In group teaching of kagok,
the students struggled with the *chŏngganbo* notation. They learnt *kagok* not for their major but for one of the optional music subjects at University.

3. 7. Understanding of *chŏngganbo* notation

*Chŏngganbo* notation was traditionally used only for ritual court music until the twentieth century. However, Ha Kyu-il transcribed *kagok* into *chŏngganbo*, as a memory-aid, in the beginning of the twentieth century. It has been used widely not only for traditional classical music but also for folk music, even popular songs. Kim Ki-su pioneered the use of *chŏngganbo* notation, in published instrumental workbooks in 1961. There is a good example of how widely *chŏngganbo* notation is used in modern Korea. This concerns its use for *tanso*, the compulsory instrument in the primary school curriculum. The repertoire of *tanso* is usually about modern Korean children’s songs (*tongyo*) and traditional folk songs. When they are taught, both notations, *chŏngganbo* and Western notation, are presented on a same page. This methodology is intended to teach not only *tanso* itself as a traditional instrument but also *chŏngganbo* system as one of the cultural heritage of Koreans’ representative traditional notation. Even Korean popular songs and foreign pop songs for the instruments such as *tanso*, *haegŭm* and *taegŭm* are transcribed into *chŏngganbo*. The
following example is a pop song, *Yesterday*, transcribed into *chŏngganbo* in the *haegŭm* workbook.\(^\text{38}\)

Koreans’ nationalism is very strong. The use of *chŏngganbo* in workbooks is a part of contemporary Korea.\(^\text{39}\) *Chŏngganbo* notation is a symbol of this nationalism. It was introduced with pride as one of King Sejong’s monumental works, as the first creation of mensural notation in Asian history, and is still acknowledged in Korean history and music textbooks, from the primary school to high school levels. The author was tested on King Sejong’s monumental works, the creation of Korean script (*Han’gŭl*) and *chŏngganbo* notation, several times in school exams.

As Keith Howard pointed out, “Notations became critical as music training adapted to the standard school grade system; the open timeframes of apprenticeship were replaced by strict programme lengths.” However, there has been a serious problem in understanding *chŏngganbo* system in a limited time frame of a *kagok* education programme today, which was observed by the author.

With a view to determining the level of understanding of *chŏngganbo* notation by *kagok* beginners, a survey was carried out in four classes, a total of sixty-one students,

---


\(^{39}\) Howard, Keith. 1998b : 600.
during the author’s fieldwork in Korea in 2001. Yi Chu-hwan’s *Kagokpo* was used in the four classes. The institutions surveyed were:

1. Korean National University of Education, Stage II (KNUE II): 22 students (3 June 2001)
3. Pusan University, Stage II (PU): 27 students. (4 June 2001)
4. Tongguk University, Stage II (DU): 4 students. (3 June 2001)

The *kagok* classes were coordinated by Cho Soon-ja. All the students took the *kagok* class for one semester as a subject for their music degree. Two of them were majoring in *kagok*. The survey was divided into three sections:

I. Musical backgrounds and personal views about the *kagok* class.

II. *Kagokpo* written in *chŏngganbo* notation.
   a) The degree of familiarity with *kagok* notation and its use
   b) Disadvantages of *chŏngganbo* notation

III. Five practical tests of traditional *chŏngganbo kagok* notation.40

---

40 *See the Appendix II (2001) for full survey questions.*
3. 7. 1. Musical backgrounds and personal views about the 

*kagok* class

The musical backgrounds of the students can be divided into two groups: The thirty-one students at Pusan University (PU) and Tongguk University (TU) had already learnt Korean traditional music with *chŏngganbo* notation for at least one or two years. In addition, ten students had learnt *kagok* already for at least one year. Their major was Korean traditional music, although their specialist areas were different, e.g., instruments, folk song, *kagok* and composition. On the other hand, thirty students at the Korean National University of Education (KNUE) had learnt mainly Western music and experienced *kavyagum* and *tanso* for a short period. However, seven of the students in the M.A. class at KNUE were currently music teachers at primary and high schools.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Major</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>KNUE II</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>Music education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KNUE M.A.</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Music education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PU II</td>
<td>27</td>
<td><em>Kagok</em> (1), Instruments (19) Composition (1) Theory (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TU II</td>
<td>4</td>
<td><em>Kagok</em> (1), Folk song (2) Instrument (1)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 3-7: Musical background of the students in the survey]
In the question about their first impression of *kagok* learning, the dominant answer was that *kagok* sounded very strange and boring because of the slow tempo. Some other answers were ‘it is too difficult to learn’ and ‘it sounds very classic and fresh’.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sondongjak with confidence</th>
<th>Unclear Sondongjak with no confidence</th>
<th>No Sondongjak and no confidence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5 (23.2%)</td>
<td>16 (26.2%)</td>
<td>40 (65.7%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 3-8: The degree of making *sondongjak* with confidence in *kagok* class]

In answering the question about the degree of performing hand signs, forty of sixty-one students (65.7%) stated they had no confidence to make *sondongjak* by themselves. Sixteen of them (26.2%) could make *sondongjak* roughly but still had no confidence. Only two students (3.2%) majoring in *kagok* answered that they could sing with *sondongjak* confidently. In addition, nobody could sing *kagok* without a notation book.

*Pŏdŭrŭn* (the first song of *kagok* one suite) was selected by 49.1% of the students as a favorite *kagok* song. *T’aep’yŏngga* was the next chosen by 11% of them, and other
favorite songs were faster tempo songs like P’yônsu taeyôp, Soyong and Urak. The rest of them did not answer this question.

3. 7. 2. The length of time taken to learn kagok with chŏngganbo notation.

The first question was about the length of time taken to learn kagok with chŏngganbo notation. The majority of KNUE and PU students (72.7% of KNUE II, 100% ofTU, 59.2% of PU) felt that they were not accustomed to reading the chŏngganbo notation even after one semester of kagok classes. Significantly, half the students of PU and even 100% of TU were still struggling with chŏngganbo notation, although they had already used it, for one year at least, while learning a taegûm, p’iri, kagok or ajaeng. As can be seen, 75% of KNUE M.A. students who were music school teachers, and in the higher stage (M.A.), required at least one month or more to get used to it. This confirmed that chŏngganbo notation is very time consuming for today’s students to learn.
The second question was about whether the students found the reading style ‘from top to bottom and right to left’ convenient or not. The following result shows that this vertical reading style was exceedingly inconvenient for most students at KNU (Stage II and MA.) and TU.

[Table 3-10: The degree of convenience of the vertical reading style of chŏngganbo]

As can be seen, a surprising 100% of KNUE stage II and TU students indicated the inconvenience of chŏngganbo notation. On the other hand, only 14.8 % of PU students expressed this inconvenience and 66.6% of PU thought chŏngganbo was a
convenient notational system. The next question was designed to check the degree of notational use during kagok class.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Entirely notation</th>
<th>Mainly notation</th>
<th>Mainly teacher</th>
<th>Entirely teacher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>KNUE stage I</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KNUE MA.</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PU</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>55.5%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TU</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 3-11: Main resource of kagok learning during the class]

As the above table shows, the KNUE Stage I and PU students had apparently contrasting figures. 65% of the students at KNUE Stage I was mainly dependent on the teacher’s demonstration, while 18% of them were entirely dependent on the teacher’s demonstration. On the other hand, 55.5% of the students at PU were dependent mainly on the notation, while 11% of them were entirely dependent on the notation.

This totally different attitude towards kagok notation was reflected in their different musical backgrounds. The KNUE students had not learnt Korean traditional music with chŏngganbo notation before, but 100% of PU students had already experienced chŏngganbo notation. As a consequence, the understanding of the chŏngganbo notation system by students in KNUE Stage II was of a very low level. Most students could not answer practical tests correctly. It appeared that the students
had really given up on reading the *chŏngganbo* system. In the final *kagok* exam they really struggled to sing *kagok* without their teacher.

The higher stage MA. students were more dependent on the *chŏngganbo* notation book than the Stage II students. The reason was obvious. MA students, teaching music at primary and secondary schools were more academic and had stronger reasons to learn because they intended to teach *kagok* in their classes. This fact was more evident in the results of the practical tests and observations of the class. During the class, MA. students were busy looking at the notation while occasionally looking at their teacher. By contrast, most Stage II students hardly looked at their *kagok* notation and watched only their teacher’s presentation.

**3. 7. 3. Disadvantages and advantages of *chŏngganbo* notation**

The comments about the disadvantages of the *chŏngganbo* notation show interesting figures. The invisible pitch movements were pointed out by 54.5% of the KNUE II students and 50% of KNUE MA. students as a critical disadvantage of *chŏngganbo* notation. In contrast, the answers about *chŏngganbo*’s disadvantages, by PU students, were more varied; only 11.1% of PU students had difficulty in reading pitches, rhythmic description was a more difficult task for them. The overall layout of
the notation was also a disadvantage for the 11.1% of PU students. An interesting fact about PU students was that six of them (22.5%) did answer ‘not found’, which is the reflection of their strong belief in chŏngganbo notation as a traditional notation. Two of the PU students stated that chŏngganbo was difficult to learn for beginners, but it was a good notational system for Korean traditional music. However, they did not explain the reasons. This comment is also significant if the fact that 59.2% of PU students were still unfamiliar with chŏngganbo reading, at the end of the semester [Table 3-9], is considered. Most of the PU students may have believed that chŏngganbo notation is the appropriate notation for Korean music in spite of it being difficult to read.

The most significant aspect of this survey is that a large number of students (75% of TU, 44.4% of PU, 37.5% of KNUE M.A. 22.7% of KNUE II) did not answer or replied ‘don’t know’, when they were asked to write about the advantages of chŏngganbo notation. This result clearly shows how difficult chŏngganbo notation is for today’s students.
3.7.4. Five practical tests for chǒngganbo notation

The five practical tests were designed to survey the following aspects of kagok as taught through chǒngganbo notation: 1. the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle, 2. sikimsae signs, 3. the timbre change, 4. common melodic patterns and 5. memorization of the song. Students were asked to write the first two phrases of the song.

Overall, the degree of understanding of chǒngganbo notation was quite low, considering the fact they had already learnt kagok for at least one semester, and even for TU students who were majoring in kagok.
The students’ understanding of *chŏngganbo* notation and songs was extremely poor, less than 50% were correct. For example, in Question 4, only three out of sixty-one students knew the repeated melodic pattern by the end of the semester. M.A. students of KNUE showed the highest familiarity of *chŏngganbo* reading within one month [Table 3-9]. Only 50% of them remembered the first two phrases of the song correctly. In spite of PU students showing the highest satisfaction with *chŏngganbo* notation, their actual understanding of the notation was quite low, no one wrote down the first two phrases of the song they had learnt for one semester, and they had been exposed to Korean traditional music before their university entrance.

**Table 3-12: The degree of understanding of *chŏngganbo* notation in the survey**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Rhythmic Cycle</th>
<th>Signs</th>
<th>Passagio point</th>
<th>Repeated melodic pattern</th>
<th>Memorization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>KNUE (II) 22</td>
<td>13 (59.1%)</td>
<td>3 (13.6%)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4 (18.2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KNEU (MA) 8</td>
<td>2 (25%)</td>
<td>3 (37.5%)</td>
<td>2 (25%)</td>
<td>1 (12.5%)</td>
<td>4 (50%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PusanUni (II) 27</td>
<td>18 (66.6%)</td>
<td>11 (40.7%)</td>
<td>7 (25.9%)</td>
<td>1 (3.7%)</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tongguk (II) 4</td>
<td>2 (50%)</td>
<td>1 (25%)</td>
<td>1 (25%)</td>
<td>1 (25%)</td>
<td>1 (25%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Conclusion**

Westernization and modernization in Korean society since the beginning of the twentieth century has simultaneously caused change to traditional music, including *kagok*. In spite of *kagok*’s circumstantial changes, its pedagogy has not reflected this
change properly. This chapter outlined kagok’s pedagogical methods from their origin to the present day.

The advantages of traditional pedagogical methods should be preserved or enhanced for the transmission of kagok. The traditional ways of teaching kagok (apprenticeship and Kujŏn simsu), from Yiwangjik Aakpu (The Institution of Korean Court Music during the Japanese colonization) to respected kagok teachers such as Ha Kyu-il, Yi Chu-hwan and Cho Soon-ja were observed. Sondongjak (hand signs), a visual aid to learning sikimsae technique, was found to be an effective traditional teaching tool. It has been shown that in the kisaeng schools’ curriculum, during the Japanese colonization, kagok was treated as the most important subject and taught by oral/aural tradition every day, demanding an enormous amount of time to master one suite.

The contemporary educational system of kagok was also observed. This was found to be vulnerable and marginalized even in Korean traditional musical society. As traditional music education has been changed and now follows a Western style, kagok lessons have become infrequent and the lesson time is very limited. Despite the change of students’ musical backgrounds, from Korean to Western, kagok scores and pedagogical methods have not been changed or developed and the traditional
The chŏngganbo notational system is still used. The chŏngganbo system is extremely non-effective for today’s students, which was proved by the survey, tests and observations. Interestingly, most of the students believed that chŏngganbo notation was sufficient for Korean traditional music, but their actual understanding of the notation, at the end of the semester, was extremely low.

Notation is defined as the reflection of the social and cultural aspect. In modern Korea both notation, chŏngganbo and Western notation, are commonly used as a vehicle of representing Korean music, despite whether it is a traditional or imported notation. It is time to create a new bridging notational system, especially in kagok, if the two facts, Koreans’ enthusiasm for the preservation of chŏngganbo as the representation of their national identity, and to overcome their problems of understanding chŏngganbo caused by their Westernized musical backgrounds, are considered. If the new notation could become a bridge between chŏngganbo and Western staff notation, Koreans would learn kagok more easily as well as reading chŏngganbo notation naturally.

Korean musicologists and musicians are not familiar with creating or using a new notational system, as it is hard to find a creation of new notational system for Korean traditional music in the twentieth century. It is even hard to find research on the
observation or evaluation of notational use in education. If the new notation is trailled, it
hopefully will stimulate Korean musicologists to extend their research area.
CHAPTER 4

Sondongjak (hand signs) in Kagok Education

Introduction

Throughout Western musical history, hands have often played an important role in music education. Notable examples include the Guidonian hand and Zoltan Kodaly’s hand signals. Kodaly’s hand signals, which comprise five different hand shapes linked to pentatonic notes, were used in Hungary to teach the pitch of folk songs more effectively. The hand signs enabled the students to visualize the tune’s contour.¹

If Kodaly’s hand signals describe pitch movement, an Indian’s krīya, hand gestures, convey the time-keeping of the rhythmic cycle (tāla). The means of defining tāla by krīya is by claps, waves and finger counting. When an Indian singer


“Singing from staff notation is a three-phase mental activity - seeing the music, solmization and pitch. The three phase mental activity is condensed into two phases when hand-signs are used, since the hand-sign coincides with the solfā name. Beyond this, the fact that the hand-signs are spatially positioned also further facilitates the matter – that is, the connection between name and pitch is also helped to a great extent, visually.”
keeps tāla, he usually slaps his right hand on his right thigh as a hand gesture, and either waves or hits his thigh, with palm tuned upward, for a wave. These gestures indicate the point reached in the tāla pattern. Even audiences keep the tāla during performances by making krīya. The following table shows how Ādi tāla is kept.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Counts</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tāla Symbol</td>
<td>1ª</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notational symbol of Krīya</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>+</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hand gestures</td>
<td>clap</td>
<td>Little finger</td>
<td>Ring finger</td>
<td>Middle finger</td>
<td>clap</td>
<td>wave</td>
<td>clap</td>
<td>wave</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 4-1: The hand gesture for Ādi tāla]²

The following figure indicates how the laghus (a type of tāla subdivision) with 7 or 9 counts are kept.

[Figure 4-1: Finger counts of krīya]

Krīya is important for the singer to keep time accurately, for the pakhāvaj (double-headed, modified barrel-shaped wooden drum) player to know which beat the singer has reached, and for the audience to understand the rhythmic improvisation in relation to the underlying metrical structure. Hand gestures are also used to describe melodic contour

---
in Bhutanese singing in the ornamental style in zhungdra.\(^3\)

[Plate 4-1 : Aku Tongmi singing the Bhutanese National Anthem with hand gestures]

\(^3\)Thimphu, Bhutan June 2006. Photos Elaine Dobson, Bhutan Music Archive MDVO47)
In kagok, hand signs (sondongjak) are also used as well. Kagok’s sondongjak is similar to the mixture between the Indian’s krīya and Bhutanese hand gestures. Kagok singers describe not only the rhythmic cycle, changdan, but also pitch, sonsikim, by hand gestures. It facilitates anticipation of the musical flow and decoration of the musical sound by tapping out the beats and tracing pitch movement and dynamics. However, they are not performed on stage. On stage, singers sit on the floor in the authentic position and do not move while singing, their hands always on their knees. This position still remains as it was under Confucianism.

When the author learnt kagok from Cho Soon-ja, I was ceaselessly asked to use my hands for beating out the rhythmic cycle and describing sondongjak.

[Plate 4-2: The author’s first kagok lesson in 1996: Left to right- Lee In-suk, Park Hyun-ji, Cho Soon-ja and Park Mi-kyung]
Cho always explained sikimsae with hand signs, called sonsikim (describing only sikimsae). In the author’s first kagok lesson, the throat vibrato technique (upward-gliding sikimsae) sounded like an impossible technique to copy.

After a few months, my throat vibrato had improved a little because I was able to emulate my teacher’s sondongjak, which refined the throat movement. Today, Cho Soon-ja always teaches kagok along with hand signs. The following photo was taken of her beginner kagok students making sondongjak in the kagok class at the Korean National University of Education.

[Plate 4-3: Kagok students making sondongjak at the KNUE in 2001]

During my field-work, in a humid summer in Korea, I asked Kim Yŏng-gi, to sing P’yŏngjo Isudaeyŏp ‘Pŏdurun’ for me with hand signs. Pŏdurun contains all kinds of kagok sikimsae in a slow tempo and shows the use of kagok’s sondongjak more clearly than other songs. She was so pleased to sing it for me. However, while wiping
sweat from her forehead, after completing twenty minutes of singing, she told me
“When I perform kagok on a stage or record my kagok singing, I usually concentrate on
creating my own style. However, today is a bit different. Singing kagok with
sondongjak clearly reminds me of how my teacher, Kim Wŏl-ha, taught me each phrase
by using hand signs. I’m missing her very much today!”

This reveals how strongly the
sondongjak affected her kagok learning because she still was able to recall it twenty
years on, despite rarely having used them. In spite of the enormous value of kagok’s
sondongjak in its learning, these hand signs have not been researched at all. Needless to
say, sondongjak has not been notated either, except for one notation written by Kim
Chŏng-ja and Ch’oe Su-ok in Sŏnga Ha Kyu-il sŏnṣaeng yakchŏn in 1999.

Even worse, sondongjak are disappearing from today’s kagok classes. Lee Jun-a, the representative
kagok singer of the Korean National Performing Art Centre, denied singing kagok with
sondongjak when I asked her to do it. She reluctantly sang one phrase of ‘Pŏdŭrŭn’ for
me. However, she did not use hand signs, and tapped out the sixteen beat rhythmic
cycles on her knees.

Lee Jun-a’s reason was that *sondongjak* are not allowed to be shown on stage during a *kagok* performance. If using *sondongjak* becomes a singer’s habit, she may unconsciously use them on stage. Therefore, Lee Jun-a does not encourage her students to use hand signs at all, even for practice although she learnt *kagok* with *sondongjak* from Kim Wŏl-ha.

When the author observed *kagok* tutorials of MA *kagok* students at Seoul National University in 2001, most students did not use *sondongjak* for *sikimsae*. They only beat the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle on their knees. In contrast, their teacher Ch’oe Su-ok naturally used *sondongjak*, while correcting her students. As she had learnt *kagok*
with *sondongjak* from her teachers, she used *sondongjak* unconsciously while singing or teaching *kagok*. If the above cases are considered, *kagok* *sondongjak* in Korea today is controversial and whether *sondongjak* will continue to be transmitted or not, is in doubt. Nevertheless, it is obvious that *sondongjak* is an extremely effective teaching method, as Cho Soon-ja and Kim Yŏng-gi have stated.

In this chapter, types and principles of *sondongjak*, its roles and methods will be examined to reveal its effectiveness and value. Furthermore, the different shapes of the *sondongjak*, used among today’s *kagok* singers, will be compared, in order to analyze the general features of *sondongjak* and the relationship between singing and *sondongjak*’s delicacy.

### 4.1. Types of *sondongjak*

*Sondongjak* usually covers *changdan* (the rhythmic cycles), *sikimsae* and *Hyuji* (rests). Describing *sikimsae* involves mainly pitch movement and dynamics. Cho Soon-ja categorized *sikimsae* into the following three kinds as a critical vocal technique of *kagok* singing.\(^6\) Consequently, there are three categories of *sondongjak* in *kagok* for:

1. Tapping *changdan* (the rhythmic cycles)

2. *Sikimsae*
   a. *Ch’ikinŭn yosŏng* (upward-gliding)
   b. *T’oesŏng* (downward-gliding)
   c. *Ch’usŏng* (pitch bend)

3. *Hyuji* (rests)

If *kagok* songs are in a slow tempo (under one *chŏnggan* (beat) = 55), *sondongjak* can describe *sikimsae* during the interval between one beat and another of the rhythmic cycles. However, if the tempo of the song is over one *chŏnggan* = 55, the interval is too short to describe the *sikimsae*. Therefore, *sikimsae* and the corresponding *sondongjak*, can be described best in the slowest song, *Isudaeyŏp-Pŏdŭrŭn* (the first song of the first *kagok* suite). In this respect, *Isudaeyŏp-Pŏdŭrŭn* is usually taught as the first song of the *kagok* class.

4. 1. 1. Tapping the rhythmic cycle

In *kagok*, the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle is shown vertically on the right end of each page of the notation. [Figure 1-6]. The meanings of all the rhythmic cycle symbols are as follows:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Both hands</th>
<th>Both hands tapping on the knees simultaneously.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Left hand</td>
<td>Left hand tapping on the left knee.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Index finger of left hand raised then lowered denoting a rest beat’s rest.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Right hand</td>
<td>Right hand tapping on the right knee.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>One short flick of the right hand on the right knee, followed immediately by a tap.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Right hand flapping on the right knee four or five times, very fast and fading, like a ball bouncing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>One short tap on the right knee.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 4-2: The symbols of the rhythmic cycle]

The sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle is often notated in different ways among authors of the notation books although the true performance of the rhythmic cycle is almost the same as each other. [Figure 4-1].
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yi Chu-hwan</th>
<th>Cho Soon-ja</th>
<th>Kim Ki-su</th>
<th>Hong Wŏn-gi</th>
<th>Kim Chung-ja</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| ![Figure 4-2: Five different types of the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycles](image)
Yi Chu-hwan uses .CreateInstanceObject for the rest beat sign, but Hong Won-gi and Kim Ki-su left it □ as a vacant square. Yi Chu-hwan also did not distinguish any different types of right hand beats, giving only .CreateInstanceObject , although the other authors distinguished three or four different types of left hand beats (.CreateInstanceObject, .CreateInstanceObject, .CreateInstanceObject). Yi Chu-hwan seemed to show a more compact rhythmic cycle for training beginners by creating his unique symbol .CreateInstanceObject, which is not a changgo symbol but the singers. The shape of the rest beat (.CreateInstanceObject) is the illustration of the left index finger’s movement (raised then lowered).

Cho Soon-ja’s rhythmic cycle shows all types (seven in total) of the rhythmic cycle icons, four different types of right hand beating (.CreateInstanceObject, .CreateInstanceObject, .CreateInstanceObject, .CreateInstanceObject) and the rest beat (.CreateInstanceObject) by the index fingers. The sixth type is a left hand beat and the seventh is beating with both hands together.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Both</th>
<th>Left Index</th>
<th>Left</th>
<th>Right</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yi Chu-hwan</td>
<td>⊙</td>
<td>⊄</td>
<td>⊇</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cho Soon-ja</td>
<td>⊙</td>
<td>⊄</td>
<td>⊇</td>
<td>; ; ;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kim Ki-su</td>
<td>⊙</td>
<td>none</td>
<td>⊇</td>
<td>; ; ;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hong Won-gi</td>
<td>⊙</td>
<td>none</td>
<td>⊇</td>
<td>; ; ;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kim Chŏng-ja</td>
<td>⊙</td>
<td>none</td>
<td>⊇</td>
<td>;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Figure 4-3: Comparison of the use of rhythmic-cycle icons]
For a professional *changgo* accompanist, the differentiation of the four types of right hand tapping is necessary, but this is not an essential skill for *kagok* learners to distinguish. Even the use of | • is not clearly defined on the sixteenth beat among the *changgo* players. In spite of the different four types of right hand icons in the rhythmic pattern, the *taegang* structure (units of the rhythmic cycle, 16 = 332+332) still has not been shown in the notation. *Taegang* structure is an important aspect for beginners playing such a long rhythmic cycle. Showing each *taegang*, helps one remember the whole rhythmic cycle more easily because the long pattern is broken into smaller units.

The fastest song ‘*P’yŏnsudaeyŏp*’ (one *chŏnggan* = 70) in *kagok* is sung with the ten-beat rhythmic cycle rather than the sixteen-beat one. The ten-beat rhythmic cycle is an abbreviated form of the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle, in which four rest-beats ⊗ and one right flap-beat have been deleted, hence, the ten-beat rhythmic cycle can make the song more vibrant.

[Figure 4-4: The sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle and ten-beat rhythmic cycle]

---

7 Cho Soon-ja. telephone interview. 7 July, 2006.
4.1.2. *Sikimsae sondongjak*

*Sikimsae sondongjak* is described by the hand or hands which is/are going to tap the next beat of the rhythmic cycle. This ensures that the next beat will be anticipated and played smoothly. The next beat is like a ‘follow through’ after the *sikimsae*, without further change of hand or hands. *Sikimsae* has the complexity of pitch movement with semitones, microtones and dynamic changes as well. Logically, if the same *sikimsae* appears in a different tempo, its duration and the level of delicacy of *sikimsae sondongjak* are consequently different. The range and the number of vibrato of one *sikimsae* is not always the same even within one song, sung by the same singer. For example, the first upward-gliding *sikimsae* of *Isudaeyŏp-Pŏdŭrŭn* takes 2.4 seconds to describe. However, the same *sikimsae* in the fifteenth bar takes, only 0.9 seconds in Cho Soon-ja’s recording. Hence, the distinctive characteristic of *sikimsae sondongjak* is ‘flexibility’.

---

8 Cho Soon-ja. *Isudaeyŏp-Pŏdŭrŭn* The Forty-five songs of three suites of female kagok – 6 CDs, Sinnara Music

4. 1. 3. ♩ Ch’ikinŭn yosŏng (upward-gliding)

Ch’ikinŭn yosŏng literally means ‘push the note upward through vibrato.’ The vocal technique ‘upward gliding’ ♩, can be described as ‘glissando upwards which includes accelerando and repeated undulations of pitch.’ It always appears for the same melodic pattern in the p’yŏngjo mode, appearing between im (♭) and t’ae (F). [Figure 4-5]. The frequency of the vibrato involves four or five repetitions of B♭ - C followed by a sudden jump up to t’ae = F. During the jump, the timbre changes from a chest sound to a head sound. When the head sound F is produced, the hand or hands tap the next beat at the same time. The following two figures show how upward-gliding sikimsae ♩ in chŏngganbo notation can be translated into the western staff notation.

1) P’yŏngjo mode: im (♭) with an upward-gliding ♩ movement to t’ae (F)

[Sign in chŏngganbo notation] [Upward-gliding transcription]

[Figure 4-5: Upward-gliding movement in p’yŏngjo mode]
2) Kyemyŏnjo mode: hwang (黑 = e♭) with an **upward-gliding** movement to chung (仲 = a♭)

![Sign in chŏngganbo notation] ![Upward-gliding transcription]

[Figure 4-6: Upward-gliding movement in kyemyŏnjo mode]

This wide vibrato of upward-gliding is described by the hand or hands in three ways in terms of which hand is used for the next beat. **Sondongjak of ch’ikinŭn yosŏng** is similar to its notational sign PictureBox. The hand or hands are half opened and they draw the sign of Ch’ikinŭn yosŏng, but the direction of the sign is modified in terms of which hand is used:

- Right hand:  
- Left hand:  
- Both hand:  

*Sondongjak* is made in-between the abdomen area and shoulder, to encourage the throat vibrato of the upward-gliding sound. As the vibrato starts with deep and slow notes, the hand or hands slowly draw strong and big waves. As the vibrato gets quicker and softer, the hand or hands rush to draw softer and smaller waves.
i) The right hand of *Ch’ikinün yosŏng* (upward-gliding *sikimsae*): *Che* 1 
gak che 2 chŏnggan (the second square in the first row from the right) in *p’yŏngjo*, 
Isudaeyŏp

[Figure 4-7: Right hand upward-gliding and its *sondongjak* description]

In the above *chŏngganbo* notation, the first beat is 1️⃣, tapping the knee 
with both hands together. After that, the second beat, 2️⃣, is played by raising the 
index finger of the left hand and then lowering it onto the left knee. Immediately, 
the right hand draws the sign 3️⃣ in time with the singing of the upward-gliding. 
Although the second beat is beaten by the left hand, the *sikimsae* sign is described 
by the right hand in order to prepare the third beat, 4️⃣, smoothly. This is because 
the beat 5️⃣ should be beaten by the right hand.
ii) The left hand of *Ch’ikinŭn yosŏng* (upward-gliding sikimsae): *che 1* *gak che 7 chŏnggan* (the seventh square in the first row from the right) in *p’yŏngjo, Isudaeyŏp*

![Image of left hand upward-gliding and its sondongjak description]

After the right hand beats the seventh *chŏnggan* on the right knee, the left hand describes the sign (㈬) with the throat vibrato of *Ch’ikinŭn yosŏng*. This is because the next beat (the eighth *chŏnggan* 有期) should be beaten by the left hand.

iii) Both hands of *Ch’ikinŭn yosŏng* (upward-gliding sikimsae): *che 2* *gak che 11 chŏnggan* (the eleventh square in the second row from the right) in *p’yŏngjo, Isudaeyŏp*

![Image of both hands upward-gliding and its sondongjak description]

9 Cho Soon-ja’s teeth are showing in the photo because she often tries to exaggerate a certain technique to make it easy to understand for her students.
In the above notation, the eleventh square starts with the hands beating on the right knee, and then both hands together describe the upward-gliding, in time with the upward gliding vibratos, to prepare for the twelfth beat. The direction of upward-gliding by Cho Soon-ja is from bottom to top, the shape of the curve becoming small and fading.

4.1.4. **T’oesŏng (downward-gliding)**

The *t’oesŏng sikimsae* literally means ‘backwards or downwards with vibrato’ which is opposite to the *Ch’ikinŭn yosŏng* (the upward-gliding technique). It can be described as ‘glissando downwards which includes accelerando and repeated undulations in pitch. The number of vibrato in *t’oesŏng* again coincides with that of the singer’s throat vibrato. It usually appears on the interval from *chung* = a♭ to *t’ae* = f and the cadence of the third section in *p’yŏngjo* mode. In *kyemyŏnjo*, mostly the interval of *im* = b♭ to *chung* = a♭ is described with *t’oesŏng sikimsae*. The following is the sign for *t’oesŏng* and its transcription in Western notation.

![Sign of chŏngganbo notation][downward-gliding transcription]

![Figure 4-10: Downward-gliding transcription in Western notation]
The range of the vibrato in *t’oesŏng* is one or one and half tones and the number of vibratos within these is approximately five or six. Flexibility is dependent on different singers. Even the same singer may not produce the same number of vibratos each time.

*T’oesŏng* occurs towards the end of the note as a descending glide with throat vibrato. In order to describe it, the lower part of the arm is held straight up and the hand, or hands, describe the sign of *t’oesŏng*. The movement of *t’oesŏng* can be compared to rolling down a coil, or fading sea waves. It starts off slowly and clearly and becomes progressively faster, and fades towards the end, as transcribed above. Therefore, the hand or hands, draw slow and clear waves first and then become faster with smaller movements. This *t’oesŏng sikimsae* is also described by the hand, or hands, in three ways.
i) The right hand of *t’oesŏng* (downward-gliding): *che 1 gak che 15th chŏnggan* - The fifteenth square in the first row from the right in *Kyemyŏn, Isudaeyŏp*

![Image of downward-gliding sign]

**Chŏngganbo**

downward-gliding sign

**Sondongjak**

Description of right hand sign

[Figure 4-11: Right hand downward-gliding *sikimsae* and its *sondongjak* description]

On beating the fifteenth *chŏnggan* on the left knee (O), the right hand shakes in time with the *t’oesŏng* throat vibratos. Although the fifteenth beat is beaten by the left hand and the *t’oesŏng* *sikimsae* sign is shown in the fifteenth *chŏnggan*, this *sikimsae* sign is described by the right hand to prepare for the next beat (the sixteenth *chŏnggan*) which should be beaten by the right hand.
ii) The left hand of *t’oesŏng* (downward-gliding): *che* 9 *gak* *che* 14th *chŏnggan* - The seventh square in the first row from the right in *p’yŏngjo*, *Tugŏ*. Downward-gliding sign.

![Image](image_url)

Chŏngganbo  
downward-gliding sign
   
   Sondongjak   
   Description of left hand sign

[Figure 4-12: Left hand downward-gliding sikimsae and its sondongjak description]

The right hand beats the fourteenth beat ( | ) on the right knee. After that the left hand describes the *t’oesŏng* sign in time with the downward-gliding throat vibratos to prepare for the next beat (the fifteenth *chŏnggan* | ).

iii) Both hands of *t’oesŏng* (downward-gliding): - *che* 6 *gak* *che* 11 *chŏnggan* - The eleventh square of the sixth row from the right in *p’yŏngjo*, *p’yŏnggŏ*.

![Image](image_url)

Chŏngganbo  
downward-gliding sign
   
   Sondongjak   
   Description of left hand sign

[Figure 4-13: Image of downward-gliding sikimsae, chŏngganbo, both hands]
As soon as the eleventh beat (\( | \) ) is played by the right hand [Figure 4-12], both hands together shake in time with the \textit{t'oesŏng sikimsae} vibratos. This is because the next beat (the twelfth \textit{chŏnggan}) should be beaten by both hands. The direction of the shaking of the hands is from top to bottom as it is drawn.

4. 1. 5. \( \leftarrow \textbf{Ch’usŏng} \) (a pitch bend)

\textit{Ch’usŏng sikimsae} is slightly raising the pitch at the end of the note. It is one of the most common techniques in kagok singing, and is of very short duration. For example, in the first section (\textit{che 1 chang}) of \textit{p’yŏngjo}, \textit{Isudaeyŏp}, \textit{ch’usŏng sikimsae} appeared eight times, \textit{Ch’ikinŭn yosŏng} appeared five times and \textit{t’oesŏng} only once. In the \textit{ch’usŏng} the last remaining sound of the tone slides up smoothly to one tone higher but the tension of the note should be increased towards this tone-higher point. The very short duration of \textit{ch’usŏng} suddenly changes to the next note. As the notes change the timbre also moves from a head sound to a chest sound. As the first note moves suddenly to the next note it is described using the index and middle fingers which slide, with accelerando, upwards, ending with a straight stabbing motion.

\textit{Ch’usŏng} usually appears at the end of the beat, and means ‘move up a
semitone or a tone, ending with accelerando and an accent.’ Both the index finger and middle finger are held straight up, and point to a spot in the air around the front of the forehead, while the other fingers are folded down. This sign is often used to indicate the change in timbre from a chest sound to a head sound in *chung* 仲 = a♭ of *p’yŏngjo* mode. In this case, both the index and middle fingers should point outwards describing a circle, in front of the chin on *nam* = C, and spiral down to stab at the level of the neck on *im* 林 = b♭.
i) **The right hand of Ch’usŏng** - *Che 2 gak che* 10th *chŏnggan* in *p’yŏngjo* *Tugŏ*- the tenth square in the second row from the right.

Sign of *ch’usŏng* in *chŏngganbo*  
*Chusŏng*  
Description of right hand sign  

[Figure 4-14: Right hand *ch’usŏng* and *sondongjak* description]

The index finger of the left hand plays the tenth *chŏnggan* and then the index finger and the middle finger of the right hand stabs in the air to describe the stressed, ‘surging’ note. After that, the right hand taps on the right knee for the fifteenth beat.

ii) **The left hand of Ch’usŏng**  *Che 2 gak che* 1 chŏnggan in *p’yŏngjo*, *P’yŏnggŏ* - the first square in the second row from the right

Sign of *ch’usŏng* in *chŏngganbo*  
*Chusŏng*  
Description of right hand sign  

[Figure 4-15: left hand *ch’usŏng* and its *sondongjak* description]
On tapping the first beat (O) with both hands, the index finger of the left hand shakes in time with the surging note. This is because the next beat (the second chŏnggan ㉚) should be beaten by the left hand. Ch’usŏng is never described by both hands in any kagok song. To use both hands together, sikimsae would have to occur on the eleventh or the last (sixteenth) beat because the twelfth beat and first beat are tapped by both hands. However, no ch’usŏng sikimsae appears in these beats.

4. 1. 6. Hyuji (Rest)

There are two types of rest signs in kagok singing. One is a short rest sign (\(^\)), the other (△) is much longer and lasts more than two or three beats for a phrase end. In hand signs, the short rest is not clearly presented each time, because it is of such short duration, even in a slow tempo. However, it is occasionally shown as an abrupt hand movement; the bending of her middle three fingers. For the much longer rest, Cho Soon-ja’s thumb and middle fingers touch.
4. 1. 7. Dynamics

There is no particular sign for dynamics in kagok notation. However, kagok is extremely melismatic because of the sikimsae, which essentially need dynamics. In order to express sikimsae signs, dynamics are always involved at the same time, as was shown in [Figures 4-4, 4-5, 4-6, 4-7 and 4-8]. If the note is accentuated, the hand movement is strong and sharp as well. If the vibrato of sikimsae is decrescendo, sondongjak become smaller and softer, like upward-gliding. If the vibrato of sikimsae is accelerando, the hand or hands move faster as well. When a phrase finishes softly, the width of the bouncing beat becomes, consequently, narrower and gentle.
4. 2. The principles behind *sondonjak*

*Kagok sondongjak* is not just a kind of hand gesture but the visual expression of a singer’s inner thought, through the hand or hands, of how the singer interprets and feels the song. This philosophical and sophisticated aspect of *kagok* also reveals why *kagok* has been loved by the literati and *kisaeng* under Confucianism for so long.

*Sondonjak* visually indicates the rhythmic cycles and the three main *sikimsae*, including dynamics and rests. The hand movement gradually establishes the tempo, style and dynamic of a piece. The critical role of *sondongjak* is to make the singing of *sikimsae* easier. Making the *sondongjak* automatically converts the *sikimsae* sounds into visible graphics. Singers usually draw these graphic *sikimsae* signs with their hands in the air between the beats. The dynamics of the *sikimsae* are also described by controlling the speed and width of movement of the hands so that they correspond to the sounds to be made.

4. 2. 1. *Sondonjak* for the visualization of *sikimsae*

*Kagok sondongjak* illustrates the movement of pitch, and its dynamics, in terms of its frequency of glottal movement and degree of dynamics. If this visual aspect of *sondongjak* is considered, a comparison between it and pitch, dynamics etc. could be shown using e.g., a melogram. The melogram was invented in 1950s for the analysis of
those melodic elements, and a melograph displays acoustical information in the form of a melogram, which generally shows pitch and loudness as function of time. In 1970 Coralie Rockwell adopted a melogram in the analysis of kagok, but failed to use it for the purpose of comparing sondongjak and melodic movements, or recognize sondongjak at all.

Yi Chu-hwan indicated sondongjak by using the changgo-ch’ae (a bamboo stick of the changgo), while playing the changgo at the same time. Students were busy watching Yi’s ch’ae movement, which made kagok’s sikimsae visible. The tracing of the sound, by the changgo stick in the air, was like a melogram revealing the degree of vibrato and dynamics. Just as the melogram shows the movement of pitch and dynamics, kagok’s sondongjak also show these aspects clearly. However, interestingly, if two different singers’ sondongjak are compared, the sondongjak clearly reveal visual differences, to the extent that the singer’s school or teacher can be identified. The reason is that the same school uses the same hand shape, directions and so on.


11 See p 236-249. for more details.
4. 2. 2. Equating sondongjak and sikimsae’s spectrogram.

It is important to recognize, here, that a well-trained singer’s glottal movement of sikimsae can exactly correspond to the movements of the singer’s sondongjak. In order to show the more concrete evidence of a strong relationship between sikimsae and sondongjak, a spectrogram is used which displays pitch and loudness in relation to time by the computer program. In order to assess this relationship Kim Yŏng-gi’s t’oesŏng (downward-gliding) and Ch’ikinŭn yosŏng (upward-gliding) in the beginning of Pŏdŭrŭn were also examined by the program. Note that the sondongjak sign should be viewed horizontally, rather than its original vertical state, so that it equates more, obviously with the left hand sondongjak.

---

12 This spectrogram was produced by Frequency 1.0 program, which requires Mac OS X 10.1 or higher system.
a) T’oesŏng (downward-gliding)

[Figure 4-16: Spectrographic image of downward-gliding and its sondongjak]¹³

The above figures show how closely sondongjak is related to the singer’s sound. In the fundamental frequency image, each waveform reflects phases of the glottal cycle, which is an indicator of vocal-fold contact; thus an ascending line indicates the closing, and

---

¹³ This spectrogram was produced by Frequency 1.0 program, which requires Mac OS X 10.1 or higher system.
descending line indicates the opening of the glottis. The width of the waveform indicates the
interval of pitches. The image on the spectrogram shows a regular inflectional waveform
(헥) occurring six times, in the pitch range, approximately from 350 Hz to 450 Hz, which
represents the t’oesŏng technique (down-ward gliding). T’oesŏng is produced by vibratos
from chung 仲 (A♭ - 415.3 Hz) to t’ae 太 (F - 349.2 Hz) while the sound gradually
becomes softer. If the image of a waveform and the dynamic configuration are combined, the
image will correspond to a singer’s t’oesŏng sondongjak. [Figure 4-16].
b) *Ch’ikinŭn yosŏng* (Upward-gliding)

The upward-gliding in the slowest *kagok* ‘Pŏdūrŭn’ sung by Kim Yŏng-gi is again analyzed in the spectrogram.

![Dynamics of upward-gliding](image)

[Figure 4-17: The similarity of spectrographic image of upward-gliding and right-hand *sondongjak*]

The above spectrogram obviously shows a very well controlled throat movement, like an elastic band; the first big clear curve of the frequency becomes smaller within
the same pitch range. The dynamic movement is a steadily repeated ‘crescendo and
decrescendo.’. The mixed image of the dynamics and frequency is the *sondongjak*
movement. The shapes are almost similar to each other; even the number of curves is
coincident with each other. The development of such a well controlled throat is very
time consuming.

Regardless of the above spectrographic images of upward-gliding and downward-
gliding *sondongjak* can be defined as the visual description of the glottal movement and
dynamics for a singer. This visual description, *sondongjak*, is not an unconscious,
habitual hand movement but the integration of the singer’s physical movement and
cognition of sound.

### 4.2.3. *Sondongjak* for conducting oneself

Counting the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycles, by tapping on the knees, and signing
the movements of *sikimsae*, plays a similar role in *kagok* as conducting does in Western
music. In Western music conducting involves the use of physical gestures and signs to
indicate how the music is to be played, the form that the music will take during
performance and, in general, it guides the overall interpretation and analysis of the
music such as dynamics, rhythmic flow, tempo, articulation and volume of the sound.
For example, if a passage is decrescendo and accelerando, hand movements are also
narrow and faster. However, the main difference between kagok’s sondongjak and Western conducting is that the object to be conducted in kagok is not a member of the orchestra but the singer, oneself.

4.2.4. Sondongjak for meditation

Cho Soon-ja believed that singing kagok with sondongjak would assist not only kagok learning but also the singer’s meditation, which leads to a relaxed state or peaceful and balanced spirit. This belief in kagok’s meditation role corresponds to the yeak sasang. Musical art is not merely a mode of entertainment, it is above all, a vehicle of a peoples’ conscience and true self. Cho’s belief in kagok made her sondongjak more curved and natural than other singers. Cho Soon-ja added the Korean traditional martial art, ‘wŏnhwado,’ to her kagok performance in 2002. Wŏnhwado was created to purify warriors’ spirits by dancing mostly curved, slow movements, particularly of the arms, that are very like kagok’s sondongjak. The goal of this martial art is also quite similar to kagok’s sondongjak in that it is a spiritual cultivation through physical movement.

Cho Soon-ja explained Dr. Lee Hye-ku’s case as a good example of this meditative aspect of kagok. Dr. Lee, one of the most outstanding traditional music

---

14 It was explained in Chapter 1.
scholars, started each morning by singing ‘Isudaeyŏp-Pŏdŭrŭn with its hand movements. He believed that singing the song with hand movements enabled him to be in touch with the deeper, spiritual side of his nature.  

*Kagok*’s meditative aspect comes from not only the slow, peaceful flow of melody but also from the repetition of rhythmic and melodic patterns with *sondongjak*. Repetitive motions and music patterns are essential for reaching a hypnotic stage. In Tibetan meditative dance, repetitive steps also lead to a meditative state.  

In *kagok* the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycles are repeated thirteen times, even one rhythmic cycle comprises repetitive rhythmic segments. The main three *sikimsae* account for over 57% because they appear many times in the authentic form of *kagok*.  

4. 2. 5. *Sondongjak* for memorization and as a rhythmic and melodic pattern-indicator

While beating the rhythmic cycles, singers feel the flow of the song in terms of its tempo, rhythm, dynamics and melodic patterns. In addition, the repetition of the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle with *sikimsae* can also be used to assist students in

17 See the Chapter 59-62.
understanding and memorizing the rhythmic structure of kagok’s six ‘taegang’ 대강.

The sixteen beat-rhythmic cycle does not consist of sixteen, individual beats the six, different, rhythmic unit ‘taegang’. (3+3+2, 3+3+2). While counting [one two three], [one, two, three], [one, two], students are able to remember the rhythmic patterns automatically with the beats of the hand movements [BLR], [LLR], [RL], [LLR], [BLR], [LR].

Certain types of sikimsae are always related to the same melodic motives, which appear at least several times through the songs. For example, the downward-gliding sikimsae in p’yŏngjo mode always corresponds to the sliding tremolo between A♭ and F. This melodic pattern appears sixteen times in Isudaeyŏp and should be described, almost always, by the right hand. Thus, repeating sondongjak and singing together, the rhythmic pattern is easily remembered.

4. 2. 6. Sondongjak, from movement to cognition and sound

Sondongjak supplies a map of how the sound is to be produced. Vocal production does not only come from throat movement but also from brain functions. Thereby, sondongjak is like a metaphor which helps transference between the cognition and voice.

18 B: both hands together, L: left hand, R: right hand.
There is another sense in which metaphor is a moving experience in that the transference that occurs when one thing is seen in terms of another is a dynamic process where meaning involves a shift. Metaphor induces a cognitive shift and there is a ‘play’ in the construction of meaning when seeing one thing in terms of another. In this definition cognition relies on metaphorical processes and metaphor is dynamic; it ‘moves’ us to understand. There is play in the construction of meaning when seeing one thing in terms of another and this mirrors the very nature of our bodily experience . . . bodily understanding is a constant feature of all higher levels of understanding and can always be found in the higher cognitive processes of all forms of symbolic discourse.\textsuperscript{19}

Furthermore, sondongjak’s visible movements are also a useful tool for categorizing various musical aspects, such as vibratos and changing dynamics, and kagok education. It is important to understand how useful a tool sondongjak is if one follows Cho Soon-ja’s teaching. In the first lesson, Cho Soon-ja usually teaches two aspects only: firstly, how to play the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle and secondly, how to sing the first two phrases, lasting eleven beats, of \textit{p’yŏngjo} ‘Isudaeyŏp-Pŏdūrūn’. To begin with she sings a few phrases of ‘Isudaeyŏp’ with sondongjak for her beginner students. After this, Cho Soon-ja explains the hand signs. Firstly, she asks her students to tap the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle with their hands on their knees. Secondly, the first sikimsae, \textit{ch’ikinūn yosŏng} (upward-gliding) of the song is introduced and repeated more than ten times, with hand movements and explanation. While copying the
sikimsae, students are often not confident and sing in a soft voice and laugh. This is because students cannot control their throats properly. However, Cho Soon-ja exaggerates the upward-gliding sondongjak, and then asks the students to copy her hand sign. A few months later, the students’ sondongjak eventually works properly, thereby the students’ control of the throat, correspondingly, is improved. This bodily understanding helped students’ vocal techniques.

Every movement of sondongjak results in a clearer perception of sikimsae. In other words, the perception of ch‘ikinūn yosŏng (upward-gliding) was helped by the motion and visual aspects of the hand movements. The author strongly felt that making sondongjak was like drawing a picture in the mind and asking the throat to move like the pencil on the paper. This experience can be explained more clearly with the following figures made by Chris Philpott.
The above figure illustrates that the lowest and most ‘physical’ movement is always a part of higher understanding. *Sikimsae* also give *kagok* students external, visual images as well, so that they last for a long time in the students’ minds. Kim Wŏl-ha’s hand sign advice to Kim Yŏng- gi, mentioned before, is a good example of the music educational theory which suggests that the dynamic, moving body is the foundation for the development of all cognition and learning. The following recollection tells the example of this.

---

20 Philpott, Chris. 2001: 85.
I had an unforgettable episode while learning *kagok* with Kim Wŏl-ha. When I learnt *kagok* with her sitting face to face on the floor, Kim always held a *changgo* stick in her right hand. As all her students know, Kim considered *sonjangdan* [sondongjak] as an important aspect to be learnt. It was not an easy task to sing in front of the very strict teacher, Kim Wŏl-ha. I was so nervous that I made many wrong *sonjangdan*; the left hand was raised instead of the right hand, the right hand was raised instead of the left hand. At that moment, Kim automatically shook the stick in front of my forehead, which was a real shock and scary moment. It made me more nervous so I made more *sonjangdan* mistakes. I still clearly remember the moment as if it had happened the day before yesterday. I have realized the reason, recently, why my teacher emphasized the fact that a singer’s body and mind should always move correspondingly while singing.\(^{21}\)

The previous *kagok* singers and teachers did not hear or know the systematic cognition of musical education theories at all, but they experienced and recognized that the *sondongjak* were an effective way to teach *kagok*, especially *sikimsae*. Because of this, they all used the *sondongjak* in their teaching.

**4. 2. 7. Sondongjak as an achievement indicator**

*Sondongjak* also indicates the level of a singer’s understanding of *kagok*. In other words, if singer’s hand sign is not detailed, her singing is correspondingly unclear. Cho Soon-ja emphasizes the use of *sondongjak* when assessing students’ ability and when correcting students singing. It takes a long time, and a lot of practice, to learn how to

make *sondongjak* properly while singing at the same time. The intricate vocal lines are
difficult to learn in themselves, and especially when the *sondongjak* are being learnt at
the same time. Initially, students have to concentrate on two things at once and
coordination may be difficult. Therefore, the *sondongjak* are a good indication of any
progress in achievement. The criteria for this achievement are:

1) The correctness of the time sequence and flow

2) The naturalness of the movement.

3) The accuracy of the hands reflecting the sound.

4) Confidence in the movements.

5) The delicacy of the signs.

When I learnt *kagok* from Cho Soon-ja, in the beginning, she often corrected my
singing with hand signs: “Your hand movements are unclear and so narrow. Straighten
up your back and watch my hands carefully. You should imagine your throat muscle is
like dough, you should mould it by hand movements. Eventually, your throat muscle
should be soft but bouncing back quickly and flexibly like an elastic band…”22 Cho
Soon-ja explained the upward-gliding technique of throat training through this metaphor,
which was helpful for copying her singing.

---

Sondongjak express not only a singer’s level of achievement but also shows the singer’s preparation for singing. There is a good example of this:

When Kim Yŏng-gi lifted her index finger and put it down, preparing for one ‘rest beat’[Plate 4-6], Kim Wŏl-ha advised her to lift the index finger a bit later than she had done. i.e., closer to the ‘rest beat’, as it was a more precise preparation for the ‘rest beat’. This reveals how closely the sondongjak of kagok must reflect the singer’s ‘inner process’ of singing.

---

4. 3. Comparison of four singers’ *sondongjak* and sound

If the *sondongjak* of four different *kagok* singers (Cho Soon-ja, Kim Yong-gi, Lee Jun-a and Ch’oe Su-ok) are compared to one other, on the video taken by the author, it becomes evident that the shape of the hand movements, the number of hand vibrations and the degree to which individual hands vibrate are not the same for each of the signs. This fact illustrates that singer’s *sondongjak* are individually specific and could be used to identify particular singing styles and interpretations of *kagok*.

Tapping the rhythmic cycle is almost the same among each singer but describing *skimsae* is not. For example, all singers described downward-gliding by curving movements downwards, but the shape of curvature and hand shapes were slightly different. Even describing upward-gliding *skimsae* appeared in many different ways among the singers, which is interesting.

---

24 See the Appendix I, 408-409.
4. 3. 1. The shape of **sondongjak**

Regardless of the similar formal shape of one *sondongjak*, each singer will interpret it with their own unique movements.

[Plate 4-8: Different shapes of *sondongjak* between Cho Soon-ja and Kim Yŏng-gi]
Cho Soon-ja often half grasps (closes) her hands which results in a more curving movement. In contrast, Kim Yŏng-gi uses straight fingers, with palms facing each other, which often makes straight movements. It is even possible that by analyzing the singer’s hand signs, each teacher could be identified. There is good evidence that Ch’oe Su-ok’s *sondongjak* is also very similar to that of her teacher, Kim Chin-hyang, who died in 1998. One T.V. documentary containing a snippet of Kim Chin-hyang’s *sondongjak*, clearly shows the similarity between both singers’ hand signs.\(^{25}\) They both grasp their fists tightly (the thumb straight outward on the top and the rest of fingers bending inwards) and push downwards many times. The hand moves from left to the right, then up and down. In addition, Kim Chŏng-ja’s hand shape is the same as that of Ch’oe Su-ok, because they learnt *kagok* together, from Kim Chin-hyang. As it was explained before, Kim Chin-hyang has learnt *kagok* from Ha Kyu-il who is considered the pioneer of today’s *kagok*.

4.3.2. Direction in *sondonjak*

Although all hand movements are aimed at describing the *sikimsae* in the air, the directions of different *sondonjak* vary. The principle behind them is the same, describing the glottal movements with dynamics. The following photos, and the image description of their *sondonjak* for upward-gliding, show the different movements in spite of the same *sikimsae*.
Cho Soon-ja

Kim Yŏng-gi

Ch’oe Su-ok

[Figure 4-19: Sondongjak of upward-gliding by three singers]
The upward-gliding *sikimsae* usually comes with decrescendo and accelerando as it was shown. Hence, the movement of the three singer’s upward-gliding *sondongjak* became smaller and faster regardless of directions. Cho Soon-ja made it quickly upward, Kim Yŏng-gi’s *sondongjak* moved down and up repeatedly and Ch’oe Su-ok also drew a curving-down stroke first followed by a few small bouncing movements. Cho Soon-ja’s movements are always curved and dynamic. In contrast, Kim Yŏng-gi’s *sondongjak* move straight up and down, so she has got a lot of spring in her hand movement. The movement of Ch’oe Su-ok’s *sondongjak*, is quite simple, bouncing the hand two or three times only. It is obvious that Ch’oe Su-ok’s simple hand movement corresponded to her simple vibrato of upward-gliding.

**4.3.3. Comparison with *sikimsae* spectrograms**

There is no doubt that spectrogram is a useful vehicle to compare the singer’s vocal technique such as the range of vibrato, frequency and immense. It instantly make visual the singer’s vocal characteristics. Therefore, the author used a spectrogram to compare the four singer’s *sikimsae* and observe the relationship between *sondongjak* and vocal techniques. The four different *kagok* singers’ upward-gliding sound (from the sixth and seventh square (*chŏnggan*) of the second column of the *Pŏdūrūn*), approximately for two seconds, were examined by the Frequency 1.0 program.
As can be seen, approximately two seconds of upward-gliding sikimsae, sung by four different singers, show a similar fundamental pitch movements (B♭-c–f) but some aspects such as waveforms, numbers of oscillations, and frequency range are quite different from singer to singer. It should be noted that the upper part of the harmonics of the above four spectrograms do not fully reflect the singers’ own sound because their singing was recorded in different noise conditions in the recording environment. Hence, the upper parts of the spectrograms are a mixture of other frequencies that appear on the recording. In spite of this difficulty, the fundamental of each spectrogram is clear and corresponds with the singer’s sound and sondongjak.

Each spectrogram demonstrates the immense of vocal control of the singers through the pattern of the wave forms. As the method of vocal control is not the same among the singers, the pattern of the wave form is shown differently. The greater the
distinction in the spectrograms also reflects the greater distinction between the singers’ vocal production and *sondongjak*. Therefore, the wave form of spectrograms is analyzed in terms of the outline of fundamental, the number of oscillations, the size of the cycle, the slope of wave form and the frequency of range.

The following figure shows the cut off fundamental waveforms for easier comparison.
1) Cho Soon-ja

2) Kim Yŏng-gi

3) Ch’oe Su-ok

4) Lee Jun-a

[Figure 4-21: Comparison of fundamental wave forms]
a. Style of *sondongjak* and outline of fundamental

Cho Soon-ja and Kim Yŏng-gi show similar upward-gliding *sondongjak* by quickening the movement, although direction of the movement is different: 1) Cho moves from bottom to top, Kim moves from top to bottom. Hence, the waveforms of the fundamentals (i.e., shown as the bottom line) of both spectrograms are similar to each other. Initially the sudden stressed B♭ moves very quickly up to c and then gradual, quickening repetitions of this interval occur before the change of timbre from chest to head sound. Then the c moves quickly to F with another timbre change. This is the standard singing style of upward-gliding.

As Cho Soon-ja and Kim Yŏng-gi gradually quicken the shaking of their hands, the cycle of the waveforms shown became shorter. In contrast, there is no quickening or shortening of the waveforms in Ch’oe and Lee’s singing. When Ch’oe made a large curvilinear movement by hands, the stressed B♭ lasted for a long duration before the three light vibratos. Coincidently, her *sondongjak* did not indicate any transitional moment, only a first curving down stroke and then very short and small vibrations of her hands, three times were made.

Lee Jun-a’s spectrogram is the most obviously different from others: the curvilinear shape is almost same pattern and size without any break point. The number
of oscillations is the highest and the range of her pitch movement is definitely the widest.26 When the author asked Yi Yang-kyo about Lee’s vocal quality, Lee Jun-a’s teacher stated: “Lee Jun-a’s kagok singing had too many oscillations and too wide a vibrato. This style is definitely not an authentic female kagok voice. I recommended her to reduce the width and number of vibratos, but, up to date she has not accepted my advice. Her voice is more suitable for kasa or sijo rather than kagok singing.”27

b. The number of shaking hands and oscillations

Kim Yŏng-gi showed the highest number of movements in her hands and Cho Soon-ja showed the next highest. The fundamental oscillations in the spectrogram are correspondingly different: Kim Yŏng-gi showed five curving oscillations, Cho Soon-ja has four oscillations and Ch’oe Su-ok showed four, but very weak oscillations.

c. The speed of each stroke and the size of the cycle

The speed of each stroke of the singers’ upward-gliding sondongjak looked different; Kim Yŏng-gi presented faster movements than Cho Soon-ja, and Ch’oe Su-ok was the slowest. On the spectrogram, Kim Yŏng-gi’s frequency cycle was much narrower than Cho Soon-ja’s. Ch’oe Su-ok produced wide large cycle and then three

---

26 It is interesting to note that performance her overseas foreigners can have a big and misleading influence on the authenticity of kagok.

27 Yi Yang-kyo is the Korea National Intangible Cultural Asset of Kasa (not kagok) and Lee Jun-a is his best student of kasa (not kagok).
small ones as she made one curving hand movement and then a very short tap. The width of the frequency cycles of the singers depended on the speed of their *sondongjak* movement.

d. Dynamic of stroke and the slope of the waveform

If the dynamic of each stroke of upward-gliding *sondongjak* among the three singers is observed, Kim Yŏng-gi’s straight down stroke is more powerful than other singers; Cho Soon-ja’s upward-gliding *sondongjak* is a much softer, curving movement. This fact is also visually presented by the angle of the rise in the above spectrograms. The slope of the rise in the Cho’s spectrogram is more gradual than the others. Kim Yŏng-gi’s powerful down strokes made the steepest slope in her spectrogram.

e. The position of *sondongjak* and frequency range

The position of *sondongjak* varies from the lower abdomen area to the forehead depending on the singer’s *sondongjak* style and sikimsae. If a note goes up, the hand moves up. In the case of upward-gliding *sondongjak*, Cho Soon-ja and Kim Yŏng-gi positioned their hands mainly around the chest and shoulders, but Ch’oe Su-ok positioned her below the chest or lower abdomen area. This fact is strongly related to the frequency range of upward-gliding. The above spectrograms clearly show the differences of frequency range among the singers. Ch’oe’s frequency range was much
lower than the others as it can be recognized easily in the above spectrogram. Ch’oe’s frequency range of vibrato is closer to the presented point of 187 Hz to 240 Hz, which is lower than the international standard pitch frequency of Bb (233.1Hz) and c (261.6Hz); the frequency of Kim Yŏng-gi and Cho Soon-ja showed it was definitely above the 187Hz. This fact reveals that the position of the sondongjak also corresponds to the singers frequency ranges. The following table shows the comparison of the elements of the upward-gliding sondongjak among the kagok singers.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Upward-gliding</th>
<th>Cho S.J</th>
<th>Kim Y.K.</th>
<th>Ch’oe S. &amp; Kim C.J.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Shape of hand</td>
<td>![hand]</td>
<td>![hand]</td>
<td>![hand]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shape of movement</td>
<td>curve</td>
<td>straight</td>
<td>curve &amp; straight</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. of movement</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Direction</td>
<td>upward</td>
<td>up and down</td>
<td>up and down</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Range of movement</td>
<td>chest-shoulder</td>
<td>chest-shoulder</td>
<td>lower abdomen-chest</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Figure 4-22: Comparison of three singers’ upward-gliding]
4. 4. *Sondongjak* and notation

It can be possible to explore the relationship between the *sikimsae* signs in the notations and *sondongjak* differences among singers. However, when the author interviewed Cho Soon-ja, Kim Yŏng-gi, Lee Jun-a and Ch’oe Su-ok about notation books, their answer was all the same: they had learnt *kagok* with Yi Chu-hwan’s *kagokpo*. They hardly used any other *kagok* notation books although they were used as references. It means that the shape of *sondongjak* was formed by their teacher rather than *sikimsae* signs in the notation books. *Sondongjak* has been formed and transmitted by the oral tradition rather than notation.

In spite of the important role of the *sondongjak* in *kagok* education, there is only one book where *sondongjak* are shown on the score, *Sŏnga Ha Kyu-il Sŏnsaeng Yakchŏn* by Ch’oe Su-ok and Kim Chŏng-ja in 1993. The notation was designed for introducing Kim Chin-hyang’s *kagok* experience of her teacher, Ha Kyu-il. Consequently, it has not become popular as a notation book for *kagok* teaching.

The fact Kim Chŏng-ja and Ch’oe Su-ok added *sondongjak* in their notation reflected that they recognized the importance of hand movements and the difficulty of performing them. If the left hand describes a *sikimsae*, the *sikimsae* sign is written on the left side of the Chinese letter denoting pitch. If both hands describe a *sikimsae*, the
sign is written on both sides of the pitch letter. The following notation clearly shows how they presented the *sodongjak* on their notation.

[Figure 4-23: Kyemyŏnjo P'yŏnggo]²⁸

---

As can be seen, the downward-gliding vibrato sign \( \ddagger \) in *che 1 gak5 chŏnggan* (the fifth square of the first row) which is to be described by the right hand, is written down on the right side of *chŏnggan* \[ \ddagger \] The upward-gliding sign in *che 5 gak16 chŏnggan* (the fifth square of the first row) is written down both sides in one *chŏnggnan* \[ \ddagger \] because it is going to be described by both hands to prepare for the next beat (the first beat of the third row).

**Conclusion**

*Sondongjak* (hand signs), *kagok*’s unique, traditional, teaching method, is the visible equivalent of *sikimsae* sound. *Sondongjak* is not shown on stage, hence it has not been transmitted well. Cho Soon-ja strongly encourages her students to use it when they are learning. Kim Yŏng-gi clearly remembers how her teacher, Kim Wŏl-ha taught her with *sondongjak* but Kim only occasionally uses it for her teaching. Lee Jun-a does not even use it at all.

This chapter set out to examine *sondongjak*’s principles and roles in *kagok* and three singer’s *sondongjak* were compared with each other. These comparisons were to prove *sondongjak*’s usefulness and effectiveness during *kagok* practice, for not only students and but also teachers. *Sondongjak* clearly corresponds to a singer’s glottal
movement when performing *sikimsae*, which in turn is strongly related to pitch, frequency, dynamics and breathing. This was proved through an analysis of the spectrogram of the *sikimsae* sound and relating it to *sondongjak*. *Sondongjak* also showed its useful roles for conducting singers themselves, indicating students’ achievement, memorizing melodic patterns and inducing the meditative stage.

After comparing the styles of *sondongjak* of the three respected *kagok* singers, it is evident that the singer’s inner mind and interpretation of the song is clearly visualized in their *sondongjak*. Every singer has their own style of *sikimsae* and *sondongjak*, and this individuality has been a valuable aspect in understanding their singing style and interpretation of the songs. In addition, *sondongjak* also reflects the singing school from which they came. In spite of the different *sondongjak* styles of the three singers, the fundamental principles of *sondongjak* are very similar. Despite its effectiveness, *sondongjak* has not been recorded or written in *kagok* notation books except for Kim Chŏng-ja’s book. To activate the use of *sondongjak*, it is obvious that it be notated in all *kagok* notation books, and, again, to encourage the use of *sondongjak*, the new integrative *kagok* notation has been developed.
CHAPTER 5

Kagok and Western Staff Notation

Introduction

The use of notation and the form it takes are the result of the social and cultural context in which it has been developed. Koreans in the Chosŏn dynasty developed their indigenous notations and also adopted Chinese notations for the chŏngak. Chinese word script was broadly used as part of notation, because Chinese word script was the only script for literature before Korean script Han’gŭl was created by king Sejong (1397-1450). The direction of the reading styles in both these notations reflected the Korean writing style of the Chosŏn dynasty: it was read from top to bottom in columns, beginning on the right-hand side of the page.

There were eight different types of notation in the Chosŏn dynasty: i. Yulchabo (Chinese lū- lū notation) ii. Kongch’ŏkpo (Chinese gŏngchê) iii. Oŭm yakpo (Korean five tone notation) iv. Hapchabo (Kŏmun’go notation) v. Yukpo (Korean onomatopoeic notation) vi. Sutchabo (Numerical notation) vii. Yŏnŭmp’yo (Korean nueme notation)

viii. Chŏngganbo (Korean mensural notation). Some of these are related to each other.

For example, the word script for the twelve pitches (yulmyǒng) in yulchabo appears in chŏngganbo, and oŭm yakpo is based on the columns of chŏngganbo.

Chŏngganbo (Korean mensural notation system) was created during the reign of King Sejong by a musician, Park Yŏn (1378-1458), who was the major contributor to the creation of chŏngganbo in the Chosŏn dynasty. The need for chŏngganbo was explained as follows. “In the 15th century the recognition that music could exist independently of a textual desideratum was only just beginning to gain ground: . . . The text was written down and could be learned accurately, studied, commented on and elaborated. The music, on the other hand, being of lesser interest, was learned only by imitation and the handing on of oral traditions. Even when notational systems did develop, they were regarded primarily as a kind of simplified aide-memoire, not as a complete description of the way in which music should be performed.”

Chŏngganbo has been used almost for ritual court music by the twentieth century. However, Kim Ki-su has used chŏngganbo notation in his workbooks of taegŭm, tanso, and haegŭm since 1961.

---

The original *chŏngganbo* in *Sejong sillok*, encloses 16 squares (*chŏnggan*) in each column divided by thin and thick horizontal lines into six units (*taegang*). Each square box denotes one beat as the time unit, and graphic symbols are used for beats, which are quite similar to the African Time Unit Box System (TUBS) and Japanese *gagaku* notation. The TUBS, developed at University of California at Los Angeles in 1962, was created for didactic purposes in West African drumming.\(^4\) The TUBS encloses equal length boxes in horizontal sequence and each box represents one instance of the faster pulse within a same piece. An empty box denotes continuing sound in a time unit, which is the same concept as *chŏngganbo*. The box also receives symbols for pitch, loudness, tone quality, and carrying power.\(^5\)

\[ \text{Figure 5-1: Time Unit Box System (TUBS) Abofoo} \]\(^6\)


Japanese gagaku notation was also created with symbols (△, •, o ,°, Θ, ⊙, ◎) for drums such as ōtsuzumi, kotsuzumi and taiko. The black dot (•) indicates the weak/soft sound and the triangular symbol (△) indicates the loud/hard sound. Repeating patterns of each drum were instantly shown in the notation by symbols within the dan (section). Richard Emmert refers to this notation for drums (ōtsuzumi, kotsuzumi and taiko) in his analysis.\(^7\)

![Taiko Dan Pattern](image)

**[Figure 5-2: Taiko Dan Pattern]**

Among the eight notations used in the Chosŏn dynasty, mainly two types of notation, chŏngganbo and Western staff notation, are used for Korean traditional music today. Even chŏngganbo notation is used only for Korean classical pieces. Korean traditional music written in the chŏngganbo notation system was transcribed into Western staff notation for the first time in the 1930s in the Yiwangjik Aakpu. “In order

---

to preserve *chŏngak* and to introduce it to the world and promote it” The Yiwangjik Aakpu asked Paek Un-bo to transcribe *chŏngak* into Western staff notation in 1928, but he died in June 1930. . . . Yiwangjik Aakpu started the project with eight musicians in each area, and then completed it in May 1939.” Yi Chu-hwan transcribed *p’iri* music and Chang Sa-hun transcribed *kagok, kasa* and *sijo* in Yiwangjik Aakpu. It attempted to introduce Korean traditional classical music to foreign countries. Eight musicians took one musical genre each, such as *kagok*, to translate into Western notation. *Chŏngganbo* was considered as the representative indigenous notation at the Kungnip kugakwŏn.

Since the introduction of Western art music along with Western staff notation in the late nineteenth century by American missionaries, Korean traditional music has been called *kugak*, national music, reserving the term *ŭmak*, music specifically for Western art music in music colleges and institutes. Furthermore, Japanese colonial policy gave support to the integration of Western music in an attempt to discourage the teaching of Korean traditional music to omit Korean culture while Korea was a colony of Japan from 1910-1945.9

---


Western staff notation has dramatically dominated Korean traditional music in the late nineteenth century. All Koreans are influenced by Western staff notation and it has been assimilated through education. It is used widely, in areas such as performance, composition, education and analysis. Among the ten Korean traditional music orchestras in Korea, only the National Orchestra for Korean Traditional Music (the Kungnip-Kugaktan), regularly performs traditional classical music (chŏngak) using chŏngganbo notation. Other orchestras rarely perform chŏngak, which means they hardly ever have the opportunity to use chŏngganbo notation, nor did they in the past because the orchestras were formed in the twentieth century and chŏngganbo was used for court music only. Chŏngganbo was essentially only used for ritual court music until the twentieth century.

Keith Howard observed the use of staff notation in Korea. “Staff notation multiplied in post-liberation Korea. To some extent, and reflecting the way in which the West was perceived, it was considered to give academic credibility to those who transcribed and played Korean music. It had great appeal to musicological science and it was thus used by scholars. As performance became part of the academic curriculum, its
use by musicians increased. All of this points to a close and important ongoing relationship between scholarship and performance training.”\textsuperscript{10}

The majority of orchestras’ repertoires consist, primarily, of the newly-composed Korean traditional music, called \textit{Ch’angjak kugak}, or \textit{sin-kugak} and traditional folk music, most of which are notated in Western staff notation. Chae Hyun-kyung defined \textit{ch’angjak kugak} as follows: “The first word, \textit{ch’angjak} [newly-composed], implies that the piece is created by an individual composer and written down for a precise performance to express the creator’s intention. It bears repeating that the whole idea of composing a piece of traditional music was revolutionary in the beginning, no less so the idea of inventing a new \textit{kugak} that could be related to modern life in Korea.”\textsuperscript{11}

When \textit{chôngak} is analyzed by musicologists, Western staff notation is more commonly presented than \textit{chôngganbo} notation. Sometimes both notations are arranged together. When \textit{kayagûm} is learnt, Western staff notation is usual. This was because it was originally taught orally and so \textit{chôngganbo} was not learnt in \textit{sanjo} lessons. They went straight to learning staff notation. \textit{Kayagûm sanjo} was transcribed for the first time by Yi Chae-suk in 1971.\textsuperscript{12} Only students who learn \textit{chôngak} as their major subject, use

\textsuperscript{10} Howard, Keith. 1998b: 604.
\textsuperscript{11} Chae Hyun-kyung. 1998: 292.
chŏngganbo notation, otherwise chŏngak is usually shown in Western staff notation in textbooks.

Paek Tae-ung revealed the significance of musical trends in Korean traditional music society in the twentieth century. He stated that the persistent use of Western staff notation for Korean traditional music, and the appearance of newly-composed Korean traditional music, created significant musical changes in style as well as notation. “Since the appearance of Western staff notation in Korean traditional music, the musical style has been changed from monophony to polyphony. This is obvious if the differences of the notational system between Korean traditional music and the Western staff system are considered.”13 Despite the many problems caused by using Western staff notation for Korean traditional music, few Korean scholars have evaluated or criticized the use of Western staff notation. Park Mi-kyung is alone in criticizing today’s circumstances and has pointed out the notational mistakes and problems in Korean traditional music: “From now on, we should discuss carefully the issues and problems of adopting Western staff notation into Korean traditional music and problems of the creation of new notations . . .

Actually, there is no trial or discussion about using Western staff notation for Korean

traditional music. We have to consider what aspects of Western staff notation distort
Korean music and what signs should be created to reflect the beauty of Korean
traditional music.”¹⁴ The use of Western staff notation for Korean traditional music is
common, despite notational mistakes and problems, and its use for kagok is no exception.

Transcribing Korean music on Western staff notation is not easy task. Charles
Seeger remarked the difficulties of music writing in terms of the level of describing
music: “Three hazards are inherent in our practices of writing music. . . . The third lies in
our having failed to distinguish between prescriptive and descriptive uses of music-
writing, which is to say, between a blue-print of how a specific piece of music shall be
made to sound and a report of how a specific performance of it actually did sound.”¹⁵

Most remaining kagok transcriptions on Western staff notation can be considered
as the descriptive notation, which usually describe sikimsae with pitch variation and
intricate rhythmic patterns. These descriptive kagok transcriptions were used for the
introduction, analysis or a certain singer’s transcription rather than for teaching.

¹⁴ Park Mi-kyung. “Han’guk ūmak ūn’g’ue ssūin akpoesō dūrōnanūn munjejōmdōl” [Perceived Issues of Musical
Both of Kim Ki-su’s *kagok* transcriptions, *chŏngganbo* (*Yŏch’ang kagok yŏdŭnyŏdŏllip*) and Western staff notation (*Anthology of Korean Han’guk ŭmak*), are in the typical descriptive notation. He created more than twenty symbols for *chŏngganbo* transcription and then it was transcribed into Western staff notation with almost the same concept. Howard commented on Kim Ki-su’s trial that Staff notation was part of the modernization process, trying to adapt traditional music in its representation to Western methods, and these staff notations predate the equivalent *chŏngganbo*. Howard’s viewpoint corresponds with Yi Hŭi-gyŏng’s, “If Kim Ki-su’s *chŏngganbo* is compared with his Western staff notation *Han’guk ŭmak*, both transcriptions are exactly correspondent each other. It is predictable that he might have transcribed *chŏngganbo* under the Western staff transcription.”

Kim Ki-su’s descriptive *chŏngganbo* notations have not been used for the *kagok* teaching. When I interviewed the most renowned *kagok* singers (Cho Soon-ja, Kim Yŏng-gi, Lee Jun-a and Ch’oe Su-ok), all used *Kagokpo* written in *chŏngganbo* by Yi Chu-hwan. *Kagokpo* has been widely used in *kagok* teaching, which was based on Yi’s

---

16 See the figure 1-2 and Figure 1-3 in the Chapter 1.
teacher, Ha Kyu-il’s transcription. Ha Kyu-il made this prescriptive notation for students as a memory-aid, so it shows basic melodies and several symbols of sikimsae signs. Traditional notation systems in the past were not required to express such complexity of music sound. Flexibility of sikimsae and rhythmic pattern remained within student’s discretion.

In this chapter, kagok scores in Western staff notation will be examined in terms of these notational problems and mistakes. In order to illustrate these, five different types of kagok scores have been selected to show the use of Western staff notation in performance, composition, education, analysis and non-Korean transcriptions. The five types to be examined are:

1. The first generation of transcriptions:
   1) Male kagok song Ch’osudaeyŏp transcribed by Chang Sa-hun.
   2) Female kagok song Isudaeyŏp transcribed by Kim Ki-su.

2. Newly–composed kagok songs (Ch’angjak Kugak):
   1) Female kagok with the taegŭm, Sangil composed by Park Il-hun.
   2) Female kagok, Őjebam Kkumgilesŏ composed by Hwang Ùi-jong.

3. Transcription for kagok analysis:
   Five male kagok transcribed by Hwang Chun-yŏn

4. Transcription for education:
   Male kagok Ch’osudaeyŏp, Tongch’angi transcribed by Kim Hae-suk.

5. Transcription by a non-Korean:

Female *kagok* song, *Isudaeyŏp*, transcribed by Coralie Rockwell.

The above selected scores are written by the musicians and scholars who have contributed most to the study of *kagok* in the twentieth century. The impact of Chang Sahun and Kim Ki-su, on Korean music in particular, was highly significant. Kim Ki-su is currently considered a pioneer of *ch’angjak kugak* because the first piece of *ch’angjak kugak* was composed by him; the new piece is a newly composed *kagok* song, called *Ten thousand Year Chrysanthemum* (*Hwangha mannyŏnjigok*). The title is a reference to the permanence of Japanese colonialism, notated in Western staff notation in 1939, whilst Korea was under Japanese colonization. Kim Ki-su was commissioned to compose this in celebration of a Japanese festival in 1940.20 Although this was the first newly-composed Korean traditional *kagok* song in Korean musical history, its newness is encapsulated in title and text, which led to severe criticism, not in the music itself.21

Park Il-hun and Hwang Úi-jong are also famous *ch’angjak kagok* composers. Hwang Chun-yŏn, a Professor at Seoul National University, has also released analytical

---

20 The score was unpublished and is preserved in Kungnip Kugakwŏn.

articles about kagok. Kim Hae-suk’s transcription of a male kagok score is used today in the sight-singing class at the Korean National Arts Conservatory in Seoul. Coralie Rockwell is the first non-Korean expert on kagok and published Kagok: a vocal form of Korean traditional music.

5. 1. The first generation of transcriptions:
Chang Sa-hun (1916 - 1991) and Kim Ki-su (1917 - 1986)

When Chang Sa-hun first translated the vocal genre (kagok, kasa and sijo) into Western staff notation it was also the first time that Korean traditional music was introduced to other countries.22 Later on, in 1980, Kim Ki-su published kagok han pat’ang (comprising fifteen songs) with taegŭm accompaniment, transcribed into Western staff notation with chŏngganbo.23 Four years later, Kim extensively transcribed kagok han pat’ang with a full ensemble accompaniment in Han’guk Ŭmak (Anthologies of Korean Traditional Music).24 Both kagok transcriptions for voice are identical except for the time signature.

Both these transcribers’ work seemed to record kagok performance with

---
descriptive Western notation. Unfortunately, it does not reflect the real sound of *kagok*.

In addition, the four main mistakes have been found in their notation. Despite the different transcriptions of *kagok* songs (male and female) [Figure 5-1, 5-2 & 5-3], a number of similarities can be found when one compares the two transcriptions. In both pieces, one beat (one square) has been translated into a crotchet, which resulted in many triplets, denoting three subdivisions of one *chŏnggan*.

The problem was that the notation is not compact to read. Chang Sa-hun tried to translate each *sikimsae* into notes instead of *sikimsae* signs (except for ~~~~ for downwards-gliding vibrato), while Kim Ki-su used three *sikimsae* signs ( ~~~, ヌ, ˘ ) and notes as well for the translation of *sikimsae*. The following paragraph describes a number of their notational mistakes in detail.
[Figure 5-3: Transcription of male kagok song, Tongch’ang, by Chang Sa-hun] \(^{25}\)

[Figure 5-4: Transcription of Pŏdŭrŭn by Kim Ki-su in 1980] \(^{26}\)

---


\(^{26}\) Kim Ki-su. 1980: 1.
[Figure 5-5: Transcription of "Pŏdŭrn" by Kim Ki-su in 1984]²⁷

5.1.1. Pitch

Firstly, pitches on both scores are one octave higher than the sounding pitch of kagok. Chang’s transcription of the male kagok song [Figure: 5-1] should have used a tenor clef instead of a treble clef. To translate kagok into Western staff notation correctly, the sounding pitches should be denoted by using the correct clef. In chŏngganbo notation, the pitches of both the male and female are not differentiated but presented in the same register, although the sound is one octave apart.

Kim’s mistakes in describing pitches might have originated from his kagok book, The eighty-eight songs of female kagok (Yŏch’ang kagok yŏdũnyŏdŏllip), which was written in chŏngganbo notation. In this, the female kagok songs were transcribed as being one octave higher than those of the male songs. However, in order to reflect the pitch differences between the male and the female kagok songs, Kim Ki-su should have made the male songs one octave lower than those of female. This is because the standard pitch of hwang (e♭), is approximately 321HZ. Unfortunately, Kim Ki-su misunderstood the pitch of hwang. Few people can sing the female kagok as it is written in his transcription, because it has too high a vocal range from c’ – f’♭. 
Originally, the chŏngganbo notation of kagok did not differentiate between the pitch of male and female. However, when it is translated into Western notation the pitch differences should be shown in the transcription.

5. 1. 2. Time signature and bar-lines

The second notational mistake involves the time signature and bar lines. To transcribe the changdan (sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle) and taegang (metric division of the rhythmic cycle) structure of kagok of the chŏngganbo notation, Chang San-hun and Kim Ki-su used Western bar-lines and time signatures in different ways: At the beginning of the score [Figure 5-1] by Chang Sa-hun and [Figure 5-3] by Kim Ki-su, 16/4 is adopted to present one changdan (one rhythmic cycle comprising sixteen beats) and five semi bar-lines are used for taegang structure. At the end of the changdan, a normal straight bar-line is adopted for the completion of one changdan. The semi bar-lines seemed to denote the rhythmic flexibility of kagok. In Kim Ki-su’s notation [Figure 5-2], \( \frac{3+3+2}{4} \) is used for the changdan structure at the beginning of the song. The time signature is \( \frac{3+3+2}{4} \), but it was traditionally expected that a song flows from 3/4 to 2/4
and eventually back to 3/4 only once in the whole song, which does not correspond with Kim’s intention of denoting the repetition of 3/4, 2/4, 3/4 *taegang* system in every rhythmic cycle, *changdan*. To avoid this time signature problem, Kim Hae-suk tried a different method [Figure 5-13].

According to Chang Sa-hun’s notation [Figure 5-1], the semi-bar-lines are used effectively, not only to express the flexibility of time and beat, but also to remind the singers of the structure of *taegang*. In contrast, Kim Ki-su’s notation did not consider the flexibility of time and beat, which is one of the characteristics of *kagok* singing. His careless transcription led to the problem of understanding *kagok*. Robert Provine pointed out the differences between *kagok* notations and the actual *kagok* performance as follows:

A particularly clear example of conflicting presumptions about notation may be found in Kim Kisú’s [Kim Ki-su] (*金琦洙*) *Wŏrha* [Wŏl-ha] *chŏnkkasŏn* (月荷正歌選) *월하정가선* (Seoul: *Han’guk Kojŏn úmak ch’ulp’ansa* (한국고전음악출판사. 1971), a volume of valuable transcriptions of performances by the singer Kim Wŏrha. Half of the book is in Western staff notation and half in Kim Kisú’s extended form of *chŏngganbo* . . . Kim makes the seemingly obvious correlation of a box in *chŏngganbo* with the staff notation’s dotted quarter note, in this score, Kim chose a dotted quarter note instead of a crotchet for one *chŏnggan*, but the dotted quarter note in Western music, regardless of the speed of the music, does not have, for a Western reader, the necessary flexibility of duration. When an unprepared Western listener hears the actual performance by Kim Wŏrha [Kim Wŏl-ha] and sees the staff notation
score, there is a great surprise, because the dotted quarter notes are so unexpectedly irregular in length.\textsuperscript{28}

When Westerners visually examine the transcriptions of Kim Ki-su [Figure 5-2], they make the assumption that crotchet notes are just about equal in duration, and naturally, when they look at the \textit{chŏngganbo} scores, they will attribute to the boxes the same quality of nearly equal duration that is associated with the crochet notes. Consequently, a number of tempo changes within one \textit{kagok} song should be considered when it is transcribed.

\textbf{5. 1. 3. Complicated triplets}

The third notational error concerns the frequent appearance of complicated triplets, such as \includegraphics[width=0.2\textwidth]{complicated_triplets}, which make the male score very difficult to read visually. Even worse, the complicated rhythms were not written as they were sung. The triplets were only the outcome of a mathematical division, from the idea that one \textit{chŏnggan} (one square in \textit{chŏngganbo}) is equal to one crotchet.

According to Western traditional theory, the three notes in a triplet should have equal value. The complicated triplets, made up of dotted quavers and semi-quavers are not shown, even in contemporary instrumental music. They are so difficult to read that singers are unable to sing \textit{kagok} properly with this notation. On the other hand, If the

\textsuperscript{28} Provine, Robert. 2002: 936-937.
fact, that these two transcriptions are descriptive notation, is remembered, this kind of complicated triplet is acceptable among Korean musicians. This is because they intended to describe this sikimsae as ‘microtonal shading.’ However, it still lacks detailed description of sikimsae in this notation. Yi Hŭi-gyŏng commented on Kim’s descriptive notation of Sujech’ŏn in han’guk ŭmak, which has been transcribed in the same way with kagok; “It is extremely difficult to follow Kim’s Western staff notation without chŏngganbo. If his Western staff notation of Sujech’ŏn remained without a recording, Sujech’ŏn in his transcription would be totally different music from the original Sujech’ŏn.”

5. 1. 4. Duration

The transcription of each chŏnggan into the duration of only one crotchet means that the authentic kagok sound was significantly shortened. In both the transcriptions [Figure 5-1 & 2], the notes are generally either a crotchet or a note shorter than a crochet. The longest duration presented in these two transcriptions is a minim. Consequently, the above kagok notations themselves do not seem to be slow melodies. However, the tempos of the above two songs are twenty beats a minute and forty beats a minute, which are more than twice as slow as the slowest tempo in Western music, ‘Largo’.

29 Yi Hŭi-gyŏng. 2005: 15.
Therefore, a crotchet and a minim, of both the transcriptions, last approximately three seconds and six seconds each in the performance, which is extremely slow. However, in the moderato tempo of Western notation, at least three minims are required to present the six-second duration.

The principal problem is that Chang and Kim’s transcriptions of kagok into Western staff notation do not adequately create a picture of the kagok sound. For slow kagok songs, instead of using a crotchet, the duration of one chŏnggan should be extended. By extending the duration of one chŏnggan, it is possible to avoid using complicated triplets and, therefore, create a more accurate form of notation. Their transcriptions both showed the limit of the Western staff notation in Korean music. Keith Howard described Kim’s transcription: “in the Anthology it is written out to comply with the constraints of staff notation conventions, while in Kugak chŏnjip it regains flexibility and is coded within what had by then become Kim’s established symbol sets.”

---

5. 2. *Ch’angjak kagok* (Newly-composed kagok)

Since Kim Ki-su’s *Ch’angjak kagok* and *Hwangha mannyŏnjigok* in 1939, many Korean composers have composed new pieces with the integration of Korean traditional musical elements, such as instruments, rhythmic patterns and modes, and Western ones. Today’s *ch’angjak kugak*, including *kagok*, originated from Korean traditional music but is written in Western staff notation. This contemporary form of *kagok* can adopt the traditional *kagok* elements such as structure of the form, *sikimsae*, the movement of principal notes and timbre. Chae Hyun-kyung analyzed the new trends of *ch’angjak kugak* into two parts related to the degree of adoption of traditional musical elements.

*Ch’angjak kugak* can certainly be said to have emerged as an invented tradition of modern Korea. Firstly, new compositions were written by synthesizing many diverse elements but always in reference to the past. Secondly, in order to connect the present with the past, *chŏnt’ong kugak* [traditional Korean music] was studied and its central elements were incorporated into the new composition. Recently, musical elements from diverse cultural backgrounds have also been adopted, reflecting the diversity of contemporary South Korea. 31

The viewpoint of Chae Hyun-kyung is also similar to that of Yi Kŏn-yong who is an outstanding, contemporary Korean composer. He categorized these new trends of

---

Korean music into two styles: 1. Traditional (chŏnt’ong-kugak). And 2. Modified traditional (sujŏngdoen chŏnt’ong kugak).\(^{32}\) Kagok genres also can be divided into these two categories. The following, two, newly-composed kagok songs are good examples of the two styles. The first piece, Sangil, composed by Park Il-hun, can be categorized as traditional. In contrast, the second piece, Ŭjebam Kkumgilesŏ, composed by Hwang Ŭi-jong, can be regarded as an example of modified traditional.

5. 2. 1. Sangil

Sangil, dedicated to Yi Sŏng-ch’ŏn was written in the same style of notation as Kim Ki-su’s kagok transcription, especially in terms of the, timbre-change signs and the one crochet for one beat system, which uses the complicated triplets. It also employs the traditional four signs of kagok’s vocal techniques:

1) _NULL: the range of voice from head resonance

2) _NULL: downward-gliding

3) _NULL: half tone higher sound very quickly

4) _NULL: slight vibrato

---

The pitch of *Sangil* (1997) is notated one octave higher than the actual singing pitch, just as in Kim’s transcription (1980 and 1984). Notational mistakes originated from the lack of knowledge on Western staff notation by Kim Ki-su, have widely used without any criticism. Kim Ki-su should have learnt the Western staff notational system.

---

33 Park Il-hun. “*Sangil.*” *Festschrift of Professor Yi Sŏng-Ch’ŏn.* 1997: 53.
thoroughly as a pioneer musician. To solve this problems, Korean musicologists have to evaluate Kim’s works on the Korean music whether it is negative or positive.

Both *Sangil* and Kim Ki-su’s transcription require female singers to produce chest sounds at high pitches a♭ or b♭ (the fifth line) which is impossible. [Figure 5-5].

In *Sangil*, there is no time signature, rhythmic cycle or *taegang* (rhythmic grouping) in the piece. This lack of a time signature makes the score extremely difficult for singers to determine phrasing and rhythmic patterns. Even the duration of each bar is irregular. The shortest duration of one bar is seven beats but the longest one is forty-five beats. In musical notation, the role of bar-lines is to mark off metrical units. Hence, the vertical bar lines function as a ‘psychological division’ in the singer’s mind. The role of the rhythmic cycle and *taegang* in Korean traditional music is similar to that of a time signature and a bar-line in Western music. Without a rhythmic cycle and *taegang* it is very hard to identify the rhythmic structure of the *kagok* song. This is because *taegang* is critically important for the phrasing of the melody, and to recognize the rhythmic flow in *kagok*. Throughout the whole song of *Sangil*, lasting around seven minutes, there are only three rests and ten breath-marks. It is very unlikely that *kagok* singers could control these long passages taking so very few breaths.
5. 2. 2. Ŭjebam Kkumgilesŏ

The pattern of melodic lines in the Ŭjebam Kkumgilesŏ is similar to that of kagok, Pŏdŭrŭn. For example, the beginning two notes, B♭-e♭, are the same as the first two notes (tae B♭ – im e♭) in the beginning of Pŏdŭrŭn.

![Musical notation](image)

[Figure 5-8: Ŭjebam Kkumgilesŏ composed by Hwang Ŭi-jong ]

---

The melodic pattern (hwang-im-nam-im-chung, e♭-b♭-c♭-b♭-a♭) of the song’s climax in Ŭjebam [Figure 5-7] is also similar to the typical climax of p’yŏngjo mode (the fourth section of p’yŏngjo).\(^{35}\) The following examples are the fourth section of p’yŏngjo Urak.

![Musical notation](image)

(The fourth section of Urak) (The climax of the Ŭjebam Kkumgilesŏ)

[Figure 5-9: Comparison of the climax between Urak and Ŭjebam ]

In Ŭjebam Kkumgilesŏ 어제밤 꿈길에서, two kinds of appoggiatura were used to give sikimsae effects. One is sliding up at the end of the note, which is similar to ch’usŏng sikimsae. The other is the typical Western appoggiaturas. All sikimsae in the two pieces are simple, and short patterns of sikimsae use appoggiaturas. The more complicated sikimsae, such as ch’ik’innŭn yosŏng (upward-gliding) or t’oesŏng

\(^{35}\) Lee In-suk. 1997: 44-46.
(downward-gliding), were ignored or simplified in this song; upward-gliding did not appear, and downward-gliding, which always comes with chung a♭-t‘ae f in the p’yŏngjo mode, was simplified as follows.

![Figure 5-10: T’oesŏng sikimsae and simplified sikimsae in Ŭjebam ]

The reason sikimsae was not fully adopted in the newly composed kagok songs is due to the notational change from chŏngganbo to Western staff notation. In fusion kugak, composers’ lack of knowledge about Korean music often means they omit the most principle characters in their composition. However, the author wonders why Hwang Ùijong has not used one of the most principle sikimsae, upward-gliding (ch‘ik’innŭn yosŏng), in this piece. If Hwang’s over thirty years musical background of traditional music, his career as the professor at the Traditional Music Department in Pusan University and a composer who has published five of his own kagok composition books, is considered, it is hard to believe that the omission was caused by a lack of knowledge of kagok sikimsae. In order to give an appropriate description of ch‘ik’innŭn yosŏng sikimsae, more than several short notes or semi-quavers and dynamic signs are essential.
Therefore, Hwang tried to avoid using complicated notation and gave up using *ch’ik’inün yosŏng sikimsae*.

The above mentioned shortcomings have drawn strong criticism of the *Ch’angjak kugak*. Yi Po-hyŏng criticized the omission of the *sikimsae*, while only the pattern of pitch movement was adopted: “most of *sin kugak [Ch’angjak kugak]* has extremely diminished the use of *sikimsae* compared with Korean traditional music. Sometimes *sikimsae* was deleted or ignored. In Korean traditional music, most *sikimsae* are strongly related to the pattern of the melodic line. It is unacceptable if only the pitch movement is adopted in contemporary Korean music and *sikimsae* is deleted.”36

Keith Howard also commented that: “*Ch’angjak kugak* or *sin-kugak*, new Korean traditional music written for the instruments [and voice] of traditional ensembles, is unjustly discarded by many Westerners and Koreans as imitative more than creative. . . . *sin-kugak* [the newly-composed Korean traditional music], according to most definitions, is not part of the tradition, hence composers have typically rejected the mere duplication of old styles and sought a balance between the competing sound worlds of *kugak* and

yangak / sŏyang ŭmak [Western music].”

5.3. Transcriptions for analysis

In music analysis, the creation of a detailed transcription is very important because the transcription is the result of an analyst’s evaluation or analysis of the piece. The transcription should not only describe the general characteristics of the musical sound pitch, duration, dynamics, articulation timbre, tempo and silence but also illustrate the analyst’s theoretical position. Transcription’s role then, is to focus on those aspects that the analyst draws out of the music.

The following example [Figure 5-9] of a kagok transcription by Hwang Chun-yŏn illustrates this importance of transcription in musical analysis. To figure out the characteristics of the melodic structure in male kagok songs, Hwang Chun-yŏn transcribed into Western staff notation five male kagok songs in p’yŏngjo mode and six male kagok songs in kyemyŏn mode. In the introduction of his article, he clearly explained that his transcription was based on Kagokpo by Yi Chu-hwan: “Yi Chu-hwan’s Kagokpo (1959) was chosen for this paper and then ‘Comparative scores’ [Figure 5-9]

were made to compare *kagok*’s melodic structure. Hwang Chun-yŏn’s analysis shows the typical method of comparison of the melodic structure in a *kagok* suite, and is based on Lee Hye-ku’s method. Firstly, the key signature of A in *kung* (principle note) e in *ujo* is read as sol in *Kŭmphap chabo*. There is no time signature in the notation, which is follows Lee Hye-ku and Jonathan Condit’s method. *Chŏnggan* was considered as a time unit rather than one *chŏnggan* equals one beat. Therefore, 16 *chŏnggan* can be divided into small *taegang* and large *taegang* structure (3.3.2.3.3.2). Lee Hye-ku insists that the concept, *chŏnggan* as time unit, is an appropriate system to fit the Korean poem structure setting with its irregular syllable pattern. The following score is the same mode *p’yŏngjo* mode and same section from first five male *kagok han pant’ang*.

---


The above example is taken from only one of Hwang’s twenty-two sections of kagok transcription. Hwang’s transcription [Figure 5-9] is very similar to that of Kim Ki-su’s [Figure 5-2]: One chŏnggan is translated into one crochet, the pitch is transcribed one octave higher than the original pitch and a number of complicated triplets are also used. The straight normal bar lines are used to present taegang structure. Despite these similarities, Hwang’s transcription differs from Kim’s as follows:

1. The time signature is not presented.
2. No sign is used to describe sikimsae.
3. Yosŏng (upward-gliding) and t’oesŏng (downward-gliding) sikimsae were often ignored.
4. Two sikimsae, ch’usŏng and yosŏng consisting of one or two notes are faithfully transcribed.

---

To examine the melodic differences or similarities among kagok’s first suite, Hwang selected and divided each eleven songs of two modes, into ten sections, in terms of their text (sijo) structure: the first phrase of the line (ch’odu) and the second phrase of the line (idu). After that, the melody of the same part of each song, in the same mode, was compared. For example, the second phrase (idu) of Urong’s first line is a modification of Isudaeyŏp, so ‘Isu (mdf)’ is written on the following table to represent this. The relationships of melodic structure in the same mode are shown on [Table 5-1].

mdf: modification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chosu</th>
<th>Isu</th>
<th>Samsu</th>
<th>Urong</th>
<th>Urak</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>S.1: Ch’odu</td>
<td>Isu/ch’osu</td>
<td>Samsu</td>
<td>Urong</td>
<td>Urak</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. 1:Idu</td>
<td>Isu</td>
<td>Samsu</td>
<td>Isu/mdf</td>
<td>Isu/mdf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.2: Ch’odu</td>
<td>Isu</td>
<td>Samsu</td>
<td>Isu</td>
<td>Ch’osu/mdf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. 2: Idu</td>
<td>Isu/ch’osu</td>
<td>Isu</td>
<td>Isu</td>
<td>Urak</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. 3:Ch’odu</td>
<td>Isu</td>
<td>Isu/samsu</td>
<td>Urong</td>
<td>Urak</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. 3: Idu</td>
<td>Isu</td>
<td>Samsu/Isu</td>
<td>Isu/mdf</td>
<td>Urak/mdf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.4: Ch’odu</td>
<td>Ch’osu/mdf</td>
<td>Isu</td>
<td>Isu/mdf</td>
<td>Ch’osu/mdf/Urak</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. 4: Idu</td>
<td>Isu</td>
<td>Samsu/Ch’osu</td>
<td>Samsu/Ch’osu</td>
<td>Urak/Ch’o/mdf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.5:Ch’odu</td>
<td>Ch’osu/mdf</td>
<td>Isu/ch’osu</td>
<td>Samsu/Ch’osu</td>
<td>Urak/Ch’o/mdf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.5: Idu</td>
<td>Isu/ch’osu</td>
<td>Samsu/Ch’osu</td>
<td>Samsu/Ch’osu</td>
<td>Urak/Ch’o/mdf</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 5-1: Comparison of melody structure of five kagok songs in ujo [p’yŏngjo]mode]^{42}

Hwang’s tabulation method (from Lee Hye-ku) has been commonly used to

---

^{42} Hwang Chun-yŏn. 2000: 23.
compare the melody in a kagok suite for decades. Han Man-yŏng also used the tabulation method in his work to examine the similarities among kagok suites.\(^{43}\) His analysis fails to reveal anything new about kagok. His conclusions merely show the research that has already been published. After examining the melodic structure of kagok’s first suite, Hwang concluded as follows.

_Chunggŏ_ [the third song of kagok’s first suite] and _Tugŏ_ [the fourth song of kagok’s first suite] originated from _Isudaeyŏp_ [the second song of male kagok’s first suite]; _Soyong_ was modified from _Samsudaeyŏp_; _Nong_ and _Nak_ were based on _Isudaeyŏp_ and _Ch’osudaeyŏp_; _P’yŏnsudeyŏp_ is a variation of _Rong_ and _Rak_. Therefore, kagok’s first suite can be divided into three groups: _Ch’osudaeyŏp_ group [the first song of male kagok han p’at’ang ], _Isudaeyŏp_ group and _Samsudaeyŏp_ group.\(^{44}\)

The result of Hwang’s analysis of kagok differs little from the theory of Chang Sa-hun, who explained _Isudaeyŏp_ and _Samsudaeyŏp_ in the introduction to Korean Traditional Music (1973) as follows.

The original song of kagok is _Isudaeyŏp_. The third song of kagok, _Tugŏ_ was considered as the modification of _Isudaeyŏp_. After _Tugŏ_, _Chunggŏ_ and _P’yŏnggŏ_ were completed in the era while Park Hyo-kwan was involved in kagok singing . . . _Samsudaeyŏp_ might have originated from _Isudaeyŏp_, but this has not been confirmed in detail. However, it is evident that _Soyong_ is a modification of _Samsakdaeyŏp_.\(^{45}\)

If Hwang’s table 5-1 above is examined carefully, an interesting question,


\(^{44}\) Hwang Chun-yŏn. 2000: 28.

regarding the relationship between melodies in kagok songs, is immediately evident. Why did many phrases of Isudaeyŏp have to be copied and modified in Urong? In contrast, why did many phrases of Isudaeyŏp have to be entirely modified in Urak rather than copied? This question is critical if one wants to establish the relationship between melodies as suggested by the title of his article. In order to examine the relationship between melodies, a comparison of each section of the songs’ transcriptions with sikimsae is essential. However, Hwang makes no attempt to do this. As a result, his transcription does not reflect the specific goal of his analysis and he fails to answer this question. The reasons why his transcription failed to establish the relationships between the melodic structures of kagok are discussed below.

Firstly, Hwang assumed too much of his readers. Hence, a lack of consistency is found in his descriptions of sikimsae, which reduces the accuracy of his transcription and lessens the point of his overall argument. For example, he only presents a simple transcription of sikimsae like ch’usŏng (slightly higher pitch of the note at the end of the duration) and chŏnsŏng (approximately a half tone above the given note), which are transcribed into only one grace note. In contrast, complicated sikimsae, yosŏng and t’oeyosŏng sikimsae are not shown at all in his transcription. Because both these types of sikimsae are rather long and complicated, several notes, pitches, durations, dynamics and
articulation are required to describe them accurately. This can cause the transcription to become visually complicated.

Secondly, the various tempi of kagok’s first suite were not considered in Hwang’s transcription, although the differing tempi of each piece are strongly related to the appearances of sikimsae. Instead every chŏnggan was simply translated into one crotchet. As a result the melodic patterns of the songs in Hwang’s transcription look very similar to each other. As it was considered, this method is from Lee Hye-ku’s concept, chŏnggan as time unit, is an appropriate system to fit the Korean poem structure setting with its irregular syllable pattern. In reality, however, the real sounds of songs are considerably different. The tempo ranges are from $J = 50$ to $J = 120$, which means some songs are twice as fast as other songs. These distinctive differences of tempo can lead to the same song sounding like a totally different song. To avoid this confusing time value, the tempo differences should be marked clearly at the top of the transcription. Only if the tempo differences are indicated as such, can the transcription be used to compare melody structure more easily. If the complicated sikimsae had been notated with signs, instead of being deleted altogether, the reason why the melodic pattern of Isudaeyŏp was modified into a faster tempo would have been obvious. For example, the melodic pattern which has no sikimsae in Isudaeyŏp was copied in the all cadences of the other kagok songs
without any modification.

However, the same melodic pattern from a♭ to f follows Ch’osu (Bar 4-6), Isu (Bar 4) and Samsu (Bar. 4) in Figure 5-10. However, this pattern was always modified in Urong and Urak. Hwang’s transcription does not explain the important melodic variation rule i.e., why the triplet pattern is modified in faster tempo songs such as Urong and Urak. However, Yi Chu-hwan’s transcription in chŏngganbo clearly shows it. The simple melodic pattern of triplets in Hwang’s transcription is not presented as simply as in Yi’s transcription, which has elaborate sikimsae t’oesông. from a♭ to f. This sort of elaborate sikimsae cannot be sung in the faster tempo of Urak. Consequently, the

46 Hwang Chun-yŏn. 2000: 36.
elaborate *sikimsae* in the slow tempo was changed into a simplified form of *sikimsae* in the fast tempo song, although Hwang’s comparative score does not show this important analytical point because of the omission of tempo signs of each song and the *t’oesŏng* sign.

Using a fixed method mainly from Lee Hye-ku, is the dominant way of analyzing *Kagok*’s melodic structure, and is based on the old manuscripts. This kind of analysis is often called “museum style research” in the Korean music society. It does not consider *kagok* as a performed sound by today’s musicians, and it is not related to *kagok*’s preservation or revitalization. Yi Hŭi-gyŏng expressed her point of view on analysis: “*Sujech’ŏn* is not a fixed sound in a fixed form on the score, it is the open sound within the basic structure which is formed by a musician’s flexibility. When Korean music is explained in a flexible and open style rather than a fixed style on the score, it can be revitalized as a today’s music rather than a heritage of the museum.”

---

47 Yi Hŭi-gyŏng, 2005: 23.
5. 4. Transcription for *kagok* education

As previously mentioned, *kagok’s* *chŏngganbo* notation is used for the students who take *kagok* as their major at university. In most books dealing with Korean traditional music, *kagok* is usually presented in Western staff notation. The following *kagok* transcription written by Kim Hae-suk is used to introduce *kagok* to the sight-singing and aural perception classes in Korea traditional music at the Korean Art Conservatory.\(^{48}\) The transcription is also notated one octave higher than the real sound. However, it is a more advanced form of notation. The readability of the score has been improved, compared with that of other *kagok* transcriptions.

---

One chŏnggan is translated into a dotted crotchet instead of one crotchet, which avoids the use of complicated triplets. Kim’s transcription also ignored defining every chŏnggan but clearly showed the taegang structure through the straight bar lines. However, inconsistent use of sikimsae translation still appears in Kim’s notation.

Firstly, ch’usŏng, (slightly surging notes at the end of note) is translated into three different durations. Her ch’usŏng note is described as an ornamentation note (bar 1), or

---

49 Pack Tae-ung. 1999: 84.
as a ‘quaver’ (bar 6), or a ‘semi-quaver’ (bar 5). In spite of these apparent differences of notational description, the real sound is not clearly distinguished and is created using almost exactly the same techniques.

Secondly, the $\flat$ sign appears twice in the transcription of $yosŏng sikimsae$ (gentle vibratos) without any explanation in Kim’s transcription. If it is supposed to indicate $yosŏng sikimsae$, it is not made clear why the sign only appears twice. $Yosŏng$ technique in ‘Tongch’angi’ was used ten times in the original notation of Kagokpo by Hong Wŏn-gi. If the new symbols or signs are meant to denote specific vocal techniques, their meaning should be shown clearly in a list of directions.

Thirdly, many mistakes can be found in the use of breathing marks in Figure 5-11. In Hong’s notation of Tongch’angi, rests appear a total of twelve times including the short breathing marks. However, in Kim’s transcription, only eight rests are indicated. The breathing place is extremely strict in kagok, which is denoted on the notation. This reduction in the number of rests is obviously erroneous and creates problems. In bars 12-21, nineteen beats are required to be sung without a rest. Singing for such a long period without a rest is practically impossible.

Fourthly, except for the deficiency of rests, every beat is in regular time. In the

---

original sound of Tongch’angi many beats are shorter or longer than their denoted tempo of $J. = 30$. Kim’s transcription is therefore different from the original sound. If kagok’s irregular beats must be translated into regular beats, at least dynamics and tempo changes, such as ritenuto, accelerando, and diminuendo, should be adopted to create a transcription that reflects kagok’s singing style. Even though the transcription is designed for beginners, the transcription should not be merely approximate. Lack of accuracy in transcription can distort kagok songs and make them difficult to sing.

5.5. The Transcription by a Non Korean

Coralie Rockwell made one-hundred and two pages of twenty-seven kagok han pat’ang in Western staff notation. Rockwell was transcribing recordings made by Garfias in the 1966. The author has compared her transcription to the original Garfias tapes, which were passed to the author in CDs.\(^{51}\) Dr. Garfias also revealed: “I returned in 1966 [to Korea] to make films of music and dance. At that time I met Ji Hwa-ja [sic] and Lee Chu-hwan [sic]. I filmed them and recorded them. I did not ask the performers [Yi Chu-hwan, Chi Hwa-ja and Kim Wŏl-ha] to make any changes to the compositions, although they may have done so without my knowledge.”\(^{52}\) They were recorded in Kugakwŏn

\(^{51}\) University of Washington Ethnomusicology Archives tape number K629/A. 1966 Korean Field Recordings.
\(^{52}\) Garfias, Robert. email interview. 19 August. 2007.
however, it sounds as if it was recorded in a recording studio. The quality of the recording was fairly good except for minor noise. The volume of the voice and accompanying sound were well balanced, so the recording is good enough to be researched and appreciated.

The recording is extremely valuable for the history of kagok. This is because not only the three singers are dead but also kagok recordings from the 1960s are very rare. In the 1960s and 1970s, few people knew the value of Korean traditional music, so Korean traditional music, including kagok, were poorly documented or preserved. Robert Garfias and Coralie Rockwell recalled the marginalized situation of Korean traditional music in Seoul in those days. Even the female singer, Chi Hwa-ja had disappeared from music society, since her marriage, in order to hide her career as a kisaeng. However, the recordings are so valuable because they show how the oscillation of her voice was beautifully controlled with tension, and this can be seen in the clear patterns of the wave-forms in the spectrogram.

Figure 5-14: Spectrogram of Chi Hwa-ja’s upward-gliding in the first taegang of Isudaeyŏp, pŏdurŭn.

Figure 5-15: Spectrogram of Chi Hwa-ja’s downward-gliding in the first taegang of Isudaeyŏp, pŏdurŭn.

Figure 5-16: Pŏdurŭn transcribed by Rockwell. 1972: 205.
In the transcriptions, sikimsae, ch’usŏng sikimsae and t’oesŏng sikimsae are described with the same signs ~~~~, which reflects the level of Rockwell’s understanding of kagok. In spite of many mistakes, this transcription of kagok has very interesting figures as it clearly distinguishes three different durations of bar and timbre changes. The three different durations of each bar are the minim (Bars 1 and 2), the dotted crotchet (Bars 3, 7, 9) and the crotchet (Bars 4, 5, 6, 8). These three different durations of each beat reflect the variety of tempo found in original kagok singing. Kagok’s flexibility of tempo was also examined by Park Mi-kyung in 1996 and was presented in the graph below.\textsuperscript{56}

![Figure 5-17: The flexibility of tempo at the beginning of Pŏdŭrŭn]

In Rockwell’s work, the slowest female kagok song is in tempo $J = 20$. At the beginning of the singing, before the accompanying instruments and other singers join in,

\textsuperscript{56} Park Mi-kyung. 1996 : 9-38.
the *yosŏng sikimsae* part is slower than the rest of the song. This is transcribed by Rockwell in minims, whereas the rest is mostly in a crochet or a dotted crochet per beat. It is Rockwell’s reflection to show the flexibility of *kagok* rhythm, although the real sound is not exactly the same as her transcription.

The timbre changes are notated using the Ⓝ sign in Figure 5-12, which denotes ‘head resonance’ between these two signs ( Crescent - ⓹ ). However, there are problems with this method, the starting and beginning points are not clear. This sign can easily cause mistakes. For example, e♭ in bar 7 of the second line of Figure 5-12, should be sung from the chest, but easily can be sung from the head.

Apart from the vague timbre changing signs, critical transcription errors of pitch and *sikimsae* description are found. In bars 29-32, C and b♭ are written one octave higher than the original sound.

However, Rockwell’s transcription does reflect the flexibility and dynamics of *kagok* songs, which is very important when making a comprehensive transcription for
scholastic use. Various kinds of dynamics and tempos occurring in one phrase, are rarely indicated by the Korean scholars but were notated in detail by Rockwell. Still, limitations in her practical knowledge of *kagok* can be found in her transcription. Rockwell does not realize the value of the unit of the rhythmic cycle (*taegang*), and as a result *taegang* does not appear at all in her transcription. *Taegang* was adopted in all the above transcriptions, by Kim Ki-su, Chang Sa-hun, Hwang Chun-yŏn and Kim Hae-suk, for the division of bars.

As can be seen in the above, all the transcriptions of *kagok* show the limitation of the Western staff notation in the same way, i.e., it does not reflect the characteristic and aesthetical aspects of *kagok*. In spite of these limitations, *kagok* transcriptions into Western staff notation is more appropriate than *chŏngganbo* in terms of describing the whole structure of *kagok* and the progression of various types of *sikimsae*, which is very important aspect for scholars and performers. For the students, this kind of descriptive Western staff notation is not appropriate as a memory aid because its clarity and representation is not satisfactory. If Western staff notation system is adopted for the *kagok* teaching, it should be modified to make for an efficient system. Keith Howard’s premise corresponds to the author’s observation of their transcriptions:
At this point it is worth reiterating that staff notation developed to accommodate the parameters of a European art music tradition, and requires adaptation if it is to adequately represent Korean music. To suggest that it should be otherwise would be an act of neo-colonial arrogance. But, something similar must apply to indigenous notation systems, for these, too, were designed for specific repertory. These, too, require modification if they are to accurately and satisfactorily represent the whole corpus of Korean music.  

**Conclusion**

“It is assumed that the ethnomusicologist has available to him accurate methods of transcribing music sound to paper, but this is a question that is far from resolved”  

Western staff notation is still commonly used in Korean traditional music including kagok’s transcription, analysis and ch’angjak kagok (newly-composed kagok). In this chapter, kagok transcriptions and ch’angjak kagok, written in Western staff notation, were examined to find out the critical disadvantages of using Western staff notation. The first generation of transcribers, Chang Sa-hun and Kim Ki-su have made complicated kagok transcriptions since 1939. These contain many notational mistakes such as octave displacement, wrong time signatures and unreadable triplets. Their

---


notational mistakes have not been criticized and are still used in the same way, by the next generation of Korean traditional music scholars and composers.

The examination of newly-composed kagok songs written in Western staff notation focused on their melodic patterns, sikimsae and musical structure and has shown that these songs do not reflect the true characteristics of kagok because critically important aspects of kagok, such as sikimsae and flexible rhythmic tempo, cannot be notated in Western staff notation. The composers chose only a simple style of sikimsae which can be easily notated, and the more elaborate style of sikimsae was rarely used in their work. The main reason was that Western staff notation has limitations in accommodating the characteristics of kagok. Consequently, the omission of the elaborate sikimsae is not the result of the composer’s choice but is caused by these notational limitations. If these notational problems are not overcome, newly-composed songs will be unable to express the true beauty of kagok. In addition, transcriptions for analysis also revealed the same notational problems because of the lack of knowledge of Western staff notation and the limitations of Western staff notation. As a result, these transcriptions were not sufficient to show the analyst’s point of view clearly.

A more serious problem, the author found, was that no one, except for foreign scholars and a few Korean musicologists, seriously acknowledged these notational
problems. These problems happen not only in *kagok* but also in most Korean traditional musical genres. Kim Ki-su’s transcriptional mistakes have often been present as is shown in this chapter. There is an urgent need to resolve these notational problems through wide discussion and new notational trials.
CHAPTER  6

New Integrative Kagok Notation

“Musical transcription is a complex and multifaceted process, but it generates a visual product, which, to permit analytical examination, can be fixed in time.”

Introduction

There is no doubt that notation is the most important vehicle for teaching music today. The more effective the notation, the more effective the teaching. Keith Howard has had over twenty-years experience within samul nori and he has transcribed one piece of samul nori (Samdo sŏl changgo), which is condensed from three volumes of text books into the five page score. The goal of the condensed score was to provide a more effective samul nori score for his performance class at the School of Oriental and African Studies at the University of London. He describes it as follows:

Working within a European university means I must comply with a syllabus. The requirement for performance courses, as with lecture courses, tends to be for a maximum single weekly lesson, yet examines student progress after either a single semester or a

---


If I only appeal to those determined to study Korean music, then interest in Korea and its musical traditions will never expand. I have to use methods that inspire rather than frustrate. This, simply put, is why teaching SamulNori to Koreans can never be the same as teaching SamulNori to foreigners.

The author would argue that there is no reason to differentiate notational systems of Korean traditional music for Koreans and foreigners, especially for beginner students. The Korean students’ musical background and teaching circumstances are similar to those of the foreigners. The contemporary educational system of Korean traditional music is no longer on apprenticeship lines, but has the limited timeframe of a curriculum like Westerners. A kind of effective notation should be used for both Korean beginners and foreigners to learn the Korean traditional music effectively. Kagok notation is no exception.

To read traditional kagok notation written in chŏngganbo properly is not an easy task for contemporary students as it was proved in Chapter 3. Most students struggle with chŏngganbo notation, because they are taught music mainly through Western staff notation in Korea. In spite of its difficulty, little research into kagok’s new notation has been carried out.

---

As socio-political changes of the Chosŏn dynasty caused kagok’s decline in the late Chosŏn dynasty, social and cultural changes, Westernization and modernization, in South Korea in the twentieth century, have brought about musical changes such as popularization of Western music, the appearance of newly-composed Korean traditional music and the creation of new music teaching methods. However, Korea is not alone in the world in experiencing such change. Kagok education does not reflect these changes in contemporary Korea. Research into kagok notation and education has been mainly restricted to the use of the chŏngganbo notation system.

In contrast, Japanese koto notation is one good example of the changes in cultural context producing outcomes in the music. “Following the impact of staff notation, a unique type of notation was devised for the koto, which essentially followed on one level of visual analysis the basic principles of staff notation in that each line and space were given a note, and the notes had rhythm. . . . There were several other experimental types of notation that were also influenced by staff notation but retained many Japanese ideas.”

The following are examples of different types of koto notation.

Vertical notation *koto* notation  
Reverse *koto* notation

[Figure 6-1: The different types of *koto* notation]^{5}

In this chapter, the New Integrative *Kagok* Notation (NIKN) will be introduced for more effective *kagok* teaching. It offers visualization of pitch movement and readable *kagok*, which can inspire beginners to understand *kagok*. Before introducing the NIKN, old vocal notations of *kagok* (*kabo*), will be examined. It must be remembered that only three different styles of prescriptive *kagok* notation have been found, and these have almost disappeared.

---

6. 1. **Kabo (Old notations for kagok singing)**

6. 1. 1. The water wave style notation (**Sup’ahyŏng notation**)

In 2002, the oldest notation book of kagok singing, *Kajobyŏllam*, which is believed to have been published in the middle of the eighteenth century, has been found by the Committee of Korean History Compilation. The notational style in this book is called the water wave style notation (**Sup’ahyŏng notation**)) and eight songs were written in the **sup’ahyŏng notation**. Other **sup’ahyŏng notation** was found in *Hyŏnhak kŭmbo* (1852) and *Hakpo kŭmbo* (1915), which were mainly designed for kŏmun’go. Consequently, there were not many pieces of vocal kagok in those books. Only three pieces of **chungdaeyŏp** were written in *Hakpo kŭmbo*.

---

Only horizontal wave lines and texts were presented in the notation and other musical aspects such as pitches, duration and rhythmic cycles were omitted. Consequently, sup’ahyŏng notation is not enough to revive the songs today and the notation disappeared without any record of its usage.  

6. 1. 2. The melodic line (Sŏnyulsŏn) kagok notation

Kagok notation which followed the rise and fall of melodic lines (Sŏnyulsŏn kagokpo) was created by Chŏng Kyŏng-t’ae, a renowned male sijo singer in 1970s.

---

7 Yim Mi-sŏn. 2006: 7.

Sŏnyulsŏn notation was originally created for sijo students (mostly amateur) and it has been popularized because it clearly shows the flow of the melody. Similar systems were used by the Japanese in the late 19th century. Versions of this for sijo have been found in the countryside, dating back to at least the 1940s.

[Figure 6-3 : Chŏng Kyŏng-t’ae’s sijo Sŏnyulsŏn]⁹

After the sijo-sŏnyulsŏn notation, Chŏng extended his notation to the kagok genre, but it failed because kagok’s melodic line is not as simple as sijo. Kagok has a more delicate and elaborate melody. In spite of the description of the pitch movements with wave lines, the Sŏnyulsŏn kagokpo is hardly used today. When the author interviewed Chŏng’s female student, Kwŏn Il-ji, she showed a very faint and worn out copy of

---

⁹ One page of this score was given by Kwŏn Il-ji to the author in 2001.
Sŏnyulsŏn kagokpo. She has learnt kagok with Sŏnyulsŏn kagokpo and still uses it for a few of her students.

Kagok notation required many lines for the wider range of registration, and signs for the various vocal techniques. This caused kagok notation to be more complex to read. The following graphic notation is designed for Tibetan chants, which shows the progression of singing through its neume-like graphic notation.

---

6.1.3 Neumatic notation (*Yŏnŭmp’yo*)

*Yŏnŭmp’yo* has been used only for *kagok*’s three anthologies: *Kagok wŏllyu*, *Yŏch’ang kayorok* and *Hyŏmnyul taesŏng*. However, today not all *sijo* poems can be sung because of inadequate signs, *yŏnŭmp’yo*, for singing, in the books. Keith Howard refers to it as a graphic representation of contour in quasi-neumatic form. The following [Figure 6-5] shows a few *yŏnŭmp’yo* signs written beside the text of *Kyerak* such as O, √, ′, ), /, □.

---


13 Howard, Keith. 1998b: 598.
Pitch indications

\[, (, /, ■, □\]

Phrasal links

\[\exists, \sqrt{\quad}, V\]

Rhythmic cycles

\[::, \cdot, \quad, ,\]

[Figure 6-6: ‘Yŏnŭmp’yo’ in Kagok wŏllyu and Yŏch’ang kayorok.]

14 Provine, Robert. 2001: 811 (top) and Song Bang-song, 2003: 432 (bottom)
The meanings of these eleven kinds of signs have not been clearly explained, despite some initial research by Korean musicologists. Song Bang-song divided the eleven signs into three: pitch indications ( ), /, □), phrasal links ( ∨, し) and change of rhythmic cycles ( " " " ) . ‘O’ on the top of the column denotes the beginning of each poetic text.

The role of yŏnŭmp’yo is similar to that of Western neumes. The yŏnŭmp’yo signs seemed to be useful only for people who had already mastered the songs and then the anthologies act only as a reminder of the music. In spite of the failure of clear interpretations of the signs, the anthologies are a very valuable collection, showing the repertoire of kagok singing including female kagok in those days.

In Japan, China, and Tibet, they also developed similar neume notations to convey more detailed information about vocal technique in anthologies or score and instruments technique. There are various types of neume notations for vocal forms in Japanese music. Hakase notation was developed for the syŏmyŏ chant, which was compiled in a syŏmyŏ anthologies. Vocal lines (utai) of nŏ are compiled in utaibon ‘utai books’, which contains more scripts rather than scores. It definitely explains not only describing

---


the mood of scores but also melody type, rhythmic style and starting pitches. In *bunraku* performance, vocal lines are written in an ornate style of calligraphy. It provides breathing points, change of dynamics and tempo for vocalist.\(^\text{17}\)

[Figure 6-7: Japanese *Bunraku* and Chinese Jiang Baishi with the melody notated in *banzi pu* ‘half character notation’ next to the song text] \(^{18}\)

In China, vocal melody note book, *sheng qu zhe*, were found in the fifteenth-century, which has indications of melody next to the words. The following notation was written in *banzi pu* ‘half character notation next to the song text. This kind of graphic

---


symbols for the anthologies in neum notation designed to give verbal instructions as to vocal production, directional movement and ornamentation.¹⁹

6. 2. Timeline of the New Integrative Kagok Notation (NIKN)

After the author’s personal, year-long experience of kagok lessons, the hardship of learning with chŏngganbo notation motivated her to create a new integrative notation. Since the author perceived kagok’s notational problems in 1996, ten years have passed and the New Integrative Kagok Notation has been completed. During the period the notational problems were verified and it was shown that it was not only the author, but also most students, who had persistent problems in kagok classes. The author was reassured that the main problem was notational and a new notation for effective kagok teaching was needed.

Notation drafts and case studies with surveys followed and are laid out below.

1. A first draft of the New Integrated Kagok Notation (NIKN) was created after the author had learnt kagok from Cho Soon-ja in Korea. (October, 1999)
2. A second draft of the NIKN was created in New Zealand before re-visiting Korea. (November, 2000)
3. The first survey and the testing of chŏngganbo notation at three different

universities were carried out, and Western staff notations of kagok were evaluated. (May and June, 2001)

4. A third draft of the NIKN was made following the research into the value of hand signs and result of the chŏngganbo survey in Korea. (July, 2001)

5. Teaching and testing of the third draft of the NIKN were carried out in the Korean National University of Education. (July-August, 2001)

6. The teaching and testing of an English version (the fourth draft) of the NIKN and chŏngganbo notation were carried out at University of Canterbury, New Zealand. (March-April, 2002)

7. The final draft of the NIKN was made according to the results of the University of Canterbury test. (October, 2002)

8. The NIKN of the first female kagok han pat’ang was completed with a computer program. (August, 2004)

9. Testing of the final version of the NIKN was carried out at the University of Canterbury in New Zealand. (September, 2004)

10. Results of the final testing and the survey of the final version of the NIKN were assessed. (October, 2004)

11. Testing of the final version of the NIKN was again carried out at the University of Canterbury in New Zealand. (September, 2006)
6. 3. A first draft of the new integrative notation

The first draft focused on three aspects, which attempted to improve the most difficult problems for beginners:

1. Visualization of pitches.

2. Presentation of the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle within the heads of notes.

3. Grouping the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle into taegang (3+3+2).

The development of the NIKN encompassed the most important elements of kagok - pitch, hand sign, duration and rhythmic cycle, timbre and sikimsae signs.

6. 3. 1. Pitch

The pitch notation was derived from staff notation using five lines, but instead of the usual layout of pitch with lines indicating E♭ - G - B♭ - D - F ascending, the lines represented the pitches of the kagok song, Pŏdŭrŭn, B♭ (林) C (南) E♭ (黃) F (太) A♭ (仲). The spaces between the lines were not used because of pentatonic scales. Hence the original names of the five pitches were presented on the left hand side of each line, and the Western names were on the right hand side.
[Figure 6-8: The first draft of the NIKN Pöörün]
This pitch notation made the visualization of the melody easier. Students were able to prepare for the next pitch. It also provided them with the visual representation of the shape of *kagok* sounds. However, critical disadvantages were found: the equidistant lines did not reflect the different intervals between the five notes (Major 2nd, minor 3rd). There was no explanation of the ledger lines that appeared several times on one page. To solve these problems, the equidistant five lines had to be revised in terms of their distance and the ledger lines had to be explained.

6.3.2. Rhythm

In this first draft, the representation of rhythm originated from *chŏngganbo* notation by Hong Wŏn-gi [Figure 1-9]. He presented the different durations with different sizes of letters. Principal notes, usually accented and given longer duration, were represented by large letters, otherwise small letters were used. This rhythmic concept was developed in the new notation whereby a big circle and a small circle represented principal and unstressed notes respectively. If a note lasted more than one bar, the extra duration after that was shown as an empty bar, as in the *chŏnggan* of Hong Wŏn-gi’s notation. Here, empty squares were left for long durations. This trial was intended to avoid the complicated rhythmic figuration that was evident in Western transcriptions of *kagok*. 
In this first draft of the NIKN disadvantages were found as follows:

a) There was not enough space in which to distinguish the size differences clearly. The main reason was that the first draft was designed in A4 format.

Hong’s notation was in A3 size, which has more space.

b) The rhythm was described too vaguely to be easily remembered, considering the different types of rhythmic patterns.

c) In spite of interval differences among pentatonic scales, the lines were all equidistant.

6.3.3. Rhythmic cycle

Basically, the sixteen beat-rhythmic cycle in the new notation was adopted from Yi Chu-hwan’s notation, but slightly changed to emphasize the two important beats (the first and the twelfth beat). The cycle shows students which hand is used to play each beat:

- ● : both hands together
- ○ : left hand only,
- † : right hand,
- ○○ : lifting an index finger of the left hand and lowered.

In the new notation, the rhythmic cycle was represented on the top of the score as in Yi’s notation, but the sign for both hands (①) was slightly changed into a whole
black circle (●) in order to be seen clearly. In addition, the correct hand or hands for the rhythmic cycle were again marked on the first circle of every bar. This was designed to help beginner students play the rhythmic cycle more easily, because their eyes do not necessarily move to the top of the notation to read and play the rhythmic cycle, while singing. Looking at the rhythmic cycle on the top and passages in the middle or the bottom of the page at the same time, can cause beginners to become confused. In this respect, the new system was intended to avoid the movement of the eyes up and down. The new system could help the students, who could not get used to the rhythmic cycle, to play it easily.

The critical disadvantage was that, despite the easy recognition of the rhythmic cycle, overall the new notation did not look coherent. If the first head of chŏnggan is of short duration, the sign is not clear because of the small size of the circle.

6.3.4. Timbre change

In kagok singing, timbre change between the head and chest sound is required many times. For example, seven timbre changes are needed during one sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle at the beginning of Pŏdurŭn. Changing timbre on time is critically important in kagok singing. In this respect, the timbre changing sign in the first draft is reinforced in the new notation, compared with that in Yi Chu-hwan’s notation. Yi Chu-
hwan put a comma sign on the right hand side of the note to denote head sounds, and chest sounds were represented without a comma. Timbre changes in the first draft of the new notation were shown by a thicker line, as well as the comma. Above the thicker line (F) the notes should be sung from the head; below the thicker line notes should be sung from the chest.

Consequently, timbre change is much more emphatic with a comma as well as a thicker line, which is easy to recognize. However, the disadvantage was that these signs were exceptions to the norm. The F on the line is sung from either the chest or head depending on the different modes and the musical phrasing. B♭ below the thicker line sometimes requires a head sound. In addition, the comma sign appeared to be deleted, because a small bar looked too complicated when it contained lots of information signs.

6. 3. 5. Sikimsae signs

In the first draft, sikimsae signs were not considered and only Yi Chu-hwan’s sikimsae signs were adopted.

6. 3. 6. Bar division

Taegang (units of rhythmic structure) are remembered in order to follow the rhythm cycles. In the new notation, the sixteen chŏnggan squares in one row were changed into sixteen bars as in staff notation. The taegang structure (3+3+2) was shown
by grouping (3+3+2) bars together with thicker bar lines. The thicker bar lines clearly showed the *taegang* structure, which is usually explained verbally during the class.

### 6. 3. 7. New signs

There were two types of rest signs used in traditional *chŏngganbo* notation: one was a comma (,) which was for breath control, the other was a triangle sign (Δ) denoting the completion of each section. In the new notation, the breath control comma sign was changed so that notes of one breath (*hohŭp*) were slurred, ⌒⌒, above the notes. Breath control is extremely important, so students have to easily recognize the length of the breath. In the traditional notation, a comma was very hard to find on the score; whereas, in the NIKN the phrase line clearly shows it. The triangle sign was still used which is easily found.

In spite of the criticism in the previous chapter, the triplet was still used in the new notation to show the same rhythmic pattern, which is the most common rhythmic, and also melodic pattern. The use of the triplet will be considered for the next draft.

### 6. 3. 8. Sondongjak (Hand signs)

*Sondongjak* was not considered at this stage.
6. 4. The Second draft of the NIKN

[Figure 6-9: The second draft of Pŏdŭrŭn]
6. 4. 1. Pitch

In the second draft, the notation was more descriptive than in the first draft. The equidistant five lines were changed into six non-equidistant lines which reflected more accurately the different intervals between the notes (Major 2nd, minor 3\textsuperscript{rd}, Perfect 4th). The layout of pitch was the ascending $B^{\flat} - C$ (南) - $F$ (太) - $A^{\flat}$ (仲) - $B^{\flat}$ (林) - $C^\prime$ (南). Compared with the pitch notation of the first draft, the $E^{\flat}$ (黄) line was deleted because it is rarely used in the $p'yŏngjo$ mode. On the other hand, the $B^{\flat}$, $C$ and $C^\prime$ were added onto the stave lines. These notes often appeared on ledger lines in the first draft. Below the staff, the lower $F$-太 was represented with its letter (太) next to the $F$ note. It was intended to be easily recognized and not confused with the usual ledger line pitches of Western notation.

The original Chinese characters for the names of the six pitches were presented on the left hand side of each line and the Western names were on the right hand side, as in the first draft. These six non-equidistant lines made the visualization of melody, and the interval differences between notes, clearer.

In pitch presentation, two major disadvantages were found in the second draft: 1) Overall, there were too many lines on the score, e.g., six pitch lines, head-sound lines, ledger lines and so on, making it complicated to read. 2) The new lower $F$ note
presented with a Chinese letter 太 was not clearly distinguished from other signs and texts.

6. 4. 2. Rhythm

To solve the vagueness of the rhythmic notation of the first draft, the second draft represented the rhythm with Western notes instead of different sized circles. Kim Ki-su and Chang Sa-hun’s rhythmic system was used in the second draft. They represented every chŏnggan as equal to one crochet and sikimsae was described with short notes and traditional signs. While the rhythmic notation of the second draft contained more detailed rhythmic descriptions, it was still difficult to count very short notes and to fit them on the score.

6. 4. 3. Rhythmic cycle

In the second draft, the signs of the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle were copied from Yi Chu-hwan’s notation, but the layout was changed from vertical to horizontal.

① : both hands together,  O :  left hand only,

1 : right hand,  ⊙ : lifting the index finger of the left hand and lowered.

The main change in the rhythmic cycle notation was that the rhythmic cycle sign, which previously had occurred on the first note of every bar, was entirely deleted. The
reason for this was not only to avoid the complicated layout, but also to help students to memorize the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle, because Cho Soon-ja strongly recommended that it be memorized during the class. The division of the rhythmic cycle (3+3+2) was clearly presented at the beginning of the notation, and was prominent enough to be remembered.

6. 4. 4. Timbre change

The biggest adaptation in the notation of changes in timbre, in the second draft, was the deletion of commas and the thicker line in the middle. Kim Ki-su’s timbre sign (0------0) above the staff was also adopted. This attempted to make timbre signs more coherent. However, there was still no space to put in the hand-movement signs, which were planned to be written above the staff. This meant that the timbre change sign had to be considered in terms of the arrangement of space on the score.

6. 4. 5. Sikimsae signs

As can be seen, sikimsae signs almost followed Yi Chu-hwan’s way, the reason is to describe the aesthetic elements of kagok. At the same time, three sikimsae techniques were interpreted, for the better understanding of the signs.
6. 4. 6. New signs.

The traditional rest sign < was twisted into V to give more attention for the rest in
the vertical flow. Overall, the vertical layout on A4 size paper added more complexity.
The size of each bar should be extended. The NIKN needed to be written by computer
to improve readability.

6. 5. First survey: understanding of chŏngganbo
notation in kagok classes

To improve the readability and effectiveness of the NIKN, research into the
practical difficulties of chŏngganbo notation, in the kagok class, was unavoidable after
the second draft.20

6. 6. The third draft of NIKN

The third draft was produced by a special computer program which was a
combination of the Finale music program, Photoshop and a Korean word programme,
Hangeul 97. In addition, the size of each staff was extended by changing the layout of the
A4 page from vertical to horizontal. Consequently, the readability of the NIKN was much
improved from the first and second draft.

20 The survey details are presented in p. 197-202.
[Figure 6-10: The third draft of NIKN]
6. 6. 1. Pitch

The third draft was quite different from the second draft. The six-line stave was replaced by the four-line stave and a few ledger lines. The four-line stave was developed into two types in terms of mode because two different modes have different stressed notes: $E^b$ is rarely used in the $p'yŏngjo$ mode, while $F$ is rarely used in the $kyemyŏnjo$ mode. To reflect this point, the $E^b$ line among the six-line stave was deleted in the $p'yŏngjo$ mode ($B^b$, $C$, $F$, and $A^b$) and the $F$ line was deleted in the $kyemyŏnjo$ mode ($B^b$, $C$, $E^b$ and $A^b$) as well. These notes, which rarely appear, were represented at the right hand side of the staff as a short dotted line.

1) $P'yŏngjo$ mode

2) $Kyemyŏnjo$ mode

This third draft clearly showed the mode of the song at a glance. The frequently used notes were shown on the left hand side of the staff. However, the pitch of the notes on the ledger lines was still not clear enough to be recognized at a glance. This resulted in confusion between Western notation and the new system.
6. 6. 2. Rhythm

To reflect the slow tempo (one \( ch\ong\gan = 20 \)) of the song ‘Pödûrûn’; the duration of each \( ch\ong\gan \) in the third draft was made three times longer than in the previous draft ( \( J \) = 20). Therefore, every \( ch\ong\gan \) was a dotted minim’s duration rather than a crochet. As a result, visually, it looked like a very slow song because of the frequent appearances of dotted minims, and the disappearance of the complicated short rhythmic features. As can be seen in the previous drafts [Figure 5-1], there were no dotted minims in the whole song, in spite of its extremely slow tempo. In this respect, this change made the third draft a more advanced notation.

6. 6. 3. Rhythmic cycle

As the basic duration of each \( ch\ong\gan \) was changed from a crochet into a dotted minim, the sign \( \frac{3+3}{2} \) was changed into \( \frac{3}{3+2} \).

\[ \begin{array}{c}
\text{\textbullet} \\
\text{\textbullet'}
\end{array} \]

6. 6. 4. Timbre change

The thicker F line in the first draft was used again in the third draft for timbre change. The space above the staff was just adequate for the hand movement signs and the thickened F line was a very clear way to represent the passagio point. However, there were exceptions. Some F notes were not intended to be sung as the head timbre,
and some other pitches below the thicker line were very occasionally required to be sung as head timbre. To solve these exceptions, a stem was placed on the note: upward stems denoted chest sounds and downward stems denoted head sounds.

This new system attempted not only to emphasize the importance of timbre change but also to provide an easier and clearer indication of them.

6. 6. 5. *Sikimsae* signs

The three main *sikimsae* techniques were presented with new signs, which are polynomial symbols, depending on the tempo and style of singers, they might perform several different ways as it was analyzed in chapter 4.

1) Upward - gliding: a tremolo sign, 

2) Downward - gliding: coiling waves

3) Slightly rising pitch at the end of the note: a slightly bending arrow

In addition, the original sign for the rest, <, was changed into v on the top of the staff so as not to be confused with the Western accent sign.
6.6.6. Bar lines

There were two kinds of bar-lines in the third draft: The semi bar-line denoted each chónggan and the full, thick bar-line denoted the taegang structure (3+3+2). The semi bar-line was also a useful method to remind the singers of the structure of taegang.
and to meet the flexible requirements of sikimsae. Although it was not shown in Yi Chu-hwan’s kagok notation book, Kagokpo, these lines clearly distinguished between the chŏnggan and taegang structures.

6. 6. 7. New signs - Sondongjak (hand signs of sikimsae)

There was no sign for hand movements of sikimsae in the chŏngganbo notation, although the sondongjak were very important in kagok education, as explained in Chapter 4. In addition, making hand movements and singing at the same time is not an easy task for beginners. Hence, in the third draft, five different icons were adopted. The hand icons were chosen to reflect the shape of hand movements.

1) : right hand (downward-gliding)
2) : left hand (downward-gliding)
3) : both together
4) : right or left (upward-gliding)
5) : point

The five icons above gave students an easy instruction in hand movements. However, the images and the size of the icons were dissimilar. It can cause an unclear presentation. The correct sondongjak could not be detected quickly enough from the
unclear icons. Consequently, the inconsistency of overall images of hand icons had to be improved.
6. 7. Fourth Draft of the NIKN
This draft was designed for the Western students, hence the pronunciation of the note names and text were changed from Korean script into English. The sixteen beat-rhythmic cycle was presented in two ways for better understanding: as traditional signs and as Western percussion instrument notation.

6.8. Final draft of the NIKN

The sikimsae signs of the previous drafts were quite similar to Western signs such as tremolo and bending pitch signs. However, the Western style sikimsae signs were replaced by the traditional signs of Yi Chu-hwan, although the directions were turned slightly from vertical to horizontal. Three, critical, reasons caused this change.

Firstly, when the frequencies of upward-gliding and downward-gliding sound were examined by the computer program, Frequency 1.0, the waveforms were similar to Yi Chu-hwan’s sikimsae signs in Chapter 4. In addition, the upward-gliding sikimsae is not the same as the Western tremolo technique.

Secondly, the NIKN was designed not only for beginners, but also for students who want to learn kagok at an advanced level using chŏngganbo notation. Hence the NIKN should contain similar images to those of chŏngganbo as a bridging notation. If students get used to Yi’s sikimsae signs and Chinese letters of pitch names, they will utilize chŏngganbo notation without hardship.
Thirdly, the NIKN should acknowledge the tradition of *chŏngganbo* notation in reflecting the aesthetical elements of *kagok* through the polynomial *sikimsae* signs such as 🍃 🌿 🍇. Using the same symbols might deliver to the students a more comprehensible to understand *chŏngganbo* and the NIKN.

The capital letters of the pitches were changed to lower case ones, which aimed at distinguishing the octave differences between notes. As mentioned before, the vocal range of the average female is almost two octaves from F (태) to e♭ (황). Hence $B \flat - C - F - A \flat$ was changed into $B \flat_c - f - a \flat$ in *p’yŏngjo* mode and $B \flat - C - E - A \flat$ was changed into $B \flat_c - e \flat - b - a \flat$ in *kyemyŏnjo* mode.

There have been another two minor changes in the final draft. The last change of the NIKN was the replacement of ledger lines by long dotted lines. This avoided any confusion created by the similarity with Western ledger lines. The texts were presented in both Korean letters and the English pronunciation of them.
Figure 6-13: The Final draft of the NIKN
6.9. Summary of the New Integrative *Kagok* Notation

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Figure 6-14: Juxtaposition of the five NIKN drafts" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Figure 6-14: Juxtaposition of the five NIKN drafts" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Figure 6-14: Juxtaposition of the five NIKN drafts" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Figure 6-14: Juxtaposition of the five NIKN drafts" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Figure 6-14: Juxtaposition of the five NIKN drafts" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Figure 6-14: Juxtaposition of the five NIKN drafts]
To create the final draft of the NIKN, five drafts were made over five years, and included surveys of *chŏngganbo* notation and four case studies. The procedures can be summarized by the following table.

(NIL=no change)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>First draft</th>
<th>Second draft</th>
<th>Third draft</th>
<th>Fourth draft</th>
<th>Final draft</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pitch</strong></td>
<td>Normal <strong>five-line</strong> staff (<em>B♭, C, F, Ab</em>) with ledger lines</td>
<td>Non-Equidistant <strong>six-line</strong> staff (<em>B♭, C, F, Ab, B♭, C</em>) with ledger lines</td>
<td>Non-Equidistant <strong>four-line</strong> staff (<em>P'yŏngje B♭-C-F-A♭, Kiemyŏnjo B♭-C-E♭-A♭</em>) with ledger lines</td>
<td>The same as the third draft but English pronunciation of note names</td>
<td>Non-Equidistant <strong>four-line</strong> staff with dotted line instead of ledger lines. The same as the fifth draft but with lower case letters for pitch (<em>P'yŏngje B♭-C-F-A♭, Kiemyŏnjo B♭-C-E♭-A♭</em>), with ledger lines.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Duration</strong></td>
<td>Different size of circle denotes different duration</td>
<td>One <em>chŏnggan</em> is a crochet &amp; complicated triplets</td>
<td>One <em>chŏnggan</em> is a dotted minim</td>
<td>NIL</td>
<td>One <em>chŏnggan</em> is a dotted minim under = 50, a dotted quaver over = 50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Rhythmic Cycle</strong></td>
<td><em>Chŏngganbo</em> sign on the top &amp; these were reminded on the head of notes as well.</td>
<td><strong>3+3+2</strong></td>
<td><strong>3+3+2</strong></td>
<td><strong>3+3+2</strong></td>
<td><strong>3+3+2</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Chŏngganbo</em> sign on the top only</td>
<td><em>Chŏngganbo</em> sign on the top only</td>
<td><em>Chŏngganbo</em> sign on the top only</td>
<td><em>Chŏngganbo</em> sign on the top and its trans. into Western percussion notation.</td>
<td><em>Chŏngganbo</em> sign on the top only.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Timbre change</td>
<td>Chŏngganbo sign for head sound and thicker line for F(point)</td>
<td>0--------0 for head sound</td>
<td>The thicker line F.</td>
<td>Chest</td>
<td>Head</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sign of sikimsae &amp; sondongjak</td>
<td>Chŏngganbo signs next to notes &amp; ⬇ for repetition of the same pattern of sikimsae</td>
<td>Chŏngganbo signs above the staff &amp; translation into Western staff notation</td>
<td>Upward-gliding, downwards-gliding.</td>
<td>Chŏngganbo signs only.</td>
<td>Employed five different types of hand sign icons.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bar</td>
<td>With bar line &amp; grouping 3+3+2 with thicker bar line</td>
<td>Without bar line &amp; grouping 3+3+2 with thicker bar line</td>
<td>Semi bar line &amp; full and thicker bar line for 3+3+2 group</td>
<td>NIL</td>
<td>NIL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New aspects</td>
<td>✸ one breath</td>
<td>Decrescendo and accel signs</td>
<td>Short breath sign ‘&lt;’ changed into ‘\’</td>
<td>English pronunciation of the text</td>
<td>Korean text and English pronunciation of the text are presented together.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Figure 6-15: Summary of the development procedure of the New Integrative Kagok Notation]
6. 9. 1. Pitch

The first idea concerning pitch was extremely simple and focused on mainly showing pitch movement, according to standard Western staff notation. However, the aim was to emphasize the pentatonic notes. To do this, a six-line staff was used, the sixth being for the octave of the lowest note. The space between the lines was not used at all. However, because of the many lines, the six-line staff was considered too complicated.

The adjustment to the pitch presentation aimed to show that certain melodic patterns and certain principal notes determined the two different modes. To show this fact clearly, two different kinds of four-line staves were created, each contained non-equidistant lines which represented the different intervals. Finally, the ledger lines were replaced by adopting long dotted lines. This avoided any confusion created by the similarity with Western ledger-lines.

6. 9. 2. Rhythm

The complex rhythms shown in previous kagok transcriptions in Western notation (e.g. Figure 5-1, 5-2 and 5-3) were made more readable in the NIKN by fitting them into longer durations.
The first trial used large and small circles to denote long and short durations respectively, and accentuation. However, these circles were too vague and were subsequently replaced by the Western notation as previous scholars had done. In the third draft, the basic duration of each chŏnggan was shown as three times longer, from a crochet to a dotted minim, than in the usual transcriptions of kagok. This was designed to avoid the complicated short, unreadable notes of the old notation. In addition, longer notes such as minims and dotted minims gave a good visual effect for slow songs under one chŏnggan = 50. i.e., one beat = 50. For a more effective visual presentation of the rhythmic flow of faster songs over one chŏnggan = 50, the standard duration of one chŏnggan was shown as a dotted crochet, instead of a dotted minim.

6. 9. 3. Rhythmic Cycle

The sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle is a very important aspect for the singer. It was felt throughout all the songs. However, it is not easy, in the traditional chŏngganbo notation book, to memorize this cycle because it does not show any divisions. To rectify this, the sign of the rhythmic cycle was written on the head of the note as a first step. However, the effect made the layout too busy. The six divisions (taegang) of the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle (3+3+2, 3+3+2) made it easier for kagok students to
memorize. In addition, this new notation clearly showed this *taegang* structure, which is emphasized during *kagok* learning.

6. 9. 4. Timbre

The most distinctive character of female *kagok* is timbre change. The traditional sign for timbre change, ’’, was difficult to recognize quickly, when presented with other signs in a small box. To make a clear timbre change sign, the timbre changing point, the passagio point, or F line, was drawn as a thicker line. It visually explained the rule that above the F line is usually sung from the head, while below the F line they are mostly sung from the chest.

After adopting this thicker line, the problem arose of how to treat the exceptional cases of these timbre rules. Very occasionally notes below the F line have to be sung from the head. To solve this problem, different directions of the stems of the notes were used. A stem going up denotes a chest sound, a stem going down denotes head sound. These two methods (the thicker line and stem direction) made the recognition of timbre changes easy.

6. 9. 5. *Sikimsae* signs

Initially, it was important to determine which *sikimsae* techniques were similar to Western vocal techniques and which were unique to *kagok*. If a similar technique
existed in Western music, the Western sign was adopted; if not, a new sign was created
or borrowed from *chŏngganbo*. For example, the most unique of *kagok*’s vocal
technique, upwards-gliding, is a little similar to tremolo, so the tremolo sign was
adopted before the next revision. Downward-gliding technique was unique to *kagok*,
hence, the traditional *chŏngganbo* sign was still used in the new integrative notation.
Therefore, some signs were changed into new signs, while others were remakes of the
traditional signs. The preceeding table Figure 6-13 briefly shows how *sikimsae* signs
were changed or maintained.

6. 9. 6. Bars

In *chŏngganbo*, the sixteen beats were divided into the sixteen squares. In the
NIKN, these were transformed into the Western sixteen bars, one beat per bar, but a
thicker bar line was used to group the *taegang* structure (3+3+2+3+3+2) of six divisions.
However, in the second draft the usual bar lines were deleted, only the thicker bar lines
remained. This trial was intended to allow for more rhythmic freedom within one
*taegang*, but without any division it was difficult to read so many notes. Hence, the final
revision adopted semi-bars lines which reflected not only the flexibility of rhythm but
also looked less complicated.
Conclusion

The NIKN notation was created to overcome the demerits of 청간보, and use the merits of Western staff notation through five drafts. The first draft focused on the visualization of pitches in the Western staff notation, which was read horizontally from left to right. To denote rhythm, different sized circles were adopted. The second draft was made on the non-equidistant, five line stave, which reflected more accurately the different intervals in the pentatonic scale. Western notes were used for the rhythm. The third draft was produced by a special computer program, which contained the non-equidistant, four-line stave, including a timbre-changing, thicker demarcation line. In addition, the five, hand icons were adopted to show 손동작 movement and direction. This well-structured draft was tested in the kagok class at the KNUE in Korea. The fourth, fifth and final drafts changed only a few minor things, such as ledger-line shape, short breath signs and the refining of the hand icons.

As a result, the NIKN is the prescriptive notation using polynomial symbols for the sikimsae, which is clearer and can be read quickly and can act as a memory aid. Polynomial symbols and semi bar lines met the flexible requirements of kagok singing. To produce a more useful, efficient notation, the drafts were revised through experiments and tests in case studies in Korea and New Zealand, which will be
discussed in the next chapter.
CHAPTER 7

The New Integrative Kagok Notation: a case study

Introduction

The aim of these case studies was to test the effectiveness of the new integrative kagok notation compared with chǒngganbo notation, in terms of pitch, duration, timbre, tempo, hand signs and ornamentation. In addition, it was essential that the merits and demerits of the New Integrative Kagok Notation were examined in order to make a more effective notation. The four different classes used for the studies were chosen because of their availability and permission was given for the author to conduct experiments and testing. To provide more reliable evidence of the effectiveness of the new notation, written surveys were circulated to the classes at the completion of the tests. These surveys assessed the degree of comprehension through practical questioning of both Korean and non-Korean kagok students.¹ Their views and suggestions were extremely valuable for improving the notation.

The NIKN of p’yŏngjo Isudaeyŏp ‘Pŏdŭrŭn’ was chosen to be tested because this piece is traditionally taught as the first piece in the repertoire and it contains various

¹ See the Appendix II.
types of vocal techniques in a slow tempo. In addition, it is the most popular song in the
kagok han pat’ang. Pŏdurŭn was taught traditionally for three hours a day over three
months. The teacher, Cho Soon-ja, believed once students were able to sing Pŏdurŭn,
the other songs were able to be easily taught. Consequently, she usually allocated at
least two hours per week, for a half semester, to teach Pŏdurŭn during one semester of
the kagok course, although Ha Kyu-il taught it for three hours a day for the three months.
However, kyemyŏnjo Isudaeyŏp Ŭnyak was also tested but only in the KNUE kagok
class, because the time given was longer than the author had planned and their
understanding of Pŏdurŭn was high. To test the NIKN, four different classes were
chosen as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Class</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Duration</th>
<th>Notation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MA at KNUE</td>
<td>June ~ July 2001</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>90 min. per day</td>
<td>Chŏngganbo and then the 3rd draft of NIKN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>for 5 days</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MUSI 251 at UC</td>
<td>March ~ April 2002</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>20 min. per week</td>
<td>Chŏngganbo notation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>for 5 weeks</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MUSI 235 at UC</td>
<td>March ~ April 2002</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>20 min. per week</td>
<td>The 4th draft of NIKN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>for 5 weeks</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MUSI251 at UC</td>
<td>September 2004</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>20 min. per week</td>
<td>The final draft of NIKN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>for 5 weeks</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MUSI251 at UC</td>
<td>August 2006</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>20 min. per week</td>
<td>The final draft of NIKN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>for 5 weeks</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 7-1: NIKN tests for effectiveness]
However, the method of testing was not the same in each class. The intention was to examine the notation under many different circumstances. In the first class to be tested at the KNUE, *chŏngganbo* was used first and then the third draft of the NIKN was used. In the second test, at the University of Canterbury in New Zealand, two notations (*chŏngganbo* and the fourth draft of NIKN) were used in two different classes, each for the same period: *chŏngganbo* notation was used in the Asian Music class and the NIKN notation was tested in the Music Education class. The final draft of NIKN was also tested in the Asian Music class in 2004.

7. 1. **Summer course at the Korean National University of Education, 2001.**

This *kagok* class, conducted by Cho Soon-ja, was designed for MA students in a three week summer school. Most of the twenty-four students were teachers at primary and secondary schools and the class was for three hours, including a thirty minute break, per day for the three weeks. The first two days were spent mainly in teaching *kagok*, but from the third day, the last hour was used for *sijo*. 
Despite being a Korean class, all the students had backgrounds in Western music, not in Korean traditional music. Three male students and twelve female students sat on the floor in a circle while learning *kagok*. The four days will be described mainly in terms of the students’ attitudes, types of questions and the understanding of notation.

**The first day:** The teacher, Cho Soon-ja, explained the principles of *kagok* such as the pitch of pentatonic notes, the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle and vocal techniques, and taught only one phrase of the first *kagok* song *Pŏdŭrn*. Cho Soon-ja sang one phrase, with *sondongjak*, and then the students tried to copy it. She often corrected students’ singing by copying them’, which is the typical Korean traditional oral teaching method. Hence, the students explored *kagok* sounds without any *kagok* notation, while copying the teacher’s *sondongjak* and singing the first phrase. The level of interest in the different sounds and vocal techniques of *kagok* was very high. The students looked a bit shy when they tried to make the first *sikimsae* technique, upward-gliding, with hand movements, which is a different technique from Western singing.
### 7. 1. 1. Observation:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Day</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Method (Notation)</th>
<th>Contents</th>
<th>Learning schedule</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>26/07</td>
<td>Oral tradition</td>
<td>Intro: Pentatonic scales, 16 beat-rhythmic cycle with hand signs. Vocal technique: upward-gliding.</td>
<td>First 16 beats of Pŏdŭrŭn  (<em>p’yŏngjo mode</em>)</td>
<td>Enthusiastic about copying teacher’s singing and sondongjak</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(2h.30m.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>27/07</td>
<td>Chŏngganbo notation</td>
<td>Repetition of the first section. Explanation of chŏngganbo notation system, vocalization &amp; breath control.</td>
<td>First and second section of Pŏdŭrŭn</td>
<td>In the first half, busy looking at chŏngganbo notation but in the second half, looking at the teacher more than chŏngganbo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(2h.30m.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>31/07</td>
<td>NIKN notation</td>
<td>Intro: explanation of NIKN system and signs. Repetition of previous singing.</td>
<td>The third section of Pŏdŭrŭn</td>
<td>Much louder singing sound. Apparently spent in reading notation and sung by themselves with soft voice.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(1h.30m.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1/08</td>
<td>Option</td>
<td>Repetition of singing and sikimsae technique with hand signs</td>
<td>Completion of Pŏdŭrŭn (fourth &amp; fifth section).</td>
<td>Most of them used the NIKN notation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(1h.30m.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>2/08</td>
<td>Option</td>
<td>Overall practice of Pŏdŭrŭn. Explanation of kagok songs in kyemyŏn mode.</td>
<td>First section of Ŭnyak (kyemyŏn mode)</td>
<td>Proud of themselves after completing Pŏdŭrŭn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(1h.30m.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>3/08</td>
<td>Survey</td>
<td></td>
<td>Second and third section of kagok</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(1h.30m.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 7-2: The procedure of the 3rd draft of the NIKN test at the KNUE]
The second day: Chŏngganbo of Pŏdŭrŭn notation by Yi Chu-hwan was handed out to the students and then Cho Soon-ja explained the structure, signs and the rhythmic cycles. While the students observed the notation, Cho-Soon-ja demonstrated the first section of Pŏdŭrŭn. Students were busy looking at the chŏngganbo notation. By the end of the second day, after learning the chŏngganbo notation, the students seemed to be very embarrassed. As chŏngganbo notation was a totally new notation for them to read. In addition, the teacher introduced two more sections of Pŏdŭrŭn. After the second class, one student I interviewed said, “I was really struggling with the chŏngganbo notation to catch up to the part of chŏngganbo notation the teacher was singing or talking.” This comment reminded me of the three answers in the survey about the demerits of chŏngganbo “Once I have lost where we are in the chŏngganbo notation it is really hard to follow” “It’s so confusing because of too many squares (chŏnggan) and small Chinese characters.”

The third day: The integrative notation was introduced and the meanings of symbols in the notation were explained. After that, the voices of the students were surprisingly much louder than on the second day. One student mentioned that she was

---

2 The comments were made by three students of KNUE stage II.
able to practise a *kagok* song with the integrative notation after school. She tried to practise *kagok* at home but failed when she used *chŏngganbo* notation.

**The fourth day:** The class teacher, Cho Soon-ja, allowed her students to use any notation they liked. Most students were happy to use the integrative notation although the two male students used *chŏngganbo* notation. After learning *Pŏdurŭn*, the next *kagok*, *kyemyŏn Isudaeyŏp Řonyak* was chosen to be taught when the third draft was available.

**7. 1. 2. Analysis**

The survey consisted of two sections: in the first section students were asked to tick twelve questions about the effectiveness of memorizing the song, the rhythmic and structural presentation and the degree of satisfaction they experienced with the new integrative notation, compared with *chŏngganbo* notation. The second section comprised five questions to be answered in written form.

**Reading Style**

In the first section, 100% of the students preferred the new horizontal reading style (left to right) to the vertical reading style (top to bottom), which is the traditional reading style and is still used in today’s *kagok* education. This is because the vertical
reading style dominates Korean education and society today, except in *kagok* notation books.

**Timbre change and hand sign icon**

In the new integrative notation, directions (upward, downward) of the stems of the notes were used to denote timbre change. This point was highly acclaimed by students. Five out of fifteen students (33.3%) ticked ‘very helpful’ and 46.6% (seven out of fifteen students) answered ‘helpful,’ three students did not answer.

![Timbre change sign](image)

Also, the response to the hand icons met the beginner students’ needs: 13.3% (two out of fifteen students) were ‘very satisfied’ with them and 80% (twelve out of fifteen students) answered ‘helpful’.

![Handsign Icon](image)

**Comparison between *Chŏngganbo* and the NIKN**
Four questions directly compared the NIKN and *chŏngganbo* notation. More students chose the new notation over *chŏngganbo* notation in the areas of rhythm, layout, memory and overall understanding as being more effective. The following bar-graph shows these results.

![Bar Graph]  

[Figure 7-1: Comparison of the notational effectiveness between the NIKN and *chŏngganbo*]

The above graph shows the NIKN is apparently more effective than *chŏngganbo* in terms of the four categories. Rhythmic expression of the NIKN is especially more easily recognisable (66%), overall understanding of the notation also had good result in
the NIKN. However, the memory efficiency is quite similar to each other, resulting in 53% and 47%. The author believes that the very limited time of learning is not enough to memorize sensitively.

The last question of the first section was preferred method of kagok notation in the class: Nine out of sixteen students (56.3%) preferred the new notation to chŏngganbo notation. six of them (37.5%) wanted to use chŏngganbo notation in the class and two students (6%) did not answer at all.

The second section was designed to give the students the opportunity in words, to express their views and opinions about the new notation. When asked about the most advantageous aspect, ten out sixteen (62.5%) students wrote that the pitch presentation was the most satisfying aspect in the new integrative notation, and three (18.7%) students described in detail how the common melodic pattern was recognized easily by the Western style of pitch presentation. One each of two students selected the timbre change and sondongjak as advantages of the kagok. One student expressed the opinion the NIKN would be good for today’s students to access kagok.
The overall images and suggestions about the new notation were described in written form as well. The students felt the new integrative notation looked much more like Western staff notation, however, no one wrote of any confusion between the new notation and Western staff notation. The few criticisms about the integrative notation were mainly about the fact that the image of chŏngganbo had disappeared. Consequently, it was too similar to Western staff notation. It was obvious that some of the visual beauty of Korean notation should be retained. This point is reflected in the revision of the third draft.
The overall assessment of ‘satisfactory’ for the new notation was very high. Thirteen students (81.25%) answered that they were satisfied with the new notation. Throughout these tests, it was obvious that if the notation was too difficult to learn from, then the comprehension and singing were of a low level, and consequently students’ interest and confidence towards learning was naturally reduced.


Two classes at the University of Canterbury (MUSI 251: Studies in Asian Music and MUSI 235: Music Education) were chosen to test both notations (the chŏngganbo notation and the NIKN) conducted by the author in March and April, 2002 and 2004. Both MUSI classes of students were at the same stage and the students were interested in the teaching methods of Asian music. The MUSI 235 class had eighteen students and the MUSI 251 comprised seven students. The English version (the fourth draft) of the new integrative notation was tested with the MUSI 235 class who are interested in teaching materials and methods. The traditional notation system, chŏngganbo notation, was introduced to the MUSI 251 class. The given time of five sessions twenty minutes per week for five weeks) was very limited for teaching and testing kagok. Lecturers generously adapted their usual lecture schedule in order for the
kagok class and test to take place. In spite of limited time, the goal of the test, ‘to compare the two notations,’ was clearly achieved. The testing procedure was as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Week</th>
<th>Duration</th>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Learning schedule</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>20 min.</td>
<td>Intro: Korean traditional vocal form kagok Video (Kagok performance &amp; kagok class)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>20 min.</td>
<td>Playing the 16 beat-rhythmic cycle Explanation of notational system such as signs and pentatonic scale, upward-gliding &amp; downward-gliding.</td>
<td>First 12 beats of Pŏdŭrŭn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>20 min.</td>
<td>Explanation of timbre change, making sondongjak Practice mainly with sikimsae technique.</td>
<td>Completion of First section of Pŏdŭrŭn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>20 min.</td>
<td>Singing three times from the beginning to the third section. Answered the questions about the songs.</td>
<td>Second and Third section Pŏdŭrŭn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>20 min.</td>
<td>Revision</td>
<td>Questionnaire³</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 7-3: The series of five weeks tests for the NIKN in the MUSI 251]

³ See the Appendix II.
7. 2. 1. Observation

First session: Two short videos were shown in order to provide more understanding of kagok. The first video, containing authentic kagok singing of ‘Pŏdŭrn’ on stage, clearly introduced what a kagok song is.\(^4\) The other video was about Cho’s kagok class which contains the demonstration of hand signs. In both classes, the kagok sound was a totally new experience.

Second session: In the MUSI 231(Music Education), when the NIKN was circulated for the first time, some students tried to sing kagok by themselves with the new notation. The similar Pŏdŭrn melody was heard softly as a background to the class before it started. They asked me questions about notation such as signs and rhythmic cycles and they tried to copy my singing. When upward-gliding vibrato was sung, they tried to copy it, but the volume of the sound was much softer. This kind of vibrato was new for them. The traditional notation of the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle was not easily read by them, although the symbols were translated into L (left), R (Right) B (both) in the handout.

In contrast, the MUSI 251 students did not try to sight-sing although the Chinese letters of the pentatonic scale were transcribed into the Western scale, and sikimsae

\(^4\) See the Filmography. (V2001-II. Cho Soon-ja and MD2001-II),
signs were interpreted in English on the left side of the chŏngganbo notation. There were no questions in this class. When I started to sing, they watched me instead of looking at the notation.

The third session: When the timbre change was explained with the timbre change sign (the second top thicker line) of the NIKN, the MUSI 251 students clearly distinguished the chest sound and head sound. However, the timbre change technique in the MUSI 235 class was not clearly sung, because the timbre change sign, was not easily found. The MUSI 235 students were given the translation of the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle into a Western percussion instrument notation, because the testing time was too limited for them to learn the traditional signs of it.

The fourth session: The MUSI 235 students seemed to have the confidence to sing melodic lines but struggled with making sondongjak. The question which arose was that sondongjak icons were not consistent; hence the students did not choose quickly which hand should be used. To help them, the principle of sondongjak was repeated three times in this session.

In the MUSI 251 class, the sikimsae signs and their translations were written on the white board and these were practised and reinforced in this session, before being sung together. Their sikimsae sounds were much louder and clearer, but they were not
sung without the author. They looked at my hands while singing. The students appeared to have a lack of confidence in reading the notation, and avoided eye contact with me during *kagok* singing. Consequently, the volume of sound was very low. During every session in MUSI 235, the principal rules of hand movements and the meaning of the singing had to be repeated verbally.

### 7.2.2. Analysis

During the fifth session, the last in the series of five weeks, the questionnaires were circulated. They consisted of three parts:

1. Seven practical tests related to rhythmic cycles, scale, melody patterns and hand signs.

2. Satisfaction with the notation in terms of its effectiveness

3. Assessment of the difficulty or ease related to timbre change, pitch and ornamentation.

The first part was designed to test specifically the degree of understanding of the notational symbols. Seven practical questions were given about the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle, the most common melodic patterns, timbre change and an explanation of certain hand signs. Such questions were difficult to answer if students had only
followed the instructor without reading the notation. The results of the seven questions were as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Accuracy</th>
<th>Chŏngganbo in MUSI 251</th>
<th>NIKN in MUSI 235</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7 out of 7 questions (100%)</td>
<td>0 out of 7</td>
<td>10 (58.8%) out of 17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 out of 7 questions (85.7%)</td>
<td>1 (14.2%)</td>
<td>5 (29.4%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 out of 7 questions (71%)</td>
<td>3 (42.8%)</td>
<td>1 (5.8%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 of 7 questions (57%)</td>
<td>3 (42.8%)</td>
<td>1 (5.8%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 7-4: Comparison of the results of seven practical questions]

The above table shows that understanding of the notation was markedly different between the two classes. Ten out of seventeen students in MUSI 235 answered the seven questions 100% correctly. On the other hand, nobody in MUSI 251 answered the seven questions 100% correctly, in spite of their interest in Asian music. Only one student answered six questions correctly. Approximately 94% of the MUSI 235 class understood the new integrative notation, 71% of these correctly, but only 55% of MUSI 251 understood chŏngganbo. This result clearly shows that chŏngganbo notation is a much harder notation to read than the NIKN.
The second part was designed to test the degree of satisfaction with the new notation. Five multi-choice questions about rhythm, pitch, ornamentation, tempo and *sondongjak* were given.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Very effective</th>
<th>Effective</th>
<th>Not effective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>235-NIKN</td>
<td>251-CG</td>
<td>235-NIKN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Rhythm</strong></td>
<td>16.6%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>61.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pitch</strong></td>
<td>77%</td>
<td>25.1%</td>
<td>22.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ornamentation</strong></td>
<td>56.5%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hand signs</strong></td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 7-5: Satisfaction with the notation in terms of its effectiveness]

The outstanding figure of the table is that effectiveness of pitch between MUSI 235 and MUSI 251 was as expected. Seventy-seven percent of MUSI 235 students felt that the new notation of pitch was very effective. On the other hand, only 25.1% of MUSI 251 students were very satisfied with the effectiveness of pitch presentation of *chŏngganbo*. This is similar to the response from the KNU students who found that the pitch presentation of the new notation was the most advantageous.\(^5\)

---

\(^5\) See 348.
The ornamentation signs of both notations worked well in both classes. Nobody thought it was not effective. Of the MUSI 235 students, 56.5% felt it was ‘very effective’ although only 25% of MUSI 251 students agreed that it was ‘very effective’. The rest of the students thought it was ‘effective’ except for ‘no response’ of 13% of MUSI 251 students.

As can be seen in the above table, nobody in MUSI 251 thought that the rhythmic description in *chŏngganbo* was ‘very effective’, 62.5% of them considered it to be ‘effective’, 25% of *chŏngganbo* users thought it was ineffective. In contrast, 16.6% of the NIKN users in MUSI 235 agreed that it was rhythmically very effective, 61.1% of them thought it was ‘effective’ and 22.2% of them thought it ‘not effective’. Therefore, the integrative notation was more successful for rhythm in *kagok* than the *chŏngganbo* notation.

![Image of diagrams showing the order of effectiveness of the notation for learning the different elements]

[Figure 7-3: The order of effectiveness of the notation for learning the different elements]
The rate of satisfaction with the *sondongjak* in MUSI 251 is significant as a higher degree of satisfaction with *chŏngganbo* notation was shown by MUSI 251 students. In addition, five out of seven students answered that the *sondongjak* were the easiest element to learn in *chŏngganbo*. However, in *chŏngganbo*, there are no *sondongjak* to indicate *sikimsae*, only those for beating the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle. *Sondongjak* were only presented by the instructor and this fact reveals why they gave up reading the *chŏngganbo* notation. Most of the students in the class hardly looked at their notation during *kagok* singing, they were so busy following the instructor’s hand-signs. On the other hand, in the MUSI 235 class, the *sondongjak* were chosen as the most difficult aspect to learn, although these were presented with icons for the hands. They also indicated that getting used to *sondongjak* took long time, and needed substantial individual practice.

The last part of the questionnaire required two descriptive answers: “What is the most difficult thing about learning *kagok*?” and “What is the easiest thing about learning *kagok*?” The answers indicated the difference in the students’ interest between the two classes and their degree of comprehension of *kagok*. Overall, answers from MUSI 235 were more detailed and with more variety of terminology, than those of MUSI 251. Most of the students (six out of seven) in MUSI 251 answered with very simple words
such as pitch, *sodontijak* and tempo, but half of the MUSI 235 students (eight students) answered with two or three lines of full sentences. Moreover, only one student in MUSI 251 mentioned timbre-change although eight students used the word ‘timbre change’ in MUSI 235. The two classes reported different aspects of learning *kagok* as the easiest and hardest elements.

![Diagram: The order of the non-effectiveness of the notation for learning the different elements](image)

**NIKN - MUSI 235**

**Chǒngganbo - MUSI 251**

[Figure7-4: The order of the non-effectiveness of the notation for learning the different elements]

Pitch was the hardest element to learn for MUSI 251 students (71.4%), but no one thought pitch was the hardest element among the MUSI 235 students. Some of the *chǒngganbo* users in MUSI 251 gave two or three answers for the hardest elements; hence timbre change, rhythm and tempo elements were also pointed out by four students and *sodontijak* by three students as well.
As can be seen, the *sondongjak* were the easiest figure for the *chŏngganbo* users in MUSI 251, but were the hardest for MUSI 235 students; the pitch was the easiest element for NIKN users, but was the hardest for the *chŏngganbo* users.

The above result, contrasting the hardest and easiest elements, was interesting, because it revealed that the hardest aspect of *chŏngganbo* notation has been improved enough to become the easiest aspect for NIKN readers.
7. 3. Testing the final version of the NIKN at the University of Canterbury, 2004

In 2002, the MUSI 251 Studies of Asian Music Class at the University of Canterbury University was chosen with the MUSI 235 Music Education class, to compare the effectiveness of kagok notation using chŏngganbo notation for a series of five weeks. In 2004 the MUSI 251 class was again chosen to be tested, but both notations (the chŏngganbo notation and the New Integrative Kagok Notation) were introduced for five weeks (September and October 2004). The testing procedure was the same as for the previous test of the MUSI 251 class and the MUSI 235 class in 2002, except for ten more extra minutes of teaching time per week. This test was designed to confirm not only the effectiveness of the NIKN but also how easily the students understood chŏngganbo notation after learning kagok with the final version of the NIKN. In order to meet the goal, the students were asked to translate chŏngganbo notation into the NIKN system after using the NIKN.

7. 3. 1. Observation

The twelve students from MUSI 251 learnt kagok for thirty minutes per week for five weeks with the final version of the NIKN.
The first session: Two short videos (kagok performance and Cho Soon-ja’s kagok class) were shown to give basic information; especially Cho Soon-ja’s kagok class video introduced the way sondongjak is performed in her kagok class. After that, the system of chŏngganbo notation was explained in terms of its reading style, pitch, rhythmic division and sikimsae signs with chŏngganbo notation of Pŏdŭrn, for ten minutes. After that, the students were asked to read it but they did not read the first square (containing four signs in a small square), they did not even match the Chinese letter of pitches and Western notes quickly. Each square of the chŏngganbo looked too complicated and strange for them to interpret.

The second session: When the first page of ‘Pŏdŭrn’ of the NIKN was circulated the students initially sang kagok with the notation. Although sikimsae was not sung properly the melody was heard clearly. After an explanation of the system, the author started the singing, and the students automatically followed. Hence, the first section was easily sung.

The third session: When the rhythmic cycle was explained and played together, there was no problem. After sondongjak of upward-gliding and downward-gliding were explained, the students copied them beautifully. However, when they were asked to play sondongjak while singing, they had difficulty in making the hand signs. Half of them
did not play *sondongjak*, but only sang it, hence they were encouraged several times to leave their hands on the desk to make *sondongjak*.

**Fourth session:** After a one week break, the class started again. They were quickly reminded of the system of notation and *sikimsae* technique and then *sikimsae* signs were sung with repetition. The students’ singing still had a good sound but no active *sondongjak*. One interesting opinion was presented by a student: “It was really strange and difficult for me to sing a slow long phrase without any accompanying instrument.”

Throughout the four sessions of *kagok* learning, the most common two questions concerned the flexibility of the *sikimsae* and the confusion of the hand movements, although the fifth draft was improved with the presentation of *sondongjak* icons.

### 7.3.2. Chŏngganbo transcription test

In the last session of the MUSI 251 class, eight squares (*chŏnggan*) of *chŏngganbo* notation were provided to be translated into the NIKN notation. [Figure:7-6]. Students’ mistakes were corrected with a thicker pen by the author.
The following figure shows the transcription of *chŏngganbo* notation from the NIKN notation by eleven students in the MUSI 251 class. As can be seen, three out of eleven students (27.3%) correctly transcribed 100% of *chŏngganbo* notation’s pitches,
rhythm and sikimsae signs. However, six out of eleven students (54.5%) made one or two mistakes in sikimsae signs or pitch description, especially missing the ch’usŏng sikimsae sign in the last square. The reason is clear: the sign (⊥) was not seen at a glance. In the last square, the six different signs were presented in a small square and this required careful scrutiny. Timbre change, shown by the stem of the note, was recognized 100% correctly by ten out of eleven (90.9%) of the students. One student (-6) did not understand the timbre change signs properly, and one student did not recognize the rhythmic division, although almost the whole class described the pitch accurately.

Overall, the result was satisfactory because the students did not understand chŏngganbo notation at the beginning of the test. However, they automatically understood chŏngganbo notation after using the NIKN for less than four hours in total. Hence, the students translated it 80% correctly, which shows not only the degree of their understanding of the NIKN notation but also chŏngganbo notation.

7.3.3. Questionnaire

The final step of the test was to complete the questionnaire, which was the same as the previous test for the MUSI 251 and the MUSI 235 students except for the first
question, in which the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle was asked for in two kinds of notation, rather than one, which used traditional signs and Western percussion notation.¹⁶

The sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle: Ten out of twelve students (83.3%) fully understood both rhythmic cycle notations. Two of them did not understand either Western notation or the traditional one. The successful students had no problem in using either Western notation for the rhythmic cycle or the traditional one.

Seven practical tests: The seven questions focused on the basic knowledge of the NIKN notation and kagok in p’yŏngjo mode such as the pentatonic scale, the common melodic pattern, sikimsae signs, timbre change and sondongjak icons. The results of the seven practical questions were satisfactory: 50% of them answered 100% correctly. This fact indicates that most students understood the NIKN notational system properly within a very limited time.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Accuracy</th>
<th>NIKN in UC 235 in 2004</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7 out of 7 questions</td>
<td>50% of the students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(100%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 out of 7 questions</td>
<td>16.6% of the students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(85.7%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 out of 7 questions</td>
<td>25% of the students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(85.7%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 out of 7 questions</td>
<td>8.3% of the students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

¹⁶ See the Appendix II.
[Table 7-6: The result of the seven practical questions in the test]

The five, multi-choice questions in the second part showed the degree of satisfaction with the NIKN in terms of the rhythm, pitch, ornamentation, tempo and hand signs. The following table shows these results.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>100% of the</th>
<th>Very effective</th>
<th>Effective</th>
<th>Not effective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>58.3 %</td>
<td>41.7 %</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pitch</td>
<td>50 %</td>
<td>50 %</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ornamentation</td>
<td>58.3 %</td>
<td>33.3 %</td>
<td>8.3 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tempo</td>
<td>33.6 %</td>
<td>58.3 %</td>
<td>8.3 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hand signs</td>
<td>41.7 %</td>
<td>50 %</td>
<td>8.3 %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Table 7-7: Satisfaction with the NIKN in terms of its effectiveness]

Regardless of the rhythm and pitch, no one answered ‘Not effective’, which means 100% of them were satisfied with the rhythm and pitch, showing ‘very effective’ or ‘effective’. Rhythm and ornamentation had the highest scores for satisfaction out of all the five aspects of the music. Satisfaction with the pitch, tempo and hand signs, were
answered as ‘effective’ by over 50 % of students. The most frequent answer regarding the rhythm and ornamentation was ‘very effective’- 58.3 %. Therefore, the effectiveness of the NIKN was again shown as satisfactory. In the MUSI 251 class, the sondongjak were chosen as the most difficult and timbre change as the easiest to learn. It is significant that the MUSI 251 students in 2002 also said that making sondongjak was the most difficult aspect and changing timbre was the easiest aspect of learning kagok.\footnote{See p.349-350.}

7.3.4. Singing test with sondongjak

The last procedure of the case study was the singing test, which was recorded on video tape. Ten students attended and two students were absent from the test. The students were divided into three groups (four male students in group one, three female students in group two and three female students in group three). Two tasks were provided for the singing test:

1) Singing the first page of the p’yŏngjo Isudaeyŏp.

2) Sight singing of the second, previously unseen, page of the p’yŏngjo Isudaeyŏp.
First, group one sang the given song, \( p'yŏngjo \) Isudaeyŏp, which they had already learnt. Groups two and three were tested next. As was expected, making the hand signs while singing did not work properly in this practical test. Most students only made hand movements when the upward-gliding and downward-gliding sikimsae appeared. In contrast, their timbre changes were extremely clear. After the singing test, one student stated: “Playing the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle, making sondongjak of sikimsae and singing at the same time is a really difficult and confusing task although we know the system and symbols well.” The student’s comment echoes the comments of MUSI 235 students in 2002: In spite of having a good comprehension of the principles of sondongjak, the practical singing with them is still a difficult task. This is a good example of kagok learning and shows why, traditionally, the first song of kagok han pat’ang, Pŏdŏrŭn was taught for three hours every day for one month, why kagok professional singing groups were organized and why the simpler form, sijo, was created and become so popular after kagok.

In spite of the difficulty of sondongjak, hand signs, the students’ sight singing was significantly well performed. They sang the second page of the \( p'yŏngjo \) Isudaeyŏp with the traditional names of notes rather than the text, which was a new piece for them.
However, they recognized the pitch and its name instantly, although they performed hand movements only when sikimsae signs were shown in the notation.

7. 4. Testing the final version of the NIKN at the University of Canterbury, 2006

As has already been shown, the MUSI 251 Studies in Asian Music class at University of Canterbury had been chosen twice for the NIKN’s test in 2002 and 2004. In 2006, MUSI 251 was again chosen for the final test of the NIKN. The main goal of the final test was to evaluate how effectively the NIKN’s sondongjak signs work. The previous questionnaire showed that making sondongjak was the most difficult and confusing aspect of the NIKN for the students.

The testing circumstances were similar to those of the previous tests in the MUSI 251 class in 2004, i.e., half an hour every Monday and Wednesday for three weeks. The first page of the p’yŏngjo Isudaeyŏp was given to the students to learn, as it had been used in the last three tests. However, in this test, the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle on the notation was represented by only traditional signs without any Western percussion notation. Understanding the traditional rhythmic cycle signs is the first step towards making sondongjak and the author believes that the recognition of the traditional signs
instantly is not easy task for the beginners. However, these rhythmic cycle signs should be recognized because they are commonly used in both court music and folk music as well. After the three weeks written questionnaires and singing and *sondongjak* tests were given.

### 7. 4. 1. Review of the five sessions

Singing a traditional non-Western song was strange for most of the students, and two out of the nine students dropped the course after the first session, although the *kagok* test was not related to their assessment. Furthermore, the students were too shy to sing *kagok* even moderately loudly in the first and second classes, and found *sikimsae* technique especially hard to sing. Theoretically, the students understood the NIKN’s notational system including *sondongjak* signs, but, singing with hand signs was not easy. A good example of this occurred when one student pointed out the author’s mistake in one of the hand signs on the notation but was enable to sing properly by herself.

During the early sessions, the author sang together with the students, because the students lacked confidence. However, the students became dependent on the author’s singing and *sondongjak* to the extent that the author found it difficult to encourage them to sing independently. The pattern of each class began by singing the first six beats,
intensively. This was repeated several times, with sondongjak, rather than singing the whole page through. After practising that, the first whole phrase (seventeen beats) was sung. This step by step approach was intended to build the students’ singing confidence. Of course, sondongjak was emphasized and practised through repetition, in order to help the students make sikimsae sound more accurately. As their sondongjak was shaped, their singing became better.

In the forth session, Elaine Dobson, who has observed all the NIKN’s tests in New Zealand as the author’s supervisor, commented: “These students’ singing and sondongjak are much better than the previous students.” The author believes that this result is strongly related to concentrating on developing the students’ confidence by the repetition and a step by step approach. For example, every single sign of NIKN was explained and the list of signs was given to the students. This case study made the author plainly aware of the great amount of time required to learn just one piece, with sondongjak Pŏdŭrŭn, and recall Kim Chin-hyang’s observation “the first piece of the han pat’ang, was taught three hours a day for three or four months, and then the rest of five pieces were taught in a year.” In this case study, teaching had already been held for two hours for three weeks it was some join what inevitable that there would be weakness in the performance at the end of such a short time. It is important to recognize
here, though, that this standard reached (of both *sondongjak* and singing) was much higher than it would have been, had *chöngganbo* notation been used, for such a short teaching time.

### 7. 4. 2. Questionnaire

**The sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle:** Six of seven students (85.8%) fully understood the traditional rhythmic cycle notation, which is a satisfactory result. When both Western and traditional notation were shown together the understanding was 83.5% (2004). Consequently, the traditional rhythmic cycle notation is adequate and there was no need to add Western percussion notation in the NIKN.

**Seven practical tests:** The seven questions asked were similar to the 2004 test, which was about the pentatonic scale, the common melodic pattern, *sikimsae* signs, timbre change and *sondongjak* icons. Five out of seven students answered 100% correctly and the remaining students answered five out of seven questions correctly (71.4%). This result is quite satisfactory and this fact indicates that most students understood the NIKN notational system properly within a very limited time.

### 7. 4. 3. Singing test with *sondongjak*

The individual singing test was carried out after five sessions of learning and it was recorded on a video tape. The students were not able to sing by themselves and still
lacked confidence in singing on the day. Hence, they were organized into two-person groups. The notation was shown on the board through a OHP and the author sang the song at the beginning and whenever the students became lost during the test. The level of singing kagok was quite different among the seven students. However, it was absolutely clear that students who could perform sondongjak better also sang better. Two students’ throat movements were similar to their sondongjak movements which showed quite a high technique. Due to a very limited time of learning, most students were still busy looking for the author’s assistance while they were being tested. Hence, this test was not sufficient for the evaluation of the level of students’ understanding of kagok singing with sondongjak.

The author made a decision to test the students’ sondongjak the following week. When the students were asked to make sondongjak with Cho Soon-ja’s recording rather than sing a song by themselves. There was no assistance from the author in this test. This plan was also intended to give them more confidence and make them more relaxed while sitting the test. The result was that they were able to concentrate on making sondongjak while looking at the notation. They looked like they were conducting Cho’s singing. Two out of the seven students used correct hand or hands all through the test, four of them made a few mistakes. Only one student, who missed class three times, was
busy copying the neighbour’s. In contrast, one student who sang *kagok* outstandingly last test showed very natural shape of *sondongjak*, especially in upward and downward-gliding *sondongjak* which was beautifully presented with curving waves.

In spite of the difficulty of singing *kagok* independently, overall, most students understood the *sondongjak* signs of the NIKN in both the notation and practical singing within two and a half hours over the five-week period. This contrasted with the author’s experience when the students used *chŏngganbo* notation, which has been examined before. It should be remembered with the *chŏngganbo* notation, that there was no sign of *sondongjak* on the notation at all, which made it extremely hard for learners to make proper *sondongjak* within one month.

**Conclusion**

To create the final version of the new notation, four case studies of the New Integrative *Kagok* Notation (NIKN) were carried out at two different universities in Korea (once in 2001) and New Zealand (three times in 2002, 2004, 2006). After testing for certain periods of time (three to five weeks), the degree of understanding of the NIKN was tested. At the same time, its effectiveness in terms of pitch, rhythm, ornamentation and *sondongjak* were surveyed in the classes. Each result, comments and
feedback always acknowledged the improvements. The merits of the NIKN, especially the visualization of pitch movement and sondongjak, overcame the demerits of chŏngganbo.

The case study clearly showed two results: Firstly, the NIKN is more effective and useful than chŏngganbo notation for beginner kagok students and foreigners. Secondly, after using this NIKN, the students were also able to read chŏngganbo notation easily. These positive results of the NIKN tests also show the potential for expanding the use of NIKN for it to be included in other Korean traditional music teaching. There is no reason to limit the use of NIKN to only female kagok. Firstly, other classical vocal forms such as male kagok and kasa can be translated into the NIKN by changing the rhythmic cycles. These both have the same two different modes (p'yŏngjo and kyemyŏnjo), and pentatonic scales, as female kagok. They even have similar melodic patterns to those of female kagok. Secondly, haegŭm, p'iri and tanso can adopt the NIKN for beginners, because chŏngganbo notation was traditionally used in their early lessons. In order to use the NIKN for instrumental teaching, it would be necessary to replace the sikimsae signs with each instruments’ own, specific signs. The basic four-line staff system would also be useful for understanding chŏngganbo notation in more advanced study.
Conclusion

In order to preserve and revitalize kagok, this study has focused on two main aspects: the recognition of the Chosŏn dynasty’s aesthetics as being fundamental to kagok and the creation of a new kagok notation. These aspects have been presented in the two parts of the thesis. The first part has revealed that kagok’s uniqueness lies not only in its sonic beauty but also in its social and cultural value. It has been shown that the aesthetic value of kagok lies in its four-hundred-year-long history, the importance of female singers (kisaeng), their lives and education, and the bearing the Chosŏn dynasty has had on kagok.

Without kisaeng’s contribution, the transmission of female kagok to the present day would have been impossible yet, prior to this thesis, research into kisaeng as kagok singers, was ignored. Kisaeng were often compared to prostitutes, this distorted view of kisaeng was increased under Japanese colonization.\(^8\) The Japanese used the kisaeng for their entertainment and Japanese tourists came to Korea and used the kisaeng as prostitutes (comfort women). This is another issue, but is not necessarily related to kagok singers. However, it is interesting that the image of kisaeng is changing today,

---

from that of prostitutes, in the Chosŏn dynasty, to attractive artists, dancers and musicians, as witnessed in one of the current, most popular, Korean, television dramas, *Hwang Chini*. Hwang Chini is now portrayed in the drama series as one of the most elegant, beautiful, humorous, talented and popular women of the Chosŏn dynasty. However, she is not recognized as the *kagok* singer she was. This thesis has provided a more realistic view of *kisaeng* and highlights the fact that her poems were sung not just read. It exposes the problems of misinterpretation and also confronts the dilemma that the popularization of *kagok* could also cause its demise.

The role of *kagok*’s hand signs (*sondongjak*) has also been evaluated in this first part and has been found to be a unique teaching method, but one which is disappearing because it appears to many to have lost its value. *Kagok*’s *sondongjak* is a good comparator with Indian’s *krīya* and the Bhutanese hand gestures used with singing. *Kagok* singers describe not only rhythmic cycles, *changdan*, but also pitch, *sonsikim* by hand gestures. *Sondongjak* style differs slightly from school to school as the *sikimsae* in each varies. The discovery of the value of *sondongjak* is a special achievement because, as with the *kisaeng*, they have not been researched and they have been totally ignored in scores.
The second part has provided a practical method for the preservation and revitalization of *kagok* in the New Integrative *Kagok* Notation (NIKN). The need for the creation of a NIKN was motivated by the problematic aspects of *kagok*’s current scoring and transcriptions. *Kagok*’s transcriptions and newly-composed *kagok*, written in Western staff notation, were analyzed. These results showed inaccuracies in the transcriptions, the degree of distortion of *kagok* because of inadequate notation, and the limitations of Western staff notation for *kagok* composition. The descriptive, and very detailed *kagok* transcriptions (e.g., Kim Ki-su’s, Figure 5-2), gave a complex visual display rather than a clear representation. Even the complex notation did not reflect at all the fluctuation of tempo, the rising and falling pitches of *sikimsae*, aspirated releases, sliding attacks and the rhythmic refinements. Ignoring these aspects in *kagok* notation does not permit the true beauty of *kagok* to be captured. This persistent problem in *kagok* transcription into Western staff notation was taken into account in the creation of NIKN.

Another critical reason for the NIKN was found after the survey of *kagok* notation, among sixty-one students at three different universities. The survey showed that the level of understanding of *chŏngganbo* was extremely low even at the end of semester, but, many of students were, ironically, proud of *chŏngganbo* notation as the
ideal notation for Korean traditional music because it appealed to their nationalism, in spite of the difficulty in learning with it. For this reason, in-between notation was urgently needed in contemporary kagok classes, to introduce a shortcut to the understanding of chŏngganbo. The goal of the NIKN, then, is to provide the effective bridging notation for the transmission of kagok to meet the Koreans’ nationalistic agenda and to make it more popular; it is meant to serve kagok students who are unfamiliar with chŏngganbo notation but who may still use chŏngganbo notation in the advanced class. As a consequence, the NIKN was created using a combination of chŏngganbo notation and Western staff notation.

In order to develop the NIKN, chŏngganbo’s merits and demerits for contemporary students and composers were clearly found. Sikimsae and elaborate melodies were transcribed adopting the polynomial symbols in chŏngganbo notation, which are the attributes of chŏngganbo for Korean traditional music. The reading habit had to be changed, from the traditional style (down the page moving from right to left) to the contemporary style (from left to right across the page). The invisible pitch movement in chŏngganbo, which caused difficulty in reading the scores quickly, was corrected by using lines similar to those of Western staff lines. However, the rigid, twelve, fixed pitches of the five-line staff notation were not necessary for the pentatonic
scales of kagok. In addition, aesthetically, Western staff notation did not reflect
traditional notation. To overcome this aspect, the non-equidistant four-line stave,
containing the dotted ledger lines and chôngganbo symbols, was integrated in the NIKN.

The effectiveness of the NIKN was proved by the five tests and surveys. They also proved NIKN to be a catalyst for the easy understanding of chôngganbo. Because of many Korean musicians’ antipathy forwards the creation of a new form of otation it is likely that it will be sometime before NIKN is widely accepted as a teaching tool. The NIKN’s potential for being widely accepted has been shown with the performers’ and teachers’, with whom the author has worked in Korea and New Zealand, enthusiasm for its use and its success. The creation of a new form of notation to its practical use in an indigenous country, usually requires at least decades. One of the African percussion notation systems, Greenotation by Doris Green is a good example of this. A young student of African dance, Ms Green, attempted to create a new form of African music notation to overcome the limitation of the Time Unit Box System, which could not include more aspects of the culture such as dance in 1960s. She recalled the process of her notation. “From the preceding paragraphs, one can readily see that the creation of Greenotation, percussion notation system, was not an overnight creation. It had its conception in the fifties. Thereafter, it went through several revisions of presentation.
The format that it has today came in 1962. The system took its maiden voyage to Africa in 1970.” It was learnt in the Ivory Coast and in the school of the Gambia, West Africa and the repertoire was compiled in a book in 1993. The more extended repertoire of the African drums written on Greenotation is selling on the website.\(^9\) The following is the example of Greenotation and a system for notating dance movement, Labanotation.\(^{10}\)

\[\text{Figure C-1: Greenotation}\] \(^{11}\)

As it was observed in Chapter 6, there has been little trial for the creation of kagok singing notation since chŏngganbo system and no one considered the difficulties of chŏngganbo understanding in a contemporary formal education system in Korea. Even worse, it is not common for Korean traditional music society to accept outsiders’ viewpoints and encourage the creation of a new form of notation, regardless of genres.

\(^9\) [www.brooklynx.org/neighborhoods/panafrican/traditions.htm. assessed 23 August.2007.]
Keith Howard recalled his experience of his modified staff notation of *samul nori*: “In 1989, Kim Duk Soo introduced me to Lim Dong Chang, a graduate of Chungang University. He lambasted my use of a modified staff notation in *Korean Musical Instruments*, my 1988 book, as a misrepresentation of Korean rhythm.”\(^\text{12}\)

The goals of NIKN meet the demand of beginner levels of any musical genre, which has been traditionally taught with *chŏngganbo* from the beginning, NIKN can be extended to be used not only for *kagok* and *kasa*, but also for Korean traditional instruments such as *tanso* (a small vertical flute) and *haegŭm* (a two-stringed fiddle) as well. This is because *chŏngganbo* is quick to learn after the NIKN and is readable by average literate students. Any piece can be directly converted into the NIKN if the four line staff is modified. If the piece is not any more pentatonic scale, the staff can be adjusted. With minor adjustment, the movement of melodic structure is still able to be visualized while maintaining the traditional names of the pitches (*hwang, t'ae, chung, im, nam*) and rhythmic cycles. The experiments on the extensive use of the NIKN for other instruments are not considered here because further years of research are needed for this. However, the possibility of using NIKN for other instruments is shown in the following NIKN transcription from the beginner’s text book of *haegŭm* originally

\(^\text{12}\) Howard, Keith. 2006b: 65.
written in chŏngganbo. It is the transcription of T’aryŏng, which is one of the yŏngsan hoesang repertoire. It was listed at the end of the haegŭm textbook, which can be learnt after mastering Western and Korean folk songs.

---

In order to introduce the above classical piece, the author, Cho Pong-nae (a *haegüm* player), took several pages to explain the system of *chŏngganbo* at the beginning of the book and then provided over one-hundred popular pieces, from nursery songs to pop-songs, written in *chŏngganbo*. His brother, Cho Sŏng-nae (a *tanso* and *taegûm* player) also presented these kinds of basic *tanso* repertoire for beginners in his *tanso* work-book. However, Cho Sŏng-nae presented them in both Western staff notation and *chŏngganbo* notation.\(^{14}\)

The pitch of all the songs in his Western staff transcription is a minor 2\textsuperscript{nd} lower than the real pitch of the \textit{tanso} sound, and was intended to give a more readable notation in C major rather than A\textsuperscript{b} major. He states: “Beginners are usually familiar with Western staff notation, so I’ve transcribed every song in minor 2\textsuperscript{nd} lower than the real pitch of the \textit{tanso} sound. This is able to be sung in solmization (sol la do re mi) easily.” In spite of his intention, his method can cause confusion for learners and other musicians between actual \textit{tanso} sound and score. Even hwang is known as E\textsuperscript{b} but it was introduced as D. His intention to use both \textit{ch\'ogganbo} and staff notation together reflected his desire to teach \textit{ch\'ogganbo} well because \textit{ch\'ogganbo} was traditionally used for court music. The use of \textit{ch\'ogganbo} for non traditional classical pieces, even for pop songs, in the beginners work-book seems to be a reflection of a nationalistic agenda. Consequently, if the NIKN is adopted, it will act as a practical bridge by overcoming the difficulties of understanding \textit{ch\'ogganbo} and this national pride.

If \textit{kagok} is to be preserved, not only an effective notation system is required but there must also be practising \textit{kagok} singers. Today the number of \textit{kagok} singers is very low. Recently, a pertinent question and answer were found on a Korean internet site.\textsuperscript{15}

Q: I am a high school boy and want to specialize in kagok at university, I wonder which universities offer kagok and how many kagok students are required in a year?

A: Please consider your future seriously again, my major is also kagok at university. After completing kagok study, it is very hard to get a job or earn money with your degree. However, you are male, so you may have more advantages than female. Nowadays male kagok students are much less than female singers.

The above discourse clearly shows the contemporary state of kagok. It is conclusive that the following three reasons are the main cause of kagok’s vulnerability.

Firstly, it is hard to find employment as a kagok singer after completing a university degree in kagok. In order to preserve kagok, kagok singers should be employed in a diversity of areas, for example, as teachers, singers, broadcasting or performance coordinators. However, the opportunities for this are extremely limited. There is no full-time female kagok lecturer; only two male, kagok, fulltime lecturers are employed at universities. Most kagok students dream of becoming a member of the NCKTPA (National Center for Korean Traditional Performing Arts), which hardly recruits any kagok singers; only two or three classical vocal singers are needed for the life-long position. The singer has to cover kagok kasa and sijo. In contrast, Western music singers are supported, by the government or city councils in every city and suburb, through organized choirs for children or adults.
Only three *kagok* singing groups have been established recently: The Korean Classical Music Ensemble, Han’guk chŏnggadan, in 1999, The Wŏl-ha Munhwa Chaedan in 1998 and Seoul Singers Association of Traditional Melodies, Seoul Kaakhoe. They perform only once or twice a year, and are patronized by private companies, not the Korean government, or the performers pay the performance costs by themselves. The repertoire is a mixture of traditional *kagok* songs and newly composed *kagok* choirs. Cha Yŏng-hŭi insisted that there was a need for Korean choral works that represent Korean musical style, because of the extremely limited number of works of Korean-based, sacred, choral music. It is axiomatic then, that opportunities for employing *kagok* professionals as solo or choir members are urgently needed to make *kagok* a popular musical heritage.

The second reason for *kagok*’s vulnerability is that Korean traditional music scholars have not extended *kagok*’s research area, and they focus on the historical approach rather than on practical and experimental research. “To be effective, they [ethnomusicologists] should embrace the pedagogical, social, aesthetic, and experimental.” In addition, most research outcomes have been presented locally and are published in domestic books and journals, rather than at well-established

---

16 Cha Yŏng-hŭi. 2002.

international conferences and in international books and journals. In 2005, Robert Provine addressed this point: “Studies of Korean music will need to be presented effectively in the standard, international scholarly language. . . . One mistake made by the general field of Korean studies is the creation of a number of journals devoted exclusively to Korean studies, independent of the major international scholarly organizations.”

The third reason for kagok’s vulnerability is that the Korean government and broadcasting organizers have encouraged traditional folk music rather than classical music. For the Seoul Olympic Games in 1988, the Korean government encouraged and sponsored Korean traditional music such as samul nori, p’ansori and sanjo. These folk music genres have had spectacular public performances while classical music, such as kagok and kasa, has been marginalized.

The reason is that folk music is seen as more active and dynamic, being louder and of a faster tempo than classical music, and thus it gets more attention from the present-day Korean public. Hence, Korean broadcasts include more folk music performances than classical ones. The government supports a few kagok performances,

---

by the Human Cultural Properties and the members of the National Center for Korean Traditional Performing Arts. Admission is free and many of the audience members are students whose attendance is a compulsory part of their music class at school. This phenomenon leads to a vicious circle. As public demand for kagok decreases, the number of kagok students decreases. As a result, kagok remains hidden from the public and the government.

In order to be more acceptable as one of today’s vocal genres, and to be more easily enjoyed by the public, kagok is changing. GugakFM airs not only traditional kagok but also newly composed kagok songs sung by young kagok singers such as Yi A-mi and Yi Yu-mi. Both singers have majored in kagok at universities and perform not only the traditional kagok but also newly composed kagok songs. Some composers have composed new kagok songs for Korean film music.

In 2005, Korean traditional music radio broadcasting, GugakFM, has offered one program ‘Cho Soon-ja’s kagok, by Cho Soon-ja, airing at 9:00 am on Sundays for six months in 2005. In addition, the Korean government has built a two-story building for the Kagok Transmission Centre in Masan where Cho lives. It is expected to facilitate more active kagok education and performances. She has also given kagok recitals with her interpretation of kagok and has held discourse with various audiences.
“Real cultures have a present as well as a past”19 This study is expected to preserve kagok by strengthening pedagogical method through NIKN. It is hoped that younger performers and foreigners will be encouraged to learn kagok and help in the preservation of this unique vocal form for the future.

Bibliography


Dobson, Elaine. 2003. “Dancing on the demon’s back: the dramnyen dance and song of
Bhutan.” *The Proceedings of Music-Culture-Society: A Symposium in Memory of John Blacking.* Callaway Centre, University of Western Australia, Perth, Australia. 1-16.


______. 2004b. “Samul nori as Traditional Preservation and Innovation in a South Korean Contemporary Percussion Genre.” *Ethnomusicology* 48.3. 405-444.


press. 539-546.


its Aesthetics.” *The World of Music*. 27. 2. 2-48


_______. 2004 Kŭndaeroŭi Chŏnhwan’gijŏk Ŭmak Yangsang, Han’guk Yesul Chonghapakkyo. Seoul: Chŏngt’ong yesulwŏn, 429-469.


______. 1976. Han’guk ŭmak Nonch’ong. [Introduction to Korean Music] Seoul:
Sumundang.


Leith, Davis. 2006. Music, Post colonialism, and Gender: The Construction of Irish


434


Sin, Hyŏn-kyu. 2006. “Kisaeng as the leader of popular culture in Chosŏn dynasty.”


______. 1981. Han’guk Úmakhak Nonjŏ Haeje. Sŏngnam: Han’guk chŏngsin munhwa yŏn’guwŏn.


## Discography

**Female kagok singers before ICA system (1971)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Genre</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>S.P.</th>
<th>Remastered CD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lee Nan-hyang</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>Urak:</em> Columbia S.P 40282</td>
<td>1993 SYNCD-058</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>Hwan'gyerak</em> Columbia S.P 40282-</td>
<td>1993 SYNCD-058</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>P'yön</em> Columbia 40369-B (21258)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>Kyerak</em> Columbia 40369-A (21257)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>Sangxyŏlgok</em> Columbia 40155-A (21259)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>Paekkususa</em> Columbia 40155-B (21260)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tanga</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>Nokŭmpangcho Taihei 8210-ACK697</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Kagyum</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pyŏngch'ang Taihei 8210-BCK696</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sŏ Sanhoju</strong></td>
<td><strong>Kagok</strong></td>
<td>Kyerak Polydor 19010-A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>Hwa-P'yön</em> Polydor 19010-B</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>Ch'unmyŏng'gok</em> Polydor 19010-A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Kim Su-jŏng</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>Hwap'yön – 1993</em> Columbia 40665-A</td>
<td>1993 SYNCD058</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>P'yŏngjo hoesang</em> Columbia 40665-B</td>
<td>1993 SYNCD-058</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chi Kŭm-jŏng</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>P'yŏngjo Isudaeyŏp</em> Kim Ho-sŏng’s personal recording</td>
<td>NSSRC-004</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>Panu Pankye</em> Kim Ho-sŏng’s personal recording</td>
<td>NSSRC-004</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>P'yongnong</em> Kim Ho-sŏng’s personal recording</td>
<td>NSSRC-004</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cho Mo-ran &amp; Kim Yŏn-ok</strong></td>
<td><strong>Kasa</strong></td>
<td>Chukchisa Columbia S.P 40282</td>
<td>1993 SYNCD-058</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Kang In-ja</strong></td>
<td><strong>Kagok</strong></td>
<td>Urak 1969 Sinsegye Rec. LP</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Park Tŏk-hwa</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>Isudaeyŏp 1969 Sŏngŭm SEL 13-31~32, 2 LPs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>P'yŏnsudaeyŏp</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Sound Recordings of Female kagok

**Ji Hwa-ja**

1966 Robert Garfias, Korean Field Recordings. Examples of kagok

- Tr 1 – U JO I SU DAE YŎP (Kagok) - Ji Hwa-ja/singer; Kim Jong-hi/haegŭm; Kim Jung-sŏp/taegum; Chŏng Jae-kuk/Se P’iri; Ku Yun-kuk/kŏmungo; Kim T’ae-sŏp/changgo (Garfias Field no. K629/A). University of Washington Ethnomusicology Archives
Tr. 2 – KE MYŎN I SU DAE YŎP (Kagok) - Ji Hwa-ja/singer; Kim Jong-hi/haegûm; Kim Jung-sôp/taègum; Chông Jae-kuk/Se Piri; Ku Yun-kuk/kômungo; Kim T’ae-sôp/changgo (Garfias Field no. K 630/A). University of Washington Ethnomusicology Archives


Kim Wŏl-ha

Cho Soon-ja
1989. The first suite (fifteen songs) of female kagok – 3 LPs, Sinnara King Rec. RO-589.
1996: ‘Kyerak’, ’P’yŏnsudaeyŏp’ and ’Isudaeyŏp’ - Urigarak moûm (5), Tanga, sijo and kagok, Mesena MS-0050f

Han Cha-yi
1999. Han Cha-yi Yŏch’ang kagok han pat’ang I, II. Dream Share TGRA-2578.

Hwang Suk-kyŏng

Kang Kwŏn-sun
Kim Yŏng-gi

Lee Jun-a

**Selected Sound Recordings of Male kagok**

Ha Kyu-il

1993. Øllak & P’yonrak, SYNCD 058

Hong, Wŏn-gi

1960.  *KBC-12 雅樂-* Korean Court Music Orchestra of National Music Institute (formerly Royal Conservatory) conducted by Kim, Ki-su and supervised by Sŏng, Kyŏng-nin. *Kagok (duet):T’ae-p’yongga* with Chi Hwa-ja,

Kim Kyŏng-bae

Kim Yŏng-uk

Park In-kyu

Yi Chu-hwan
Yi Pyŏng-sŏng


**Selected Sound Recordings from Collections**

- **1970s** Yi Chu-hwan and Hong Wŏn-gi. DYCD-1417.
- **1993** *Chŏnt’ong kagok & kasaŭi wollyu* [The Origin of Korean Traditional Lyrics] King Rec. SYNCD-058B.
- **1999** *Kugak sŏnggaŭi Ch’oegobong* (The origin of Korean Traditional Lyrics) NSSRCD-004.
- **2001** *Pogosipŭn hangawi ŏlgul* [Selected songs for the Ch’usŏk] Z-DR-9100 by NCKTPA.
- **2001** Selected Korean Traditional songs by Yi Tong-gyu and Kim Wŏl-ha. SBCD-4380-1/4.
- **2002** An Invitation to Korean Music, KSBCD-4439.
- **2004** Ŭmak sigan, 4 kagok. Z-DYK-726.

**Filmography**

**VHS tapes**

*MBC t’ŭkchip Documentary Ch’ŏnnyŏnŭi norae* [MBC’s a special documentary, Looking for the origin of the sound of the one thousand year old song, kagok], Feb.1999. Masan MBC, (90min.).


*Sound of the Millennia*. 2000. Korea Foundation (59 min.).

*Aku Tongmi, 2006, Bhutanese National Anthem*. Thimphu, Bhutan: Elaine Dobson, Bhutan Music MDVBO47)
Appendix I

Catalog of Fieldwork Research Materials

I. Cassette Tapes

1. Private kagok lessons from Cho Soon-ja and discourse among Cho Soon-ja and Park Mi-kyung, Lee In-suk and Park Hyŏn-ji

   T96-4. Cho’s office, Masan, 8 Feb. 1996. (90min.).
   T96-6. Park’s house, Taegu, 12 Mar. 1996. (90min.).
   T96-7. Park’s house, Taegu, 19 Mar. 1996. (90min.).
   T96-8. Park’s house, Taegu, 26 Mar. 1996. (90min.).
   T96-9. Park’s house, Taegu, 9 Apr. 1996. (90min.).
   T96-10. Park’s house, Taegu, 16 Apr. 1996. (90min.).
   T96-11. Park’s house, Taegu, 23 Apr. 1996. (90min.).
   T96-12. Park’s house, Taegu, 30 Apr. 1996. (90min.).
   T96-13. Park’s house, Taegu, 18 May 1996. (90min.).

2. The NIKN test at the Korea National University of Education, Ch’ŏng-ju, 2001

   T2001-1. 26 Jul. 2001. (90min.).
   T2001-3. 27 Jul. 2001. (90min.).
   T2001-4-1. 31 July 2001. (90min.).
   T2001-4-2. 31 July 2001. (90min.).
   T2001-5. 1 Aug. 2001. (90min.).
   T2001-6. 1 Aug. 2001. (90min.).
   T2001-7. 2 Aug. 2001. (90min.).
   T2001-8. 7 Aug. 2001. (90min.).
3. Interview with Kim Ho-sŏng


II. Mini Digital Video Cassettes

1. MD2001-I *Kagok class at Korean Traditional Performing Arts High school*, 18 Jun. 2001. (45min.).

2. MD2001-II *Chŏngganbo and NIKN test at KNUE*, 26 Jul. 2001. (60min.).

3. MD2001-III *Chŏngganbo and NIKN test at KNUE*, 1-2 Aug. 2001. (60min.).

4. MD2001-IV *Chŏngganbo and NIKN test at KNUE*, 2-3 Aug. 2001. (60min.).


8. MD2002-I *NIKN test in MUSI 251 at UC*, Mar. 2002. (80min.).


NIKN test in MUSI 251 at UC, Aug. 2006. (12min.).

III. VHS tapes

- Rec. by Lee In-suk

1. V1996-I Cho Soon-ja’s *kagok han pat’ang* with hand signs (PAL), Taegu, 10 May 1996. (43min.).

2. V1996-II Cho Soon-ja’s *kagok han pat’ang* with hand signs (NTSC), Taegu, 10 May 1996. (43min.).

  • Rec. by Cho Soon-ja


Web sites


Appendix II

Questionnaire for surveys and tests.
<가곡연구: 명인 조순자와 세 악보 창안을 중심으로>를 위한
설문조사

설문조사에 응해주시서 먼저 감사드립니다.
본 설문조사는 Ph.D 논문 <가곡연구: 명인 조순자와 세 악보 창안을 중심으로>를 위한
연구의 목적으로만 쓰일 것이며 원하시면 언제든지 주신 정보는 투철하게 드리겠습니다.
설문에 소요될 시간은 20분 정도입니다.

연구자 이인숙: 제명대 피아노과 졸업. 동대학원 음악학석사, 한국음악학회간 신인논문상
수상. 현 렌트베리음대 (뉴질랜드)에서 가곡으로 종주음악학 박사과정중.

논문으로는 <피아노의 구조발달이 작품양식에 미친영향>, <가곡의 노랫말
어서 듣나는 배자규칙>, <가곡교육의 어제와 오늘>, <가곡에서 듣나는
한국음악의 문화와 사회>등

I. 응답자의 음악적 배경과 가곡 수입에 관한

1. 연주할 수 있는 국악기이 있습니까? 예 / 아니요. 가악중
2. 학부에서의 전공은 무엇입니까? 성악
3. 가곡을 배운지는 얼마나 되었습니다가? 1학기
4. 가곡디슨을 녹음하신 적이 있습니까? 만약 녹음하셨다면 연습의 어떤 점에 특히 도움이
 되셨습니까? 혹은 어떠한 제Brightness을 정하게カテゴ리에 맡겨지지만 녹음을 듣고rea없고 여러차의 음악기 교
5. 가곡한바탕으로 가장 좋아하는 가곡은 어느 것입니까?
6. 가곡을 처음 배웠을 때 듣자마음이 들었을 때의 느낌은 어떠셨나요? 기존...
7. 전간보와보를 이해하 귀악을 배운적이 있습니까? 아니.
8. '바람이'을 배우는데 가장 어려웠던 점은 무엇입니까? 정확한 음정, 검이.

II. 가곡보에 관련하여:

1. 악보의 시스템에 익숙해지는데 얼마나 걸렸습니까?
   1) 1주일 2) 2-3주일 3) 한달이상 4) 아직도 익숙하지 않다.
2. 세로읽기 악보가 불편하신지는 없는지요?
   1) 불편하다 2) 불편하다 3) 생각해본 적 없다
3. 가곡의 가략을 따로될 때 1) 슬라이드어설과 2) 황태정은남중 어느것으로 기록합니까?
4. 수업시간중 노래를 부를 때 악보의 의존도는 어느 정도 입니까?
1) 악보만 진적으로 본다. 2) 선생님만 진적으로 쓰다 본다.
3) 악보를 주로 보면 선생님을 가끔씩 본다. 선생님을 주로 보면 악보는 가끔씩 본다.
5. 노래를 배우는데 있어 정간표의 가장 불편한 점은 무엇이라 생각하십니까?
   서로 피어있어 가는 것 같아요.
6. 노래를 배우는데 있어 정간표의 장점은 무엇이라 생각하십니까?
   장단이 뚜렷해져 적다.
7. 악곡을 이해하거나 암기하기 위해 혼자 시도한 나름의 방법이 있습니까? (예: 오성의 역할) 복음..

III. 가곡보 이해도 Test
1. 16번 장단은 그리고.

   ①

2. 다음의 기호가 나타내는 바를 설명하세요.
   1) 화살표된 기호는 어느 손으로 시작동작을 해야 되나요? 
      2) 
      3) A
      4) I
      5) 

3. 용성에서 두성발성으로 변화되는 지점은 평조에서는 ( ) 음, 계면에서는 ( ) 이다.
4. 평조와 계면조에서 자주 나타나는 음형을 나열하시오.
   평조:
   계면조:
5. '바른 음'을 알기하고 있는 부분까지 정간이나 오성 또는 문자를 이용하여 기술하세요.

응답자 서명
감사합니다. 2001.5월.
설문조사

<전문가적연구>
-현재 조준자를 중심으로 한 여창가족과 세 약보 창안을 중심으로-

설문에 응해주시셔서 먼저 감사드립니다.
본 설문은 세 약보를 좀 더 나아 약보로 만드는 자료로 쓰일 것이며 이를 위해 약보에 대한 귀하의 의견과 만족도를 조사함에 목적이 있습니다.
귀하께서 주신 설문응답은 Ph.D 논문<가족연구>를 위한 연구의 목적으로만 쓰일 것이며
원하시는 언제든지 주신 정보는 외롭게 되지 않으시오.
설문에 소요될 시간은 20분 정도입니다. 이 연구에 대해 의문이 있으신 분은 64+3+364 2987 Elaine Dobson (뉴질랜드
랜허베리대학 교수)에게 문의하시면 성의껏 대답해 드리겠습니다. 이 설문 자료는
랜허베리의 자료 연구실에 보관될 것입니다.
이 설문 자료에 응답하실 때 응답자의 소속을 엽려하시면 감사하겠습니다.
응답자 소속: 

연구자 이인숙: 사범대 피아노과 졸업, 동대학원 음악학석사, 한국음악사학회 선임논문상
수상, 현 켄터베리음대 (뉴질랜드)에서 가곡으로 중학음악 박사과정 중.
논문으로는<피아노의 구조달달이 작품양식에 미친영향>, <가곡의 노랫말
에서 듣나는 배경음직>, <가곡교육의 어제와 오늘>, <가곡에서 듣나는
한국음악의 문화와 사회>등

제1부
설문에 부합하는 응답에 체크 표시해 주십시오

1. 약보에서 읽기 스타일은 어느 쪽이 편안하니까?
   □ 세로 읽기   ○ 가로 읽기

2. 한장단(16막)을 3.3.2.대장구조로 나눈 것이 노래를 부르는데 도움이 되었습니까?
   □ 아주 도움이 됨   □ 도움이 됨   □ 도움이 안 됨

3. 사전중 음운선과 음표의 대를 통한 음절의 변화의 반영은 노래학습에 도움이 되었습니까?
   □ 아주 도움이 됨   □ 도움이 됨   □ 도움이 안 됨   □ 잘 모르겠음

4. 약국의 리듬을 기억하는데 어느 약보가 편리한가요?
   □ 정간보   □ 세 약보

5. 손등작용 기억함에 있어 약보에 제시된 손모양의 그림이 도움이 됬니까?
   □ 아주 도움이 됨   □ 도움이 됨   □ 혼란을 가중함

6. 시감을 기초작 해농은 것에 대한 상세한 부분 설명의 필요성을 느끼나요?
   □ 필요함   □ 필요없음

7. 음료를 안식하는데 있어 오전의 고정관념 때문에 사전보로 적응하는데 혼란스러웠습니까?
   □ 아주 혼란스러웠음   □ 혼란스러웠음   □ 큰 어려움 없었음
8. 노래의 구조를 이해하는데 어느 악보가 더 편리한가요?
   □ 정간보   □ 새 악보

9. 시각적 기억에 뒤로 있는데 있어 어느 악보가 더 효과적이었습니까?
   □ 정간보   □ 새 악보

10. 실제노래의 리듬과 음표가 새 악보에서 그 반영되는 것이었습니까?
    □ 더 상세 정확히   □ 비슷하게 반영되었음   □ 잘 모르겠음

11. 두 개의 템포 기호 중 어느 쪽이 악곡의 리듬을 이해하기가 쉬운가요?
    □ 3초에 한 박   □ 1분에 20박

12. 앞으로의 가곡 수업에 당신은 어느 악보를 사용하고 싶습니까?
    □ 정간보   □ 새 악보   □ 오선보

제2부
다음 질문에 대하여 응답자의 의견을 상세히 서술해 주시면 설문지의 연구에 많은 도움이 되겠습니다. 악보와 관련된 어떠한 사항(리듬, 시각기호, 손신표, 음가, 베이지, 악보의 효과성 등)의 의견도 감사하겠습니다.

1. 구전(이들) 정간보(이들), 새악보(이들)로 가곡을 배웠을때 가곡에 대한 이해도를 중심으로 묻어 드리겠습니다. 
   □ 구전: 제목, 작곡자, 작곡가 등에 대해 설명 해주세요. 
   □ 정간보: 제목, 작곡자, 작곡가 등에 대해 설명해 주세요.
   □ 새악보: 제목, 작곡자, 작곡가 등에 대해 설명해 주세요.

2. 새 악보의 어떤 점에 만족하시는가요?
   □ 새악보: 새악보의 제목, 작곡자, 작곡가 등에 대해 설명해 주세요.
   □ 구전: 구전: 제목, 작곡자, 작곡가 등에 대해 설명해 주세요.

3. 새 악보의 어떤 점이 보완되어야 한다고 생각하십니까?

4. 새악보의 전체적 이미지가 오선보와 정간보 중 어느쪽에 가깝게 느껴집니까?
   □ 오선보   □ 정간보

5. 새 악보에 대한 만족도가 어떠합니다?
   □ 매우 만족스럽다   �□ 만족스럽다   �□ 보통   �□ 만족스럽지 않다

이상의 설문이의 의견이 있으면 향후의 빠른 공간에 서술해 주시면 감사하겠습니다. 응답해 주셔서 감사합니다. 2001년 8월 7일
1) The following figure is fourteen beats of the sixteen rhythmic cycle of *kagok*. Please write down which hand/ hands is used in playing each beat. (Both hands- B, Left hand-L, Index finger- I, Right hand- R)

![Diagram of fourteen beats of *kagok*]

2) Write down the pentatonic notes in *kagok*. Please circle a note which appeared rarely in *koagk Isoodaeup*.

3) What are the most common two melodic patterns in *kagok Isoodaeup*? Please write down the patterns as it is on the score.

4) Explain what these signs denote in the notation system.

![Notation symbols]

5) Lower pitches are produced from your ( ).
Higher pitches are produced from your ( ).

6) How do you recognise that timbre has to be changed on the score?

7) The following score is the beginning of the 'Beod'. Which hand/ hands are used for the circled ornamentations?

![Score with circled ornamentations]
8) How effective is the *jungganbo* notation in learning the rhythm, pitch, ornamentation, tempo and hand signs of *kagok*?

   Rhythm: 1) very effective  2) moderately effective  3) not very effective

   Pitch: 1) very effective  2) moderately effective  3) not very effective

   Ornamentation: 1) very effective  2) moderately effective  3) not very effective

   Tempo: 1) very effective  2) moderately effective  3) not very effective

   Hand signs: 1) very effective  2) moderately effective  3) not very effective

9) What is the most difficult thing to learn *kagok*? (Ex: timbre change, pitch, rhythm, hand sign etc.)

10) What is the easiest thing to learn *kagok*? (Ex: timbre change, pitch, rhythm, hand sign etc.)

\[Thank\ you!\]
1) The following figure is fourteen beats of the sixteen rhythmic cycle of kagok. Please write down which hand/hands is used in playing every beat. (Both hands- B, Left hand-L, Index finger of left hand-I L, Right hand- R)

2) Write down the pentatonic notes in kagok? Please circle a note which appeared rarely in kagok Isoodaeyeup.

3) What are the most common two melodic patterns in kagok issodaeyeup? Please write down the patterns as they are on the score.

4) Explain what these signs denote in the notation system.

5) Lower pitches are produced from your ( ).
Higher pitches are produced from your ( ).

6) How do you recognise that the timbre has to be changed on the score?

7) The following score is the beginning of the ‘Bead’. Which hand/hands are used for the circled ornamentations?
1) How effective is the new notation in learning the rhythm, pitch, ornamentation, tempo and hand signs of kagok?
   Rhythm: 1) very effective  2) moderately effective  3) not very effective
   Pitch:  1) very effective  2) moderately effective  3) not very effective
   Ornamentation: 1) very effective  2) moderately effective  3) not very effective
   Tempo:  1) very effective  2) moderately effective  3) not very effective
   Hand signs: 1) very effective  2) moderately effective  3) not very effective

2) What is the most difficult thing to learn kagok? (Ex: timbre change, pitch, rhythm, hand sign etc.)

3) What is the easiest thing to learn kagok? (Ex: timbre change, pitch, rhythm, hand sign etc.)

Thank you!
1) The following figure is fourteen beats of the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle of gagok. Please write down which hand/ hands is used in playing each beat. (Both hands- B, Left hand-L, Index finger of left hand- I L, Right hand- R)

2) Write down the pentatonic notes in gagok? Please circle a note which appeared rarely in gagok Pyeongjo Isudaeyeup.

3) What are the most common two melodic patterns in gagok Isudaeyeup? Please write down the patterns as they are on the score.

4) Explain what these signs denote in the notation system.

5) Lower pitches are produced from your ( ) , Higher pitches are produced from your ( )

6) How do you recognise that the timbre has to be changed on the score?
7) The following score is the beginning of the 'Bead'. Which hands/ hands are used for the circled ornamentations? ( L, R, B )

8) How effective is the new notation in learning the rhythm, pitch, ornamentation, tempo and hand signs of kagok?
   i. Rhythm: 1) very effective 2) moderately effective 3) not very effective
   ii. Pitch: 1) very effective 2) moderately effective 3) not very effective
   iii. Ornamentation: 1) very effective 2) moderately effective 3) not very effective
   iv. Tempo: 1) very effective 2) moderately effective 3) not very effective
   v. Hand signs: 1) very effective 2) moderately effective 3) not very effective

9) What is the most difficult thing to learn in gagok? (Ex: timbre change, pitch, rhythm, hand sign etc.)

10) What is the easiest thing to learn in gagok? (Ex: timbre change, pitch, rhythm, hand sign etc.)

How many times have you missed the gagok teaching since the second week of September?
1) The following figure is the sixteen-beat rhythmic cycle of *kagok*. Please write down which hand/hands is used in playing each beat. (Both hands - B, Left hand - L, Left Index finger - LI, Right hand - R)

2) Explain what these signs denote in the notation system.

3) Lower pitches are produced from your ( ).
Higher pitches are produced from your ( ).

4) How do you recognise that the timbre has to be changed on the score?

5) The following score is the beginning of the *kagok 'Beod'*; which hands are used for the circled ornamentations?

6) What is the most difficult thing to learn in *kagok*? (Ex: pitch, rhythm, timbre change, *sikimsae*, hand sign etc )

7) What is the easiest thing to learn in *kagok*? (Ex: pitch, rhythm, timbre change, *sikimsae*, hand sign etc )

Thank you ☺️!
**Glossary**

*Changdan* 장단: The name of the Korean traditional Rhythmic cycle.

*Changgo* 장고: Double-headed, hourglass-shaped drum.

*Ch’angjak kugak* 창작국악: Newly-composed Korean traditional music written for the instruments of traditional ensembles and voice.

*Changot* 장옷: A special veil to hide a woman’s face in the Chosŏn dynasty.

*Chase* 자세: Body position.

*Ch’ik’inŭn yosŏng* 치키는 요성: Literally, pushing upward while making vibratos. One of the most important vocal techniques in kagok, also describes ‘upward-gliding.’

*Ch’ilgŏ Chiyak* 칠거지약: Seven forbidden rules for females under Confucianism.

*Ch’odu* 초두: The first phrase of the line in sijo text.

*Chŏngak* 정악: Confucian ritual music. Music for the ruling class, such as kagok, kasa and sijo, interchangeable with aak.

*Chŏngak Chŏnsŭpso* 정악전습소: The Korean traditional music institution during Japanese colonization.

*Chŏnggu yŏngŏn* 정구영언: *Kagok* anthologies by Kim Ch’ŏn-taek in 1728.

*Chosŏn dynasty* 조선시대: 1392-1910 also called Yi dynasty

*Chŏngganbo* 정간보: Korean traditional mensural notation created in the 15th century. It consists of columns of lines read downwards and from right to left. Each column contains information for a voice, instrument or category of instrument, in a box, and each box in a column represents a unit of time. Thicker lines separating groups of boxes indicate the rhythmic cycle.
Ch’osudaeyŏp 초수대엽 : The title of the first song of the first male kagok suite.

Ch’unaengjŏn 춘앵전 : Korean traditional classical dance, usually performed in front of the King.

Chung 중 仲 : One note of the Korean pentatonic scale, normally corresponding to A

Chungdaeyŏp 중대엽 : The moderate tempo songs before kagok was created in the sixteenth and seventeenth century.

Chunggŏ 중거 : The title of the second song of both modes (p’yŏngjo and kyemyŏnjo) in the kagok suite.

Chungin 중인 : Literally, middle class people. One of the four classes of people of the Chosŏn dynasty.

Chungyŏôm 중여음 : The instrumental interlude between the third and fourth sections of a kagok performance.

Ch’usŏng 추성 : A surging vocal technique in kagok.

Haedong Kayo 해동가요 : Kagok anthologies by Kim Su-chang in 1763.

Haegûm 해금 : Two-stringed bowed lute.

Hwang 황 : 黃 One note of the Korean pentatonic scale, normally corresponding to E

Hwan’gyerak 한계락 : The title of the twelfth song in kyemyŏnjo mode in the female kagok suite.

Idu 이두 : The second phrase of the line.

Il-p’ae 일패 : The highest grade of kisaeng group.
Isudaeyŏp 이수대엽 : The title of the first song in both modes (p’yŏngjo & kyemyŏnjo) in the male and female kagok suite.

Isudaeyŏp-Podūrūn 이수대엽-버들은 : The title of the first song of the first female kagok suite.

Kadan 가단 : Professional kagok singers’ group in eighteenth and nineteenth century.

Kagaek 가객 : A professional kagok singer in the eighteenth and nineteenth century.

Kagok 가곡 : Korean traditional, classical, vocal form accompanied by a chamber ensemble.

Kagok han pat’ang 가곡한바탕 : One suite of kagok comprising fifteen songs for female and twenty-four songs for male.


Kagok Wŏllyu 가곡원류 : Kagok anthologies by An Min-yŏng 안민영 and Park Hyo-kwan.

Kasa 가사 : A long narrative song accompanied by the changgo.

Kayagŭm 가야금 : A twelve-string, plucked zither.

Kisaeng 기생 : Female entertainer during the Chosŏn dynasty also called kinyŏ.

Kŏmun’go 거문고 : Six-stringed plucked zither. One of the oldest, native Korean instruments. It is often played by the most senior member of the orchestra.

Kunja 군자 : An elite man in Confucianism.


Kyemyŏnjo 계면조 : One of the Korean traditional modes. e , (f) , a , b
**Kyerak** 계락 : The title of the thirteenth song in the kagok suite.

**Kyŏngjŏngsan** 경정산 : The name of the most famous professional kagok vocal group in kagok’s most popular era, the eighteenth and early nineteenth century.

**Mandaeyŏp** 만대엽 : The slowest song in the sixteenth century before kagok was created.

**Miinyo** 민요 : Korean folk songs.

**Mubugi Chohap** 무부기조합 : Unmarried-kisaeng union during the Japanese colonization.

**Muhyŏng Munhwajae** 무형문화재 : Human Cultural Property the title awarded to a very highly regarded performer.

**Nam** 남 : One of the Korean pentatonic notes normally corresponding to C.

**Nogaba** 노래가사바꾸어부르기 : text change, while melodic line remains the same.

**Nonghyŏn** 농현 : A press-and-release technique for playing zither and wind instruments, through which the uniquely Korean wavering quality is produced in varying degrees. Simply called vibrato or ornamented technique in instrumental music.

**Noraetmal** 노랫말 : The texts of songs.

**Ŏllak** 언락 : The title of the twentieth song in the male kagok suite.

**Ŏllong** 언릉 : The title of the sixteenth song in the male kagok suite.
Pak 박: one beat of the rhythmic cycle, one \( ch\onggan \) is one \( p\ak \). in \( kagok \).

P'ansori 판소리: a one-man operatic form. Narrative-singing by a professional folk musician accompanied by a drummer. The singer also speaks and encourages the audience to participate. The term is derived from “p’an,” gathering place, and “sori,” singing.

Panyŏp 반엽: The title of the fifth song in the \( kagok \) suite. It denotes the transition from \( p’y\ongjo \) songs into the \( kyemy\ŏnjo \) songs.

P’iri 피리: A cylindrical oboe made of bamboo.


P’yŏn 편: a variation of the original \( kagok \) song.

Puk 북: Barrel drum used in p’ansori.

P’yonggŏ 평거: The title of the third song of both modes (\( p’y\ongjo \ & \ kyemy\ŏnjo \)) in the \( kagok \) suite.

P’yongjo 평조: Traditional mode comprising \( e\flat, f, a\flat, b\flat, c\)\.

P’yŏllak 편락: The title of the twenty-first song in the male \( kagok \) suite.

P’yŏngnong 편룡: The title of the tenth song in (\( kyemy\ŏnjo \)) in the \( kagok \) suite.

P’yŏnsudaeyŏp 편수대엽: The title of the fourteenth song in \( kyemy\ŏnjo \) in the female \( kagok \) suite.

Rak 락: A variation of the original \( kagok \) song (Isudaeyŏp).
**Sakdaeyŏp** 삭대엽 : The fastest song before *kagok* was created. It developed into *kagok*.

**Salp'uri** 삐푸리 : Korean traditional dance for removing bad luck (*sal*).

**Sam-p’ae** 삼패 : the third (lowest) grade of the *kisaeng* group.

**Samul nori** 사물놀이 : Traditional, percussion quartet comprising a *kkwaenggwari* (small gong), a *ching* (large gong), a *puk* (barrel drum) and a *changgo* (hourglass shaped drum)

**Sanjo** 산조 : an improvised, solo, instrumental form but more recently conforming to a relatively fixed style played in individual *sanjo* schools.

**Sejong sillok** 세종실록 : Annals of King Sejong. 1418-50.

**Sijo** 시조 : Korean traditional, lyric short song requiring only the *changgo* for accompaniment.

**Sikimsae** 시김새 : Often called ornamentation but having distinctive characteristics: a pivotal bridge linking one note to the other, while exploring different vocal techniques, rhythmic flexibility and timbre changes.

**Sonbi** 선비 : Korean traditional literati.

**Sonsikim** 손시킴 : Describing *sikimsae* by hand/hands, interchangeable with *sondongjak*.

**Sondongjak** 손동작 : Hand movement in *kagok* practice.

**Soyong** 소용 : The title of the fifteenth song in the *kagok* suite.
"T’ae" 태 : 太 One note of the Korean pentatonic scales, approximately corresponding to F.

"Taegang" 대강 : the unit of the rhythmic cycle in chŏngganbo notation. In kagok, one rhythmic cycle comprises six taegang.

"Taegŭm" 대금 : The large transverse bamboo flute, 2 feet 5 inches long, larger than the Japanese shakuhachi. It has a blow hole, a hole covered with a thin membrane and six finger-holes. Air blown into it vibrates the thin membrane and produces somewhat piercing sounds. The string and wind instruments are tuned to B produced by the taegŭm.

"Taeyŏm" 대여음 : The instrumental prelude in kagok.

"T’aep’yŏngga" 태평가 : The last song of the kagok suite, a male and female duet. When in female kagok the singer is joined by a male singer in the T’aep’yŏngga.

"Tanjŏn" 단전 : The (lower) abdomen or the hypo gastric center.

"T’oesŏng" 퇴성 : ‘downward-gliding’ vocal technique in kagok.

"Tonggittal" 동짓달 : December in the lunar calendar.

"Tugŏ" 두거 : The title of the third song in both modes (p’yŏngjo & kyemyŏnjo) in the kagok suite.

"Ŭmjil" 음질 : Vocal quality.

"Urak" 우락 : The title of the eleventh song in both modes (p’yŏngjo & kyemyŏnjo) in the kagok suite.

"Yangban" 양반 : Elite class of people during the Chosŏn Dynasty.

"Yanggŭm" 양금 : Korean dulcimer.
Yeak 예악 : Music for the control of the mind. The main goal of Confucian music.

Yegi 예기 : One of the Confucianism bibles containing the goals of music.

Yin-yang 음양 : The dual cosmic forces.

Yiwangjik Aakbu 이왕직아악부 : The national institution of Korean traditional music during Japanese colonization.

Yŏnŭmp’yo 연음표 : Korean traditional notation which denoted vocal techniques as well as the text.

Yosŏng 요성 : Vibrato or wavering sound.

Yubugi Chohap 유부기조합 : Married-‘kisaeng union during Japanese colonization.

Zhongyong 중용 : Doctrine of the Mean in Confucianism.
PART III

New Integrative Kagok Notation Score of

The First Suite (hanbatang) of Female Kagok

by Lee In-suk

Transcribed from Cho-Soon-ja’s Yech’ang kagokpo (Kagok Anthology)
## Contents

1. **P’yŏngjo**  
   *Isudaeyŏp*  
   平調  
   貳數大葉  
   버들은 *Pŏdŭrŭn*  
   1

2. **P’yŏngjo**  
   *Chunggŏ*  
   平調  
   中擧  
   청조야 *Ch’ŏngjoya*  
   4

3. **P’yŏngjo**  
   *P’yŏnggŏ*  
   平調  
   平擧  
   일소 백미 *Ilo paengmi*  
   7

4. **P’yŏngjo**  
   *Tugŏ*  
   平調  
   頭擧  
   일각이 *Ilgaki*  
   10

5. **P’yŏngjo**  
   *Kyemyŏnjo*  
   *Panyŏp*  
   半羽半界  
   半葉  
   남하여 *Namhayŏ*  
   13

6. **Kyemyŏnjo**  
   *Isudaeyŏp*  
   界面調  
   貳數大葉  
   연약이 *Ŏnyaki*  
   16

7. **Kyemyŏnjo**  
   *Chunggŏ*  
   界面調  
   中擧  
   산촌에 *Sanch’one*  
   19
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Kyemyŏnjo</th>
<th>P’yŏnggŏ</th>
<th>界面調</th>
<th>平舉</th>
<th>초강 Ch’ogang</th>
<th>22</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Kyemyŏnjo</td>
<td>Tugŏ</td>
<td>界面調</td>
<td>頭舉</td>
<td>임술지 Imsulji</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Kyemyŏnjo</td>
<td>P’yŏngnong</td>
<td>界面調</td>
<td>平弄</td>
<td>북두 Puku</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>P’yŏngjo</td>
<td>Urak</td>
<td>平調</td>
<td>羽樂</td>
<td>바람은 Paramūn</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>P’yŏngjo+</td>
<td>Kyemyŏnjo</td>
<td>半羽半界調</td>
<td>還界樂</td>
<td>앞내나 Apnaena</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Kyemŏnjo</td>
<td>kyerak</td>
<td>界面調</td>
<td>界樂</td>
<td>청산도 Ch’ŏngsando</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Kyemyŏnjo</td>
<td>P’yŏnsudaeyŏp</td>
<td>界面調</td>
<td>編數大葉</td>
<td>모란은 Moranūn</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Kyemyŏnjo</td>
<td>T’aep’yŏngga</td>
<td>界面調</td>
<td>太平歌</td>
<td>태평가 T’aep’yŏngga</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Translation of <em>kagok</em> texts</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. <em>Pyŏngjo Isudaeyŏp</em></strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A willow tree becomes a ball of thread</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An oriole’s singing turns into a spinning wheel.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weaving my broken heart through the ages for my love.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who was it that said ‘spring blossom is beautiful!’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. 평조 이수대엽 (平調二數大葉)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>버들은 실이되고 꾀꼬리는 북이되어</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>구십(九十) 에 짜내느냐 나의시름,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>누구서 녹음방초(錄陰芳草)를</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>승화시(勝花時) 라 하든고?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2. <em>Pyŏngjo Chunggŏ</em></strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blue bird, please come. You brought my lover’s letter.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How did you come from so far away?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>You may not guess</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>how deeply we love each other.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2. 평조 중거 (平調中擧)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>청조(靑鳥)야 오도고야, 반갑다 님의 소식</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>약수삼천리(弱水三千里) 를 네 어이 건너온다?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>우리님 만단정회(萬端情懷) 네 다 알가 하노라.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3. <em>Pyŏngjo Pyŏnggŏ</em></strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Your laughter illuminates me</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heaven and earth, which are the appearance.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Why do people from all walks of life miss the flowers growing where you have died and perished?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3. 평조 평거 (平調平擧)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>일소백미생(一笑白媚生)이 태진(太眞)이</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>여절(麗質)이라.명황(明皇)도 이라므로</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>만리행촉(萬里行蜀)하였으니.지금에</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>마의방초(馬巍芳草)를 못내 설위 하노라.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. *Pyŏngjo Tugŏ*
Why does time go so slowly?
How can he know
my sorrow at this joyful time?
I can not sleep thinking of my love.

4. 평조 두거 (平調頭舉)
일각이 삼추(三秋)라 허니 열흘이면 몇삼추(三秋)
제 마음을 즐겁거니 남의 시름 생각하라? 천리(천리)
임이별(任離別) 허고 잠 못닐워 하노라

5. *Pyŏngjo Kyemyŏnjo, Panyŏp*
My love is far away, don't ask others
to convey news for you!
How could they know what we are up to?
How can they substitute your love?
Because my news is carried by others,
my yearning heart becomes saddened.

5. 반우반계 반엽 (半羽半界 半業)
남하여 편지전치말고 당신이 제오되어
남이 남의 일을 못 일과져 하라마는
남하여 전한편지니 일동말동 하여라

6. *Kyemyŏnjo Isudaeyŏp*
He is late for our tryst:
the flowers of the green peach have all
shattered.
I wonder whether that magpie
which called this morning was faithful.
No matter: I'll take my mirror and
touch up my eyebrows afresh.¹

6. 계면조 이수대엽 (界面調二數大業)
연약이 늦어가니 정매화(庭梅化)도 다 지거다.
아침에 우든 가치 유신(有信)타 하라마는, 그러나
경중아미(鏡中蛾眉)를 다스려 몸끼 하노라.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Text (Korean)</th>
<th>Text (English)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Kemyŏnjo Chunggŏ</td>
<td>산촌(山村)에 밤이 드니 면데 개 지저온다. 시비(柴扉)를 열고보니 하늘이 차고 달이로다. 저 개야 공산(空山) 잠든 달을 지저 무삼하리오.</td>
<td>The night deepens in the mountain village A dog's barking catches my ear Pushing open the brush-wood door The sky is full with the moon Why is the dog barking empty cries?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Kemyŏnjo Pyŏnggŏ</td>
<td>초강(楚江) 어부(漁夫)들아 고기 낚아 삶지마라 굴삼려 충혼(屈三閭 忠魂)이 어복리(漁腹裡)에 들었으니, 아무리 정확 삶은을 익을 줄이 있으랴.</td>
<td>Hey! Fisherman of the grassy river. In the corner of the fish belly lies the dead loyal subject(official) Who will dare to try and eat the fish?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Kemyŏnjo Tugŏ</td>
<td>임술지추(壬戌之秋) 칠월기망(七月旣望)에 배를타고 금릉(金陵)에 나려, 손조고기낚아 고기주고 술을사니 지금에 소동파(蘇東坡) 없으니 놀이적어 하노라</td>
<td>Hey, Sodongpa! I prepared liquor and a banquet from the fish I caught in commemoration of the date of your death. However, without your presence I never write a word.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Kemyŏnjo Pyŏnrong</td>
<td>낫아 고기주고 술을 사너, 지금(至今)에</td>
<td>I pray, I pray Praying to Chilsung to show</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compassion for my poor heart.</td>
<td>소동파(蘇東坡) 없으니 이 적어 하노라.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Although I have met my love,</td>
<td>복두칠성(北斗七星) 하나 둘 사이 나이 다소</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>for whom I've yearned, the night</td>
<td>일곱분께 민망(憫忙) 발괄 소지(所持) 한장</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>is over without telling him</td>
<td>이리 착한 음을 만나 정뙇말씀 채 못허니</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>all the things on my mind.</td>
<td>쉬 새니 글로 민망 밤중만 삼태성(三台星)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How can I avoid being pathetic?</td>
<td>차사(差使)농아 샛별없이 하소서.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>While you shine clearly? Stop Venus from</td>
<td>11. 평조 우락 (平調 羽樂)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rising by sending your troops.</td>
<td>바람은 지도(地動)치듯 불고 궂인비는 붓드시 온</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>눈 정(精)에 거룬님을 오늘밤 서로 만나자 하고</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>판 점 처서 맹서(盟誓)받았더니 이 풍우중(風雨中)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>에 제어이 오리? 진실(眞實)로 오기곤 오량이면</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>연분(緣分)인가 하노라.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12.반우반계 환계락 (半羽半界 還界樂)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. <em>Pyŏngjo Urak</em></td>
<td>앞내나 뒷내나 중(中)에 소 먹이는 아회놈들아</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>stormy winds shake the universe</td>
<td>앞내 고기와 뒷내 옛 고기를 다몰속 잡아 네 다라</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>네어 주어드란 네타고 가는 소 등에 걸쳐다가 주롭</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>우리도 바빠 가는 길이오에 전활동동동 하여라.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
13. **Kyemŏnjo kyerak**
Blue mountains gently gently,
green waters gently gently;
Hills gently gently, streams gently gently,
and between them I too gently gently
In the midst, gently gently, this body
growing older; gently gently shall it be.

14. **Kyemŏnjo Pyŏnsudaeyŏp**
The peony is the king of flowers
and the sunflower a noble subject;
The lotus is a gentleman,
the apricot blossom a commoner;
The chrysanthemum a sage in retirement,
the plum blossom a poor scholar;
The gourd flower is an old, old man,
the China pink is a boy;
The mallow is a witch and the wild rose a harlot;
Among them the pear blossom is a poet, and are not the red
peach, the green peach, and the peach of three colours, all of
| them playboys? | 15. **Kyemŏnjo T’aepyŏngga**  
Reign of peace here. Reign of peace there.  
Reign of peace on the dream way. The world is above the cloud.  
Live a life just like the cloud over there. |
|----------------|---------------------------------|
| 15. 계면조 태평가 ( 界面調 太平歌)  
이려도 태평성대 (太平聖代) 저려도 성대 (聖代)로다.  
요지일월 (堯之日月)이요 순지건곤 (舜之乾坤)이로다.  
우리도 태평성대 (太平聖代)니 놀고 놀려 하노라, |
Directions

The score is read left to right across the page.

**Rhythmic Cycle** – shown at the top of each page.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Both hands</th>
<th>Both hands tapping on the knees simultaneously</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Left hand</td>
<td>Left hand tapping on the left knee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Right hand</td>
<td>Right hand tapping on the right knee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>One short flick of the right hand on the right knee, followed immediately by a tap</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Right hand tapping the right knee four or five times, very fast and fading, like a ball bouncing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>One short tap on the right knee</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Pitch

- 4 complete stave lines – the pitches, indicated on the left, of either p'yŏngjo mode or kyemyŏnjo mode
- Incomplete dotted lines – pitches which rarely appear, indicated on the right.

![Diagram of P'yanjo and Kyemyonjo modes]

Duration

- The rhythmic structure is divided into 6 units (taegang) indicated by the bold ‘bar lines’.
- The units (taegang) are subdivided into dotted crochet or dotted minim patterns (chŏnggan) indicated by the semi ‘bar lines.’

Timbre

The bold, horizontal line indicates the passagio point between

- chest sound (notes below the line with stems up) and
• head sound (notes above the line with stem down)

Articulation (*Sikimsae*)

• ![upward glissando](image)
  Upward-gliding – glissando upwards which includes accelerando and repeated dips in pitch.

• ![downward glissando](image)
  Downward-gliding – glissando downwards which includes accelerando and repeated undulations of pitch.

• ![upward returning glissando](image)
  Upward-gliding returning to the first note at the end – glissando upwards which includes accelerando and repeated dips in pitch.

• ![pitch bend upwards](image)
  Pitch bend upwards – slightly raising the pitch at the end of the note.

• ![forceful grace note](image)
  Forceful, grace note before the beat, a powerful downward attack.

• ![end of phrase](image)
  End of phrase

• ![short rest](image)
  Short rest

• ![abbreviation](image)
  Abbreviation for the short melodic pattern仲(仲 a♭)南(南 c)倉(倉 b)南.c in one beat.
Hand-signs *(sondongjak)*

- Right hand
- Left hand
- Both hands together
- Right hand point
- Left hand point
Tempo: 120

Pianissimo piano
Kvemyn P'yongyang
Kapyrus, Pseudonym. Kyewonjo

(3 + 3 + 2)

Kaye

[Music notation]
'모란운 Moranŭn'

Kyemyŏnjo P'yŏnsudaeyŏp 界面調 編數大葉

한정간 = 약 0.8초 (♩ = 75)

2+2+1

모란운화중앙

Mo ran ŭi ấn hwajung wy a

이요

ang yi yo

향일화는

Hyang il hwa nū ŏn ch’ung sin yi

로 다

ro da Yŏn hwa nūn

군자요행화소

Ku un ja yo Haeng hwa so

인이라

yi in yi ra kug hwa nūn